

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact

Copyright ‘exceptions’ or ‘users’ rights’ have become a highly controversial aspect of copyright law. Most recently, member states of the European Union have been forced to amend their systems of exceptions so as to comply with the Information Society Directive. Taking the newly amended UK legislation as a case study, this book examines why copyright exceptions are necessary and the forces that have shaped the present legislative regime in the United Kingdom. It seeks to further our understanding of the exceptions by combining detailed doctrinal analysis with insights gained from a range of other sources. The principal argument of the book is that the United Kingdom’s current system of ‘permitted acts’ is much too restrictive and hence is in urgent need of reform, and that paradoxically the Information Society Directive points the way towards a much more satisfactory approach.

ROBERT BURRELL is Reader in Law at the University of Queensland, and Associate Director of the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture. He worked previously at the Australian National University and at King’s College, London.

ALLISON COLEMAN is Director of Culturenet Cymru at the National Library of Wales. She was previously Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth.

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*Cambridge Studies in Intellectual Property Rights*

As its economic potential has rapidly expanded, intellectual property has become a subject of front-rank legal importance. *Cambridge Studies in Intellectual Property Rights* is a series of monograph studies of major current issues in intellectual property. Each volume will contain a mix of international, European, comparative and national law, making this a highly significant series for practitioners, judges and academic researchers in many countries.

*Series editor*

Professor William R. Cornish, *University of Cambridge*

*Advisory editors*

Professor François Dessemontet, *University of Lausanne*

Professor Paul Goldstein, *Stanford University*

The Hon. Sir Justice Robin Jacob, *The High Court, England and Wales*

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact

---

Robert Burrell  
Allison Coleman



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa  
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*Typeface* Plantin 10/12 pt.    *System* L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X 2<sub>ε</sub> [TB]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN 0 521 84726 5 hardback

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

For Gita and Amelia  
Elizabeth and Sarah

## Contents

---

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of statutes</i>	xxiii

<b>Introduction</b>	1
The exceptions in focus	1
The functions of the exceptions	4
The plan of this work and our argument in outline	6
A note on language	10

### **Part I Where we are**

<b>1 Copyright and freedom of expression</b>	<b>15</b>
Recognising the problem	16
The idea/expression dichotomy and judicial reaction	20
Recognising the conflict	24
Resolving the conflict	35
Conclusion	41
<b>2 Fair dealing for the purposes of criticism, review and news reporting and related exceptions</b>	<b>42</b>
Fair dealing for the purposes of criticism, review and the reporting of current events: introduction	43
Does the exception apply to the work in question?	44
Is the use for an approved purpose?	48
Is the use fair?	57
Attribution of the work	60
Summary	61
Miscellaneous provisions relating to the communication of information	62
Miscellaneous provisions relating to the creation of derivative works	64
Other obstacles faced by users	67
Conclusion	78

viii	Contents	
3	The public interest defence	80
	The public interest defence in its early form	81
	The recent authorities	91
	Can the same result be achieved by other means?	94
	The objections of principle to a public interest defence	102
	Is a public interest defence legitimate?	103
	Is a public interest defence appropriate?	108
	Is a public interest defence necessary?	109
	Is a public interest defence workable?	111
	Conclusion	111
4	Exceptions applying to education, research and private study	113
	Fair dealing for the purposes of research or private study	115
	The education exceptions: overview	120
	Things done for the purposes of instruction or examination	120
	Anthologies for educational use	124
	Performing, playing and showing works in educational establishments	124
	Lending of copies by educational establishments	126
	The licensing provisions	126
	Case study: copyright licensing in higher education	130
	Conclusion	135
5	The library and archive provisions and related exceptions	136
	Overview of the existing exceptions	137
	Defining libraries, archives, museums and galleries and the role of such institutions	138
	Divisions within the 1988 Act	142
	Wider coverage under the directive	143
	The existing library exceptions	145
	Miscellaneous exceptions	160
	Conclusion	162
<b>Part II How we got here</b>		
6	Markets and metaphors	167
	Exceptions, licences and market failure	168
	Copyright as a form of property	180
	Copyright law and notions of balance	187
	Conclusion	191
7	Copyright in supranational fora	193
	The logic of harmonisation	194
	The Commission's understanding of copyright I: market failure, the copyright balance and property rights	197
	The Commission's understanding of copyright II: harmonisation and the copyright families	201

Contents	ix
Opportunities for participation	208
The Information Society Directive and the importance of official inertia	213
Summation	215
The international forum	215
Conclusion	219
<b>8 Copyright in the domestic arena</b>	<b>220</b>
Understandings of copyright	221
The DTI's mandate	226
Draftsmanship and the inevitable accident	230
Implementing directives: the method of transposition	235
European legislation and the erosion of parliamentary control	236
The role of the judiciary	238
Conclusion	245
 <b>Part III Where we go from here</b>	
<b>9 The fair use panacea</b>	<b>249</b>
The evolution of the fair use defence and its abolition by the judiciary	253
Protecting parodies	264
The fair use defence: current practice and future developments	267
Conclusion	274
<b>10 A model for reform</b>	<b>276</b>
A flexible system	276
A workable system	277
A law of users' rights	279
The importance of public participation	280
Working with the Directive: criticism, review and news reporting	282
Supplementing the Directive: the public interest defence	287
Working with the Directive: private study and research, education, libraries and archives	288
Summation	297
The three-step test	298
Other types of users' rights	299
Making harmonisation a reality	303
Changing attitudes	304
Contractual exclusion and technological measures of protection	306
Conclusion	310
 <b>Appendices</b>	
Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, Part I, Chapter III: 'Permitted Acts'	313
Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, s. 296ZE and Schedule 5A	352



Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

x	Contents	
	Directive 2001/29/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 May 2001 on the harmonisation of certain aspects of copyright and related rights in the information society	355
	United States Copyright Act 1976, 17 USC, s. 107	375
	<i>Bibliography</i>	376
	<i>Index</i>	412

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Preface

---

The idea for this book arose out of conversations we had while we were both working at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. At the time plans for a European Directive to deal with copyright in the ‘information society’ were at an early stage, but it was already apparent that copyright users were going to struggle to influence the legislative process. We were also concerned that plans for European harmonisation were premature, given that significant doubt remained (and still remains) about some of the directions in which technological developments were taking us. At the same time, however, we did not share the outright opposition expressed by some to any suggestion that copyright exceptions might be harmonised in Europe. In particular, it seemed to us that the United Kingdom’s permitted act regime was much too restrictive, and that European harmonisation might provide an opportunity to revisit the entire system of copyright exceptions to an extent that was unlikely to arise in the absence of European intervention in this area.

Our plans for this book have changed considerably since our initial discussions and we have benefited from talking about our ideas with a number of people, including Anne Barron, Lionel Bently, Huw Beverley-Smith, Bill Cornish, Susan Davies, Paul Mitchell and John Phillips. Nevertheless, many of the themes that sparked our interest in this project have remained more or less consistent. We have touched on these themes and on some of the other ideas that inform this work in earlier publications. In particular, it should be noted that Chapter 9 of this book is based on an article written by Robert Burrell and published in the *Intellectual Property Quarterly* in 2001. In writing this book Allison Coleman took principal responsibility for Chapters 4 and 5 and Robert Burrell took sole responsibility for the remainder of this work. We have endeavoured to state the law as at 1 February 2004, but where possible we have tried to take account of later developments.

We are indebted to a number of people for the assistance they provided us during the writing process. In particular we should like to take this opportunity to thank Lionel Bently, Bill Cornish, Peter Drahos, Michael

Cambridge University Press  
0521847265 - Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact  
Robert Burrell and Allison Coleman  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

xii Preface

Handler, Gita Sarda, Brad Sherman, James Stellios and Adrienne Stone for reading and commenting on drafts; Susan Davies, James Hutton and Paul Mitchell for helping with the research; and the Australian National University's Faculties Research Grant Fund and the Monash University Travelling Fellowship Scheme for their financial support for elements of this project. We should also like to thank the Grains Research and Development Corporation and the Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation for their ongoing support for the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture. Finally we should like to thank the staff at Cambridge University Press, in particular Finola O'Sullivan, Brenda Burke, Annie Lovett, Jane O'Regan and Philippa Youngman for their hard work and efficiency.

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

## Abbreviations

---

AC	<i>Law Reports, Appeal Cases</i>
AIPJ	<i>Australian Intellectual Property Journal</i>
AIPLA	<i>American Intellectual Property Law Association</i>
All ER	<i>All England Law Reports</i>
ALR	<i>Australian Law Reports</i>
App Cas	<i>Law Reports, Appeal Cases</i>
Atk	<i>Atkyns' Chancery Reports</i>
Bently and Sherman	L. Bently and B. Sherman, <i>Intellectual Property Law</i> (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)
Berne Convention	Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works
BT	Board of Trade
CAB	Cabinet Office
CDPA	Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988
Ch	<i>Law Reports, Chancery Division</i>
Cox	<i>Cox's Equity Cases</i>
CLR	<i>Commonwealth Law Reports</i>
CMLR	<i>Common Market Law Reports</i>
Computer Program Directive	Council Directive 91/250/EEC of 14 May 1991 on the legal protection of computer programs
<i>Copinger</i>	K. Garnett, J. Rayner James and G. Davies (eds.), <i>Copinger and Skone James on Copyright</i> , 14th edn (London: Sweet & Maxwell, 1999)
Cornish and Llewelyn	W. Cornish and D. Llewelyn, <i>Intellectual Property: Patents, Copyright, Trade Marks and Allied</i>

xiv Abbreviations

	<i>Rights</i> , 5th edn (London: Sweet & Maxwell, 2003)
CPR	<i>Canadian Patent Reporter</i>
CrAppR(S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing)
Database Directive	Directive 96/9/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 March 1996 on the Legal Protection of Databases
DR	<i>European Commission of Human Rights Decisions and Reports</i>
<i>Droit de Suite</i> Directive	Directive 2001/84/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 September 2001 on the resale right for the benefit of the author of an original work of art
East	<i>East's Term Reports, King's Bench</i>
ECJ	European Court of Justice
E-Commerce Directive	Directive 2000/31/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 8 June 2000 on certain legal aspects of information society services, in particular electronic commerce, in the internal market
ECR	<i>European Court Reports</i>
EEA	European Economic Area
EGLR	<i>Estates Gazette Law Reports</i>
EHRR	<i>European Human Rights Reports</i>
EIPR	<i>European Intellectual Property Review</i>
EMLR	<i>Entertainment and Media Law Reports</i>
EntLR	<i>Entertainment Law Review</i>
EnvLR	<i>Environmental Law Reports</i>
Esp	<i>Espinasse's Nisi Prius Reports</i>
EU	European Union
EWCA Civ	Court of Appeal Civil Division
F	<i>Federal Reporter</i>
F Supp	<i>Federal Supplement</i>
FCA	Federal Court of Appeal (Canada)
FCT	Federal Court of Canada, Trial Division
FSR	<i>Fleet Street Reports</i>

Guibault	L. Guibault, <i>Copyright Limitations and Contracts: An Analysis of the Contractual Overridability of Limitations on Copyright</i> (The Hague: Kluwer Law International, 2002)
HC	House of Commons
HL	House of Lords
HO	Home Office
IFPI	International Federation of the Phonographic Industry
IIC	<i>International Review of Industrial Property and Copyright Law</i>
Information Society Directive	Directive 2001/29/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 May 2001 on the harmonisation of certain aspects of copyright and related rights in the information society
IPJ	<i>Intellectual Property Journal</i>
IPQ	<i>Intellectual Property Quarterly</i>
IPR	<i>Intellectual Property Reports</i>
KB	<i>Law Reports, King's Bench</i>
Laddie et al., 2nd edn	H. Laddie, P. Prescott and M. Vitoria, <i>The Modern Law of Copyright and Designs</i> , 2nd edn (London: Butterworths, 1998)
Laddie et al., 3rd edn	H. Laddie, P. Prescott, M. Vitoria, A. Speck and L. Lane, <i>The Modern Law of Copyright and Designs</i> , 3rd edn (London: Butterworths, 2000)
LCO	Lord Chancellor's Office
LJ Ch	<i>Law Journal Reports, Chancery</i>
LO	Law Officers' Department
MacCC	<i>MacGillivray's Copyright Cases</i>
NZLR	<i>New Zealand Law Reports</i>
QB	<i>Law Reports, Queen's Bench</i>
Rental Right Directive	Council Directive 92/100/EEC of 19 November 1992 on rental and lending right and on certain rights related to copyright in the field of intellectual property

xvi Abbreviations

Ricketson	S. Ricketson, <i>The Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works</i> (London: Kluwer & QMW, 1987)
RIDA	<i>Revue Internationale Du Droit D'Auteur</i>
RPC	<i>Reports of Patent, Design and Trade Mark Cases</i>
RSC	Revised Statutes of Canada
Russ	<i>Russell's Chancery Reports</i>
SCC	Supreme Court of Canada
SCE	Standing Committee E
Sherman and Bently	B. Sherman and L. Bently, <i>The Making of Modern Intellectual Property</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999)
<i>Shorter OED</i>	<i>The New Shorter Oxford English Dictionary</i> (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993)
SI	Statutory Instrument
SR (NSW)	<i>New South Wales State Reports</i>
Sterling	A. Sterling, <i>World Copyright Law</i> , 2nd edn (London: Sweet & Maxwell, 2003)
Swanston	<i>Swanston's Chancery Reports</i>
Tax Cas	<i>Tax Cases</i>
Term Directive	Council Directive 93/98/EEC of 29 October 1993 harmonizing the term of protection of copyright and certain related rights
TRIPS	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights 1994
TS	Treasury Solicitor
US	<i>United States Supreme Court Reports</i>
USC	United States Code
Vesey	<i>Vesey Junior's Chancery Reports</i>
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization
WIPR	<i>World Intellectual Property Reports</i>
WLR	<i>Weekly Law Reports</i>
WN	<i>Weekly Notes of Cases</i>

## Table of cases

---

- A v. B Plc* [2003] QB 195 85, 101  
*A & M Records v. Napster* 239 F 3d 1004 (2001) 213, 268  
*Acohs v. Bashford Consulting* (1997) 37 IPR 542 99  
*AG v. Guardian Newspapers (No 2)* [1990] 1 AC 109 92, 104, 106  
*AGL Sydney v. Shortland County Council* (1989) 17 IPR 99 266  
*Alcolix* (1994) 25 IIC 605 207, 284  
*American Cyanamid v. Ethicon* [1975] AC 396 100  
*American Geophysical Union v. Texaco* 60 F 3d 913 (1994) 170, 268  
*Ashdown v. Telegraph Group* [2001] Ch 685; [2002] Ch 149 23, 24,  
 31, 53, 54, 55, 92, 93, 94, 100, 101, 103, 180, 189, 239  
*Associated Newspapers Group v. News Group Newspapers* [1986]  
 RPC 515 21, 55, 58  
*Australian Broadcasting Corp. v. Lenah Game Meats* (2001) 185  
 ALR 1 85  
*Autodesk v. Dyason* [1992] RPC 575 262  
*Baner v. Sweden* (1989) 60 DR 128 105  
*Banier v. News Group Newspapers* [1997] FSR 812 45  
*Basic Books v. Kinko's Graphics* 758 F Supp 1522 (1991) 268  
*BBC v. BSB* [1991] 3 All ER 833 54, 59  
*Beggars Banquet v. Carlton* [1993] EMLR 349 88, 100  
*Bell v. Whitehead* (1839) 8 LJ Ch 141 254  
*Beloff v. Pressdram* [1973] 1 All ER 241 31, 43, 81, 83, 98, 242  
*Blair v. Osborne & Tomkins* [1971] 2 QB 78 185  
*Bloomsbury Publishing v. News Group Newspapers* [2003]  
 FSR 842 90  
*Bonnard v. Perryman* [1891] 2 Ch 269 39  
*British Leyland v. Armstrong Patents* [1982] FSR 481; [1986]  
 AC 577 96, 184, 185, 242  
*British Oxygen v. Liquid Air* [1925] 1 Ch 383 47, 261  
*Cala Homes (South) v. Alfred McAlpine Homes East* [1995]  
 FSR 818 23  
*Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music* 114 S Ct 1164 (1994) 28, 264, 268



xviii Table of cases

- Campbell *v.* Frisbee [2003] EMLR 76 85  
 Campbell *v.* MGN [2003] QB 633; [2004] EMLR 247 84, 85, 86  
 Canon Kabushiki Kaisha *v.* Green Cartridge [1997] AC 728 184, 185  
 Cary *v.* Kearsley (1802) 4 Esp 168 254  
 Cary *v.* Longman and Rees (1801) 1 East 358 254  
 CBS Songs *v.* Amstrad [1988] RPC 567 119  
 CCH Canadian *v.* Law Society of Upper Canada [2004] SCC 13 48,  
 58, 117, 118, 119, 173  
 Cellular Clothing *v.* Maxton [1899] AC 326 96  
 Channel Nine *v.* Network Ten (2002) 55 IPR 112 50, 51, 56, 227  
 Chiron Corporation *v.* Organon Teknika (No 10) [1995] FSR 325 98,  
 99  
 Cie générale des établissements Michelin – Michelin & Cie *v.* CAW  
 Canada (1996) 71 CPR (3d) 348 32, 50  
 Collier Constructions *v.* Foskett (1990) 19 IPR 44 94, 95  
 Commonwealth of Australia *v.* Fairfax (1980) 147 CLR 39 31, 48,  
 81, 227  
 Re A Company's Application [1989] Ch 477 86  
 Copyright Licensing *v.* University of Auckland (2002) 53 IPR 618 48,  
 49, 56, 57, 117  
 Cork *v.* McVicar (The Times, 31 October 1984) 83, 86  
 Cornelius *v.* De Taranto [2001] EMLR 329 98  
 Corrs Pavey Whiting & Byrne *v.* Collector of Customs (1987) 10  
 IPR 53 94, 95  
 Cream Holdings *v.* Banerjee [2003] Ch 650 101  
 De Garis *v.* Neville Jeffress Pidler (1990) 18 IPR 292 49, 116, 117  
 Dejonge & Co *v.* Breuker 235 US 33 (1914) 285  
 Dennis *v.* Ministry of Defence [2003] EnvLR 741 99  
 Dennis *v.* United States 341 US 494 (1951) 108  
 Dering *v.* Earl of Winchelsea (1787) 1 Cox 318 95  
 Designers Guild *v.* Russell Williams (Textiles) [2001] FSR 113 22  
 Deutsche Grammophon *v.* Metro [1971] ECR 487 194  
 Distillers *v.* Times Newspapers [1975] QB 613 31, 55  
 Doherty *v.* Allman (1878) 3 App Cas 709 98  
 Donoghue *v.* Allied Newspapers [1938] Ch 106 23  
 Douglas *v.* Hello! (No 1) [2001] QB 967 90, 101  
 Douglas *v.* Hello! (No 5) [2003] EMLR 641 90  
 Eldred *v.* Ashcroft 536 US 186 (2003) 23, 24, 219  
 Eldred *v.* Reno 239 F 3d 372 (2001) 20  
 EMI Electrola *v.* Patricia [1989] ECR 79 194  
 Ernest Turner *v.* PRS [1943] Ch 167 86, 239  
 Express Newspapers *v.* Liverpool Daily Post [1985] FSR 306 262

- Femis-Bank *v.* Lazar [1991] 2 All ER 865 100  
 Football Association Premier League *v.* Panini [2003] FSR 698; [2004] FSR 1 64, 65, 66, 240  
 Francome *v.* Mirror Group Newspapers [1984] 1 WLR 892 86, 87  
 Fraser *v.* Evans [1969] 1 QB 349 81  
 Fraser *v.* Thames TV [1984] QB 44 90  
 Glyn *v.* Weston Feature Film Co [1916] 1 Ch 261 92, 95, 106, 264, 266  
 The Gramophone Co *v.* Leo Feist (1928) 41 CLR 1 257  
 Gyles *v.* Wilcox (1741) 2 Atk 141 254, 255  
 Harbottle *v.* National Westminster Bank [1977] 2 All ER 862 100  
 Harper *v.* Biggs (1907) [1905–1910] MacCC 168 256  
 Harper & Row Publishers *v.* Nation Enterprises 471 US 539 (1985) 20  
 Hawkes and Sons *v.* Paramount [1934] 1 Ch 593 65, 239, 261, 262, 263  
 Heptulla *v.* Orient Longman [1989] FSR 598 23  
 Holley *v.* Smyth [1998] QB 726 39  
 Hubbard *v.* Vosper [1972] 2 QB 84 31, 46, 47, 52, 57, 58, 242, 261  
 Hyde Park *v.* Yelland [1999] RPC 655; [2001] Ch 143 21, 31, 47, 48, 55, 56, 81, 83, 91, 92, 93, 94, 97, 100, 103, 104, 106, 107, 109, 110, 180, 239  
 Ibcos Computers *v.* Barclays Mercantile Highland Finance [1994] FSR 275 22, 23  
 Imutran *v.* Uncaged Campaigns [2001] 2 All ER 385 92  
 Initial Services *v.* Putterill [1968] 1 QB 396 86  
 IPC Magazines *v.* MGN [1998] FSR 431 64, 65  
 Jeffrey *v.* Rolls Royce (1962) 40 Tax Cas 443 104  
 Jersild *v.* Denmark (1995) 19 EHRR 1 37, 59  
 Jockey Club *v.* Buffham [2003] QB 426 83, 86, 87, 101  
 Johnstone *v.* Bernard Jones Publications [1938] Ch 599 262  
 Joy Music *v.* Sunday Pictorial Newspaper [1960] 2 WLR 645 265, 267  
 Re Keene [1922] 2 Ch 475 104  
 Keep Thompson Governor Committee *v.* Citizens for Gallen Committee 457 F Supp 957 (1978) 32  
 Kennaway *v.* Thompson [1981] QB 88 99  
 Kettles and Gas Appliances *v.* Hordern (1934) 35 SR (NSW) 108 96  
 Kingdom of the Netherlands *v.* European Parliament and the Council of the European Union [2001] ECR I-7079 274  
 Lion Laboratories *v.* Evans [1985] QB 526 31, 81, 83, 86, 110, 237, 267

xx Table of cases

- London & Leeds Estates *v.* Paribas (No 2) [1995] 1 EGLR 102 62  
 London Regional Transport *v.* The Mayor of London [2003]  
 EMLR 88 84, 87, 102  
 Ludlow Music *v.* Robbie Williams [2001] FSR 271 262  
 Ludlow Music *v.* Robbie Williams (No 2) [2002] EMLR 585 98  
 M'Beath *v.* Ravenscroft (1839) 8 LJ Ch 208 100  
 Mars *v.* Teknowledge [2000] FSR 138 81, 89, 185  
 Mattel *v.* MCA Records 28 F Supp 2d 1120 (1998) 32  
 Mattel *v.* Pitt 229 F Supp 2d 315 (2002) 32  
 Mattel *v.* Walking Mountain Productions 353 F 3d 792 (2003) 32  
 Mawman *v.* Tegg (1826) 2 Russ 385 254  
 Maxtone-Graham *v.* Burtchaell 803 F 2d 1253 (1986) 32  
 Meeropol *v.* Nizer 417 F Supp 1201 (1976); 560 F 2d 1061  
 (1977) 29, 30  
 Miller *v.* Jackson [1977] 1 QB 966 98, 99  
 Monsanto *v.* Schmeiser [2001] FCT 256; [2002] FCA 309; [2004]  
 SCC 34 186, 187  
 Moorhouse *v.* University of New South Wales (1975) 133  
 CLR 1 119  
 Mothercare *v.* Penguin Books [1988] RPC 113 32  
 Musical Fidelity *v.* Vickers [2003] FSR 898 31, 305  
 Music Vertrieb Membran *v.* GEMA [1981] ECR 147 39, 194  
 Network Ten *v.* Channel Nine [2004] HCA 14 51, 262  
 New Era Publications *v.* Henry Holt 695 F Supp 1493 (1988) 32  
 Newspaper Licensing *v.* Marks and Spencer [2001] Ch 257 48, 54,  
 56, 57, 240  
 News Verlags *v.* Austria (2001) 31 EHRR 8 23, 24  
 Newton *v.* Diamond 349 F 3d 591 (2003) 262  
 Nine Network Australia *v.* Australian Broadcasting Corp (1999) 48 IPR  
 333 54, 56  
 Noah *v.* Shuba [1991] FSR 14 45  
 Nottinghamshire Healthcare *v.* News Group Newspapers [2002] RPC  
 962 98  
 Parfums Christian Dior *v.* Evora [1998] RPC 166 104  
 Pasterfield *v.* Denham [1999] FSR 168 78  
 PCR *v.* Dow Jones Telerate [1998] FSR 170 81, 86  
 Penguin Books *v.* India Book Distributors [1985] FSR 120 96  
 Pepper *v.* Hart [1993] AC 593 245  
 Plix Products *v.* Frank M Winstone (Merchants) [1986] FSR 63 22  
 PPL *v.* Maitra [1998] 1 WLR 870 98  
 Princeton University Press *v.* Michigan Document Services 99 F 3d  
 1381 (1996) 170, 268

## Table of cases

xxi

- Pro Sieben v. Carlton* [1998] FSR 43; [1999] FSR 610 43, 48, 49, 50, 52, 53, 54, 55, 60, 274
- Queen v. James Lorimer & Co* (1984) 77 CPR 2d 262 81
- R v. Carter* [1993] FSR 303 239
- R v. Dukett* [1998] 2 CrAppR(S) 59 239
- Raleigh Cycle v. Miller* (1949) 66 RPC 23 98
- Ravenscroft v. Herbert* [1980] RPC 193 23
- Rogers v. Koons* 960 F 2d 301 (1992) 26, 28, 50
- Ruckelshaus v. Monsanto* 467 US 986 (1984) 105
- San Francisco Arts and Athletics Club v. US Olympic Committee* 483 US 522 (1987) 27
- Sayre v. Moore* (1785, decision reproduced in *Cary v. Longman* (1801) 1 East 358) 254
- Schnapper v. Foley* 471 F Supp 426 (1979) 20
- School Books* (1972) 3 IIC 394 203, 204
- Schweppes v. Wellingtons* [1984] FSR 210 265
- Series 5 Software v. Clarke* [1996] 1 All ER 853 100
- Service Corp v. Channel 4* [1999] EMLR 83 81, 83
- Shelfer v. City of London Electric Lighting Co* [1895] 1 Ch 287 98, 99
- Shelley Films v. Rex Features* [1994] EMLR 134 90
- Sid & Marty Krofft Television v. McDonald's* 562 F 2d 1157 (1977) 20
- Silhouette v. Hartlauer* [1998] 2 CMLR 953 180
- Sillitoe v. McGraw Hill Book Co* [1983] FSR 545 59, 261
- Silver Thistle* (1997) 28 IIC 140 207
- Skybase Nominees v. Fortuity* (1996) 36 IPR 529 21
- Slingsby v. Bradford Patent Truck* [1906] WN 51 106
- SmithKline & French v. Department of Community Services and Health* [1990] FSR 617 94, 95
- Solar Thompson v. Barton* [1977] RPC 537 100, 185
- Re a Solicitor* (5 November 1996) (Court of Appeal) (*Lexis Transcript*) 88
- Sony Corp v. Universal City Studios* 464 US 417 (1984) 268
- Stovin-Bradford v. Volpoint* [1971] Ch 1007 185
- Suntrust Bank v. Houghton Mifflin Co* 268 F 3d 1257 (2001) 41, 50
- Television New Zealand v. Newsmonitor Services* [1994] 2 NZLR 91 117, 119
- Theakston v. MGN* [2002] EMLR 398 85, 101
- Theophanous v. Herald & Weekly Times* (1994) 182 CLR 104 37
- Tidy v. Natural History Museum* (1998) 39 IPR 501 78
- Time v. Bernard Geis* 293 F Supp 130 (1968) 25

xxii Table of cases

- Times Newspapers *v.* MGN [1993] EMLR 442 89, 91  
 Time Warner *v.* Channel 4 [1994] EMLR 1 52, 274  
 Trebor Bassett *v.* The Football Association [1997] FSR 211 66  
 Tucker *v.* News Media Ownership [1986] 2 NZLR 716 85  
 United Wire *v.* Screen Repair Services [2000] 4 All ER 353 185  
 Universities UK *v.* Copyright Licensing Agency [2002] EMLR 693  
 133, 134, 135, 239  
 University of London Press *v.* University Tutorial Press [1916]  
 2 Ch 601 242, 260  
 W *v.* Egdell [1990] 1 Ch 359 97  
 Walt Disney *v.* Air Pirates 581 F 2d 751 (1978) 25, 41  
 Warner Bros *v.* Christiansen [1988] ECR 2605 194  
 Whittingham *v.* Wooler (1817) 2 Swanst 428 254  
 Wigginton *v.* Brisbane TV (1992) 25 IPR 58 227  
 Wilkins *v.* Aikin (1810) 17 Ves 422 254  
 Williams *v.* Settle [1960] 1 WLR 1072 98  
 Williamson Music *v.* The Pearson Partnership [1987] FSR 97 50, 266  
 Woodward *v.* Hutchins [1977] 1 WLR 760 85  
 Woolgar *v.* Chief Constable of the Sussex Police [2000] 1 WLR 25 86,  
 87, 88  
 World Wildlife Fund *v.* World Wrestling Federation Entertainment  
 [2003] EWCA Civ 401 99  
 Wrotham Park *v.* Parkside Homes [1974] 1 WLR 798 98  
 Zamacois *v.* Douville [1943] 2 DLR 257 58  
 ZYX Music *v.* King [1995] FSR 566 106

## Table of statutes

---

### United Kingdom

- |   |                    |
|---|--------------------|
| Broadcasting Act 1996   | Copyright Act 1956 |
| s. 137 54, 69, 307  | s. 6(1) 232        |
| Copyright Act 1842  | s. 6(2) 110        |
| s. 15 256   | s. 7 153           |
|   | s. 7(5) 156        |
|   | s. 9 232           |
|   | s. 9(3) 234        |
|   | s. 9(4) 234        |
| Copyright Act 1911  |                    |
| s. 2(1) 234   | s. 15 157          |
| s. 2(1)(i) 258, 259   | s. 19 231          |
| s. 2(1)(iii) 234  | s. 25(1) 257       |
| s. 2(1)(iv) 124   |                    |
| Copyright and Related Rights Regulations 1996 (SI 1996 No 2967)   |                    |
| reg. 35 159   |                    |
| Copyright and Related Rights Regulations 2003 (SI 2003 No 2498)   |                    |
| 128, 136  |                    |
| Copyright (Application of Provisions relating to Educational Establishments to Teachers) (No 2) Order 1989 (SI 1989 No 1067)  |                    |
| 120   |                    |
| Copyright (Certification of Licensing Scheme for Educational Recording of Broadcasts and Cable Programmes) (Educational Recording Agency Limited) Order 1990 (SI 1990 No 879) |                    |
| 128   |                    |
| Copyright (Certification of Licensing Scheme for Educational Recording of Broadcasts) (Open University) Order 2003 (SI 2003 No 187)   |                    |
| 128   |                    |

xxiv Table of statutes

Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988

- |             |                                     |             |  |
|-------------|-------------------------------------|-------------|--|
| s. 3(3)     | 63                                  | s. 32(5)    | 231  |
| s. 4(2)     | 44                                  | s. 33       | 120, 124                                       |
| s. 9(2)(ab) | 60                                  | s. 33(1)    | 124  |
| s. 9(3)     | 44                                  | s. 33(2)    | 124  |
| s. 11(2)    | 44                                  | s. 33(3)    | 123  |
| s. 18       | 133, 198                            | s. 34       | 120, 123, 125, 182, 295,<br>302                |
| s. 18(2)    | 47                                  | s. 34(1)    | 125  |
| s. 18A(2)   | 126, 158                            | s. 34(2)    | 125, 127                                       |
| s. 28(1)    | 69                                  | s. 34(3)    | 125  |
| s. 28A      | 76, 150, 301                        | s. 35       | 120, 125, 127, 129,<br>170                     |
| s. 29       | 42, 115, 116, 119, 152,<br>153, 198 | s. 35(1)    | 127  |
| s. 29(1)    | 115, 237                            | s. 35(1A)   | 127  |
| s. 29(1B)   | 115                                 | s. 35(2)    | 222  |
| s. 29(1C)   | 116                                 | s. 36       | 120, 127, 128, 129,<br>170                     |
| s. 29(2)    | 116                                 | s. 36(1A)   | 128  |
| s. 29(3)    | 152                                 | s. 36(1B)   | 128  |
| s. 29(3)(b) | 116, 117, 118                       | s. 36(3)    | 128, 129, 222                                  |
| s. 30       | 43                                  | s. 36A      | 120, 126, 158, 159,<br>295, 302                |
| s. 30(1)    | 43, 46, 60                          | ss. 37–44A  | 136  |
| s. 30(1A)   | 43, 46, 47, 121                     | s. 37       | 142  |
| s. 30(2)    | 60, 207                             | s. 37(2)(a) | 146  |
| s. 30(3)    | 60                                  | s. 38       | 142, 145, 147, 148, 149,<br>150, 151, 153, 159 |
| s. 31       | 299                                 | s. 38(1)    | 148  |
| s. 31(1)    | 64                                  | s. 38(2)(b) | 148  |
| s. 31(3)    | 65                                  | s. 38(2)(c) | 148  |
| ss. 31A–C   | 237                                 | s. 39       | 142, 145, 147, 148, 149,<br>150, 151, 153, 159 |
| ss. 31A–F   | 299                                 | s. 39(2)(b) | 148  |
| ss. 31B–C   | 222                                 | s. 40       | 152  |
| ss. 31B–D   | 170                                 | s. 40(2)(a) | 146  |
| s. 31D      | 222                                 | s. 40(2)(b) | 147  |
| ss. 32–36A  | 120                                 | s. 40A      | 142, 145, 158, 295,<br>302                     |
| s. 32       | 120, 121, 122, 123, 230,<br>240     | s. 40A(1)   | 158  |
| s. 32(1)    | 121                                 | s. 40A(2)   | 158, 159                                       |
| s. 32(2)    | 122                                 | s. 41       | 142, 145, 154, 155                             |
| s. 32(2A)   | 121                                 |             |  |
| s. 32(2B)   | 121                                 |             |  |
| s. 32(3)    | 124, 300                            |             |  |
| s. 32(3A)   | 123                                 |             |  |
| s. 32(4)    | 123                                 |             |  |

## Table of statutes

xxv

- |             |                                      |              |   |
|-------------|--------------------------------------|--------------|---|
| s. 42       | 142, 145, 155, 156                   | s. 62(2)     | 233                                     |
| s. 42(1)    | 156                                  | s. 62(3)     | 233                                     |
| s. 42(2)    | 155                                  | s. 63        | 160, 162, 299                           |
| s. 43       | 142, 145, 146, 150, 151,<br>152, 153 | s. 63(1)     | 162                                     |
| s. 43(2)(b) | 151                                  | s. 63(2)     | 162                                     |
| s. 43(3)(a) | 151                                  | s. 64        | 66                                      |
| s. 43(3)(b) | 151                                  | s. 65        | 70, 185, 233, 299                       |
| s. 43(3)(c) | 151                                  | s. 66        | 159, 302                                |
| s. 44       | 136, 142, 145, 159, 302              | s. 66A       | 182                                     |
| s. 44A      | 142, 145, 157, 237                   | s. 68        | 5, 299                                  |
| s. 44A(1)   | 157                                  | s. 69        | 5                                       |
| s. 44A(2)   | 157                                  | s. 70        | 198, 233                                |
| ss. 45–46   | 62                                   | s. 71        | 198                                     |
| s. 45(2)    | 63                                   | ss. 73–73A   | 5, 302                                  |
| s. 46(2)    | 63                                   | s. 74        | 170, 222, 299                           |
| s. 46(4)    | 62                                   | s. 74(4)     | 222                                     |
| s. 47       | 160                                  | s. 75        | 141, 160, 161                           |
| s. 47(1)    | 160                                  | s. 75(1)     | 161                                     |
| s. 47(2)    | 160                                  | s. 80        | 77                                      |
| s. 47(3)    | 160                                  | s. 80(2)(a)  | 77                                      |
| s. 48       | 88                                   | s. 80(2)(b)  | 78                                      |
| s. 49       | 136, 160, 161                        | s. 80(3)–(6) | 78                                      |
| s. 50(1)    | 87                                   | s. 80(5)     | 186                                     |
| ss. 50A–C   | 5, 235, 237                          | s. 118       | 133                                     |
| ss. 50A–D   | 300                                  | s. 119       | 133                                     |
| s. 50B      | 5, 116                               | ss. 135A–G   | 6                                       |
| s. 50BA     | 116                                  | s. 137       | 129                                     |
| ss. 51–53   | 5, 302                               | ss. 138–140  | 129                                     |
| ss. 54–55   | 5, 182, 302                          | s. 143       | 127                                     |
| s. 56       | 5                                    | s. 143(2)    | 128                                     |
| s. 57       | 182                                  | s. 163(1)    | 44                                      |
| s. 58       | 63, 87, 237, 285                     | s. 171(3)    | 81, 237, 241                            |
| s. 58(1)    | 163                                  | s. 172(3)    | 243                                     |
| s. 59       | 123, 302                             | s. 174       | 120                                     |
| s. 60       | 170, 222, 237                        | s. 178       | 60, 62, 118, 122, 148,<br>149, 158, 231 |
| s. 60(2)    | 222                                  | s. 253       | 301                                     |
| s. 61       | 141, 160, 161                        | s. 296A      | 69, 307                                 |
| s. 61(2)(c) | 161                                  | s. 296B      | 69, 307                                 |
| s. 61(3)    | 152                                  | s. 296ZE     | 306                                     |
| s. 61(4)    | 161                                  | s. 296ZE(2)  | 74                                      |
| s. 62       | 233, 234, 299, 300                   | s. 296ZE(3)  | 74                                      |



xxvi Table of statutes

- |                      |     |                    |          |
|----------------------|-----|--------------------|----------|
| Sched. 1, para. 1(3) | 153 | Sched. 1, para. 16 | 150, 153 |
| Sched. 1, para. 3    | 150 | Sched. 5A          | 74, 306  |
- Copyright (Educational Establishments) (No 2) Order 1989 (SI 1989 No 1068) 120
- The Copyright (Librarians and Archivists) (Copying of Copyright Material) Regulations 1989 (SI 1989 No 1212)
- |                  |               |                  |          |
|------------------|---------------|------------------|----------|
| reg. 3(1)        | 148           | reg. 5(2)(b)     | 154      |
| reg. 3(2)        | 151, 154, 155 | reg. 5(2)(c)     | 154, 155 |
| reg. 3(3)        | 154, 155      | reg. 6(2)(a)     | 155      |
| reg. 3(4)        | 151, 155      | reg. 6(2)(b)     | 155      |
| reg. 3(5)        | 148           | reg. 6(2)(c)     | 155      |
| reg. 4(2)(b)(i)  | 146           | reg. 6(2)(d)     | 155      |
| reg. 4(2)(b)(ii) | 147           | reg. 7(2)(a)(i)  | 151      |
| reg. 4(2)(c)(i)  | 148           | reg. 7(2)(b)     | 151      |
| reg. 4(2)(c)(ii) | 148           | reg. 7(2)(c)     | 151      |
| reg. 4(2)(d)     | 148           | Sched. 1, Part A | 148, 155 |
| reg. 4(3)        | 146           | Sched. 2         | 145      |
| reg. 5(2)(a)     | 154, 155      |                  |          |
- Copyright (Recording for Archives of Designated Class of Broadcasts and Cable Programmes) (Designated Bodies) Order 1993 (SI 1993 No 74) 161
- Copyright (Recording of Folksongs for Archives) (Designated Bodies) Order 1989 (SI 1989 No 1012)
- reg. 3(2) 161
- Electronic Commerce (EC Directive) Regulations 2002 (SI 2002 No 2013)
- |         |    |                |    |
|---------|----|----------------|----|
| reg. 2  | 76 | reg. 19        | 76 |
| reg. 17 | 76 | reg. 19(a)(i)  | 77 |
| reg. 18 | 76 | reg. 19(a)(ii) | 77 |
- Government of Wales Act 1998 161
- Human Rights Act 1998
- s. 12 100, 101
- s. 12(3) 101
- s. 12(4) 101
- Legal Deposit Libraries Act 2003
- s. 6 157
- s. 7 157
- s. 9 160

Limitation Act 1980	
s. 2	147
Patents Act 1977	
s. 70	301
Public Lending Right Act 1979	158
Public Records Act 1958	161
Public Records Act (Northern Ireland) 1923	161
Public Records (Scotland) Act 1937	161
Registered Designs Act 1949	
s. 26	301
Trade Marks Act 1994	
s. 21	301
Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations 1999 (SI 1999 No 2083)	
reg. 5(1)	69

### European Union legislation

Computer Program Directive	Art. 14(1)(a)	77
Art. 5	235	
Art. 6	235	
Art. 9(1)	69, 307	
Database Directive	Art. 14(1)(b)	77
Art. 6(1)	307	
Art. 8(1)	307	
<i>Droit de Suite</i> Directive	Information Society Directive	
recital 5	200	
Art. 3	303	
Art. 4	303	
Art. 8	195	
Art. 10	195	
E-Commerce Directive	recital 9	200
recital 17	76	
Art. 2	76	
Art. 12	76	
Art. 13	76	
Art. 14	76	
	recital 12	196
	recital 16	300
	recital 20	300
	recital 35	292
	recital 37	292
	recital 40	144
	recital 42	293
	recital 60	302
	Art. 1(2)	300
	Art. 5(1)	214, 301
	Art. 5(2)(a)	288, 290, 291, 292, 295, 308
	Art. 5(2)(b)	288, 290, 291, 292, 309
	Art. 5(2)(c)	144, 288, 295, 308

## xxviii Table of statutes

Art. 5(2)(d)	299, 308	Art. 5(3)(m)	299
Art. 5(2)(e)	308	Art. 5(3)(n)	144, 289, 296
Art. 5(3)(a)	289, 293, 294, 295, 308	Art. 5(3)(o)	277, 302
Art. 5(3)(b)	299, 308	Art. 5(4)	282, 288, 289
Art. 5(3)(c)	214, 282, 284, 285, 287	Art. 5(5)	298
Art. 5(3)(d)	282, 283, 286	Art. 6	3, 308
Art. 5(3)(e)	107, 283, 285, 308	Art. 6(4)	307, 308, 309
Art. 5(3)(f)	283, 285	Art. 9	108, 158, 287, 306
Art. 5(3)(g)	303	Rental Right Directive	
Art. 5(3)(h)	299	Art. 5	303
Art. 5(3)(i)	299, 300	Art. 5(1)	158
Art. 5(3)(j)	162, 299, 300	Art. 5(3)	126, 158
Art. 5(3)(k)	283, 284	Term Directive	196
		recital 9	200

**Foreign legislation***Australia*

Copyright Act 1905	
s. 28	257, 258
Copyright Act 1912	257
Copyright Act 1968	
s. 10	228
ss. 40–73	249
s. 40	227
s. 40(2)	228
s. 40(3)	228
s. 42	227
ss. 103A–112E	249
s. 103B	227
s. 103C	227
s. 103C(2)	228
s. 202	301

*Austria*

Copyright Act 1936	23
--------------------	----

*Canada*

Copyright Act, RSC 1985	
ss. 29–30.9	249
ss. 31–32.2	249

*France*

Intellectual Property Code 1992	
Art. 122(5)	49, 284

*Germany*

Basic Law	
Art. 14	203, 204
Copyright Act 1965	
Art. 24(1)	49, 207, 284
Art. 45	206
Art. 45a	206
Art. 46	206
Art. 47	206
Art. 48	206
Art. 49(1)	206

## Table of statutes

xxix

Art. 49(2) 206

Art. 50 206

Art. 51 206

Art. 52a 206

Art. 53(1) 205

Art. 53(2) 205

Art. 53(2)(1) 205

Art. 53(2)(2) 205

Art. 53(2)(3) 205

*India*

Copyright Act 1957  
 ss. 52(1)(a)–(za) 249

*New Zealand*

Copyright Act 1994  
 ss. 40–92 249

*Singapore*

Copyright Act 1987  
 ss. 35–74 249

*South Africa*

Copyright Act 1978  
 ss. 12–19B 249

*Spain*

Copyright Act 1996  
 Art. 39 284

*United States*

Constitution of the United States  
 Art. 1, cl. 8 (the ‘copyright  
 clause’)  
 First Amendment 2, 8, 18, 19,  
 20, 26, 33  
 Fifth Amendment 105  
 Copyright Act 1976 (17 USC)  
 s. 107 4, 249  
 s. 108(a)–(i) 249  
 s. 1201(a)(1) 270

**International instruments**

Berne Convention 1886  
 Art. 8 2

Berne Convention 1971  
 Art. 9(2) 2, 106, 216  
 Art. 10(1) 286  
 Art. 10bis(2) 65, 285  
 Art. 17 106

European Convention on the  
 Protection of Human Rights  
 and Fundamental Freedoms 1950  
 Art. 8 85, 109  
 Art. 10 23, 109  
 Art. 10(2) 34

Prot. 1, Art. 1 105  
 TRIPS 1994  
 Art. 7 187, 218, 271  
 Art. 8 218, 271  
 Art. 10 106  
 Art. 13 2, 217, 271  
 WIPO Copyright Treaty 1996  
 Preamble 188  
 Art. 11 3, 74  
 WIPO Performances and  
 Phonograms Treaty 1996  
 Preamble 188  
 Art. 18 3, 74