

## Democratization and Research Methods

---

*Democratization and Research Methods* is a coherent survey and critique of both democratization research and the methodology of comparative politics. The two themes enhance each other: the democratization literature illustrates the advantages and disadvantages of various methodological approaches, and the critique of methods makes sense of the vast and bewildering democratization field. Michael Coppedge argues that each of the three main approaches in comparative politics – case studies and comparative histories, formal modeling, and large-sample statistical analysis – accomplishes one fundamental research goal relatively well, “thickness,” integration, and generalization, respectively, but the other two poorly. Chapters cover conceptualization and measurement, case studies and comparative histories, formal models and theories, political culture and survey research, and quantitative testing. The final chapter summarizes the state of knowledge about democratization and lays out an agenda for multimethod research.

**Michael Coppedge** is professor of political science at the University of Notre Dame. He is one of the principal investigators for the Varieties of Democracy Project at the Kellogg Institute, a collaboration producing many new indicators of democracy. He chaired the American Political Science Association’s Task Force on Indicators of Democracy and Governance. His first book, *Strong Parties and Lame Ducks: Presidential Partyarchy and Factionalism in Venezuela* (1994), analyzes institutional problems underlying the crisis of Venezuelan democracy. He has published articles on comparative and Latin American politics in *Journal of Politics*, *Perspectives on Politics*, *Comparative Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, *Journal of Democracy*, *Party Politics*, *Studies in Comparative International Development*, and other journals and books. He is a past recipient of grants from Fulbright-Hayes, the Tinker Foundation, the World Society Foundation, and the Research Council of Norway, and he has taught at Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies, Princeton, Yale, and Georgetown. Coppedge received his PhD from Yale University in 1988.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## **Strategies for Social Inquiry**

### **Editors**

Colin Elman, *Maxwell School of Syracuse University*  
John Gerring, *Boston University*  
James Mahoney, *Northwestern University*

### **Editorial Board**

Bear Braumoeller, David Collier, Francesco Guala, Peter Hedström, Theodore Hopf, Uskali Maki, Rose McDermott, Charles Ragin, Theda Skocpol, Peter Spiegler, David Waldner, Lisa Wedeen, Christopher Winship

This new book series presents texts on a wide range of issues bearing upon the practice of social inquiry. Strategies are construed broadly to embrace the full spectrum of approaches to analysis, as well as relevant issues in philosophy of social science.

### **Published Titles**

John Gerring, *Social Science Methodology: A Unified Framework*, 2nd edition

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Democratization and Research Methods

---

**Michael Coppedge**

University of Notre Dame



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521537278](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521537278)

© Michael Coppedge 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Coppedge, Michael, 1957–

Democratization and research methods / Michael Coppedge.

p. cm. – (Strategies for social inquiry)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-83032-4 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-53727-8 (paperback)

1. Democratization – Research – Methodology. 2. Comparative government – Research – Methodology. I. Title.

JC423.C7173 2012

321.8–dc23 2012003497

ISBN 978-0-521-83032-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-53727-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

	<i>List of tables</i>	page xi
	<i>List of figures</i>	xiii
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
1	Research methods and democratization	1
	Rationale	1
	Overview	4
2	Defining and measuring democracy	11
	Operationalizing concepts	14
	Measurement	23
	Consequences for analysis	33
	Thickening thin concepts	44
	Conclusion	47
3	Criteria for evaluating causal theories	49
	Three fundamental criteria for good theory	52
	Multiple paths to theory	62
	Toward theoretical perfection	74
4	Checklists, frameworks, and Boolean analysis	76
	Conventional wisdoms	77
	What checklists tell us	92
	Moving beyond checklists: Inductive theoretical frameworks	95
	Boolean analysis	108
	Appendix: Coding criteria and sources for checklist demonstration	113
5	Case studies and comparative history	115
	Histories and case studies	116
	The nature of comparative histories	129

	Evaluation of the comparative-historical approach	140
	Appendix	151
6	Formal models and theories	158
	Integration	159
	Positional models of liberalization	165
	Positional models of transition and survival	170
	Economic models of transition and survival	176
	Evaluating formal theories and models	182
	Conclusion	192
7	Rigor in extensive and intensive testing	194
	Degrees and kinds of rigor	204
	Trade-offs between extensive and intensive testing	206
	Toward testing that is extensive and intensive	214
	Prospects	220
8	Political culture and survey research	222
	Versions of political culture	223
	Macro-macro studies	228
	A comprehensive framework	237
	Political culture and mass-led regime change or consolidation	242
	Conclusion	255
9	Quantitative testing	257
	Assumptions of quantitative analysis	259
	Tests with cross-sectional data	268
	The complications and advantages of time-series	
	cross-sectional data	275
	Other dependent variables	286
	Other explanatory variables	289
	Conclusion	304
10	An agenda for future research	310
	Concepts and indicators	311
	Case studies and comparative histories	315
	Formal models and theories	318
	Political culture	321



Quantitative testing	323
Prospects for democratization research	326
<i>References</i>	329
<i>Index</i>	351

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## List of tables

2.1 Elements of Held's models of democracy	<i>page</i> 15
2.2 Definitions of authoritarian regime and a low degree of polyarchy contrasted	18
2.3 Two unidimensional components of polyarchy	27
2.4 Principal components analysis of democracy indicators for 1990	28
2.5 Appropriate uses of indicators at different levels of measurement	45
4.1 Leadership and cultural causes of democracy	80
4.2 Economic and social causes of democracy	84
4.3 State and institutional causes of democracy	88
4.4 International causes of democracy	91
4.5 Using a checklist to predict democracy in 2000	93
4.6 Basic distinctions made by the Linz and Stepan framework	105
5.1 Fisher tests of comparative-historical models	148
5A.1 Summary of arguments and outcomes in Skocpol (1979)	151
5A.2 Summary of arguments and outcomes about the timing of initial democratization in Latin America in Rueschemeyer, Stephens, and Stephens (1992)	152
5A.3 Summary of arguments and outcomes about Europe in Rueschemeyer, Stephens, and Stephens (1992)	153
5A.4 Summary of the impact of party system types on coups from Collier and Collier (1991)	153
5A.5 Summary of arguments and outcomes from Downing (1992)	154
5A.6 Summary of arguments and outcomes in Ertman (1997)	155
5A.7 Summary of arguments and outcomes in Luebbert (1987)	156
5A.8 Summary of arguments and outcomes in Moore (1966)	157
6.1 Formal models of democratization	166
9.1 Democracy and British colonial rule, 2000	269
9.2 Estimates of the impact of per capita income on level of democracy	279
9.3 The proliferation of dependent variables	286
9.4 Summary of quantitative findings	305

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## List of figures

2.1 Models of Democracy	<i>page</i> 13
2.2 Intension and Extension in Linz's Definitions of Regime Types	20
2.3 Distribution of Countries on Two Dimensions of Democracy, 2000	25
2.4 The Impact of Measurement Error on Inferences	36
3.1 Paths to Thick, General, and Integrated Theory	74
5.1 Major Historical Transitions	131
5.2 The Overlapping Temporal Domains of Comparative Histories	133
5.3 Path-Dependent and Non-Path-Dependent Models	138
6.1 Przeworski's Extrication Game	160
6.2 Przeworski's Extended-Form Game of Liberalization	169
7.1 Data Used in Intensive and Extensive Testing	209
7.2 The Logic of Intensive Testing	211
7.3 Contestation and Income by Region	216
8.1 Illustration of the Ecological Paradox	236
9.1 Impact of Income on Contestation by Year: Cross-Sectional Estimates with 95 Percent Confidence Intervals	272
9.2 Income and Democracy: Between- versus Within-Country	278
9.3 Distribution of Coefficients for Annual Cross-Sections: Regressing Contestation on Income	280

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

This book has been in gestation more than ten years – how much more, I cannot bear to calculate. In a sense, it began when I was a graduate student thirty years ago. I remember wanting to believe that the research I was reading was giving me real insights into comparative politics, but at the same time I had a nagging feeling that it rested on a shaky foundation that people were trying hard to ignore. I remember wondering, “How do we know what we think we know?” In subsequent years I undertook a long, slow journey through methodology and the philosophy of science to satisfy my own curiosity and eventually found the answers I sought. This is the book I wish I had had. I hope it will be useful to beginning graduate students who are now where I was then.

During the decade-plus that I have been writing this book, I have accumulated too many debts to enumerate exhaustively. Among them are general intellectual debts to great scholars whose insights on methodology or regimes I have appropriated and remixed: Kenneth Bollen, Henry Brady, David Collier, Robert Dahl, Larry Diamond, Barbara Geddes, Alexander George, John Gerring, Gary Goertz, Donald Green, Peter Hall, David Held, Carl Hempel, Jonathan Katz, Robert Keohane, Gary King, Thomas Kuhn, Imre Lakatos, Evan Lieberman, Juan Linz, James Mahoney, Gerardo Munck, Guillermo O’Donnell, Karl Popper, Adam Przeworski, Charles Ragin, Giovanni Sartori, Phillippe Schmitter, Ian Shapiro, Theda Skocpol, Alfred Stepan, and Sidney Verba.

I owe more specific debts to the many people who commented on draft chapters, corresponded with me, or followed up on presentations of the work in progress, most generously Neal Beck, Andrew Bennett, Michael Bernhard, Daniel Brinks, Matthew Cleary, Ruth Collier, Kathleen Collins, Alan Dowty, Robert Fishman, Rob Franzese, Mark Gasiorowski, John Gerring, Carlos Gervasoni, Andrew Gould, Thomas Gresik, Frances Hagopian, Jonathan Hartlyn, Evelynne Huber, Wendy Hunter, Herbert Kitschelt, Evan Lieberman, Scott Mainwaring, Xavier Márquez, Monika Nalepa, Gabriela Nava-Campos,

David Nickerson, the late Guillermo O'Donnell, Valeria Palanza, Richard Rose, Ben Ross-Schneider, Sanjay Ruparelia, Jason Seawright, Richard Snyder, John Stephens, J. Samuel Valenzuela, Kurt Weyland, and an anonymous referee. I extend general thanks as well to the dozens of graduate students who took the two graduate seminars on which this book is based, "Comparing Democracies" and "Comparative Research on Democratization." I am also grateful to FLACSO-Quito, the Institute for Development Studies in Sussex, and the Duke-UNC Working Group on Political and Economic Regimes for the opportunity to lecture on selected draft chapters.

This book benefited greatly from research assistance provided by Angel Alvarez, Victoria Anglin, Annabella España Nájera, Cora Fernández-Anderson, Ezequiel González Ocantos, Lucas González, Courtney Isaak, Claudia Maldonado, and Erik Wang. It also benefited indirectly from research assistance by Sandra Botero, Chad Kiewiet de Jonge, and Cecilia Pe Lero, whose work on other projects freed me up to finish the book. I owe institutional debts to the Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies, the Department of Political Science, and the College of Arts and Letters at the University of Notre Dame for leaves, course reductions, and other kinds of material and moral support.

During the years of work on this book, I made many people wait for many things much longer than they would have liked. They include colleagues, department chairs, deans, journal editors, advisees, my collaborators in the Varieties of Democracy project, the members of the APSA Task Force on Indicators of Democracy and Government, Lewis Bateman of Cambridge University Press, and, most frequently and importantly, my wife and family. They handled my delays with patience and understanding more often than I deserved. I can only hope that in the long run the book will have been worth the wait.

Some portions of this book were previously published elsewhere and are reprinted with permission, for which I am grateful. Portions of Chapters 2, 3, and 7 were first published as Michael Coppedge, "Thickening Thin Concepts and Theories: Combining Large N and Small in Comparative Politics," *Comparative Politics* (July 1999): 465–476. Portions of Chapter 2 were first published by SAGE/SOCIETY as Michael Coppedge, "Democracy and Dimensions: Comments on Munck and Verkuilen," *Comparative Political Studies* 35: 1 (February 2002): 35–39. Figure 2.2 and Tables 2.1 and 2.2 were previously published in Michael Coppedge, "Thickening Thin Concepts: Issues in Large-N Data Generation," in *Regimes and Democracy in Latin America: Theories and Methods*, 105–122, ed. Gerardo L. Munck (New York: Oxford



University Press, 2007). Portions of Chapter 3 were previously published in Michael Coppedge, “Theory Building and Hypothesis Testing: Large-N Versus Small-N Research on Democratization,” in *Regimes and Democracy in Latin America: Theories and Methods*, 163–177, ed. Gerardo L. Munck (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007).

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83032-4 - Democratization and Research Methods  
Michael Coppedge  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---