Minorities within Minorities

Most discussions of multiculturalism and group rights focus on the relationship between the minority and the majority. This volume advances our understanding of minority rights by focusing on conflicts that arise within minority groups and by examining the different sorts of responses that the liberal state might have to these conflicts. Groups around the world are increasingly successful in maintaining or winning autonomy. In light of this trend, a crucial question emerges: what happens to individuals within groups who find that their group discriminates against them? This volume brings together distinguished scholars who examine this question by weaving together normative political theory with case studies drawn from South Africa, the United States, India, Canada and Britain. Classical liberalism, deliberative democracy, feminism and associative democracy are among the theoretical frameworks used to offer solutions to the complex set of issues raised by minorities within minorities.

Avigail Eisenberg is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Victoria. She is the author of Reconstructing Political Pluralism and co-editor of Painting the Maple: Essays on Race, Gender and the Construction of Canada.

Jeff Spinner-Halev is the Schlesinger Professor of Political Science in the Department of Political Science at the University of Nebraska. He is the author of The Boundaries of Citizenship: Race, Ethnicity and Nationality in the Liberal State and Surviving Diversity: Religion and Democratic Citizenship.

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
Minorities within Minorities

Equality, Rights and Diversity

Edited by
Avigail Eisenberg and Jeff Spinner-Halev
As this book manuscript was being prepared, Susan Moller Okin tragically passed away. Susan was a pioneering feminist political theorist whose landmark books taught her colleagues and many students to think differently about political theory. We will miss her.
# Contents

*Notes on Contributors*  
*Acknowledgements*  
*Introduction*

## Part I  Toleration

1. Tolerable liberalism  
   **Melissa S. Williams**  
   page 19

2. A liberalism of conscience  
   **Lucas Swaine**  
   page 41

## Part II  Equality

3. Multiculturalism and feminism: no simple question, no simple answers  
   **Susan Moller Okin**  
   page 67

4. Can intra-group equality co-exist with cultural diversity?  
   Re-examining multicultural frameworks of accommodation  
   **Gurpreet Mahajan**  
   page 90

5. Dilemmas of gender and culture: the judge, the democrat and the political activist  
   **Anne Phillips**  
   page 113

6. The rights of internal linguistic minorities  
   **Alan Patten**  
   page 135
Contents

Part III Individual autonomy

7 Autonomy, association and pluralism 157
   JEFF SPINNER-HALEV

8 Sexual orientation, exit and refuge 172
   JACOB T. LEVY

9 On exit 189
   OONAGH REITMAN

10 Minors within minorities: a problem for liberal multiculturalists 209
   ROB REICH

11 Beyond exit rights: reframing the debate 227
   DANIEL M. WEINSTOCK

Part IV Self-determination

12 Identity and liberal politics: the problem of minorities within minorities 249
   AVIGAIL EISENBERG

13 Internal minorities and indigenous self-determination 271
   MARGARET MOORE

14 Self-determination as a basic human right: the Draft UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples 294
   CINDY HOLDER

Part V Democracy

15 Associative democracy and minorities within minorities 319
   VEIT BADER

16 A deliberative approach to conflicts of culture 340
   MONIQUE DEVEAUX

References 363
Index 385
Notes on contributors

V E I T B A D E R is a Professor of Social and Political Philosophy and of Sociology at the University of Amsterdam. He is the author of several books and many articles on equality, citizenship and pluralism. He is currently finishing a book on Religious Diversity and Associative Democracy.

M O N I Q U E D E V E A U X is an Associate Professor of Political Science at William College. Most recently, she is author of Cultural Pluralism and Dilemmas of Justice (Cornell, 2000).

A V I G A I L E I S E N B E R G is an Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Victoria in Canada. She is author of Reconstructing Political Pluralism (SUNY, 1995), co-editor of Painting the Maple: Essays on Race, Gender and the Construction of Canada (UBC, 1998) as well as several articles on accommodating multinationalism and multiculturalism in liberal states.

C I N D Y H O L D E R is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Victoria. She is the author of several articles on group rights, the most recent of which is a co-authored piece entitled “Indigenous Rights and Multicultural Citizenship” in the Human Rights Quarterly (2002).

J A C O B T. L E V Y is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. He is the author of The Multiculturalism of Fear (Oxford, 2000) and a number of articles and chapters on multiculturalism and nationalism, the rights of indigenous peoples, language rights and related topics. He is currently writing on the tension between rationalist and pluralist conceptions of liberalism, and associated topics in the history of liberal and constitutionalist thought. His work on the chapter in this volume was partially supported with an Earhart Foundation Fellowship.

G U R P R E E T M A H A J A N is Professor of Political Science at Jawaharlal Nehru University. She has edited and written several volumes on multiculturalism, including Identities & Rights: Aspects of Liberal Democracy.
Margaret Moore is Associate Professor in the Political Studies Department at Queen’s University (Canada). She is the author of Foundations of Liberalism (Oxford, 1993) and The Ethics of Nationalism (Oxford, 2001).

Susan Moller Okin was Professor of Political Science and Marta Sutton Weeks Professor of Ethics in Society at Stanford University. She was the author of Is Multiculturalism Bad for Women? (Princeton, 1999), Women in Western Political Thought (Princeton, 1979) and Justice, Gender and the Family (Basic Books, 1989).

Alan Patten is Associate Professor of Political Science at McGill University. He is author of Hegel’s Idea of Freedom (Oxford, 1999) and co-editor of Political Theory and Language Rights (Oxford, 2003) and has also written several articles on multinationalism and multilingualism.

Anne Phillips is Professor of Gender Theory in the Gender Institute and Department of Government at the London School of Economics. Among her many books are Engendering Democracy (Polity Press, 1991), The Politics of Presence (Oxford, 1995) and Which Equalities Matter? (Polity, 1999).

Rob Reich is Assistant Professor of Political Science and Ethics in Society at Stanford University. He is the author of Bridging Liberalism and Multiculturalism in American Education (Chicago, 2002).

Onaigh Reitman is a research fellow in the Gender Institute at the London School of Economics. Her research centers on law and public administration in culturally diverse societies, focusing on the interplay between state law and the informal and transnational regulatory practices of some minorities, particularly in the context of divorce. She is completing a manuscript entitled Regulating Identity: Divorce, Diaspora Style.

Jeff Spinner-Halev is the Schlesinger Professor of Political Science at the University of Nebraska. He is the author of The Boundaries of Citizenship: Race, Ethnicity and Nationality in the Liberal State and Surviving Diversity: Religion and Democratic Citizenship. He has been a Laurance S. Rockefeller Visiting Fellow at the Center for Human Values at Princeton University, and a Lady Davis Fellow and a Fellow at the Institute for Advanced Studies at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.
Notes on contributors

Lucas Swaine is Assistant Professor and Rockefeller Scholar in the Department of Government at Dartmouth College. He was previously the Gifford Research Fellow at the University of St. Andrews in Scotland. He has published articles in such journals as Ethics and History of Political Thought, and currently is working on a book on liberalism, theocracy and liberty of conscience.

Daniel Weinstock holds a Canada Research Chair in Ethics and Political Philosophy at the Université de Montréal. He has published numerous articles on issues such as deliberative democracy, minority rights, and constitutionalism in divided societies. His present writing projects deal with issues such as the constraints on democratic deliberation in times of war, the ethical foundations of language policy in multilingual societies, and the political philosophy of the family.

Melissa Williams is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. She is author of Voice, Trust and Memory: Marginalized Groups and the Failings of Liberal Representation (Princeton, 1998). She is Editor of NOMOS, the Yearbook of the American Society for Political Legal Philosophy, and was co-editor of Identity, Rights, and Constitutional Transformation (Ashgate, 1999).
Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the Department of Political Science and the Human Rights and Human Diversity Program at the University of Nebraska for providing funding for a conference on Minorities within Minorities in October 2002. We would also like to acknowledge the helpful advice that James Bohman, Idil Boran, Suzanne Dovi, Geoffrey Brahm Levey and Jacob Levy gave to several conference participants in their role as discussants.

We wish to thank the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for providing resources that helped in the preparation of the manuscript. We are grateful to Colin Macleod for his advice on this project and on the preparation of the manuscript. We are also grateful to Theresa Gerritsen for her excellent research assistance in preparing the manuscript. Two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press provided helpful suggestions on how to revise the text for the better, and John Haslam of Cambridge University Press was unfailing in his good advice and encouragement.

We thank the University of Chicago Press for granting permission to reprint a revised version of chapter 3 from Rob Reich’s book Bridging Liberalism and Multiculturalism in American Education (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002).

We thank Sage Publications for granting permission to reprint a revised version of Monique Deveaux, “A Deliberative Approach to Conflicts of Culture,” Political Theory, vol. 31, no. 6, December 2003, pp. 780–807.

We thank Lucas Swaine for granting permission to reprint “A Liberalism of Conscience,” Journal of Political Philosophy, vol. 11, no. 4, December 2003, pp. 369–91.