

THE POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY OF NEEDS

This ambitious and lively book argues for a rehabilitation of the concept of 'human needs' as central to politics and political theory. Contemporary political philosophy has focused on issues of justice and welfare to the exclusion of the important issues of political participation, democratic sovereignty and the satisfaction of human needs, and this has had a deleterious effect on political practice. Lawrence Hamilton develops a compelling positive conception of human needs: the evaluation of needs must be located within a more general analysis of institutions, but can in turn help to justify forms of coercive authority that are directed toward the transformation of political and social institutions and practices. His argument is animated throughout by provocative and original discussions of topics such as autonomy, recognition, rights, civil society, liberalism and democracy, and will interest a wide range of readers in political and social philosophy, political theory, law, development and policy.

Lawrence A. Hamilton is Mellon Research Fellow at Clare Hall, Cambridge and Senior Lecturer in the Political Science Programme, Faculty of Human Sciences, University of Natal, Durban, South Africa. He has published a number of journal articles.



THE POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY OF NEEDS

LAWRENCE A. HAMILTON

Clare Hall, Cambridge University of Natal, Durban, South Africa





> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP, United Kingdom

> > CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
> >
> > The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
> > 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
> > 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
> > Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
> > Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Lawrence A. Hamilton 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Adobe Garamond 11/12.5 pt. System LaTeX 2€ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Hamilton, Lawrence A., 1972–
The political philosophy of needs / Lawrence A. Hamilton.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 82782 5
I. Common good. 2. Public interest. 3. Basic needs. 4. Civil society.
5. Democracy. 6. Political participation. 1. Title.
JC330.15.H36 2003 320'01'1 – dc21 2003043811

ISBN 0 521 82782 5 hardback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



You invent luxury I invent humiliation You invent love I invent solitude You invent the law And I invent obedience You invent God And I invent faith You invent work And I invent hands You invent weight And I invent a back You invent another life And I invent resignation You invent sin And I **remain** in Hell So help me God -Tom Zé and Odair Cabesa de Poeta



Contents

Preface		page ix
	Introduction	I
	I Liberalism's rights-preferences couple	2
	2 Beyond the rights-preferences couple	9
	3 The form and outline of the argument	II
I	The nature of needs	21
	1 Need categories	23
	2 Vital needs	27
	3 Particular social needs	31
	4 Agency needs	35
	5 The natures of needs: historical, normative, political	48
2	The formation and interpretation of needs	63
	I Generation and legitimation	65
	2 Normative power and the institution of private property	71
	3 Perception and interpretation	76
	4 Oppression and need	86
	5 True interests	88
	6 The concept of true interest	IOO
3	The political evaluation of needs	103
	I Freedom and rights: a critique of the concept of 'civil society'	104
	2 Practices, institutions, and the evaluation of institutions	116
	3 Roles: reclaiming the census	125
	4 Practical reason and practical imperatives	129
4	The state of needs	134
	I The state	135
	2 The modern state, coercion, and power	140
	3 The state as ultimate evaluator and guarantor for meeting needs	145
	4 Need priority: practical not theoretical	146
	5 Political participation: procedural and institutional proposals	153

vii



viii	Contents	
6 7	Legitimacy and paternalism States of needs	162 168
C	Conclusion What needs to be done? The case of South Africa	171 173
Biblio	ography	185
Index	202	



Preface

This book is about human needs and politics. These are vast, complex areas of human action, interaction, conflict and value, and the reader may wonder why I chose to tackle both topics and not one or the other. The reason is simple. Quite early on I realised that both needs and politics have to be understood in their unexpurgated historical, causal, cognitive and normative contexts, and an understanding of one involves an understanding of the other. I do not profess to have got very far in either task, or in my related task of developing proposals for the evaluation of needs and institutions. That is for the reader to judge. However, the fact that I take this view about how to understand needs and politics explains why I cover two big topics in one relatively small book, and why I hope this contribution to political philosophy may also be of use to moral and legal philosophers, political scientists, economists, sociologists and policy-makers.

What I know about politics and political philosophy in general is, amongst other things, the fruit of many conversations and arguments with a number of people. It gives me great pleasure to single out and thank a few of them. One person in particular has pride of place: Raymond Geuss, my teacher and friend. Raymond was my original thesis supervisor, and I would like to thank him for his constant intellectual inspiration, guidance and discussion, and for his ability simultaneously to encourage freedom over ideas while demanding strict control over delivery. I am deeply grateful to Lisa Brown for many years of creative stimulation, and for providing invaluable criticism of my work at every stage of its development. She found things to discuss and correct on every page of a number of 'final' drafts. I am indebted to Amartya Sen, John Dunn, Stephanie Blankenburg, Ze'ev Emmerich and Geoffrey Hawthorn, all of whom provided searching criticism and patient guidance in reading and commenting on earlier draft chapters and sections. I thank two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press and my original thesis examiners, Andrew Gamble and David Runciman, for their careful reading of the manuscript and for crucial suggestions. I owe



x Preface

particular thanks to David Bilchitz, Lucy Delap, Des Gasper, Freddy Hamilton, Jeesoon Hong, Istvan Hont, Jaeho Kang, Andy Kuper, Melissa Lane, Clive Lawson, Tanni Mukhopadyay, Glen Rangwala, Sanjay Ruparelia, Morag Patrick and Andrea Sangiovanni for reading, criticising and discussing parts of the manuscript with care and fervour. Final thanks go to my parents: pillars of support and founts of knowledge for longer than I can remember. Although I have sometimes been unable or too pigheaded to follow all advice and criticism, all these people have provided invaluable help and stimulus. None of them, however, should be construed as responsible for any of the remaining mistakes and deficiencies in what follows.

I would like to acknowledge the generosity of the Cambridge Commonwealth Trust and the Cambridge Political Economy Society Trust for funding my doctoral research. I am particularly indebted to Clare Hall, Cambridge, for electing me as their Mellon Research Fellow, thereby providing me with financial support and an excellent environment to continue my research. I am very grateful to Cambridge University Press, and in particular Hilary Gaskin, for making the arduous task of transforming a manuscript into a book seem simple.

The final section of the second chapter is an abridged and modified version of my article, 'A Theory of True Interests in the Work of Amartya Sen', *Government and Opposition*, 34. 4 (1999). The first three sections of the third chapter are an extended and developed version of my article, "Civil Society": Critique and Alternative', in *Global Civil Society and Its Limits*, edited by S. Halperin and G. Laxer (London: Palgrave, 2003).

I would like to thank Tom Zé for permission to reprint several lines of the song lyrics from his track 'Ui! (Você Inventa)'. I have been aided in my translation by the translation found in *The Best of Tom Zé* (Milwaukee, WI: Luaka Bop, Inc., 1990).