

Generational Income Mobility in North America and Europe

Labor markets in North America and Europe have changed tremendously in the face of increased globalization and technical progress, raising important challenges for policy makers concerned with equality of opportunity. This book examines the influence of both changes in income inequality and of social policies on the degree to which economic advantage is passed on between parents and children in the rich countries. Standard theoretical models of generational dynamics are extended to examine generational income and earnings mobility over time and across space. Over twenty contributors from North America and Europe offer comparable estimates of the degree of mobility, how it has changed through time, and the impact of government policy. In so doing, they extend the analytical tool kit used in the study of generational mobility, and offer insights for not only the conduct of future research but also directions for policies dealing with equality of opportunity and child poverty.

MILES CORAK is Director of Family and Labour Studies at Statistics Canada. He is also adjunct professor with the Department of Economics at Carleton University, a Research Fellow at the Institute for the Study of Labor (Bonn), and during 2003/04 was a visiting researcher at the UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre. He is the editor of Government Finances and Generational Equity (1998) and Labour Markets, Social Institutions, and the Future of Canada's Children (1998).



Generational Income Mobility in North America and Europe

EDITED BY

MILES CORAK





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

© Cambridge University Press 2004

http://www.cambridge.org

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Sabon 10/13 pt. System \LaTeX 2 $_{\mathcal{E}}$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Generational Income Mobility in North America and Europe / edited by Miles Corak.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 82760 4

Income distribution – North America.
 Income distribution – Europe.
 Social mobility – North America.
 Social mobility – Europe.
 Corak, Miles.
 HC95.Z9I514 2004

339.2′2 – dc22 2004045659

ISBN 0 521 82760 4 hardback

The publisher has used its best endeavors to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



In loving memory of David Anton Corak



Contents

List	t of figures	page ix
List	t of tables	X
List	t of contributors	XV
Pre	face	xviii
1	Generational income mobility in North America and Europe: an introduction Miles Corak	1
2	A model of intergenerational mobility variation over time and place <i>Gary Solon</i>	38
3	Equal opportunity and intergenerational mobility: going beyond intergenerational income transition matrices <i>John E. Roemer</i>	48
4	Intergenerational mobility for whom? The experience of high- and low-earning sons in international perspective <i>Nathan D. Grawe</i>	58
5	What do trends in the intergenerational economic mobility of sons and daughters in the United States mean <i>Susan E. Mayer and Leonard M. Lopoo</i>	? 90
6	Changes in intergenerational mobility in Britain Jo Blanden, Alissa Goodman, Paul Gregg, and Stephen Machin	122
7	Intergenerational mobility in Britain: new evidence from the British Household Panel Survey John Ermisch and Marco Francesconi	147

vii



viii	Co	ontents
8	Non-linear patterns of intergenerational mobility in Germany and the United States Kenneth A. Couch and Dean R. Lillard	190
9	Family structure and labor market success: the influence of siblings and birth order on the earnings of young adults in Norway, Finland, and Sweden Anders Björklund, Tor Eriksson, Markus Jäntti, Oddbjørn Raaum, and Eva Österbacka	207
10	New evidence on the intergenerational correlation in welfare participation Marianne E. Page	226
11	Intergenerational influences on the receipt of unemployment insurance in Canada and Sweden Miles Corak, Björn Gustafsson, and Torun Österberg	245
12	Unequal opportunities and the mechanisms of social inheritance Gøsta Esping-Andersen	289
Ind	lex	315



Figures

4.1	An illustration of the relationship between quantile	
	regression and equality of opportunity: regression in	
	earned income at the 95 th quantile compared with	
	regression at the average and at the 5^{th} quantile page	ge 64
4.2	Sensitivity of published estimates of intergenerational	
	earnings elasticities to life-cycle bias	66
5.1	Trends in intergenerational income elasticities,	
	sons and daughters	102
7.1	Kernel density estimates of the father's, mother's, and	
	child's HG score distribution by child gender	163
7.2	Estimated γ for father–child pairs by cohort and	
	percentile of the father's Hope–Goldthorpe	
	score – quantile regressions	175
7.3	Estimated γ for mother–child pairs by cohort and	
	percentile of the mother's Hope–Goldthorpe	
	score – quantile regressions	176
10.1	Number of recipients of aid for families with dependent	
	children as a proportion of the total US population	236
10.2	Intergenerational welfare correlation over time, by	
	three-year birth cohorts	237
11.1	Schematic overview of the intergenerational transmission	
	of UI status	250
11.2a	Estimated hazard rates governing time to first UI use:	
	Canadian men between 16 and 30 years	273
11.2b	Estimated hazard rates governing time to first UI use:	
	Swedish men between 16 and 28 years	274

ix



Tables

4.1	Data sources for the analysis of intergenerational	
	earnings mobility	page 65
4.2	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity	
	between fathers and sons: United States	71
4.3	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings	
	elasticity between fathers and sons: United States	
	and Canada	74
4.4	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity	
	between fathers and sons: United States and Germany	76
4.5	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity between	veen
	fathers and sons: United States and the United Kingdom	78
4.6	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity	
	between fathers and sons: United States and	
	Malaysia	80
4. 7	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity	
	between fathers and sons: selected developing countries	83
4.8	Estimates of the intergenerational earnings elasticity	
	between fathers and sons (excluding business and farm	
	income): Nepal and Pakistan	84
4.9	Estimates of the return to education in the father	
	generation	84
5.1	Sample characteristics for sons and daughters	99
5.2	Descriptive statistics for parents' income and child's	
	income by three- or four-year cohorts	100
5.3	Test of linear trend in the elasticity of parental income	
	and sons' and daughters' income	104
5.4	Employment and marital status of children	106
5.5	Elasticity of sons' and daughters' income with respect to	
	parents' income by work and marital status	106

 \mathbf{X}



List o	of tables	xi
5.6	Observed and predicted trends in the elasticity	
J.0	of children's income with respect to parents'	
	income due to changes in women's labor market	
	work and marriage rates	108
5.7	Least Squares estimates of the trend in the	100
0.7	intergenerational income elasticity by marital status	
	for sons and daughters	110
5.8	Proportion of PSID sample lost to attrition,	
	by gender	112
5A.1	Unstandardized and standardized LS regression	
	coefficients for the effect of the logarithm of parental	
	income on the logarithm of child's income for three-year	
	rolling cohorts	116
5A.2	Unstandardized and standardized LS regression	
	coefficients for the effect of parental income on child's	
	income by year	118
6.1	Descriptive statistics for two cohorts of men and women	
	in the United Kingdom	130
6.2	Least Squares estimates of the changes in intergenerational	
	income mobility	132
6.3	Assessing measurement error in the British Cohort Study,	
	the impact of time-averaging parental income on the	
	intergenerational income elasticity	135
6.4	Sensitivity analysis of the extent of possible measurement	
	error across birth cohorts for sons	137
6.5	Changes in intergenerational mobility and educational	
	upgrading	139
	Quartile transition matrices for sons	141
	Quartile transition matrices for daughters	141
6.7a	Quartile transition matrices for sons conditional	
	on education	142
6.7b	Quartile transition matrices for daughters conditional	
	on education	142
7.1	Studies of intergenerational income and earnings mobility	
	in Britain	150
7.2	Descriptive statistics of selected variables of interest by	4
	sample: means and standard deviations	162



xii List of tables

7.3	Estimates of intergenerational mobility in occupational	
	status: permanent fixed-effects estimates using the general	
	sample	165
7.4	An assessment of the influence of measurement error on	
	intergenerational mobility in occupational status	169
7 . 5	Permanent fixed-effects estimates of intergenerational	
	mobility by percentile of parent's Hope-Goldthorpe	
	score: quantile regressions estimates using the	
	General Sample	171
7.6	Estimates of intergenerational mobility in earnings and	
	income: LS, LS average, and IV based upon the Matched	
	Sample	179
7A.1	Estimates of intergenerational mobility in occupational	
	status: alternative measures of child's Hope–Goldthorpe	
	score using the General Sample	185
7A.2	Permanent occupational prestige by cohort: father-child	
	pairs from the General Sample	186
7A.3	Permanent occupational prestige by cohort: mother-child	
0.4	pairs from the General Sample	186
8.1	Descriptive statistics for analytical samples: United States	40-
	and Germany	197
8.2	Least Squares regression estimates of intergenerational	
	earnings mobility in the United States and Germany:	100
0.3	sons 18 years and older	199
8.3	Least Squares regression estimates of intergenerational	
	earnings mobility in the United States and Germany:	200
0.4	sons 25 years and older	200
8.4	Estimated intergenerational earnings elasticities by father's	
	earnings quintile, Germany and the United States:	202
0 5	sons 18 years and older	202
0.3	Estimated intergenerational earnings elasticities by father's earnings quintile, Germany and the United States:	
	sons 25 years and older	203
9 1	An overview of the data used in the earnings analysis:	203
7.1	Finland, Norway, and Sweden	211
9 2	Descriptive overview of family structure by gender	215
	The influence of family background on earnings:	213
7.5	Least Squares regression results	216
	Zunt squares regression results	_10



List of	tables	X111
9.4	Sample sizes for the estimation of sibling correlations:	
	numbers of individuals and families	219
9.5	Estimated sibling correlations by family structure	220
10.1	Estimated probabilities of welfare participation using	
	different observation windows	231
10.2	Published estimates of the intergenerational correlation	
	of welfare receipt in the United States	232
10.3	Estimated trends in the importance of family background	
	in determining the probability of welfare receipt	239
11.1	Correlations in the use of unemployment insurance	
	between fathers and sons: Canada and Sweden	255
11.2a	Descriptive statistics for the analyses of time to first	
	spell and longitudinal patterns in UI use: Canada	259
11.2b	Descriptive statistics for the analyses of time to first spell	
44.0	and longitudinal patterns in UI use: Sweden	261
11.3a	Time to first UI use for Canadian men: summary of logit	261
44 21	estimates of the hazard function	264
11.30	Time to first UI use for Swedish men: summary of logit	2/0
11 1	estimates of the hazard function	268
11. 4 a	Logit estimates of the hazard rate governing time to first	270
11 1h	use of UI: Canada, men aged 16 to 30 Logit estimates of the hazard rate governing time to first	2/0
11.40	use of UI: Sweden, men aged 16 to 28	272
11 5	Estimated hazard and survivor rates: time to first UI	2/2
11.5	spell, Canada and Sweden	275
11 6a	The impact of individual learning and social capital on	2/3
11.04	the probability of using UI: summary of estimates from	
	random effects probit models for Canadian men	277
11.6b	The impact of individual learning and social capital on	
	the probability of using UI: summary of estimates from	
	random effects probit models for Swedish men	278
11.7a	Random effect probit estimates of the probability of	
	UI use: Canadian men from the ages of 16 to 31	280
11.7b	Random effect probit estimates of the probability of	
	UI use: Swedish men from the ages of 16 to 28	282
12.1	<u>-</u>	
	attainment and on cognitive performance of children	
	in eight countries	300



xiv	List o	f tables
12.2	Least Squares regression results of the impact of family	
	background on the cognitive performance of children	
	in six countries	302
12.3	Least Squares regression estimates of the impact of	
	education and cognitive ability on annual earnings	
	in the United States and Sweden	305



Contributors

- ANDERS BJÖRKLUND is Professor of Economics at the Swedish Institute for Social Research (SOFI) at Stockholm University. He was visiting professor at the University of Michigan in 1995/96. In recent years his research has focused on intergenerational income mobility, economics of education, and earnings and income inequality.
- JO BLANDEN is a Research Officer at the Centre for Economic Performance at the London School of Economics.
- MILES CORAK is Director of Family and Labour Studies at Statistics Canada and a Research Fellow of the Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA), Bonn, Germany. During 2003/04 he was a visiting researcher at the UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre, Florence, Italy.
- KENNETH A. COUCH is an Associate Professor in the economics department at the University of Connecticut. His research interests include inequality, intergenerational mobility, and the analysis of government programs designed to assist the poor.
- TOR ERIKSSON is a Professor in Economics at the Aarhus School of Business and a Research Director at the Center for Corporate Performance in Aarhus, Denmark. His research interests include intergenerational mobility and topics in personnel and labor economics.
- JOHN ERMISCH is a Professor at the Institute for Social and Economic Research at the University of Essex and a Fellow of the British Academy. His research deals with how markets interact with household and demographic decisions. His latest book is *An Economic Analysis of the Family* (Princeton University Press, 2003).
- GØSTA ESPING-ANDERSEN is Professor of Political and Social Sciences at the University of Pompeu Fabra in Barcelona. His recent



xvi

List of contributors

books include Social Foundations of Postindustrial Economies (Oxford, 1999) and Why We Need a New Welfare State (Oxford, 2003).

- MARCO FRANCES CONI is Principal Research Officer at the Institute for Social and Economic Research at the University of Essex. His current research interests include economic analyses of labor market dynamics, intergenerational links, and public policy evaluations.
- ALISSA GOODMAN is the Programme Director of the Education, Employment, and Evaluation Sector at the Institute for Fiscal Studies, London.
- NATHAN D. GRAWE is Assistant Professor of Economics at Carleton College, Northfield, Minnesota. His research examines the transmission of economic inequalities within the family and in particular the role of educational financing.
- PAUL GREGG is a Reader in the Economics Department at the University of Bristol. He has research associations with the Centre for Market and Public Organisation at Bristol, the Centre for Economic Performance at the London School of Economic, and is a member of the Council of Economic Advisers at HM Treasury.
- BJÖRN GUSTAFSSON is Professor at the Department of Social Work, Göteborg University, Sweden, and a Research Fellow of the Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA), Bonn, Germany.
- MARKUS JÄNTTI is a Professor in the Department of Economics and Statistics at Abo Akademi University in Finland. His research interests include inequality, poverty, and socio-economic mobility, particularly in a comparative context.
- DEAN R. LILLARD is Senior Research Associate in the Department of Policy Analysis and Management at Cornell University. His research interests include intergenerational mobility, the economics of education, and health economics.
- LEONARD M. LOPOO is an Assistant Professor of Public Administration at the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs at Syracuse University. His research focuses on the economics of the family.



List of contributors

xvii

- STEPHEN MACHIN is Professor of Economics at University College London, Director of the Centre for the Economics of Education, and Research Director of the Centre for Economic Performance at the London School of Economics. He is a co-editor of the *Economic Journal*, and has been visiting Professor at Harvard University (1993/4) and at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (2001/2).
- SUSAN E. MAYER is Dean and Associate Professor at the Harris School of Public Policy Studies at the University of Chicago.
- MARIANNE E. PAGE is Associate Professor of Economics at the University of California, Davis. Her research interests include intergenerational mobility and the behavioral effects of education and welfare programs.
- EVA ÖSTERBACKA is Assistant Professor at the Department of Economics and Statistics, Åbo Akademi University. Her main research deals with the relationship between family background and economic outcomes.
- TORUN ÖSTERBERG is affiliated with the Department of Social Work, Göteborg University, Sweden.
- ODDBJØRN RAAUM is a Senior Research Fellow at The Ragnar Frisch Centre for Economic Research, University of Oslo. His research deals with wage formation, labor market policies, economic return to education, labor market performance among immigrants, and the impact of family background on adult socio-economic outcomes.
- JOHN E. ROEMER is Elizabeth S. and A. Varick Stout Professor of Political Science and Economics at Yale University. He currently works on issues at the intersection of political philosophy, economics, and politics.
- GARY SOLON is Professor of Economics at the University of Michigan.



Preface

This volume contains twelve essays from twenty-three collaborators, and spans - to varying degrees - ten countries in North America and Europe, as well as touching upon the experience of a further five with lower levels of per capita income. It grew out of a substantive concern with the need for internationally comparable results in the analysis of generational income mobility. The early 1990s witnessed a number of data and methodological developments that revitalized research on this topic in labor economics, and which began to complement a long-standing literature in sociology. As more and more studies of the relationship between parental income and the adult labor market success of children became available, concerns about the comparability of the findings both within and across countries began to be expressed. The idea for this volume springs from this concern, and it is intended to present the major findings and methods to researchers in the area but also to a broader audience concerned with mobility across the generations from both a research and policy perspective.

The initial idea and planning for the project sprang from conversations between Anders Björklund, Marco Francesconi, Susan Mayer, and myself. I am, in the first instance, grateful for their collaboration and to the former Canadian International Labour Network for supporting the initial planning by sponsoring our participation at one of its conferences. I would also in particular like to thank Statistics Canada for funding and hosting a workshop that brought the majority of the collaborators together in Ottawa during February 2001 to present and discuss initial drafts of the chapters. Christopher Jencks and Sascha Becker also participated in this workshop and their input to the discussions is much appreciated. Thanks are also due to Gert Wagner and the staff of the Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung (DIW) for sponsoring and hosting a follow-up workshop

xviii



Preface xix

in Berlin in June 2001 at which a number of revised chapter drafts were reviewed. Finally, I thank Chris Harrison, Patricia Maurice, Alison Powell, and their colleagues at the Cambridge University Press for their review of the project and work in shepherding it through the production process.