The Problem of Animal Generation in Early Modern Philosophy

This book examines the early modern science of generation, which included the study of animal conception, heredity, and fetal development. Analyzing how it influenced the contemporary treatment of traditional philosophical questions, it also demonstrates how philosophical presuppositions about mechanism, substance, and cause informed the interpretations offered by those conducting empirical research on animal reproduction. Composed of cutting-edge essays written by an international team of leading scholars, the book offers a fresh perspective on some of the basic problems in early modern philosophy. It also considers how these basic problems manifested themselves within an area of scientific inquiry that has not previously received much consideration by historians of philosophy.

Justin E. H. Smith is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Concordia University in Montreal. A scholar of early modern philosophy, he has contributed to the *Leibniz Review, History of Philosophy Quarterly*, and *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND BIOLOGY

General Editor
Michael Ruse Florida State University

Advisory Board
Michael Donoghue Yale University
Jean Gayon University of Paris
Jonathan Hodge University of Leeds
Jane Maienschein Arizona State University
Jesús Mosterín Instituto de Filosofía (Spanish Research Council)
Elliott Sober University of Wisconsin
Nils-Christian Stenseth University of Oslo
Daniel W. McShea Duke University

Alfred I. Tauber The Immune Self: Theory or Metaphor?
Elliott Sober From a Biological Point of View
Robert Brandon Concepts and Methods in Evolutionary Biology
Peter Godfrey-Smith Complexity and the Function of Mind in Nature
William A. Rottschaefer The Biology and Psychology of Moral Agency
Sahotra Sarkar Genetics and Reductionism
Jean Gayon Darwinism’s Struggle for Survival
Jane Maienschein and Michael Ruse (eds.) Biology and the Foundation of Ethics
Jack Wilson Biological Individuality
Richard Creath and Jane Maienschein (eds.) Biology and Epistemology
Alexander Rosenberg Darwinism in Philosophy, Social Science, and Policy
Peter Beurton, Raphael Falk, and Hans-Jörg Rheinberger (eds.) The Concept of the Gene in Development and Evolution

David Hull Science and Selection
James G. Lennox Aristotle’s Philosophy of Biology
Marc Ereshefsky The Poverty of the Linnaean Hierarchy
Kim Sterelny The Evolution of Agency and Other Essays
William S. Cooper The Evolution of Reason
Peter McLaughlin What Functions Explain

Steven Hecht Orzack and Elliott Sober (eds.) Adaptationism and Optimality
Bryan G. Norton Searching for Sustainability
Sandra D. Mitchell Biological Complexity and Integrative Pluralism
Gregory J. Cooper The Science of the Struggle for Existence
Joseph LaPorte Natural Kinds and Conceptual Change
William F. Harms Information and Meaning in Evolutionary Processes
Markku Oksanen and Juhani Pietarinen Philosophy and Biodiversity
Jason Scott Robert Embryology, Epigenesis, and Evolution

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
The Problem of Animal Generation in Early Modern Philosophy

Edited by
JUSTIN E. H. SMITH
Concordia University
Contents

List of Contributors  xi

Introduction  1
  Justin E. H. Smith

I. THE DAWNING OF A NEW ERA

1. The Comparative Study of Animal Development: William Harvey’s Aristotelianism  21
  James G. Lennox

  Annie Bitbol-Hespériès

II. THE CARTESIAN PROGRAM

3. Descartes’s Experimental Method and the Generation of Animals  65
  Vincent Aucante

4. Imagination and the Problem of Heredity in Mechanist Embryology  80
  Justin E. H. Smith

III. THE GASSENDIAN ALTERNATIVE

5. The Soul as Vehicle for Genetic Information: Gassendi’s Account of Inheritance  103
  Saul Fisher

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
Contents

   Andreas Blank

IV. SECOND-WAVE MECHANISM AND THE RETURN OF ANIMAL SOULS, 1650–1700

7. Animal Generation and Substance in Sennert and Leibniz 147
   Richard T. W. Arthur

8. Spontaneous and Sexual Generation in Conway’s Principles 175
   Deborah Boyle

9. Malebranche on Animal Generation: Preexistence and the Microscope 194
   Andrew Pyle

10. Animal as Category: Bayle’s “Rorarius” 215
    Dennis Des Chene

V. BETWEEN EPIGENESIS AND PREEXISTENCE: THE DEBATE INTENSIFIES, 1700–1770

11. Explanation and Demonstration in the Haller-Wolff Debate 235
    Karen Detlefsen

12. Soul Power: Georg Ernst Stahl and the Debate on Generation 262
    Francesco Paolo de Ceglia

    François Duchesneau

VI. KANT AND HIS CONTEMPORARIES ON DEVELOPMENT AND THE PROBLEM OF ORGANIZED MATTER

14. Kant’s Early Views on Epigenesis: The Role of Maupertuis 317
    John Zammito

15. Blumenbach and Kant on Mechanism and Teleology in Nature: The Case of the Formative Drive 355
    Brandon C. Look

VII. KANT AND THE BEGINNINGS OF EVOLUTION

    Catherine Wilson
Contents

17. Kant and Evolution 402
   Michael Ruse

Bibliography 417

Index 447
Contributors


Vincent Aucante is Director of the French Cultural Center of Rome. He teaches philosophy at the Gregorian University. He has published a critical edition of the *Écrits physiologiques et médicaux de Descartes* (Presses Universitaires de France, 2000).

Annie Bitbol-Hespériès is the author of numerous publications in the history of philosophy and in the history of medicine, notably *Le Principe de vie chez Descartes* (Vrin, 1990), and is the editor with J.-P. Verdet of a critical edition of Descartes’ *Le Monde, L’Homme* (Le Seuil, 1996).

Andreas Blank is Lecturer in the Department of Philosophy at the Humboldt University of Berlin and currently Visiting Fellow at the Cohn Institute for the History and Philosophy of Science and Ideas at Tel Aviv University. He is the author of *Der logische Aufbau von Leibniz’ Metaphysik* (2001) and *Leibniz: Metaphilosophy and Metaphysics, 1666–1686* (forthcoming).

Deborah Boyle is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the College of Charleston in Charleston, South Carolina. She has published articles on Descartes and Hume and has a forthcoming article on Margaret Cavendish’s natural philosophy.

Francesco Paolo de Ceglia is Assistant Professor of History of Science at the University of Bari (Italy). He is the author of *Introduzione alla fisiologia di Georg Ernst Stahl* (Pensa, 2000).
List of Contributors

Dennis Des Chene is Professor of Philosophy at Washington University in Saint Louis. Recent publications include papers on machines in the science of living things and Descartes’ theory of mind. His current projects concern seventeenth-century theories of the passions and the history and philosophy of twentieth-century mathematics.

Karen Detlefsen is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania. Her article “Supernaturalism, Occasionalism, and Preformation in Malebranche” appeared in Perspectives on Science, and she is completing a book on generation, individuation, and final causes in the seventeenth century.

François Duchesneau is Professor of History and Philosophy of Science at the Université de Montréal. He is the author of L’ Empirisme de Locke (M. Nijhoff, 1973), La physiologie des Lumières: empirisme, modèles et théories (M. Nijhoff, 1982), Genèse de la théorie cellulaire (Bellmarin; Vrin, 1987), Leibniz et la méthode de la science (Presses Universitaires de France, 1993), La dynamique de Leibniz (Vrin, 1994), Philosophie de la biologie (PUF, 1997), and Les Modèles du vivant de Descartes à Leibniz (Vrin, 1998).

Saul Fisher is Director of Fellowship Programs for the American Council of Learned Societies. He is the author of Pierre Gassendi’s Philosophy and Science (Brill, forthcoming).


Brandon C. Look is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy of the University of Kentucky. He is the author of Leibniz and the Vinculum Substantiale and editor (with Donald Rutherford) of the Leibniz–Des Bosses Correspondence, which will appear as part of the Yale Leibniz series.

Andrew Pyle is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Bristol. He is the author of Atomism and Its Critics: Democritus to Newton (Thoemmes Press, 1995) and of Malebranche (2003), in Routledge’s Arguments of the Philosophers series.

Michael Ruse is Lucile T. Werkmeister Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Program in the History and Philosophy of Science at Florida State
List of Contributors

University. He is the author of numerous books in the philosophy of biology, including *Darwin and Design: Does Evolution Have a Purpose?* (Harvard University Press, 2003).

Justin E. H. Smith is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Concordia University in Montréal. A scholar of early modern philosophy, he has contributed to the *Leibniz Review, History of Philosophy Quarterly*, and the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*. He is currently at work on a book on the problem of species membership in seventeenth-century philosophy and biology.

Catherine Wilson is currently Professor of Philosophy at the Graduate Center, City University of New York. She is the author of *The Invisible World: Early Modern Philosophy and the Invention of the Microscope* (Princeton University Press, 1995) and of a number of articles on seventeenth- and eighteenth-century history and philosophy of science.

John Zammito is John Antony Weir Professor of History and Chair of the Department of German and Slavic Studies at Rice University. He has published two works on Immanuel Kant which take up issues of biology among other matters: *The Genesis of Kant’s Critique of Judgment* (University of Chicago Press, 1992) and *Kant, Herder, and the Birth of Anthropology* (University of Chicago Press, 2001).