

On the Rule of Law

The rule of law is the most important political ideal today, yet there is much confusion about what it means and how it works. This book explores the history, politics, and theory surrounding the rule of law ideal, beginning with classical Greek and Roman ideas, elaborating on medieval contributions to the rule of law, and articulating the role played by the rule of law in liberal theory and liberal political systems. The author outlines the concerns of Western conservatives about the decline of the rule of law and suggests reasons why the radical Left have promoted this decline. Two basic theoretical streams of the rule of law are then presented, with an examination of the strengths and weaknesses of each. The book examines the rule of law on a global level, and concludes by answering the question of whether the rule of law is a universal human good.

BRIAN Z. TAMANAHA is Chief Judge Benjamin N. Cardozo Professor of Law at St. John's University School of Law. He has written awardwinning books in legal theory, and published widely in leading journals. He is Associate Editor of the Law and Society Review.



On the Rule of Law

History, Politics, Theory

Brian Z. Tamanaha





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Brian Z. Tamanaha 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Plantin 10/12 pt. System \LaTeX 2 ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 84362 6 hardback ISBN 0 521 60465 6 paperback



For Honorata

"Oni"



Contents

	Acknowledgments	page viii
	Introduction	1
1	Classical origins	7
2	Medieval roots	15
3	Liberalism	32
4	Locke, Montesquieu, the Federalist Papers	47
5	Conservatives warn	60
6	Radical left encourages decline	73
7	Formal theories	91
8	Substantive theories	102
9	Three themes	114
10	International level	127
11	A universal human good?	137
	Notes Bibliography	142 163
	Index	175

vii



Acknowledgments

For helpful comments on earlier drafts of this book, I thank Jeff Sovern, Paul Kirgis, three anonymous Readers for Cambridge University Press, and two anonymous Readers procured by John Tryneski. Their critical observations helped me tighten the argument, fill in gaps, and rectify flaws. The faculties at Hofstra Law School and the University of Pennsylvania Law School invited me to present parts of this book; I thank them for their feedback. I thank Chris Borgen for his invaluable assistance with Chapter Ten. I thank Michael Freeman for inviting me to present a Public Lecture at University College London on one of the themes taken up in this book, later published as "The Rule of Law for Everyone?" in volume 55 of Current Legal Problems (2002). I thank William Twining for several days of intensive intellectual exchange at two separate, crucial periods in the writing of this book. William has influenced this book as well as everything else I have written or thought about in legal theory since I had the good fortune to meet him. I owe particular thanks to Brian Bix for his careful reading and insightful comments on the manuscript. His observations helped improve the book in ways large and small. Brian is one of the most astute and knowledgeable legal theorists writing today. Anyone with an interest in the subjects covered in this book would find a wealth of information in his work, starting with his book, Jurisprudence: Theory and Context. I also thank Finola O'Sullivan and John Tryneski for their enthusiastic support for the book. I thank Lisa Roder for her superb research assistance. I thank Jolijt and Kats for their patience, understanding, and good humor while I worked on this book.

Finally, I thank Katsugi Tamanaha, my father, for serving as my inspiration and imagined audience. My conviction is that theory is relevant to everyday life and should therefore be available to everyone. Unfortunately, most theoretical works are too dense and jargon-filled to be of interest to non-theorists. When colleagues and friends inquired why I was striving to write this book in a more generally accessible style, which (I confess) is a departure from my previous theoretical books, my response was that my goal was to write a book intelligent people like my father could read. I hope I have succeeded.

viii