Ligeti, Kurtág, and Hungarian Music during the Cold War

Drawing on key elements from musical thought in inter-war Hungary, this book provides a new perspective on the nation’s musical heritage both inside and outside Hungary’s borders during the Cold War. Although Ligeti became part of the Western avant-garde after he left Hungary in 1956, archival sources illuminate his ongoing contact with Hungarian musicians, and their shifting perspective on his work. Kurtág’s music was more obviously involved with Hungarian traditions, was entangled with the Soviet occupation, and was a contributing part of the city’s diverse musical culture. However, from the mid-1960s onwards, critics identified his music as an artistic and moral ‘truth’ distinct from the broader musical life of Budapest: it was an idealised symbol of life beyond the everyday in Hungary. Grounding her interpretations of works in these complex political circumstances, Beckles Willson is nonetheless sympathetic to arguments by Ligeti, Kurtág, and Budapest music critics that their music might have a life beyond nationalist and Cold War ideology.

Rachel Beckles Willson is Reader in the Music Department at Royal Holloway, University of London. She is the author of György Kurtág’s ‘The Sayings of Péter Bornemiszsa’ op. 7 (2004) and she has many articles published in journals including Contemporary Music Review, Slavonica, Music and Letters, and Central Europe.
Music in the 20th Century

**General Editor** Arnold Whittall

This series offers a wide perspective on music and musical life in the twentieth century. Books included range from historical and biographical studies concentrating particularly on the context and circumstances in which composers were writing, to analytical and critical studies concerned with the nature of musical language and questions of compositional process. The importance given to context will also be reflected in studies dealing with, for example, the patronage, publishing, and promotion of new music, and in accounts of the musical life of particular countries.

*Other titles in the series*

- James Pritchett
  The music of John Cage

- Joseph Straus
  The music of Ruth Crawford Seeger

- Kyle Gann
  The music of Conlon Nancarrow

- Jonathan Cross
  The Stravinsky legacy

- Michael Nyman
  Experimental music: Cage and beyond

- Jennifer Doctor
  The BBC and ultra-modern music, 1922–1936

- Robert Adlington
  The music of Harrison Birtwistle

- Keith Potter
  Four musical minimalists: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass

- Carlo Caballero
  Fauré and French musical aesthetics

- Peter Burt
  The music of Toru Takemitsu

- David Clarke
  The music and thought of Michael Tippett: modern times and metaphysics

- M. J. Grant
  Serial music, serial aesthetics: compositional theory in post-war Europe

- Philip Rupprecht
  Britten’s musical language

- Mark Carroll
  Music and ideology in Cold War Europe
Adrian Thomas
Polish music since Szymanowski

J. P. E. Harper-Scott
Edward Elgar, modernist

Yayoi Uno Everett
The music of Louis Andriessen

Ethan Haimo
Schoenberg’s transformation of musical language

Rachel Beckles Willson
Ligeti, Kurtág, and Hungarian Music during the Cold War
For Tony, Robina, Mark and Rob.
And with warm memories of Naomi, who even learned some Hungarian.
I am even jealous of their language, which contains nothing human, whose sound calls forth another world – forceful and harsh as a prayer, comparable to a roar, to a plea, its enunciation perpetuating the very accents of hell. Even if I know only its swear words, it gives me endless pleasure; I cannot listen to enough of it – it enchants me and petrifies me – I am astounded by all the beauty and the horror its words contain, words as sweet as nectar and as bitter as cyanide, so perfectly appropriate for the expression of death throes. It is in Hungarian one must expire, or refuse death altogether.

Émile Cioran: *History and Utopia* (1960)

Imagine a garden maze, a maze in which mirrors conceal the hedges, giving the illusion of open space and free movement but also distorting wildly, as in a fairground hall of mirrors. At one corner you look impossibly tall, thin, and pale, like the poet Petőfi; at the next, absurdly squat. First you confidently step forward – and hit a mirror. Then you nervously edge around an open space. But sometimes you can walk straight through a mirror (or hedge), only to find yourself in another alley. Here you meet the administrator of the maze, himself lost in it.

This is Hungary . . .

The maze has its own language. I call it the Hungarian Periphrastic. It is a language of diabolical circumlocution, of convoluted allegory and serpentine metaphor, all guarded by a crack regiment of sub-Germanic abstract compound-nouns. Nothing is said directly. Everyone is taken from behind. A spade is never a spade. A crime is never a crime . . . It is the intellectual version of an attitude that prevails in the whole society: that of getting around the system rather than confronting it, of finding loopholes and niches rather than making demands of the state; and the premise of this attitude is . . . the essential permanence and immutability of the system . . .

The hedges move daily.

Timothy Garton Ash

('A Hungarian Lesson', 1985)
## Contents

- List of music examples    page xi
- Acknowledgements           xiii
- Note on the text            xvi

### Introduction 1

#### PART I

1. After 1920: on land, language and music   13

2. After 1945: a new empire forms   26
   - Institutional transformations 27
   - Discourses about music: an overview   31
     - 1945–1948 ♦ After 1949
   - Specific discourses and their musics 42
     - Music for children ♦ Music for worship ♦ Instrumental music (Music without language?) ♦ Formalism
   - Silences 59
     - Public silence ♦ Private silence (music and language reconsidered)

#### PART II

3. After 1956: the parting of ways   77
   - Hungarian contexts 78
     - Budapest ♦ Kurtag, at home ♦ Ligeti, escaped
   - Juxtapositions 92
     - Language as music ♦ Language in music ♦ Music as 'language' (Darkness and Light)
   - Hungarian contexts revisited 115
     - Ligeti as longing ♦ Kurtag as object of longing

4. After 1968: Budapest, Kurtag, and events   127
   - Politics and culture in Budapest 127
   - Kurtag's presence 137
     - Music and Passion ♦ Interlude: Games, or passing the message on ♦ Music and teaching, music and seeking

5. After 'The West': Ligeti looks back   163
   - Ligeti as émigré 164
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter/Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hungary abroad?</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language in music: home?</td>
<td>♦ Language as music ♦ Light and dark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ligeti in Hungary</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 After Budapest: out of Hungary?</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budapest, dissolution, and the end of the Cold War</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtág's Voices</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian intimations</td>
<td>♦ Central European truths ♦ Hungarian ideals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>♦ Voices from elsewhere?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue: On 'Hungary', and (our) longing for Moscow</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bluebeard and Three Sisters</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longing and myth</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coming home</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Personalia | 234  |
- Bibliography | 244  |
- Index | 273  |
Music examples

2.1 Ligeti, ‘A Merchant Came with Giant Birds’, from Three We¨ores Songs, close 70
2.2 Ligeti, Night, bb. 39–44 73
3.1 Kurt ´ag, String Quartet op. 1, movement 1, bb. 1–5 93
3.2 Kurt ´ag, analytical note to Ligeti’s sound blocks 94
3.3 Kurt ´ag, Eight Piano Pieces op. 3, movement 1, extract 95
3.4 Kurt ´ag, ‘Spring’, movement 1 from The Sayings of P´eter Bornemisza, close 102
3.5 Kurt ´ag, Wind Quintet op. 2, movement 1 108
3.6 Kurt ´ag, Eight Duos op. 5, movement 7 109
3.7 Kurt ´ag, ‘Sin’, movement 1 from The Sayings of Péter Bornemisza, close 110
3.8 Kurt ´ag, ‘Death’, movement 7 from The Sayings of Péter Bornemisza, bb. 1–4 111
3.9 Kurt ´ag, ‘Death’, movement 3 from The Sayings of Péter Bornemisza 112
3.10 Pascal Decroupet and Inge Kov ´acs, analysis of Ligeti’s Atmosph`eres 113
3.11 Kurt ´ag, String Quartet op. 1, movement 1, close 115
3.12 Ligeti, String Quartet no. 2, close 116
4.1 Kurt ´ag, ‘In memoriam F. M. Dostoevsky’ (Four Songs to Poems by J´anos Pilinszky op. 11) 142
4.2 Kurt ´ag, Splinters op. 6c, movement 2 146
4.3 Kurt ´ag, Splinters op. 6c, movement 4, opening 147
4.4 Kurt ´ag, ‘Key to Signs Used’, from Games 150
4.5 Kurt ´ag, ‘Let’s Be Silly’, from Games Volume I 151
4.6 Kurt ´ag, ‘Objet trouv´é (2)’, from Games Volume I 152
4.7 Kurt ´ag, Prelude and Waltz in C, from Games Volume I 154
4.8 Kurt ´ag, ‘Antiphony in f-sharp’, from Games Volume II 156
4.9 Kurt ´ag, ‘So that We Never Get out of Practice’, from S. K. Remembrance Noise op. 12 158
4.10 Kurt ´ag, “Two Lines from “Tapes””, from S. K. Remembrance Noise op. 12 159
4.11 Kurt ´ag, ‘The Sadness of the Bare Copula’, from S. K. Remembrance Noise op. 12 160
4.12 Kurt ´ag, Hommage `a Mih´aly Andr´as. 12 Microludes for String Quartet op. 13, movement 1 161
## List of music examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Analysis of Ligeti, <em>Drei Hölderlin Fantasien</em> no. 1, bb. 1–13</td>
<td>Ligeti</td>
<td>171</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Kodály <em>Evening Song</em>, bb. 1–18</td>
<td>Kodály</td>
<td>174</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Ligeti, <em>Hungarian Studies</em> no. 2, bb. 1–8</td>
<td>Ligeti</td>
<td>175</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Ligeti, ‘Fém’ (Metal), from <em>Piano Études</em>, extract</td>
<td>Ligeti</td>
<td>179</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Bocet ‘dúpá soť’ (Lament for husband)</td>
<td>Ligeti</td>
<td>180</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Bartók, String Quartet no. 6, movement 4, bb. 1–6</td>
<td>Bartók</td>
<td>186</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘Rimma Dalos: O Love, the Edifier!’, <em>Omaggio a Luigi Nono</em> op. 16, close</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>203</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘Hommage-message to Pierre Boulez’, <em>Kafka Fragments</em> op. 24, opening</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>213</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘I Am Dirty Milena’, <em>Kafka Fragments</em> op. 24, close</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>214</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘The Water Thickens’, <em>Attila József Fragments</em> op. 20</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>216</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘Song, Lean Out of My Lips’, <em>Attila József Fragments</em> op. 20</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>217</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘Mercy, Mother’, <em>Attila József Fragments</em> op. 20</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>218</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘The Sweet Breeze Purls Along’, <em>Attila József Fragments</em> op. 20</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>219</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Kurtág, ‘There’ll Be Tender Meat’, <em>Attila József Fragments</em> op. 20</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>220</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Kurtág, . . . quasi una fantasia . . . op. 27 no. 1, movement 1, close</td>
<td>Kurtág</td>
<td>223</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Ligeti, Piano Concerto, movement 2, close</td>
<td>Ligeti</td>
<td>224</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I began gathering materials for this book in 1999, and the long intervening period has placed me in debt to a large number of people. At the Paul Sacher Foundation I received much help from Felix Meyer and Ulrich Mosch, as well as unstinting technical support from Evelyn Diendorf, Christina Dreier, Carlos Chanfón and Matthias Kassel. At the Hungarian Music Council Ágnes Páldy welcomed and aided my research process, I was also well supported by staff at the Hungarian National Archive, at Artpool, the National Philharmonia concert agency, as well as many libraries in Budapest, including the Hungarian Music Information Centre (special thanks to Eszter Vida). Márta Papp, at Hungarian Radio, was exceptionally generous with her time. The staff at Boosey and Hawkes in London have kindly opened their cabinet of archived concert reviews to me on more than one occasion.

Sabbatical leave funded by the University of Bristol, along with Parallel Leave funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Board, underwrote my major archival searches in Budapest in 2002 and 2003. A British Academy Small Research Grant enabled me to research at the Paul Sacher Foundation in 2003 and 2004, as well as pay for research assistance from Vera Kusz, István G. Németh and Lóránt Péteri, who filled some gaps in my archival searches. An award from Music & Letters contributed to final reproduction costs and musical typesetting (for which thanks to Christopher Brown).

I should like to express gratitude to a number of individuals in Budapest whose conversations have been of special guidance. Mária Feuer, Eszter Lázár, Tibor Tallián and Bálint András Varga each had a story to tell about the media in the 1970s and 1980s, László Vidovszky, Zoltán Jeney, László Sáry and András Wilheim offered valuable insights into the New Music Studio and its controversies; László Tihanyi provided recollections of concert life in the 1980s. János Breuer, Adrienne Csengery, János Demény, László Dobszay, Péter Eötvös, István Láng, András Székely and András Szöllösy each offered personal perspectives. I was immensely privileged to work with Kurtág during my studies at the Liszt Academy between 1992 and 1995, and I am grateful for both the contact I have had with him subsequently and the generosity with which he has responded to my queries.

Invitations to interdisciplinary conferences organised in 2001, 2003 and 2004 by György Péteri (as part of the Program on East European Cultures & Societies at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology) were of
considerable value and inspiration as I mapped out the broader intellectual background for the research. Conferences on which I collaborated with Adrian Thomas at Cardiff University and the University of Bristol in 2001 (Socialist Realism in Central European Music: 1945–1955) and 2002 (The Modernisms of the 1960s in Czechoslovakia, Hungary and Poland) also contributed substantially as the project evolved.

In bringing the book to its final form, I’ve had great support from colleagues and friends who have read all or part of the manuscript in earlier versions. Here I should mention Andrea Bohlman, Anna Dalos, Péter Halász, Barry Millington, Ferenc Rados, Jim Samson, Florian Scheding and Richard Steinitz in particular, as well as my ever-supportive editor Arnold Whittall. Peter Sherwood’s checking my Hungarian translations was also of tremendous assistance, but was really only the final touch to eight years of regular input to and encouragement of my work on Hungary, for which I am extremely grateful. I also thank other Hungarianist friends Lynn Hooker, Michael Kunkel, David Schneider, Claudio Veress, Alan E. Williams and Tim Wilkinson for their interest and frequent help. And without the involvement of Béla Simon, of course, the book would have been scarcely imaginable.


I acknowledge the permission given by publishers for the reproductions of musical extracts as follows:

**Works by Kurtág**

Eight Piano Pieces op. 3 © Copyright 1965 by Zeneműkiadó Vállalat, Budapest, with rights with Universal Edition A. G., Vienna for all countries other than Hungary, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Poland, Bulgaria, Romania, Albania, and the former Soviet Union.

Four Songs op. 11 © Copyright 1979 by Editio Musica, Budapest, for Hungary, Albania, Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, China, the former Yugoslavia, Poland, Romania and the former Soviet Union. © Copyright 1979 for all other countries by Universal Edition A. G., Vienna.
Acknowledgements

The Sayings of Peter Bornemisza op. 7 © 1973 by Editio Musica, Budapest for Hungary, Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Poland, Romania and the former Soviet Union. © 1973 by Universal Edition A. G., Vienna for all other countries. German text © 1973 by Universal Edition A. G., Vienna. English text © 1973 by Editio Musica, Budapest. String Quartet op. 1, Wind Quintet op. 2, Eight Duos op. 5, Splinters op. 6c, Games S. K. Remembrance Noise op. 12, Hommage à Mihály András 12 Microludes for String Quartet op. 13, Omaggio à Luigi Nono op. 16, Atila József Fragments op. 20, Kafka Fragments op. 24, . . . quasi una fantasia . . . op. 27 no. 1 © Copyright Editio Musica, Budapest. Reproduced by kind permission.

Works by Kodály

Evening Song © Editio Musica, Budapest. Reproduced by kind permission.

Works by Ligeti

String Quartet no. 2 © 1971
Éjszaka © 1973
Magyar Etűdök © 1983
Piano Concerto © 1986.
‘Fém’ [Metal] No. 8 from Etudes, Book II © 1998
Három Weöres Dal © 2004

All copyright Schott Musik International GmbH & Co. KG, Mainz. Reproduced by permission. All rights reserved.

I also thank the Paul Sacher Foundation for permission to quote from letters housed in the collections of György Kurtág, Ligeti, and Sándor Veress. Copyright remains with the authors of these letters, and I have gained permission to make citations wherever possible.

Finally, I thank Mr János Vasilescu for permission to reproduce Lili Ország’s ‘Sárga holdportrét, Holdak, Holdfej, Hold és föld’ [Yellow Moon Portrait: moons, moon head, moon and earth] (1957) on the dust jacket.
The text refers to a large number of critics and composers whose names will be unfamiliar to most readers. On their first appearance I have attempted to make their significance clear, but I have also provided a ‘Personalia’ at the back of the book that fills out additional biographical data, including professional genealogies and affiliations.

Archives are abbreviated in footnotes as follows:

- **MOL** Magyar Országos Levéltár (Hungarian National Archive)
- **MZT** Magyar Zenei Tanács (Hungarian Music Council)
- **PSF** Paul Sacher Foundation

Documents housed at the MOL and MZT are listed individually and numbered in the ‘Archives’ section of the Bibliography, and are referenced in the footnotes as ‘MOL document 1’, ‘MOL document 2’, and so forth.

Collections within the Paul Sacher Foundation:
- **GKC** György Kurtág Collection
- **GLC** György Ligeti Collection
- **SVC** Sándor Veress Collection

I have presented the titles of Hungarian musical works initially in Hungarian (with an English translation), and thereafter in English only. I have provided translations of journal titles appearing only once in the text itself; but more significant and/or regularly appearing journals and newspapers remain in Hungarian. These are the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hungarian Title</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Zene</td>
<td>Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Élet és Irodalom</td>
<td>Life and Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filharmónia műsorfüzet</td>
<td>Programme Booklet of the Philharmonia Concert Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magyar Kórus</td>
<td>Hungarian Chorus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magyar Nemzet</td>
<td>Hungarian Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magyar Zene</td>
<td>Hungarian Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magyar Zenei Szemle</td>
<td>Hungarian Musical Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Népszabadság</td>
<td>People’s Freedom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nyugat</td>
<td>West</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pesti Napló</td>
<td>[Buda]Pest Diary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note on the text

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hungarian</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Szabad Nép</td>
<td>Free Folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Színház</td>
<td>Theatre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Új Zenei Szemle</td>
<td>New Musical Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zenei Szemle</td>
<td>Musical Review</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>