Conceptions of Giftedness

Second Edition

What does it really mean to be gifted and how can schools or other institutions identify, teach, and evaluate the performance of gifted children? Gifted education is a crucial aspect of schooling in the United States and abroad. Most countries around the world have at least some form of gifted education. With the first edition becoming a major work in the field of giftedness, this second edition of *Conceptions of Giftedness* aims to describe the major conceptions of what it means to be gifted and how these conceptions apply to the identification, instruction, and assessment of the gifted. It will provide specialists with a critical evaluation of various theories of giftedness, give practical advice to teachers and administrators on how to put theories of gifted education into practice, and enable the major researchers in the field to compare and contrast the strengths of their theoretical models.

Robert J. Sternberg, PhD, is IBM Professor of Psychology and Education at Yale University and Director of the PACE Center at Yale. He was the 2003 President of the American Psychological Association. He is the author of more than 1,000 publications on topics related to cognition and intelligence. He has won numerous awards from professional associations and holds five honorary doctorates.

Janet E. Davidson is Associate Professor of Psychology at Lewis & Clark College, where she won the Professor of the Year award in 1997. She does research on several aspects of giftedness, including the roles that insight and metacognitive skills play in gifted problem-solving performance. In 1988, she won a Mensa Education and Research Foundation Award for Excellence.

Conceptions of Giftedness

Second Edition

Edited by **ROBERT J. STERNBERG** *Yale University PACE Center*

JANET E. DAVIDSON Lewis & Clark College



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 052183841X - Conceptions of Giftedness, Second Edition Edited by Robert J. Sternberg and Janet E. Davidson Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521838412

© Cambridge University Press 1986, 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First edition published 1986 Second edition published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Conceptions of giftedness / edited by Robert J. Sternberg, Janet E. Davidson. – 2nd ed. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 0-521-83841-X – ISBN 0-521-54730-X (pbk.) 1. Genius. 2. Gifted children – Psychology. I. Sternberg, Robert J. II. Davidson, Janet E. III. Title. BF412.C66 2005 153.9'8 – dc22 2004023791

15BN-13 978-0-521-83841-2 hardback 15BN-10 0-521-83841-x hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-54730-7 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-54730-x paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Preface		page vii
List of Contributors		ix
1	Gifted Education Without Gifted Children: The Case for No Conception of Giftedness James H. Borland	1
2	Youths Who Reason Exceptionally Well Mathematically and/or Verbally: Using the MVT:D ⁴ Model to Develop Their Talents <i>Linda E. Brody and Julian C. Stanley</i>	20
3	A Child-Responsive Model of Giftedness Carolyn M. Callahan and Erin M. Miller	38
4	School-Based Conception of Giftedness Tracy L. Cross and Laurence J. Coleman	52
5	Giftedness, Talent, Expertise, and Creative Achievement <i>John F. Feldhusen</i>	64
6	Permission to Be Gifted: How Conceptions of Giftedness Can Change Lives <i>Joan Freeman</i>	1 80
7	From Gifts to Talents: The DMGT as a Developmental Model <i>Francoys Gagné</i>	98
8	Nurturing Talent in Gifted Students of Color Edmund W. Gordon and Beatrice L. Bridglall	120
9	The Munich Model of Giftedness Designed to Identify and Promote Gifted Students <i>Kurt A. Heller, Christoph Perleth, and Tock Keng Lim</i>	147

vi		Contents
10	Systemic Approaches to Giftedness: Contributions of Russian Psychology Ida Jeltova and Elena L. Grigorenko	171
11	Giftedness and Gifted Education Franz J. Mönks and Michael W. Katzko	187
12	The Importance of Contexts in Theories of Giftedness: Learning to Embrace the Messy Joys of Subjectivity <i>Jonathan A. Plucker and Sasha A. Barab</i>	201
13	Feminist Perspectives on Talent Development: A Research-Based Conception of Giftedness in Women <i>Sally M. Reis</i>	217
14	The Three-Ring Conception of Giftedness: A Developmental Model for Promoting Creative Productivity <i>Joseph S. Renzulli</i>	246
15	In Defense of a Psychometric Approach to the Definition of Academic Giftedness: A Conservative View from a Die-Hard Liberal <i>Nancy M. Robinson</i>	280
16	Creative Giftedness Mark A. Runco	295
17	Genetics of Giftedness: The Implications of an Emergenic–Epigenetic Model <i>Dean Keith Simonton</i>	312
18	The WICS Model of Giftedness Robert J. Sternberg	327
19	Beyond Expertise: Conceptions of Giftedness as Great Performance <i>Rena F. Subotnik and Linda Jarvin</i>	343
20	Domain-Specific Giftedness: Applications in School and Life Joyce VanTassel-Baska	358
21	Extreme Giftedness Catya von Károlyi and Ellen Winner	377
22	Making Giftedness Productive Herbert J. Walberg and Susan J. Paik	395
23	The Actiotope Model of Giftedness Albert Ziegler	411
24	The Scientific Study of Giftedness Richard E. Mayer	437
Au	thor Index	449
Subject Index		452

Preface

Emanuel Feuermann was hired to the faculty of the University of Cologne at the age of 16 to teach the cello to students, all of whom were older than he was. He was a child prodigy who made good and became a superstar as an adult. In contrast, his brother, Sigmund Feuermann, was an even more amazing child prodigy than was Emanuel. But by the age of 31, Sigmund returned to his parents' home in Vienna in semiretirement. His career as a mature violinist had been, to a large extent, a bust. What is it that distinguishes gifted children who later go on to become gifted adults from those who do not? Indeed, what does it even mean to be gifted, and how can schools or other institutions identify, teach, and evaluate the performance of gifted children?

Gifted education is a crucial aspect of schooling in the United States and abroad. Most countries around the world have at least some form of gifted education. To help those with an interest in the field of gifted education, we edited a volume that was published in 1986 by Cambridge University Press, *Conceptions of Giftedness*. However, that book has been out of print for several years. Since the book went out of print, the senior editor of this volume has received many requests for permission to copy material from that book and also for a new edition of the book. This book is that new, second edition.

This book describes the major conceptions of what it means to be gifted and how these conceptions apply to the identification, instruction, and assessment of the gifted.

There are several reasons, we believe, for a book on conceptions of giftedness:

1. *Need for theoretical guidance.* Although there are many gifted programs, the large majority of them continue to be based on no theory in particular. Rather, they use off-the-shelf measures, such as tests of intelligence, creativity, or achievement, without any clear motivation

viii

Preface

in the choice of tests. A book such as this one would help specialists in the field of giftedness choose a model with which to work.

- 2. *Need for translation of conceptions of giftedness into practice.* In retrospect, the first edition of the book probably overemphasized theory at the expense of information regarding how theory can be put into practice. Because the large majority of readers of the book are likely to be teachers, it is important that the book emphasize application in addition to theory. Translation into practice needs to deal with identification procedures, instructional methods, and instruments for assessment of achievement in gifted individuals.
- 3. *Need for comparison of conceptions.* Theorists often present their own work without giving full consideration to how their work compares with that of others. Yet, in order to evaluate competing conceptions, teachers of the gifted need to know the similarities and differences among the conceptions. They cannot be expected to figure out these similarities and differences on their own.

WHY PUBLISH A SECOND EDITION?

Since 1986, the field has changed, as have some of the major contributors to it. We therefore believe that the time is ripe for this second edition of *Conceptions of Giftedness*, which reflects the current state of the field.

Each author was asked to address the following five questions in his or her chapter, as well as any other questions he or she might wish to entertain:

- 1. What is giftedness?
- 2. How does your conception of giftedness compare with other conceptions?
- 3. How should gifted individuals be identified?
- 4. How should gifted individuals be instructed in school and elsewhere?
- 5. How should the achievement of gifted individuals be assessed?

You will find in this volume a wide range of views, from Borland's suggestion that we do not need a conception of giftedness, to Callahan and Miller's view that we need enhanced and more powerful conceptions. You, the reader, may choose, or come up with your own conception!

We have designed this book to be relevant to several potential audiences: students, teachers of the gifted, professors in gifted-education programs, parents of gifted children, and people who themselves have been labeled as gifted or believe they should have been. We hope you all enjoy and learn from our volume.

> RJS JED

Contributors

Sasha A. Barab Indiana University Bloomington, IN

James H. Borland Teachers College Columbia University New York, NY

Beatrice L. Bridglall Teachers College Columbia University New York, NY

Linda E. Brody Johns Hopkins University Baltimore, MD

Carolyn M. Callahan University of Virginia Charlottesville, VA

Laurence J. Coleman University of Toledo Toledo, OH

Tracy L. Cross Ball State University Muncie, IN

John F. Feldhusen Purdue University West Lafayette, IN **Joan Freeman** Middlesex University London, England

Francoys Gagné Université du Québec à Montréal Montréal, Canada

Edmund W. Gordon Teachers College Columbia University New York, NY

Elena L. Grigorenko Yale University New Haven, CT

Kurt A. Heller University of Munich Munich, Germany

Linda Jarvin Yale University New Haven, CT

Ida Jeltova Fairleigh Dickinson University Teaneck, NJ

Michael W. Katzko Radboud University Nijmegen Nijmegen, Netherlands

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 052183841X - Conceptions of Giftedness, Second Edition Edited by Robert J. Sternberg and Janet E. Davidson Frontmatter More information

х

Contributors

Tock Keng Lim PsychMetrics International Singapore

Richard E. Mayer University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA

Erin M. Miller University of Virginia Charlottesville, VA

Franz J. Mönks Radboud University Nijmegen Nijmegen, Netherlands

Susan J. Paik Claremont Graduate University School of Educational Studies Claremont, CA

Christoph Perleth University of Rostock Rostock, Germany

Jonathan A. Plucker Indiana University Bloomington, IN

Sally M. Reis University of Connecticut Storrs, CT

Joseph S. Renzulli University of Connecticut Storrs, CT

Nancy M. Robinson University of Washington Seattle, WA

Mark A. Runco California State University, Fullerton Fullerton, CA The Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration Bergen, Norway

Dean Keith Simonton University of California, Davis Davis, CA

Julian C. Stanley Johns Hopkins University Baltimore, MD

Robert J. Sternberg Yale University New Haven, CT

Rena F. Subotnik American Psychological Association Washington, DC

Joyce VanTassel-Baska The College of William and Mary Williamsburg, VA

Catya von Károlyi University of Wisconsin, Eau Claire Eau Claire, WI

Herbert J. Walberg Hoover Institution Stanford University Palo Alto, CA

Ellen Winner Boston College Boston, MA Harvard's Project Zero Cambridge, MA

Albert Ziegler University of Ulm Ulm, Germany