Age in the Welfare State

The overwhelming costs of providing for aging populations have brought many welfare states to the brink of insolvency. Now is the time to ask: how did we get here? *Age in the Welfare State* explains how it came to pass that some nations give the lion’s share of social benefits to the elderly, while others do more to protect children and working-age adults. A sweeping work of historically and sociologically informed political science, *Age in the Welfare State* offers a surprising challenge to the conventional wisdom that welfare state policies are a result of either pressure-group politics or the ideologies of parties in power. This vividly written and exhaustively documented work draws on in-depth case studies of family, labor-market, and pension policy making in Italy and the Netherlands, as well as broader cross-sectional analysis of spending patterns in twenty OECD countries. Scholars of social policy and comparative politics, practitioners, and policy makers will be challenged by this book’s startlingly new insights about the historical roots of current welfare state predicaments.

Julia Lynch is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Pennsylvania. Her recent dissertation, on which this book is based, garnered the Gabriel Almond prize of the American Political Science Association for the best dissertation in comparative politics. Professor Lynch was previously a scholar in the Robert Wood Johnson Health Policy Scholars program at Harvard University, and she has been a visiting researcher at the European University Institute in Florence and the Luxembourg Income Study project in Luxembourg.
Age in the Welfare State

THE ORIGINS OF SOCIAL SPENDING ON PENSIONERS, WORKERS, AND CHILDREN

JULIA LYNCH

University of Pennsylvania
In memory of Rue Bunzelman Deutsch
## Contents

*List of Tables and Figures*  page x

*List of Abbreviations*  xiii

*Acknowledgments*  xvii

1  **INTRODUCTION**  1

2  **MEASURING THE AGE OF WELFARE**  15

3  **AGE AND THE WELFARE STATE: THEORIES AND HYPOTHESES**  41

4  **FAMILY ALLOWANCES: WAGES, TAXES, AND THE APPEAL TO THE SELF-EMPLOYED**  70

5  **BENEFITS FOR THE UNEMPLOYED: YOUNG AND OLD IN THE FORTRESS LABOR MARKET**  108

6  **OLD-AGE PENSIONS: THE ARCHITECTURE OF EXPENDITURE**  139

7  **CONCLUSION**  180

*References*  201

*Index*  219
Tables and Figures

**Tables**

2.1. Public Spending on the Elderly, per Person Aged 65+

2.2. Public Spending on Unemployment and Active Labor Market Policies, per Registered Unemployed

2.3. Public Spending on Occupational Injury and Sickness Programs, per Member of the Civilian Labor Force

2.4. Public Spending on Cash Benefits and Services for Families, per Person under 15

2.5. Public Education Spending, per Person Aged 0–20

2.6. Per Capita Health Spending Ratios

2.7. Elderly/Non-elderly Spending Ratio (ENSR)

2.8. ENSR with Education Spending

2.9. Social-Fiscal Measures as a Percentage of GDP

2.10. Tax Expenditures on Elderly and Non-elderly

2.11. Housing Policy Orientations

3.1. Percentage Change in ENSR, 1960–2000

5.1. Net Replacement Rates of Unemployment Insurance Benefits

5.2. Benefits for the Unemployed in Italy and the Netherlands

5.3. Age Distribution of Long-Term Unemployed Population

5.4. Working-Age Disability Beneficiaries, by Age
Abbreviations

Italy
ANF  assegno per il nucleo familiare (family allowance)
CENSIS Centro Studi Investimenti Sociali (Center for Social Studies and Policies, socio-economic research institute)
CGIL Confederazione Generale Italiana del Lavoro (left-leaning labor union confederation)
CIG Cassa per l'Integrazione Guadagni (short-time earnings replacement benefit program)
CIGS Cassa per l’Integrazione Guadagni Straordinaria (special short-time benefit)
CISL Confederazione Italiana Sindacati Lavoratori (Catholic-inspired labor union confederation)
CNEL Consiglio Nazionale dell'Economia e del Lavoro (National Council on Labor and the Economy, tripartite consultative body)
CUAF Cassa Unica per gli Assegni Familiari (Unified Family Allowance Fund)
DC Democrazia Cristiana (Christian Democratic Party)
FNP Federazione Nazionale Pensionati (pensioners’ union affiliated with CISL)
FPLD Fondo Previdenza Lavoratori Dipendenti (largest state-administered pension fund, covering dependent employees)
INCA Istituto Nazionale Confederaile di Assistenza (social service agency linked to CGIL)
INPS Istituto Nazionale della Previdenza Sociale (national social security administration)
Abbreviations

ISTAT  Istituto Nazionale di Statistica (national statistical agency)
PCI   Partito Comunista Italiano (Communist Party of Italy)
(P)DS  (Partido) Democratici di Sinistra (Democratic Party of the Left, formerly PCI)
PSI  Partito Socialista Italiano (Socialist Party of Italy)
TS  trattamenti speciali (special unemployment insurance benefits)
UIL  Unione Italiana del Lavoro (Centrist labor union confederation)

The Netherlands
ABW  Algemene Bijstandswet (Unemployment Assistance Act)
AKW  Algemene Kinderbijslagwet (General Family Allowance Act)
AOW  Algemene Ouderdomswet (General Old-Age Pensions Act)
ARP  Anti-Revolutionaire Partij (Protestant Reform Party)
CBS  Centraal Bureau voor de Statistiek (national statistical agency)
CDA  Christen Democratisch Appel (Christian Democratic Appeal, formed in 1980 from merger of Catholic and Protestant parties)
CNV  Christelijk Nationaal Vakverbond (Catholic trade union federation)
FNV  Federatie Nederlandse Vakbeweging (largest Dutch trade union federation)
JWG  Jeugdwerkgarantiewet (Youth Work Guarantee Law)
KVP  Katholieke Volkspartij (Catholic Peoples’ Party)
NVV  Nederlands Verbond van Vakverenigingen (Socialist trade union federation, merged to form part of FNV in 1981)
PPR  Politieke Partij Radicalen (Radical Party)
PvdA  Partij van de Arbeid (Labor Party)
RWW  Rijksgroepsregelting voor Werkloze Werknemers (Unemployment Assistance Act)
SER  Sociaal-Economische Raad (Socio-Economic Council)
SVB  Sociale Verzekeringsbank (Social Insurance Bank)
VUT  Vervroegde Uittreding (private early retirement pension provision)
WAO  Wet op de Arbeidsongeschiktheidsverzekering (Disablement Insurance Act)
WIW  Wet Inschakeling Werkzoekenden (Job-Seekers Employment Act)
WW  Wet Werkloosheidsvoorziening (Unemployment Insurance Act)
Abbreviations

WWV  Wijziging Wet Werkloosheidsvoorziening (Extended Unemployment Insurance Act)

International

ILO  International Labour Office
IMF  International Monetary Fund
LIS  Luxembourg Income Study project
OECD Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

Miscellaneous

ENSR  Elderly/Non-elderly Spending Ratio
GDP  Gross Domestic Product

Country Abbreviations Used in Figures

AUS  Australia
AUT  Austria
BEL  Belgium
CAN  Canada
DEN  Denmark
FRA  France
FIN  Finland
GER  Germany
GRE  Greece
IRE  Ireland
ITA  Italy
JPN  Japan
LUX  Luxembourg
NET  Netherlands
NOR  Norway
NZL  New Zealand
POR  Portugal
SPA  Spain
SWE  Sweden
UK  United Kingdom
US  United States
Acknowledgments

This book has been many years in the making, the vast majority of which have been enjoyable. I attribute this in large part to the fact that it was truly a joint effort. It would not have been possible for me to research, write, or complete it without the invaluable contributions of various funding institutions, mentors, colleagues, friends, and family.

I owe deep intellectual debts to many: to Gösta Esping-Andersen, who set me on the right track; to John Zysman, Jonah Levy, and Henry Brady, who gave me the right tools and showed me how to use them; to Maurizio Ferrera and Tim Smeeding, who always showed faith and backed it up with good works; and especially to Karen Anderson and Sara Watson, who have always been generous and who just keep getting smarter every year. Numerous colleagues – among them Melanie Cammett, Andrea Campbell, Anna Grzymala-Busse, Katie Carman, Evan Lieberman, Lauren Morris MacLean, Paul Pierson, Mark Vail, Rob Weiner, Christa van Wijnbergen, and Daniel Ziblatt – gave intelligent feedback at crucial moments. I cannot thank these wonderful people enough.

Field work for this project was financed with a National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship, a Social Science Research Council International Dissertation Field Research Fellowship, and an Alan Sharlin Memorial Award from the Institute for International Studies at the University of California, Berkeley. Financial support during writing and rewriting came from another Sharlin Award and a John L. Simpson Memorial Research Fellowship, also administered by the Institute for International Studies at Berkeley, and from a most generous fellowship from the Robert Wood Johnson Health Policy Scholars program.

While in Italy, I relied heavily on the kindness of the European University Institute in Florence. Since my first venture to Italy in 1993, the faculty,
staff, and researchers of the EUI have provided me with a home away from home and a vibrant intellectual community. The Robert Schuman Centre's 1998–9 European Forum on “Recasting European Welfare States” provided an ideal environment for testing out new ideas during my stay in Italy and beyond. I would particularly like to thank Stefano Bartolini and Martin Rhodes for making the resources of the EUI available to me on repeated occasions.

My research in Italy would not have been possible without the support of Maurizio Ferrera, whose kindness, generosity, and belief in the project has sustained me through many rough patches. I would also like to thank Marino Regini and Daniele Franco, as well as librarians Peter Kennealy at the EUI, Oreste Bazzichi at Confindustria, and Mila Scarlatti at the Centro Studi CISL. Aedin Doris, Jackie Gordon, Ann-Louise Lauridsen, Dan Oakey, Jacobien Rutgers, and Joanna Swajcowska supplied moral and immoral support at crucial moments during my Italian sojourns.

In the Netherlands, Anton Hemerijck was a welcoming beacon, setting me up with logistical support from the University of Leiden and providing me with the feedback and intellectual support necessary to research a case study effectively in a short period of time. The staff of the library at the Ministry of Social Welfare and the experts gathered at the Hugo Sinzheimer Institute in Amsterdam amazed me with their patience and expertise. Nelleke van Deusen-Scholl and Heleen Mastenbroek managed to teach me workable Dutch in a period of about five months, a feat that shall never cease to amaze me. Karen Anderson, Jacobien Rutgers, and Bauke Visser helped to make my time in the Netherlands pleasant as well as productive.

Logistical support in the final phases has come from my terrific TS-CS guru, Ben Goodrich; from Todor Enev, whose deeply intelligent data sleuthing makes the term “research assistant” utterly inadequate; and from Melanie Daglian, whose positive energy made preparing the final manuscript an enjoyable task. Tom and Emma were there at the beginning and saw it through to the end. There are no two better friends with whom to go through life. Last, this book is dedicated to my very special grandmother, Rue Bunzelman Deutsch. As we both got older, she became my partner in crime, showing me that sometimes the true meaning of intergenerational solidarity comes down to poking fun at the middle generation.

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
November 2005