

SELF-INTEREST BEFORE ADAM SMITH

A Genealogy of Economic Science

Self-Interest before Adam Smith inquires into the foundations of economic theory. It is generally assumed that the birth of modern economic science, marked by the publication of The Wealth of Nations in 1776, was the triumph of the "selfish hypothesis" (the idea that selfinterest is the motive of human action). Yet, as a neo-Epicurean idea, this hypothesis had been a matter of controversy for over a century and Smith opposed it from a neo-Stoic point of view. But how can the Epicurean principles of orthodox economic theory be reconciled with the Stoic principles of Adam Smith's philosophy? Pierre Force shows how Smith's theory refutes the "selfish hypothesis" and integrates it at the same time. He also explains how Smith appropriated Rousseau's "republican" critique of modern commercial society, and makes the case that the autonomy of economic science is an unintended consequence of Smith's "republican" principles. This book sheds light on some classic puzzles of economic theory and is a major work from an outstanding scholar.

PIERRE FORCE, Nell and Herbert M. Singer Professor of Contemporary Civilization and Professor of French at Columbia University in New York, is the author of *Le Problème herméneutique chez Pascal* (1989) and *Molière ou Le Prix des choses* (1994).



IDEAS IN CONTEXT

Edited by Quentin Skinner (General Editor), Lorraine Daston, Dorothy Ross and James Tully

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

The series is published with the support of the Exxon Foundation.

A list of books in the series will be found at the end of the volume.



SELF-INTEREST BEFORE ADAM SMITH

A Genealogy of Economic Science

PIERRE FORCE

Columbia University





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Pierre Force 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003 Reprinted 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Adobe Garamond 11/12.5 pt. System LATEX 2E [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Force, Pierre.

Self-interest before Adam Smith: a genealogy of economic science / Pierre Force.
p. cm. – (Ideas in context; 68)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 83060 5
I. Economics – History. I. Title. II. Series.

HB75.F67 2003
330.15 – dc21 2003043590

ISBN 0 521 83060 5 hardback



Contents

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> viii
	Introduction	I
I	Self-interest as a first principle	7
2	Epicurean vs. Stoic schemes	48
3	Self-interest and reason	91
4	Passions, interests, and society	135
5	Interested and disinterested commerce	169
6	Self-interest and the public good	205
	Conclusion	256
Bibliography Index		264 276



Acknowledgments

The topic of this book has been with me for a long time. I first touched upon it in a 1989 article. It was in the background of my 1994 book on Molière.² The colloquium I organized at the Maison Française of Columbia University in 1994 was dedicated in great part to these issues.³ Some of the arguments developed in chapter 1 were presented in a Yale French Studies article in 1997.4 Many of the ideas present in this book were tested in the seminar I taught in 1996, "The Commerce of the Self from Montaigne to Adam Smith," and in the seminar I co-taught with Allan Silver in 2000, "Self-Interest before Capitalism in Literature and Social Theory." The questions and comments from students in these seminars greatly helped me to clarify my thinking. This work owes a lot to the many conversations I had with Allan Silver, a colleague who is also a true friend. I thank another friend, Kathy Eden, for helping me find my way in the complete works of Augustine. Thanks are also due to Charles Larmore for several useful suggestions, and to Knud Haakonssen for his generous advice on how to navigate the waters of Smith scholarship. I also wish to acknowledge the comments, suggestions and criticisms from colleagues and friends who read parts of the manuscript. I had the opportunity to discuss chapter I with the members of the Chicago Group on Modern France. Chapter 2 has benefited from Jean Lafond's unmatched expertise on the Augustinian tradition in the early modern period. Incisive comments by Jon Elster and John D. Collins have led me to reformulate some key passages in chapter 3.

¹ "What Is a Man Worth? Ethics and Economics in Molière and Rousseau," *Romanic Review* 1 (1989), pp. 18–29.

² Molière ou Le Prix des choses. Morale, économie et comédie, Paris: Nathan, 1994.

³ De la morale à l'économie politique. Dialogue franco-américain sur les moralistes français, edited by Pierre Force and David Morgan, introduction by Pierre Force, Pau: Publications de l'Université de Pau, 1996.

⁴ "Self-Love, Identification, and the Origin of Political Economy," in *Exploring the Conversible World: Text and Sociability from the Classical Age to the Enlightenment*, edited by Elena Russo, *Yale French Studies* 92 (1997), pp. 46–64.



Acknowledgments

ix

Chapter 4 was discussed at a session of Columbia's Early Modern Salon. It incorporates many helpful suggestions I received from Katherine Almquist, James Helgeson, and Gita May. Chapter 6 was almost entirely re-written in response to the criticisms and suggestions I received from two anonymous readers at Cambridge University Press. I thank my colleagues and students in Contemporary Civilization at Columbia for providing the intellectual environment that made this book possible. Special thanks are also due to the staff of the Columbia French Department, Isabelle Chagnon, Benita Dace, and Meritza Moss, for providing the administrative environment that allowed me to write this book while chairing an academic department. Last but not least, I would like to express my gratitude to my research assistant, Julia Chamberlin, who has been an example of efficiency and thoughtfulness.

My wife Christel Hollevoet was completing a book of her own when this one was being written. Being able to share the toils and the joys of scholarship has strengthened our love. I dedicate this book to our beloved children Charlotte and Eliot.