

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE WORLD HITLER NEVER MADE

What if the Nazis had triumphed in World War II? What if Adolf Hitler had escaped Berlin for the jungles of Latin America in 1945? What if Hitler had become a successful artist instead of a politician? Gavriel D. Rosenfeld's pioneering study explores why such counterfactual questions on the subject of Nazism have proliferated in recent years within Western popular culture. Examining a wide range of novels, short stories, films, television programs, plays, comic books, and scholarly essays that have appeared in Great Britain, the United States, and Germany since 1945, Rosenfeld shows how the portrayal of historical events that *never* happened reflects the evolving memory of the Third Reich's real historical legacy. He concludes that the shifting representation of Nazism in works of alternate history, as well as the popular reactions to them, highlights their subversive role in promoting the normalization of the Nazi past in Western memory.

GAVRIEL D. ROSENFELD is Associate Professor of History at Fairfield University (Connecticut). He is a specialist in the history and memory of the Third Reich and the Holocaust. His previous publications include *Munich and Memory: Architecture, Monuments, and the Legacy of the Third Reich* (2000).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE WORLD HITLER NEVER MADE

Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

GAVRIEL D. ROSENFELD



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521847063

© Gavriel D. Rosenfeld 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-84706-3 Hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2009

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
Introduction	I
PART I THE NAZIS WIN WORLD WAR II	
Comparative overview	29
1. Great Britain defeated: between resistance and collaboration	34
2. The United States and the dilemmas of military intervention	95
3. Germany's wartime triumph: from dystopia to normalcy	161
4. Other nations: a dissenting view	187
Comparative conclusions	195
PART II ALTERNATE HITLERS	
5. The fugitive Führer and the search for justice	199
6. The world without Hitler: better or worse?	271

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

PART III HYPOTHETICAL HOLOCAUSTS

7. Hypothetical Holocausts and the mistrust of memory	333
Conclusion	374
<i>Notes</i>	398
<i>Bibliography</i>	492
<i>Appendix: Alternate histories by theme, era, nation, and medium</i>	510
<i>Index</i>	519

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of illustrations*

1. Scene from the 1947 play *Peace in Our Time*. (Source: John Knowles, the Noël Coward Society). 43
2. *TV Times* cover featuring the 1964 film *The Other Man*.
Used by permission of IPC tx Limited. 53
3. Still from the 1964 film *It Happened Here*. Used by permission
of Kevin Brownlow. 56
4. Page from *Britain Invaded* (1990). Used by permission of The
Trustees of the Imperial War Museum, London (negative
number HU36121). 73
5. Cover of *Fatherland* by Robert Harris (© 1992 by Random House,
Inc.). Used by permission of Random House, Inc. 78
6. Illustration of Hitler in Washington D.C. from the 1940 novel
Lightning in the Night by Fred Allhoff. © Liberty Library
Corporation. 98
7. Cover of *The Man in the High Castle* by Philip K. Dick (© 1962
by Philip K. Dick). Used by permission of G. P. Putnam's Sons,
a division of Penguin Group (USA) Inc. 105
8. Cover of *Justice League of America* Nr. 107 © 1973 DC Comics.
All Rights Reserved. Used with permission. 114
9. Still from the *Saturday Night Live* television skit,
"What If: Überman" (1979). 136
10. Image taken from *The Philadelphia Experiment II* provided
through the courtesy of Lions Gate Entertainment. 141
11. Still from the 1994 film *Fatherland*. 143
12. Cover of *The Plot against America: A Novel* by Philip Roth.
© Philip Roth. Reprinted by permission of Houghton Mifflin
Company. All rights reserved. 153

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

List of illustrations

13. Cover of *Wenn Adolf Hitler den Krieg nicht gewonnen hätte* (1979) by Helmut Heissenbüttel. Cover design by Heinz Edelmann. Used by permission of Verlag Klett-Cotta. 167
14. Page from *Strange Adventures* Nr. 3 © 1950 DC Comics. All Rights Reserved. Used with permission. 204
15. Cover of *T-Man*, issue Nr. 34 (1956). 206
16. Still from the television episode “The Master Plan of Dr. Fu Manchu” (1956). Used by permission of Alpha Video. 210
17. Still from the *Twilight Zone* episode “He’s Alive!” (1963). Courtesy of CBS Broadcasting Inc. 215
18. Cover of *Who Will Watch the Watchers?* by Edwin J. Fadiman (1970). Used by permission of Little, Brown. 222
19. Cover of *The Portage to San Cristóbal of A.H.* (1981). Reprinted with the permission of Simon & Schuster Adult Publishing Group from THE PORTAGE TO SAN CRISTÓBAL OF A.H. by George Steiner. Copyright © 1981 by George Steiner. 228
20. Still from the 1996 film *The Empty Mirror*. Used with permission of Walden Woods Film Company. 255
21. Page from the comic book *Adolf die Nazi-Sau* (1998–99). © Eichborn Verlag AG, Frankfurt am Main, Mai 1998. 260
22. Cover of *Elleander Morning* (1984). 275
23. Cover of *The Iron Dream* (1972). 288
24. Cover of *Making History* by Stephen Fry (© 1996 by Random House, Inc.). Used by permission of Random House, Inc. 299
25. Still from the *Twilight Zone* episode “Cradle of Darkness” (2002). 306
26. Cover of issue Nr. 292 of the comic book *The Fantastic Four* (1986). 323
27. Cover of *After Dachau* by Daniel Quinn (2001). 337
28. Cover of *Die Stimmen der Nacht* by Thomas Ziegler (1984). 347

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

One evening while nearing the completion of this study, I was finishing dinner at a Chinese restaurant in midtown Manhattan when I opened a fortune cookie and read the message: “It’s not helpful to wonder what might have been.” Had I taken such an admonition to heart, I never would have been able to finish this book. But I also never would have done so without the assistance of numerous persons and institutions.

I would like to thank Fairfield University for a third-year sabbatical grant, which provided me with a semester free of teaching that enabled me to complete an important portion of my research and writing. Special thanks go to my department chair, David McFadden, for steadfastly supporting my research proposals, to Harold Forsythe for passing along several tips on sources, and to Cecelia Bucki and Patricia Behre-Miskimin for patiently indulging my own speculations in the department hallway. I would also like to thank the students in my upper-level seminar on alternate history, all of whom contributed to my understanding of the subject. I owe a special debt of gratitude to John Cayer, the director of Fairfield’s DiMenna-Nyselius Library’s interlibrary loan office, who was unfailingly helpful in securing obscure source material and always a joy to chat with. And finally, I would like to thank Peter Sarawit at the media center for helping me to produce digital images from VHS tapes for many of the book’s illustrations.

I am also grateful to scholars at other institutions. Particular thanks go to Alon Confino, Saul Friedländer, Paul Miller, and Eugene Sheppard, who read various portions of the manuscript and offered perceptive comments that helped me refine my thoughts. I would especially like to thank my father, Alvin Rosenfeld, for his careful copyediting and thoughtful stylistic suggestions. Thanks also go to Volker Berghahn, Noel Cary, Marion Deshmukh, Alexandra Garbarini, Jeffrey Herf, Wulf Kansteiner, Michael Rothberg, Kristin Semmens, and Denise Youngblood, for participating in conference panels at which selected chapters from the book were presented.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to the American Historical Association, the German Studies Association, and the Association for Jewish Studies, for permitting me to present portions of my research at the organizations' annual conferences. Thanks also to Vicki Caron and Cornell University, as well as Jonathan Petropoulos, John Roth, and Claremont McKenna College for inviting me to speak on my research. I would also like to thank Peter Baldwin, Paula Hyman, Ned Lebow, Peter Mandler, Gary Kenneth Peatling, Dirk Rupnow, Jeffrey Weidlinger, and Jay Winter for providing answers to questions that arose during the course of research and writing, and for their general interest in my work.

In conducting the research for this book it was a real pleasure to come into contact and exchange ideas with the producers of the sources themselves. My most grateful thanks go to writers Jesse Bier, Michel Choquette, Christian v. Dittfurth, David Dvorkin, Al Franken, Gary Goss, Richard Grayson, Joseph Heywood, Brad Linaweaver, Arno Lubos, E. M. Nathanson, Kamran Pasha, Hans Pleschinski, Craig Raine, Arthur Rhodes, Leo Rutman, Norman Spinrad, Sabine Wedemeyer-Schwiersch, Len Wein, and Thomas Ziegler for offering personal insights into their own work. Thanks to playwright Robert Krakow for sending me both video and print copies of his play, *The False Witness*, and to scholars Adrian Gilbert, John Lukacs, Bruce Russett, Hugh Thomas, and Henry Turner for responding to various questions of mine.

Writing this book has also been a gratifying experience insofar as it has confirmed the old adage about the "comfort of strangers." In the course of my research I cast countless inquiries out into the heavily populated void of cyberspace like so many digitized messages in a bottle, hoping they would be found and answered. I was extremely gratified that numerous individuals, all unknown to me beforehand, responded with generosity and provided indispensable assistance by sending me copies of source material and answering tough questions. They include: Bill Black and Mark Heike of AC Comics for sending me a photocopy of the comic book *T-Man*, Issue Nr. 34 from 1956; Nick Cooper for sending me extremely rare tapes of *An Englishman's Castle*, as well as helpful information about Giles Cooper; Sean Delaney at the British Film Institute for sending me hard-to-find reviews of *The Other Man*, *An Englishman's Castle*, and *Night Conspirators*; Ida Heissenbüttel for faxing me reviews of her late husband's work; and Mark Squirek for generously sending me a scan of the 1950 *Strange Adventures* tale, "The Strange Fate of Adolph Hitler." I received other reviews from Frjthoff Müller of the *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, John Knowles of the Noël Coward Society, Matthias Seeberg at *Konkret* magazine, Beate

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xi

Volkenrath at the Institut für Zeitungsforschung in Dortmund, Monika Klein at the Innsbrücker Zeitungsarchiv, Esther-Beatrice von Bruchhausen at Eichborn Verlag, Friedel Wahren and Martina Geissler at the Lektorat Science Fiction/Fantasy, Sascha Mamczak at Heyne Verlag, Anne Zauner at the Dokumentationsstelle für neuere österreichische Literatur, Ray Russell at Tartarus Press, and the Science Fiction Versand Wolfgang Kratz. I am also grateful to Max Brooks for background information on *Saturday Night Live*. Finally, Anna Charin, Eli Eshed, Barton Hacker, Charles Mitchell, and Robert Schmunk were helpful in responding to various questions of mine.

I benefited not merely from helpful strangers, however, but also good friends who provided assistance at various stages of my research and writing. I would like to thank Melissa Clark for sending me a videotape of the *Twilight Zone* episode, “Cradle of Darkness”; Johannes Schmidt for sending me a copy of the hard-to-find film, *Conversation with the Beast*; and Felix Singer for providing technical help in producing additional digital images from VHS tapes for some of the book’s illustrations. Thanks also go to Miranda Banks and Sidney Rosenfeld for assisting me with several thorny research questions. Finally, longtime colleagues Dani Eshet, Josh Goode, Ethan Kleinberg, Dave McBride, and Adam Rubin deserve mention for providing years of loyal friendship and intellectual camaraderie.

It is a pleasure to express my gratitude to the wonderful staff at Cambridge University Press for their assistance in bringing the present volume into existence. Michael Watson was unfailingly helpful in responding to my countless questions and in facilitating the editing and production process. Elizabeth Davey provided timely advice and was extremely resourceful in securing the rights to reproduce many of the book’s images. Isabelle Dambricourt, likewise, was very helpful coordinating much of the publication process. Christopher Jackson deserves special thanks for his meticulous copy-editing. And I would also like to thank the two anonymous readers who offered many worthwhile suggestions and encouraged me with their enthusiasm for the manuscript.

For obvious reasons I cannot offer any personal thanks to the internet, but I owe it a substantial debt of gratitude for enabling me to conduct an enormous amount of the research for this project. Indeed, I sometimes wonder whether I would have been able to write this study at all without its existence. My family, in particular, is thankful that this wonderful research tool enabled me to conduct much of my work at home instead of having to take long trips out of town. That being said, I did make several research visits to various archives and libraries, where I completed research the

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-84706-3 - The World Hitler Never Made: Alternate History and the Memory of Nazism

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

Acknowledgments

old-fashioned way – by carefully reading through it. I would like to acknowledge the many helpful individuals at these institutions, in particular, Volker Kaukoreit and Peter Seda at the Österreichisches Literaturarchiv in Vienna, as well as the library staffs at the Academy of Motion Pictures' Center for Motion Picture Study in Beverly Hills, California, the University of California at Los Angeles's Young Research Library, Loyola Marymount University's Von der Ahe Library, Cornell University's Low Library, Columbia University's Butler Library, Yale University's Sterling Library, and Indiana University's Lilly Library.

Finally, I owe more than just a word of thanks to my family. My wife, Erika Banks, patiently listened to me expound upon my theories of alternate history in their roughest form and made the ultimate sacrifice by sitting through portions of the film *They Saved Hitler's Brain*. My children, Julia and Benjamin, meanwhile, were always eager to offer welcome respites from the long hours of research and writing. For providing the love and emotional support that only a family can, I dedicate this work to them.