Forbidding Wrong in Islam
An Introduction

Michael Cook’s massive study in Islamic ethics, *Commanding Right and Forbidding Wrong in Islamic Thought*, was published to much acclaim in 2001. It was described by one reviewer as a masterpiece. In that book, the author reflected on the Islamic injunction, incumbent on every Muslim, to forbid wrongdoing. The present book is a short, accessible survey of the same material. Using anecdotes and stories from Islamic sources to illustrate the argument, Cook unravels the complexities of the subject. Moving backwards and forwards through time, he demonstrates how the past informs the present. By the end of the book, the reader will be familiar with a colourful array of characters from Islamic history ranging from the celebrated scholar Ghazzālī, to the caliph Hārūn al-Rashīd, to the Āyatullāh Khumaynī. The book educates and entertains. At its heart, however, is an important message about the Islamic tradition, its values, and the relevance of those values today.

THEMES IN ISLAMIC HISTORY comprises a range of titles exploring different aspects of Islamic history, society and culture by leading scholars in the field. Books are thematic in approach, offering a comprehensive and accessible overview of the subject. Generally, surveys treat Islamic history from its origins to the demise of the Ottoman empire, although some offer a more developed analysis of a particular period, or project into the present, depending on the subject-matter. All the books are written to interpret and illuminate the past, as gateways to a deeper understanding of Islamic civilization and its peoples.

**Editorial adviser:** Patricia Crone, Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton

**Already published:**
Chase F. Robinson, *Islamic Historiography*
0 521 62081 3 hardback
0 521 62936 5 paperback

0 521 58214 8 hardback
0 521 58813 8 paperback
This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in China by Everbest

Typeface Jaghbub (Adobe) 10/12 pt. System QuarkXPress® [PC]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

National Library of Australia Cataloguing in Publication data

Cook, M. A. (Michael Allan), 1940–
Forbidding wrong in Islam: an introduction.
Bibliography
Includes index.
ISBN 0 521 82913 5.
ISBN 0 521 53602 2 (pbk.).
1. Islamic ethics. 2. Religious life – Shi‘ah. 3.
297.5

ISBN 0 521 82913 5 hardback
ISBN 0 521 53602 2 paperback
## Contents

*Preface*  page  xi

*Map*  xiii

1 **Introduction**  1
   1 Terminology  3
   2 Religious allegiances  5
   3 Sources  7

2 **The elements of the duty of forbidding wrong**  11
   1 Why?  11
   2 Who?  13
   3 To whom?  21
   4 About what?  22

3 **How is wrong to be forbidden?**  27
   1 With the tongue  28
   2 With the hand  29
   3 Recourse to the heart  35
   4 Are there other ways to forbid wrong?  38
   5 Concluding remarks  42

4 **When is one unable to forbid wrong?**  45
   1 The conditions of obligation  45
   2 The efficacy condition  48
   3 The side-effects condition  51
   4 The danger condition  53

5 **What about privacy?**  57
   1 The immunity of hidden wrongs  57
   2 Don’t expose a respectable Muslim  61
   3 Concluding remarks  62
6 The state as an agent of forbidding wrong
1 The claims of the state to forbid wrong
2 The scholars on the role of the state: positive views
3 The scholars on the role of the state: negative views

7 The state as an agent of wrongdoing
1 The misdeeds of rulers
2 Rebuking rulers as forbidding wrong
3 Rebellion as forbidding wrong

8 Is anyone against forbidding wrong?
1 Does anyone deny the duty outright?
2 Has the future already arrived?
3 What do the Şüfiş have to say?
4 ‘Abd al-Ghanî al-Nâbulusî
5 Minding one’s own business
6 Concluding remarks

9 What was forbidding wrong like in practice?
1 What wrongs do people commit?
2 Who actually forbids wrong?
3 Forbidding the wrongs of rulers
4 Forbidding wrong and rebellion
5 Concluding remarks

10 What has changed for the Sunnîs in modern times?
1 Religious allegiances in the modern Islamic world
2 The interaction with the West: attraction and repulsion
3 Living with the modern state: activism and quietism
4 Towards forbidding wrong in an Islamic state
5 Religious policing in Saudi Arabia
6 Forbidding wrong and privacy

11 What has changed for the İmâmîs in modern times?
1 Comparing İmâmîs and Sunnîs
2 The interaction with the West: attraction and repulsion
3 Living with the modern state: from quietism to activism
4 Towards forbidding wrong in an Islamic state
5 Forbidding wrong and privacy
6 Concluding remarks
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Do non-Islamic cultures have similar values?</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What are we looking for?</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Pre-Islamic Arabia</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rabbinic Judaism</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Medieval Catholicism</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Non-monotheist parallels?</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Forbidding wrong and monotheism</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The distinctiveness of the Islamic case</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Do we have a similar value?</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Common ground</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rescue and forbidding wrong</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Right and wrong</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Concluding remarks</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 173
In May 2000 the British police were searching the home of a suspected member of al-Qā‘ida in Manchester, and chanced on a terrorist manual written in Arabic. After the events of 11 September 2001, extracts from this manual were made available in an English translation. These extracts included instructions to be followed by undercover members of the organisation in order not to blow their cover; such a member should avoid manifesting his religiosity through his appearance or conduct. One point underlined in this connection was, in the wording of the translation, that he should ‘not get involved in advocating good and denouncing evil in order not to attract attention to himself’. In the same way, a brother travelling on a special mission ‘should not get involved in religious issues (advocating good and denouncing evil)’.

The duty which the terrorist manual thereby set aside is a central, and in some ways distinctive, feature of Islamic ethics. As the celebrated Sunnī scholar Ghazzālī (d. 1111) put it, every Muslim has the duty of first setting himself to rights, and then, successively, his household, his neighbours, his quarter, his town, the surrounding countryside, the wilderness with its Beduin, Kurds, or whatever, and so on to the uttermost ends of the earth. Of these demanding activities, all bar the first fall under the rubric of ‘commanding right and forbidding wrong’ (al-amr bi’l-ma‘rif wa’l-nahy ‘an al-munkar) – roughly speaking, the duty of one Muslim to intervene when another is acting wrongly.

This book is an epitome of a research monograph I recently published on this duty under the title Commanding right and forbidding wrong in Islamic thought (Cambridge 2001).

Note on footnotes: Unless otherwise indicated, all references are to my monograph Commanding right and forbidding wrong in Islamic thought, Cambridge 2001. Apart from cross-references and a few references to new sources, the purpose of these notes is to help any reader who wishes to do so to locate the relevant passage or passages in the monograph.

1 *The New York Times*, 28 October 2001, B8. The passages are taken from pages 54 (item 11) and 40 (item 6) of the manual respectively.

2 445.
The original monograph was a detailed presentation of the results of some fifteen years of research. Its seven hundred pages were weighed down with several thousand footnotes and over fifty pages of bibliography. Moreover, the large-scale organisation of the material was according to the various sects and schools that make up the Muslim community, not by topic. In short, the monograph was written primarily for specialists. The text (as opposed to the footnotes) was not in principle inaccessible to non-specialists, but it would have taken considerable courage and persistence for anyone other than a specialist to read it from cover to cover.

The present epitome is designed specifically for the non-specialist. As can be seen from the table of contents, the material has been drastically rearranged to make the organisation thematic; only the last four chapters replicate the organisation of the monograph.

No one who has read the monograph need read this epitome. Except in a small number of cases readily identifiable from the notes, there is no new material here. I have often rearranged the data, and occasionally this leads to new and perhaps better ways of looking at things. But there is nothing here that would count as a novel theory.

At the same time, no non-specialist who reads this epitome has any need to go to the monograph. Everything that really matters about the subject is covered here. Perhaps the only exception would be someone with an interest in one particular sect or school; for such a purpose, the organisation of the monograph is more helpful.

This epitome is subject to all the numerous debts set out in the ‘Acknowledgements’ and footnotes of the monograph. Some further information used here was kindly given to me by Şükrü Hanoğlu, Barbara von Schlegell, Matti Steinberg and Nenad Filipović. I have benefited considerably from the comments of Patricia Crone and Bob Moore on the typescript, and I regret that at the time I was working on this epitome, few reviews of the monograph had yet appeared. Finally, I would like to thank Janet Klein for preparing the index.

---

3 I have written an even more succinct account of forbidding wrong that is to appear as the entry ‘al-Nahy ‘an al-munkar’ in the Supplement to the second edition of the Encyclopaedia of Islam. There is also an informative article by W. Madelung in the Encyclopaedia Iranica (London 1982–, art. ‘Amr be ma’ruf’).
This map shows the location of places mentioned in the text, and contains information related to more than one period.