Over the past twenty years, debate surrounding cultural diversity has become one of the most active areas of contemporary political theory and philosophy. The impact of taking cultural diversity seriously in modern political societies has led to challenges to the dominance of liberal theory and to a more serious engagement of political theory with actual political struggles. This volume of essays by leading political theorists reviews the development of multiculturalism, surveys the major approaches, addresses the critical questions posed, and highlights new directions in research. *Multiculturalism and Political Theory* provides a “state of the art” overview for both students and researchers.

Anthony Simon Laden is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He is the author of *Reasonably Radical: Deliberative Liberalism and the Politics of Identity* (2001).

David Owen is Professor of Social and Political Philosophy in the Division of Politics and International Relations at the University of Southampton. He is the author of *Maturity and Modernity* (1994) and *Nietzsche, Politics and Modernity* (1995).
Multiculturalism and Political Theory

Edited by
Anthony Simon Laden and David Owen
Multiculturalism and political theory / edited by Anthony Simon Laden and David Owen.

p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-67090-6 (pbk.)
HM1271.M843151 2007
305.8001–dc22

2007003516

ISBN 978-0-521-85450-4 hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-67090-6 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes on contributors</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part I Trajectories

1. The new debate on minority rights (and postscript)  
   *Will Kymlicka*  
   25

2. Structural injustice and the politics of difference  
   *Iris Marion Young*  
   60

3. Multiculturalism as/and/or anti-racism?  
   *Charles W. Mills*  
   89

4. Feminism and multiculturalism: mapping the terrain  
   *Ayelet Shachar*  
   115

### Part II Approaches

5. Egalitarian liberalism and universalism  
   *Simon Caney*  
   151

6. Contextualism, constitutionalism, and *modus vivendi* approaches  
   *Jacob T. Levy*  
   173

7. Negotiation, deliberation, and the claims of politics  
   *Anthony Simon Laden*  
   198
### Contents

#### Part III Critical issues

8 Multiculturalism and the critique of essentialism  
*Andrew Mason*  
221

9 Liberalism, multiculturalism, and the problem of internal minorities  
*Daniel M. Weinstock*  
244

10 Redistribution and recognition: two approaches  
*David Owen and James Tully*  
265

11 A critical theory of multicultural toleration  
*Rainer Forst*  
292

#### Part IV New directions

12 Law’s necessary forcefulness: Ralph Ellison vs. Hannah Arendt on the Battle of Little Rock  
*Danielle Allen*  
315

13 Imagining civic relations in the moment of their breakdown: a crisis of civic integrity in the Netherlands  
*Bert van den Brink*  
350

14 Democracy and foreignness: democratic cosmopolitanism and the myth of an immigrant America  
*Bonnie Honig*  
373

**Index**  
408
Danielle Allen is Dean of Humanities at the University of Chicago. Her research interests include classical Greek literature, political philosophy, the history of rhetoric, the philosophy of punishment, democratic theory and history, and twentieth-century American poetry. She is the author of The World of Prometheus: The Politics of Punishing in Democratic Athens (2000) and Talking to Strangers: Anxieties of Citizenship since Brown v. Board of Education, as well as numerous articles and chapters in edited volumes.

Bert van den Brink is Research Fellow of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences and Associate Professor of Philosophy at Utrecht University, the Netherlands. He is the author of The Tragedy of Liberalism: An Alternative Defense of A Political Tradition (2000), coeditor of Bürgergesellschaft, Recht und Demokratie (1995), and The Problem of Reasons of One’s Own (2004). He is on the editorial board of the journal Philosophical Explorations and on the advisory board of the journal Contemporary Political Theory.

Simon Caney is Professor in Political Theory, Oxford University, and Fellow and Tutor in Politics, Magdalen College. He has published articles on liberalism, perfectionism, human rights, climate change, international distributive justice, national self-determination, multiculturalism and intervention. He is the author of Justice Beyond Borders: A Global Political Theory (2005). He has also has co-edited National Rights, International Obligations (1996) and Human Rights and Global Diversity (2000). He is currently writing books entitled On Cosmopolitanism and Global Justice and Climate Change (co-authored with Dr. Derek Bell.)

Rainer Forst is Professor of Political Theory and Philosophy at Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University in Frankfurt/Main. He is the author of Contexts of Justice: Political Philosophy beyond Liberalism and Communitarianism (2002), Toleranz im Konflikt: Geschichte, Gehalt und
vi

Notes on contributors


Notes on contributors

Jacob T. Levy is Tomlinson Professor of Political Theory at the Department of Political Science, McGill University, and Secretary-Treasurer of the American Society for Political and Legal Philosophy. He is the author of *The Multiculturalism of Fear* (2000), and numerous articles and chapters on minority rights, indigenous rights, nationalism, federalism, and the history of liberal thought, that have appeared in *Ethics, Nomos, History of Political Thought, Social Philosophy and Policy*, and edited collections including *Citizenship in Diverse Societies, Language Rights and Political Theory, and Nationalism, Liberalism, and Pluralism*. He has been a Fulbright Scholar (1993–1994) and a visiting Mellon Fellow at the University of Chicago Law School (2004–2005). He is currently writing on rationalism and pluralism in liberal thought.

Andrew Mason is Professor of Political Theory at the University of Southampton. He is the author of *Explaining Political Disagreement* (Cambridge University Press, 1993) and *Community, Solidarity and Belonging* (Cambridge University Press, 2000), and the editor of *Ideals of Equality* (1998). His most recent book, *Levelling the Playing Field* was published in 2006.


Ayelet Shachar is the Canada Research Chair in Citizenship and Multiculturalism at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto and the Leah Kaplan Visiting Professor in Human Rights at Stanford.
Notes on contributors


James Tully is a Professor of Political Science, Law, Philosophy, and Indigenous Governance at the University of Victoria, BC, Canada. Before the University of Victoria he taught Political Science and Philosophy at McGill University and was the inaugural Henry N. R. Jackman Distinguished Professor of Philosophical Studies, in Philosophy, Political Science and Law, at the University of Toronto 2001–2003. He has published eight books and many articles on topics in contemporary political philosophy and the history of political philosophy, including *Strange Multiplicities: Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity* (Cambridge University Press, 1996). He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and a Fellow of the new Canadian Trudeau Foundation.

Daniel Weinstock holds the Canada Research Chair in Ethics and Political Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy of the Université de Montréal, where he is also a Full Professor. He is the founding director of the University’s Ethics Research Center. He has published many articles on the interface between culture and justice. He is presently working on a book project exploring the complex relationship between children, families, and the liberal-democratic state.

Iris Marion Young was Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. Her research interests covered contemporary political theory, feminist social theory, and normative analysis of public policy. Her books include *Justice and the Politics of Difference* (1990), *Throwing Like a Girl and Other Essays in Feminist Philosophy and Social Theory* (1990), *Intersecting Voices: Dilemmas of Gender, Political Philosophy, and Policy* (1997), and *Inclusion and Democracy* (2000).
The original thought for this volume arose in a conversation with John Haslam at APSA in 2000. In this respect, John has seen the project through from glint in the eye to conception to, finally, gestation. Throughout this process, he has been encouraging, helpful across a range of issues, and – above all – patient (despite the temptations to the contrary). We are deeply grateful to John for all his support as well as his editorial acumen.

Early versions of the chapters by Laden, Levy, Mills, and Young were given as papers at a Chicago Political Theory Network conference in November 2004. The editors are grateful to all who attended and in particular to Peg Birmingham, David Ingram and Paul Gomberg, who served as discussants, and to Stephen Engelmann, who helped to organize the conference.

We would also like to thank our respective colleagues in Chicago and Southampton who have provided a working environment within which these issues are fiercely debated in an utterly non-dogmatic spirit, and, in particular, Chris Armstrong, Russell Bentley, Chris Brown, Samuel Fleischacker, Andrew Mason, and Aaron Ridley. We are both much in debt over several years to the intellectual generosity of James Tully. Andrew Brearley was of great assistance in putting the final manuscript into a consistent form.

Finally, we would like to thank our respective Carolines for – yet again – covering the father-shaped holes in family life that occurred in the course of constructing this volume with their characteristic grace and good humor. This volume is dedicated to our children, Arthur, Miranda, Clara, Raphaël, and Jacob who will, in their turn, engage with a world where (we hope) the debates discussed herein have made a difference. Several of the chapters in this volume have been previously published, and we gratefully acknowledge the permission to republish them here. “The New Debate over Minority Rights,” by Will Kymlicka, was previously published in Will Kymlicka, *Politics in the Vernacular* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), and is reprinted here with the

Iris Young died as the final touches were being made to this volume. Those who knew her, even slightly, will feel the loss of a vibrant, humorous, and passionate human being whose commitment to justice made a difference. Those who knew her work will feel the loss of one of political philosophy’s most practically grounded and theoretically imaginative voices. We hope that those who will meet her for the first time in this collection will understand why we join so many colleagues and friends in missing her.

Anthony Simon Laden, Chicago

David Owen, Southampton