

ANTHROPOLOGY AND THE NEW GENETICS

The growth of "new genetics" has dramatically increased our understanding of health, diseases and the body. Anthropologists argue that these scientific advances have also had far-reaching social and cultural implications, radically changing our self-understanding and our perception of what it means to be human; that we have become "biomedicalized," fragmented, and commodified – thus redefining our notions of citizenship, social relations, family, and identity. This book shows how anthropology can contribute to and challenge the ways we have come to understand genetic issues. Exploring a range of issues and case studies in human genetic research, it provides an ethnographic "reality-check," arguing that we must look beyond the "gene-centrism" of genetic codes, family trees, and insular populations, to explore their wider cultural, ethical, and philosophical implications. Merging natural and social issues with the real world of medical science, this book will be welcomed by anyone interested in anthropology, sociology, biology, health, and medicine.

Gísli Pálsson is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Iceland, and an Honorary Fellow of the Royal Anthropological Institute. He has published over 100 scholarly articles and twenty books, including *Coastal Economies, Cultural Accounts* (1991), *Nature and Society: Anthropological Perspectives* (1996), *Beyond Boundaries: Understanding, Translation and Anthropological Discourse* (1995), and *Images of Contemporary Iceland* (1996).



NEW DEPARTURES IN ANTHROPOLOGY

New Departures in Anthropology is a book series that focuses on emerging themes in social and cultural anthropology. With original perspectives and syntheses, authors introduce new areas of inquiry in anthropology, explore developments that cross disciplinary boundaries, and weigh in on current debates. Every book illustrates theoretical issues with ethnographic material drawn from current research or classic studies, as well as from literature, memoirs, and other genres of reportage. The aim of the series is to produce books that are accessible enough to be used by college students and instructors, but will also stimulate, provoke, and inform anthropologists at all stages of their careers. Written clearly and concisely, books in the series are designed equally for advanced students and a broader range of readers, inside and outside academic anthropology, who want to be brought up to date on the most exciting developments in the discipline.

SERIES EDITORIAL BOARD

Jonathan Spencer, University of Edinburgh Michael Lambek, University of Toronto and London School of Economics Saba Mahmood, University of California, Berkeley Olivia Harris, London School of Economics



Anthropology and the New Genetics



GÍSLI PÁLSSON

University of Iceland





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521671743

© Gísli Pálsson 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-85572-3 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-67174-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my mother, Bára Sigurðardóttir



Contents

List of figures and table		page x
Ack	knowledgments	xi
1	Introduction: "As deep as life itself"	1
2	Birthmarks become landmarks: "Little worlds in themselve	es" 32
3	Genealogies, relationships, and histories	59
4	Biobanking: medical records and genetic databases	91
5	For whom the cell tolls: bioethics	123
6	Biovalue: appropriating genomes	150
7	Human variation	176
8	Conclusion	207
References		231
Index		255

ix



Figures and table

Figures

1.1	Rosalind Franklin's Photograph 51 of the B form	
	of DNA	page 7
1.2	"The geography of our genome" (Nature)	9
2.1	A pedigree with two pairs of sisters affected by	
	osteoarthritis (source: deCODE genetics)	39
2.2	"Birthmark 1, Map A" by Katrín Sigurðardóttir	52
3.1	The lineage of Saint Anne (Gerard David (1455–1523);	
	Musée des Beaux-Arts de Lyon); © MBA Lyon. Photo	
	Alain Basset	65
3.2	An asthma pedigree with eleven generations	
	(source: deCODE genetics)	72
3.3	Operating the genealogical machine: number of visits	
	(log-ins per day) (source: deCODE genetics)	80
6.1	"Mapping the Human Genome" (New England BioLabs)	156
6.2	Populations included in the Human Genome Diversity	
	Project collection (after Cavalli-Sforza 2005)	159
7.1	An attempt to match language groups with biological	
	taxa based on gene frequency (from Moore 1994)	187
Tab	ole	

Iuoic

4.1 A Comparison of seven genetic database projects 112

X



Acknowledgments

Work on this book began during the summer of 2004, following an invitation to the University of Edinburgh under its Northern Scholars Scheme. I thank my hosts Janet Carsten and her colleagues in the Department of Social Anthropology for rich and stimulating discussions on some of the implications of the new genetics. The form of the book owes much to discussions with the editors of the New Departures in Anthropology series. I greatly appreciate an early discussion with Jonathan Spencer and the critical reading of the first draft by Olivia Harris and Michael Lambek. Thanks to a part-time position at the University of Oslo from 2002 to 2004, I had the opportunity to engage in sustained dialogue with Norwegian colleagues, notably Signe Howell, Torben Hviid Nielsen, Arne Kalland, Marit Melhus, Aud Talle, Henrik Treimo, and, last but not least, the late Eduardo Archetti. During a lecture trip to Canada in the fall of 2005, at the invitation of the anthropology departments at the universities of Alberta and British Columbia, I had challenging discussions with a number of colleagues about some of the issues presented here. In particular, I would like to thank Mark Nuttall for facilitating my trip and organizing my stay.

I owe a particular debt to Paul Rabinow, one of the pioneers of the subfield of anthropology concerned with the new genetics and its implications, for his hospitality during a sabbatical leave at the University of California at Berkeley in the spring and summer of 2001 when some of the ideas presented here took shape, for his collaboration on issues relating to

xi



Acknowledgments

Icelandic biopolitics, and for his theoretical inspiration. I am also grateful to Kristín E. Harðardóttir, Lecturer in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Iceland. Not only did she co-ordinate in a superbly efficient fashion a research project for which I was responsible, but my work has benefited extensively from her own perceptive observations and analyses. Along with Arnar Árnason and Barbara Prainsack she read the entire manuscript and offered a number of highly useful comments. I thank them all for their observations and effort. Many other colleagues have been of help in one way or another, as collaborators, editors, or commentators, including Anna Birna Almarsdóttir, Nancy Marie Brown, Anne Brydon, Philippe Descola, Paul Durrenberger, Herbert Gottweis, Agnar S. Helgason, Stefan Helmreich, Eric Hirsch, Klaus Hoeyer, Tim Ingold, Linda Hogle, Örn D. Jónsson, Bruno Latour, Susanne Lundin, Benjamin S. Orlove, Hans-Jörg Rheinberger, Ingrid Schneider, Lesley A. Sharp, Halldór Stefánsson, Marilyn Strathern, and Melanie G. Wiber. Research assistant Sigurður Örn Guðbjörnsson traced a number of important references.

Last but not least I acknowledge my debt to both my wife Guðný Guðbjörnsdóttir, whose sober take on the new genetics and ongoing commentaries upon my work helped to keep me on course, and all the practitioners of the new genetics who have shared with me their thoughts and opinions during informal fieldwork and formal interviews. In particular, I appreciate the cooperation of the staff of deCODE genetics – especially Kári Stefánsson, Director, Jeffrey Gulcher, Director of Research, Porgeir Porgeirsson, Assistant Director of Research, Unnur Póra Jökulsdóttir and Eiríkur Sigurðsson, Co-ordinators of Communication, Stefán Einar Stefánsson, Co-ordinator of the osteoarthritis team, and Þórður Kristjánsson, in charge of the company's genealogical database the "Book of Icelanders." Also, I have had useful contact with the staff of Frisk Software, Reykjavík, including Director Friðrik Skúlason and anthropologist Elín Klara Grétarsdóttir Bender.

xii



Acknowledgments

I have reproduced parts of works co-authored with Kristín E. Harðardóttir ("For Whom the Cell Tolls: Debates about Biomedicine," Current Anthropology, 2002), Agnar Helgason ("Blonds, Lost and Found: Representations of Genes, Identity, and History," Developing World Bioethics 2003), and Paul Rabinow ("Iceland: The Case of a National Human Genome Project," Anthropology Today, 1999, and "The Iceland Controversy: Reflections on the Trans-National Market of Civic Virtue," in A. Ong and S. J. Collier (eds.), Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics, and Ethics as Anthropological Problems, Blackwell Publishers, 2005). Also, I have drawn upon articles I have previously published: "The Life of Family Trees and the Book of Icelanders," Medical Anthropology, 2004, "Decoding Relatedness and Disease: The Icelandic Biogenetic Project," in J.-P. Gaudillére and H.-J. Rheinberger (eds.), From Molecular Genetics to Genomics: The Mapping Cultures of Twentieth-Century Genetics, Routledge, 2005, and "Appropriating Family Trees: Genealogies in the Age of Genetics," in F. von Benda-Beckmann, K. Benda-Beckmann, and M. G. Wiber (eds.), Changing Properties of Property, Berghahn Books, 2006. The research on which this book is based has been generously supported by several funds and institutions, including the Nordic Committee for Social Science Research (NOS-S), the Icelandic Center for Research, the University of Iceland, and the University of Oslo.

xiii