Beyond Comparison: Sex and Discrimination

In *Beyond Comparison: Sex and Discrimination* Timothy Macklem addresses foundational issues in the long-running debate in legal, political, and social theory about the nature of gender discrimination. He takes the highly original and controversial view that the heart of discrimination lies not in the unfavourable comparisons with the treatment and opportunities that men enjoy but rather in a denial of resources and opportunities that women need to lead successful and meaningful lives as women. Therefore, to understand what women need we must first understand what it is to be a woman.

By displaying an impressive command of the feminist literature as well as intellectual rigour, this work promises to be a milestone in the debate about gender equality and will interest students and professionals in the areas of legal theory and gender studies.

Timothy Macklem is Lecturer in Law at King’s College London.
Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law

GENERAL EDITOR: GERALD POSTEMA
(UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA, CHAPEL HILL)

ADVISORY BOARD
Jules Coleman (Yale Law School)
Antony Duff (University of Stirling)
David Lyons (Boston University)
Neil MacCormick (University of Edinburgh)
Stephen R. Munzer (U.C.L.A. Law School)
Phillip Pettit (Princeton University)
Joseph Raz (University of Oxford)
Jeremy Waldron (Columbia Law School)

Some other books in the series:
Stephen R. Munzer: A Theory of Property
R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris (eds.): Liability and Responsibility: Essays in Law and Morals
Robert F. Schopp: Automatism, Insanity, and the Psychology of Criminal Responsibility
Steven J. Burton: Judging in Good Faith
Jules Coleman: Risks and Wrongs
Suzanne Uniacke: Permissible Killing: The Self-Defense Justification of Homicide
Jules Coleman and Allan Buchanan (eds.): In Harm’s Way: Essays in Honor of Joel Feinberg
John Fischer and Mark Ravizza: Responsibility and Control
R. A. Duff (ed.): Philosophy and the Criminal Law
Larry Alexander (ed.): Constitutinalism
R. Schopp: Justification Defenses and Just Convictions
Anthony Sebok: Legal Postivism in American Jurisprudence
William Edmundson: Three Anarchial Fallacies: An Essay on Political Authority
Arthur Ripstein: Equality, Responsibility, and the Law
Heidi M. Hurd: Moral Combat
Steven J. Burton (ed.): “The Path of the Law” and Its Influence: The Legacy of Oliver Wendell Holmes, Jr.
Jody S. Kraus and Steven D. Walt (eds.): The Jurisprudential Foundations of Corporate and Commercial Law
Christopher Kutz: Complicity: Ethics and Law for a Collective Age
Peter Benson (ed.): The Theory of Contract Law: New Essays
Philip Soper: The Ethics of Deference

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
Beyond Comparison:
Sex and Discrimination

Timothy Macklem
King’s College London
For Gail Thorson
## Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
page xi

1. The Issues  
   1. DISCRIMINATION AND EQUALITY  
      1
   2. DISCRIMINATION AND DIFFERENCE  
      4
   3. DISCRIMINATION WITHOUT COMPARISON  
      10
   4. COMPARISON AND NONCOMPARISON  
      16
   5. EQUALITY, DIFFERENCE, AND THE ENDING OF ROLES  
      19
   6. WHAT IT MEANS TO LEAD A SUCCESSFUL LIFE  
      23
   7. WHAT IT MEANS TO BE A WOMAN  
      33
   8. RADICAL INQUIRIES  
      39

2. Equality  
   1. INTRODUCTION  
      43
   2. DIFFERENCE AND DOMINANCE  
      44
   3. IMPLICATIONS  
      58
   4. CONCLUSION  
      71

3. Difference  
   1. INTRODUCTION  
      79
   2. THE DECONSTRUCTION OF GENDER  
      82
   3. THE RENEWAL OF GENDER  
      91

4. Reasons for Feminism  
   1. THE VALUE OF DIVERSITY  
      107
   2. THE CHARACTER OF DISADVANTAGE  
      109
   3. THE ROLE OF SEXUAL IDENTITY IN A SUCCESSFUL LIFE  
      113

5. The Value of Diversity  
   1. THE NATURE OF DIVERSITY  
      121
   2. THE RELEVANCE OF DIVERSITY  
      128
   3. THE VALUE OF DIVERSITY  
      132
CONTENTS

6. The Character of Disadvantage 135
   I. INTRODUCTION 135
   II. UNDERSTANDING DISADVANTAGE 140
   III. SEXUAL DISADVANTAGE 153
   IV. DISADVANTAGE, LIMITATION, AND INFERIORITY 155

7. The Role of Sexual Identity in a Successful Life 157
   I. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF LIMITATIONS AND INFERIORITY 157
   II. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF MISCONCEPTIONS 167
   III. ASCERTAINING MISCONCEPTIONS 184

8. Equality, Difference, and the Law 192
   I. THE IMPORTANCE OF BEING UNDERSTOOD 192
   II. WHERE DIFFERENCE MATTERS 197
   III. DISCRIMINATION AND THE LAW 202

Index 209
Like so many before me, I owe a great deal to a great many, in ways that no acknowledgment could ever recompense. What is more, I owe it in ways that I cannot begin to credit properly. I can only offer my fullest thanks to Carol Creighton, Elizabeth Goldberg, Heather Janack, G. V. La Forest, Grant Lamond, David Lillico, David Paciocco, and Larry Taman.

This book has its roots, some direct, others now remote, in a doctoral thesis submitted at the University of Oxford. I am deeply grateful to the Attorney General of Ontario for research leave, to the Commonwealth Scholarship Commission in the United Kingdom and the British Council for fully supporting that research, to Balliol College for a Kukes Scholarship, and to Columbia University for an External Awards Fellowship. I also thank my examiners, Nicola Lacey and Christopher McCrudden, for their helpful and constructive comments, and above all my supervisor, Joseph Raz, who was and remains uniquely inspiring, exacting, and supportive, both as a mentor and as a friend.

For support and particular guidance in making the book what it is now I thank the series editor, Gerald Postema, the anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press, and Stephanie Achard.

Finally, I particularly thank John Gardner for his friendship and support over the years since we were students together, for reading all I have written, and for offering acute criticism and ever sensible advice.

I cannot express what I owe to Gail Thorson, without whom nothing, and to whom this book is dedicated.