

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

## Index

- AB/AC type conflict 281, 300  
 bilateral 18, 147, 166  
 examples of 300–1, 422  
 inherent normative 423, 489  
 multilateral treaties, growth due to 423  
 norms, renegotiation of 490  
 resolution 426–7, 428, 429, 434, 435–6, 489  
 state responsibility and 427, 429, 432–3, 438, 489  
 WTO examples of 433–4
- Abi-Saab, Georges 92
- academics, custom, creation by 16
- acte contraire* 133  
 customary law and 137
- actio popularis* 55, 80, 85
- Agreement on Trade-Related Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) 42  
 dispute settlement provisions 346  
 suspension of 347
- WIPO conventions incorporated into 346
- Akehurst, Michael 17
- Alvarez, José 20
- Appellate Body *see* WTO Appellate Body
- applicable law 178, 278, 327, 489  
*pacta sunt servanda* and 328  
*pacta tertiis* and 328  
 priority rules for resolving 327–8  
 state responsibility and 327  
 states, contractual freedom of 328, 335
- arbitration, WTO bilateral settlements and 44
- Aréchaga, Jiménez de  
 AB/AC conflicts, state responsibility and 429
- armed conflict, law on 408–9
- authoritative interpretations, WTO agreements and 112, 216
- avoidance of conflict  
 international adjudicator, techniques of 240  
 international law and 247  
 international organisations, role in 238  
 states, negotiation, role in 239
- Bello, Judith 27  
 WTO, purpose of 33  
 WTO rules, views on 26
- Benvenisti, Eyal 15, 476
- bilateral, AB/AC conflicts 18, 147, 166
- Bodansky, Daniel  
*non liquet*, justification for 152
- border disputes, WTO and 23
- Bos, Maarten 7  
 international law, normative concept of 90  
 treaty and custom, mutual exclusivity of 156
- Brownlie, Ian, international law, sources, ICJ Statute in 94
- Capotorti, Francesco 165  
 conflict, interpretation of 168
- case law, WTO Appellate Body 52
- cessation  
 secondary obligation of 299  
 WTO obligations, sanction for breach of 27
- Charney, Jonathan  
 international tribunals, number of 123  
 states bound by norms, independent of explicit consent 105
- Cheng, Bin  
 customary law, general practice of states 132  
 general principles of international law: derogation from 129; superior value of 127

- choice of law, applicable law, conflict in 327
- Codex Alimentarius Commission 349
- collective rights and obligations 10
- command and prohibition, conflict between 184
- communitarianism 10
- competence
- attributed, doctrine of 286
  - international organisations: implied powers of 287; lacking 286
- compulsory dispute settlement systems, conflict and 22
- conflict clauses
- applicable law, conflict in 489
  - illegal *inter se* agreements and 437
  - lacunae, avoidance of 490
  - a priori* exclusion, treaty provisions 468
- conflict rules 328–9
- DSU, limited scope of 354, 355
  - European Convention on Human Rights 334
  - future treaties, priority over 342–3, 437
  - GATT, Agriculture Agreement, priority of 359
  - GATT and GATS provisions 351
  - hierarchy of 329
  - internal treaty conflicts 355, 356
  - lex posterior* and 335
  - lex specialis* and 385, 387, 391
  - new treaties, pre-existing treaty subject to 332
  - non liquet* in absence of 419
  - pacta sunt servanda* limiting 335
  - UN Charter Art. 103 337, 437; *lex posterior* and 339; non-UN members and 338; obligations under 338–9
  - WTO, summary of 361
  - WTO treaty 344, 345; lack of 354
- conflicts of interest 15
- constructivism, international law and 14–15
- continuing treaties 379
- 'contracting out' 236
- contractual freedom of states 183
- countermeasures 53
- contracting out 218; WTO treaty and 228, 232, 233, 236
  - DSU in 219, 220
  - general international law, objective of 271
  - lex specialis* and 389–90
  - proportionality of 271
  - state responsibility 106, 229
  - third parties, effect on 233
  - WTO members, available to 231
- Crawford, James 39, 61
- AB/AC conflicts, resolution of 428
- bilateral and multilateral obligations, distinguishing 61
- contracting out 218, 220
- DSU, status of 39
- environmental obligations 62
- erga omnes* obligations 61, 62
- human rights obligations 62
- integral obligations, view on 65
- jus cogens*, norms of 98–9
- legal interest, standing and 81
- state responsibility, acts of other states and 430, 431, 432
- customary international law
- acte contraire* and 137
  - creation of 92
  - 'fall-back', general international law, onto 210–11
  - general principles of law, subordinate nature of 128
  - jus cogens* 394; creation of 98
  - lex specialis* as 407; nature of 129, 394
  - norms: codification of 48; general principle of law, derogation from 127; identification 92; later prevailing over earlier treaty norm 134; later treaty, conflict with 137; public interest and 105; states bound without consent 105; treaty norm subsequently modified by 138
  - opinio juris* 136
  - precautionary principle as part of 481–2
  - primary status of 129
  - state practice, dependence on 136
  - state responsibility, rules on 271
  - subsequent practice, modification of treaties by 50
  - treaties: basis in 48; dilemma between 156, 157; distinction from 131–2; evolution to 156; termination or revision by 138
  - treaty interpretation rules, contracting out and 214–15
  - UN Charter Art. 103 340
  - Vienna Convention, preserved application of 407
  - WTO 47, 48
  - WTO law, source of 48
- customary practice, Marrakesh Agreement, provision in 49
- Daillier, P.
- public international law, definition of 28
- de Vattel, Emerich
- international law, domestic principles transposed into 174–5
  - lex specialis* and 387

- definition of conflict 5–6, 329–30  
 norms 167, 168, 169–70, 176, 183, 188, 199–200; definition advocated by this work 169–70, 176, 199–200
- Delbrück, Jost  
 environmental protection, *erga omnes* and 101–2
- Descamps, Baron  
 customary law, primary status of 129
- diplomatic law  
 respect for 36  
 self-contained regime of 36  
 status of 107
- dispute settlement  
 DSU and 359–60  
 SPS agreement 352  
 TRIPS agreement 346  
 WTO and 5
- Dispute Settlement Understanding *see* DSU
- domestic factors in conflict 15
- Draft Articles on State Responsibility 2001  
 countermeasures prohibited by 107
- diplomatic law and 107  
*erga omnes* obligations 61, 62–3, 101  
 general international law, contracting out of 213  
 integral obligations: breach of 54;  
 prohibited suspension of 53  
*lex specialis* 232, 392  
 reciprocal and integral obligations,  
 distinction between 64
- droit supplétif* 149
- DSB  
 Appellate Body recommendations, legally binding force of 442  
 authority of 287  
 decisions: forms of 46; WTO organ status 46  
 dispute settlement 45  
 WTO panel recommendations, binding force of 442
- DSB authorisation, WIPO convention,  
 priority over 346
- DSU 42  
 Appellate Body and panels competency,  
 basis for 289  
 arbitrators: compulsory jurisdiction of 445–6; jurisdiction, expansion under 447  
 authoritative interpretation 112  
 bilateral settlements, unenforceable under 44  
 breach, presumption of 86  
 conflict clause, limited effect of 354, 355  
 conflicting obligations, interpretation under 196  
 contracting out, remedies and 220  
 countermeasures, remedy 76
- covered agreements: definition of 345, 443; impairment, redress for 451;  
 jurisdiction and 465; operation, levels of 460, 473
- dispute resolution 51, 359–60
- DSB, authority established by 287  
 international law, status in 467–8  
 jurisdiction, WTO panels and Appellate Body 465  
 legal interest, standing and 81, 82  
*lex specialis* 220  
 provisions covering conflict of norms 196  
 remedies 218–19, 220, 222  
 repeat claims procedure 121  
 retaliation, arbitrators' jurisdiction in relation to 446–7  
 state responsibility, countermeasures, contracting out of 216  
 suspension: arbitrators' jurisdiction in relation to 447; WTO members, unilateral acts of 235  
 treaty norms, customary countermeasures, contracting out of 137  
 working procedures, WTO panels and Appellate Body, consistency with 361  
 WTO panels: compulsory jurisdiction conferred by 445–6; creation of 442; international law, application of 468–70; status of 442
- EC law, positive integration, example of 75
- EC treaties  
 domestic law, form of 75  
 objective nature of 74–5  
 economic development 19  
 economic interdependence, breach of WTO obligations, effect of 80  
 economic state, emergence of 30  
 economics, science of 34  
*effet utile*, WTO treaty and 402  
 embedded liberalism 34  
 GATT seclusion from public international law 34
- environment 19, 20  
 environmental protection: free-riders and 101; global common as 102  
 'exhaustible natural resources', WTO Appellate Body interpretation of 485  
 standard enforcing, trade barriers by 20  
 trade liberalisation and 20  
 treaties, object and implementation 72  
 treaty-based obligations 62
- erga omnes partes* obligations 53, 54, 55, 81–2, 100–1  
 environmental protection and 101–2  
*jus cogens* and 100–1

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

- European Convention on Human Rights, earlier treaties, priority accorded to 334
- European Union  
 conflicts within 285  
 decisions, annulment of 291, 296  
 treaties: domestic law, form of 75;  
 objective nature of 74–5  
*expressio unius est exclusio alterius* 126
- Fastenrath, Ulrich 93
- Final Act 41
- Fish Stocks Agreement  
 flag states, high seas competency of 104  
 third parties bound by 103, 104
- fishing, WTO dispute resolution 23
- Fitzmaurice, Sir Gerald  
 interdependent nature, treatise of 58–9  
 reciprocal and integral obligations, distinction between 58  
 treaties, invalidity of 280  
 treaty obligations, distinction between 61  
 Vienna Convention and 59
- forum shopping, international disputes 115
- GATS *see* General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)
- GATT  
 Agreement on Agriculture, priority of 359  
 breach: state responsibility and 276–7;  
 suspension in response to 228–9  
*effet utile* 402  
 embedded liberalism, effect on 34  
 GATS: accumulation with 403; conflict, *lex specialis*, resolution by 405, 492; not mutually exclusive 399–401; overlapping provisions of 401–2, 403; pre-existing conflict rule 351  
 individuals, relevance to 68  
 institutional ethos of 34–5  
*inter se* agreements, prohibited by 303  
 international law, branch of 37  
 interpretation 267–8, 269; *abus de droit*, doctrine of 269  
 necessity requirement under 108  
 norms, permissive and prescriptive elements of 160  
 panel reports 51; judicial decisions, status as 51; legitimate expectations 51; status of 46  
 remedies under 231  
 schedules and provisions, priority 358  
 state responsibility, contracting out and 229  
 WTO members, UN Charter obligations 351  
 GATT 1947 34  
 panels: applicable law before 456; GATT claims, jurisdiction of 458  
 GATT 1994 41  
 WTO treaty, effect on 345  
 General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) 41  
*effet utile* of 402  
 GATT: accumulation with 403; conflict, *lex specialis*, resolution by 405, 492; not mutually exclusive 399–401; overlapping provisions of 401–2, 403; pre-existing conflict rule 351  
 schedules and provisions, conflict between 357–8  
 general international law  
 conflict: broader definition in 197; WTO treaty, resolution by 404  
 contracting out 158, 236; *expressio unius est exclusio alterius* and 218; *lex specialis* and 214; *pacta sunt servanda*, compatibility with 475–6; presumption against 236; WTO treaty 218, 228  
 corpus of 148  
 countermeasures, objective of 271  
 fall-back 201, 273; countermeasures, third parties, effect on 233; customary international law and 210–11; forms of 201–2, 208; treaties, ‘gaps’ in 273–4; WTO Treaty and 205, 207  
 graduation, custom from treaty 156, 157  
*jus cogens* 149  
 norms of 147–8  
 particular international law:  
 complemented by 155; prevalence of 150, 391  
 secondary rules of 149  
 state responsibility 271  
 treaties ‘contracting out’ of 212, 213  
 weakest and strongest forms of 150  
 WTO treaty, interpretation of 268, 269  
 general principles of law 127, 130, 131  
 customary law and 128, 132, 394  
 definition of 128–9  
 derogation from 127, 129  
*jus cogens* and 127  
*lex generalis*, nature of 129  
 secondary nature of 128, 129, 394, 488  
 WTO, role in 130  
*generalia specialibus non derogat* 405, 406, 407  
*lex specialis*, basis for 407–8  
 genocide, prohibition on 21  
 Genocide Convention, objects of 56, 74  
 global common  
 environmental protection 102  
 fundamental human rights 154  
 high seas 154

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

## 510 INDEX

- globalisation 19–20, 21  
 graduated normativity 99  
 Grossen, Jacques-Michel, conflict, presumption against 243  
 Grotius, Hugo, *lex specialis*, reference to 387  
*Grundnorm* 172  
 Guggenheim, Paul, public international law, definition of 28  
 Guillaume, Gilbert, treaty interpretation, divergent case law on 123–4
- Hafner, Gerhard 19  
 Hahn, Michael 70  
 Hardie, Sir Andrew 339  
 Higgins, Rosalyn  
 international law, view of 7  
 later custom modifying earlier treaty 138
- high seas  
 flag states, competency on 104  
 global common 154  
 horizontal nature of conflict 11  
 Howse, Robert 34  
 Hulsroj, Peter 8  
 customary law, state practice 132  
 treaties prevailing over custom 135
- human rights 19, 20, 21, 62  
 derogations permitted under  
 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 21  
 enforcing, trade barriers by 20  
 fundamental 126, 154  
 fundamental obligations, non-suspension of 77  
 global common 154  
*inter se* agreements: detracting from 309; modifying 322  
 non-derogable: norms of 21; obligations of 108  
 obligations: breach, standing to invoke 65; collective promise to uphold 65; trade liberalisation and 20  
 treaties: object and implementation of 72; purpose of 74  
 WTO dispute resolution 23  
 WTO treaty, *inter se* treaty modifications to 322–3
- IMF rules, WTO treaty, relationship between 347–8  
 implicit expressions of intent 330–1  
 implied jurisdiction  
 of international courts and tribunals 447–8  
 WTO panels and 450  
*in dubio mitius* 186  
*in foro domestico*, international law, source of 125
- inconsistent adjudication of norms 17  
 inherent nature of conflict 12  
 inherent normative conflict 178, 275, 489  
 AB/AC conflict types and 423  
 illegality and 277  
*inter se* agreements and 321  
 international organisations, inconsistent acts by 285  
 invalidity and 277  
 later norm prohibited by earlier 299–300  
 norms breaching other norms 276  
 one norm illegal under another 298–9  
 solutions for 278  
 state responsibility and 276  
 termination, norms of 278  
 intellectual property, WTO protection standards 71  
*inter se* agreements  
 conflict clauses in 437  
 human rights and 309, 322  
 modifying multilateral treaties:  
 contextual differences 321, 322;  
 prohibition on 280–1, 302, 304, 305–7  
 pre-existing treaties, deviation from 436  
 third party rights, affecting 309, 312, 320, 332  
 treaties, supplementing 342  
 Vienna Convention, prohibition on 280–1, 302, 304, 305–7, 310, 314  
 WTO: trade liberalisation and 316, 317–18, 320; trade restricting 316  
 WTO members: conflict of norms and 321; contractual freedom to change 318, 320  
 WTO treaty 316, 332; deviating from 315  
 WTO treaty, modifications to 478
- interest groups 15, 16  
 international agreements, *inter se* agreements affecting 309  
 International Convention on Civil Aviation, non-parties, public interest bound by 105  
 International Court of Justice  
 advisory opinion by 118–19  
 judgments, authority of 121  
 judicial review, United Nations decisions 292–3  
 jurisdiction of 16–17  
 leading role of 123  
*non liquet*, ruling on 151  
 Statute of, international law, source of 89, 94  
 UN Charter Art. 103 and 339–40  
 international courts, resort to 22  
 international courts and tribunals  
 advisory opinion of ICJ sought by 118–19  
 binding preliminary rulings by 121, 124  
 contradictory statements by 122–3

- declining jurisdiction 115  
 ICJ, leading role of 123  
 implied jurisdictional powers of 447–8  
 inconsistent decisions: abuse of  
   process 115, 116; *lis alibi pendens* and 115;  
   same facts 115  
 increase in number of 123  
 jurisdiction, determination of 114, 115  
 International Covenant on Civil and  
   Political Rights 21  
 international law  
   applicable law, conflicts in 178, *see also*  
   customary international law, general  
   international law, norms 178  
   central legislator, lack of 13, 92, 441  
   centralised adjudication, lack of 17, 93,  
   441  
   co-existence of states in 17, 19, 31  
   co-operation of states, development of 17,  
   18, 19, 31, 32, 66, 154  
   co-ordination, different branches between  
   120  
   completeness of 151  
   conflict, resolution of 275  
   conflicting commands in 180  
   constructivism and 14–15  
   ‘contract out’ by states 37  
   customary, variety of actors involved in 16  
   decentralised nature of 95  
   definitions of 28  
   divergent law-making process 97  
   diversity and conflict 13  
   division of powers, lack of 92  
   dual function of 13  
   enforcement mechanisms 36–7  
   equitable principles of 126  
   *erga omnes partes* obligations in 66  
   evolution from custom to treaty 156  
   *expressio unius est exclusio alterius* 126  
   fundamental human rights 126  
   general and particular, distinguishing  
   norms of 147–8  
   general principles 92, 124; customary law  
   and 128, 132; definition of 128–9;  
   derogation from 127, 129; induction,  
   process of 126; legal logic 126; meta  
   principles 125; ‘necessary’ 127; role of  
   130; secondary nature of 128, 129; source  
   of 125; WTO, role in 130  
   inconsistencies in 13  
   international organisations, bound by  
   324–5  
   international trade law 29–31  
   interpretation, conflict avoidance and 247  
   intertemporal, problem of 165, 242  
   judicial decisions: abuse of process 115,  
   116; contradictory 114, 115, 117; *lis alibi*  
   *pendens* and 115; status of 110, 112  
   lacunary character of 19, 152  
   legitimacy and democratic content of 38  
   *lex generalis* 129  
   *lex posterior* 126, 173  
   *lex specialis* 126  
   liberal theories 14  
   neutrality of 13  
   *non liquet* 13, 151; justification for 152  
   normative concept of 90  
   obligations, suspension of 106  
   *pacta sunt servanda* 125  
   particular 155; binding nature of 155;  
   corpus of 155; prevailing over general  
   150  
   pre-normative elements 6  
   presumption, new law and pre-existent,  
   consistency in 241  
   principle and rule, difference between  
   132  
   realist theories 14  
   residual negative principle 150, 154  
   rights and obligations under 10  
   rules of: equal binding force 96; WTO  
   treaty, interpretation 274  
   self-contained regime of 35, 36, 37  
   sources 89, 93, 125; conflict between 92–3;  
   formal 91; inherent hierarchy lacking 94;  
   international organisations, acts of 256;  
   material 91; municipal law 125, 174–5;  
   normativity threshold 91; state consent  
   and 13, 133; traditional 94; uncertainty  
   as to 90, 91  
   state aiding breach by another 430  
   state consent, derived from 441, 488  
   state sovereignty: consequence of 33;  
   hierarchies created by 38; limit on 154  
   states: consumers as 7–8, 91; equality in  
   13; free-riders 101; legal relationships of  
   487; subjects of 95  
   sub-systems 38, 40; WTO law as 38  
   temporal nature of 14  
   treaties, role of 9  
   UN Charter, status of 99  
   unitary view of 38  
   WTO: covered agreements, status of 460;  
   contracting out 40; law, as part of 25, 26,  
   27, 29, 37, 38; norms, overruled by 492  
 International Law Commission 12  
   1996 Draft Art. 27 430, 431, 432  
   *jus cogens* 98  
   state aiding another to commit breach  
   430  
   treaties, later custom modifying, view on  
   140–1  
 International Monetary Fund, WTO,  
   relationship between 480  
 International Office of Epizootics  
   349

- international organisations  
 acts incompatible with constituent instrument 285  
 acts of 256, 290, 291  
 annulment of organs' decisions, availability of 291  
 attributed competence, doctrine of 286  
 co-operation between 238  
 competence: implied powers of 287; lack of 286; 'limited' or 'special' 415  
 decisions: conflict between 141; norms, conflict with 146–7  
 implied powers, theory of 415  
 international law, extent bound by 324–5  
 judicial review and 290  
*jus cogens*, respect for 324  
 legally binding acts: internal operations 144–5; *jus cogens*, consistency with 146; members' rights and obligations affecting 145; status of 145, 146  
 multilateral treaties, *inter se* deviation from 325  
 non-consenting members, ability to bind 105  
 norms: acts inconsistent with 324; created by 416; created within 96  
 presumption of legality 241  
*ultra vires* acts of 436  
 UN Economic and Social Council, co-ordination and consultation role 238  
 UN Security Council 100  
 WTO 44  
 WTO, co-operation agreements 238–9  
 interpretation, WTO treaty, members' common intentions of 260, 263  
 Islamic law, state responsibility, view of 432
- Jackson, John 27  
 Jenks, Wilfred 8, 15, 19  
 conflict, strict interpretation of 167, 170, 171; criticism of 173–4, 183  
*Conflict of Law-Making Treaties* 8  
 conflict of norms, presumption against 242–3  
 general principles of law 131  
 legislative intent 370  
 treaties, negotiators' responsibilities 237–8
- Jennings, Sir Robert 91  
 international law, sources of 93  
 judicial decisions  
*amicus curiae*, use of 119  
 application of law in particular case 112  
 conflicting 122; interpreting same law 117;  
*res judicata* and 110, 115  
 contradiction between 114
- inconsistent, WTO 121  
 status of 51, 110  
 temporal nature of 124
- judicial review  
 European Union, decisions of 291, 296  
 International Court of Justice, United Nations decisions 292–3  
 international organisations, decisions by 290  
 United Nations, decisions of 287, 292–3  
 WTO organs, decisions of 293, 298  
 WTO panels, waiver decisions of 296
- jus cogens* 13, 14, 21  
 binding effect, state consent notwithstanding 105  
 conflict: source of 22; treaty norm with 134  
 customary international law, creation by 98  
*erga omnes* obligations and 100–1  
 general international law and 149  
 general principles of law, status of 127  
 hierarchical supremacy of 98  
 integral treaties, type of 60  
 International Law Commission view on 98  
 international organisations: consistency with 146; respect for 324  
 invalid treaty, conflict with 279, 280, 281, 282  
*lex specialis* and 394  
 no deviation from 22  
 non-derogable nature of 37  
 norms 67; in conflict with 278, 279; non-deviation by 436  
*pacta sunt servanda*, principle of 37, 467  
 preference in conflict with treaty 173  
 special customary law and 394  
 standing 81–2  
 UN Charter and 99  
 Vienna Convention 60, 98, 134, 149
- Karl, Wolfram  
 AB/AC conflicts, resolution of 427  
 criticism of 183  
 future treaties, priority claims over 336  
 treaty obligations, conflicting 167
- Kelsen, Hans  
 conflict of norms, rejection of 172  
*Grundnorm* 172
- Kingsbury, Benedict  
 ICJ, leading role of 123
- Kontou  
 criticism of 141  
 later custom modifying earlier treaty 139–40
- Kopelmanas, Lazar 92  
 customary international law, creation of 92

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

- Kuijper, Pieter Jan  
 GATT, branch of international law, theory of 37  
 WTO, self-contained legal system, emergence of 39, 40
- lacuna  
 conflict rules in 438, 490  
*non liquet*, declaration of 419, 421, 490
- Lauterpacht, Hersch  
 conflict, broad interpretation of 168  
*inter se* agreements, contracting parties' consent for 315  
 treaties, void where breach earlier 280, 425
- law-making  
 international law, norms of 12  
 'over-inclusion' and 12  
 'under-inclusion' and 12
- law-takers, states as 7–8
- Leebron, David 21
- legal standing  
 bilateral obligations, breach of 63  
 human rights obligations 65  
 multilateral obligations, breach of 63  
 'specially affected' states 63, 64
- legislative intent  
 date of 374  
 later prevailing 368–9, 370  
*lex posterior* rule and 369–70
- legitimate expectation, GATT panel reports, creation by 51
- lex generalis*  
*lex specialis*, accumulation with 410;  
 earlier giving way to later 412;  
 supplemented by 410  
 WTO obligations 87
- lex mercatoria* 48
- lex posterior* 14, 96, 97, 374  
 conflict: applicable law in 489; primary function in 439  
 conflict clause, priority over future treaties and 335  
 continuing treaties and 380, 406  
 detecting 388–9  
 general principle of law as 126  
 legislative intent and 369–70  
*lex specialis*, coinciding with 395, 396;  
 interaction with 392; priority of 407  
 municipal law, origins in 97  
 norms, application to 380  
 regional and multilateral treaties, conflict between 377  
 treaties, priority to earlier treaty and 333  
 UN Charter Art. 103 and 339  
 Vienna Convention and 362, 375–6, 408  
 WTO treaty and 375–6  
*lex specialis* 126, 232
- conflict: applicable law in 489; GATT and GATS 405  
 conflict rules, application of 385, 396  
 continuing treaties 406, 408  
 contracting out, general international law and 213, 214  
 contractual freedom of states and 388  
 countermeasures 389–90, 393; WTO obligations, breach of 389  
 customary international law as 407  
 detecting 388–9  
 general norms, interpretation of 410  
 general principles of law, secondary nature of 394  
*generalia specialibus non derogat*, basis in 407–8  
 indeterminate, *non liquet* declaration 421  
 international tribunals, jurisdiction determined by 455  
*lex generalis*, accumulation with 410;  
 precedence of 412; supplementing 410  
*lex posterior*, interaction with 392, 395, 396; prevailing over 405, 407  
 norms: general norms prevailing over 387–8; subject matter 389  
 self-defence and armed conflict 408  
 special customary law and 394  
 SPS treaty, application under 482  
 state consent, determination of 438  
 treaty interpretation, role in 414  
 treaty norm, general international law, conflict between 391–2  
 UN Charter Art. 103 and 387  
 Vienna Convention 392  
 wider credence, dangers of 408  
 WTO 389–90; agreements and 142, 411  
*lex specialis derogat legi generali*, WTO treaty and 233, 397–9
- liberal theories  
 change to domestic legal system, international law, effect on 14  
 international law and 14
- lis alibi pendens* 115
- living treaties *see* treaties, continuing
- Lowe, Vaughan  
 inconsistent tribunal decisions 115  
 international tribunals, jurisdiction of 114, 115
- McRae, Donald  
 criticism of 31, 32, 33  
 economic state, emergence of 30  
 GATT/WTO, international law, place in 29–31, 34  
 international trade and economic law 29, 31  
 state sovereignty, views on relevance of 33

- Marceau, Gabrielle  
 criticism of 316  
 WTO law, self-contained view of 316  
 margin of discretion 176  
 Marrakesh Agreement 41, 42, 146  
 amendment procedures under 43, 45  
 conflict, prevailing nature of 356  
 contracting out, general international law 216  
 customary practice, guidance by 49  
 WTO, scope and function of 287  
 WTO organs, competence of 287  
 Marrakesh Protocol 357–8  
 Mavroidis, Petros, contracting out, DSU and 220  
 MEAs, WTO treaty, relationship between 350  
 Mosler, Hermann, general principles of law, customary law and 132  
 Most Favoured Nation (MFN) 69  
 obligations 69, 79, 160  
 multilateral treaties  
 conflict between 375  
 conflicting with bilateral 375  
 municipal law, international law, source of 125
- NAFTA, dispute settlement 115  
 national interests, international law, effect on 14  
 negative integration  
 bilateral obligations 66  
 WTO rules 73, 184  
 neutrality, international law in 13  
 non-governmental organisations 16  
*non liquet*  
 avoidance of 129, 151  
 conflict of norms and 151  
 conflict rules, lacunae in 419, 438, 490  
 ICJ ruling on 151  
 indeterminate *lex specialis*, declaration due to 421  
 justification for 152  
 lacuna, declaration due to 419, 421  
 non-resolvable conflict and 421  
 views on 151  
 WTO legal system in 152–3  
 WTO panels, declaration by 454  
 normative feedback loop 239–40  
 norms *see also* treaty norms  
 accumulation 161, 162, 182, 201, 487;  
 complementary 162  
 avoidance of conflict, limitations of 272  
 breach, state responsibility for 278, 299  
 broad interpretation of conflict 168  
 command and prohibition, conflict between 184  
 conditional obligations imposing 160  
 conflict: between norms 5, 6, 7, 10, 13, 94, 115, 163; identification of 166; *jus cogens* with 278, 280; lacuna, law in 173, 278, 331, 419; *ratione personae*, limitations and 254; *ratione temporis*, limitations and 254; resolution of 173, 436  
 conflict clauses, priority to earlier norms 22  
 constituent elements, identification of 93  
 continuing treaties, treatment of 378–9  
 contracting out 236  
 contractual freedom of states and 183  
 creation, determinate point in time lacking 97  
 creation and identification of 91  
 decision of international organisations 146–7  
 definition of conflict 167, 168, 169–70, 172, 176, 183, 188, 199–200  
 derogation from another 237  
 doctrinal writing contradicting 110  
 earlier customary, conflict with later treaty 137  
 earlier norm terminated by new norm 282–3  
 empowering 159  
 enforcement, vital interests and 108, 109  
 environmental, bilateral treaty, conflict with 462  
 evolutionary nature of 136  
 exempting 159, 160  
 explicit right, prohibition on 187  
 explicit termination or suspension by another norm 283  
 fall-back position 488  
 forum shopping and conflict 115  
 functions of 158  
 general 160  
 general international law 147–8  
 general principles of law, status of 124  
 hierarchy of 5, 7, 278  
 identification of 91  
 illegal 436  
 implementation leading to breach of another 272  
 imposing negative obligations 160  
 incorporation of 237  
 individual 159  
 inherent conflict, breach causing 176  
 inherent normative conflict 178, 489  
*inter se* 106; agreements and 321  
 interaction of 158, 161  
 international communications treaties 108  
 international organisations: acts inconsistent with 324; created by 96, 416

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

- interpretation: application as distinct  
 from 204; multilateral treaties, derived  
 from 263
- interpretation by *lex specialis* 410
- interpretation in light of other norms 262
- invalidity 278; *jus cogens*, conflict with  
 278, 279
- jus cogens*, non-deviation from 436
- later derogating from earlier 185
- lex posterior* and 380
- lex specialis*: general norm prevailing over  
 387–8; subject matter 389
- margin of discretion 176
- mutual exclusivity 163, 175, 183
- necessary conflict 184
- negative permission 161
- negotiation stage and conflict 237, 239
- new, change in law, purpose of 242
- non liquet* in conflict 151
- 'objective' question of conflict 176
- one breaching another 276
- one illegal under another 298–9
- outcomes, classification by 278
- particular international law 147–8, 156
- permissive 159, 160
- positive obligations, 184, 186
- positive permission 161
- prescriptive 158
- presumption against conflict 240–1,  
 242–3, 251
- prohibitive 158
- public interest of 101, 102, 104–5
- ratione materiae* 161, 165
- ratione personae* 162, 165
- ratione temporis* 165
- reference to another 237
- regulatory 159
- renegotiation of 490
- rights and obligations under 171
- secondary 159
- sources of 89
- speciality, principle of 416, 418
- state consent 133; created by 95
- state or body bound by both rules 165
- states creating 418
- subject and parties, overlapping 165
- subject matter of 96
- suspension/termination under Vienna  
 Convention Art. 60 106–7
- teleological interpretation 420
- terminated 278
- terminating other norms 162
- treaties: drafting 237; interpretation in  
 light of other norms 251; interpretation  
 of 247
- unconditional obligations imposing 160
- unilateral acts and 144
- vague nature of 94
- validity, earlier detracting from later  
 norm 424
- WTO Appellate Body interpretations  
 190–1, 193–4
- WTO panel interpretations 190–1, 193–4
- WTO treaty and 463, 491
- OECD Arrangements on export credits 348
- opinio juris* 48, 136
- Oxford English Dictionary*, treaty  
 interpretation, use in 262, 268
- pacta sunt servanda* 27, 37, 117
- AB/AC conflicts, resolution of 426
- conflict in applicable law and 328
- conflict clauses, limitation on 335
- conflict of norms, resolution of 436
- contracting out, compatibility of 475–6
- general principle of law 125
- international tribunals, applicable law of  
 461
- jus cogens*, standing of 37, 467
- treaty provisions, *a priori* exclusion of  
 468
- WTO members, contractual freedom 38
- pacta tertiis* 14, 95
- AB/AC conflicts, resolution of 426
- conflict in applicable law and 328
- conflict of norms, resolution of 436
- conflict rules, restriction on 332
- inter se* agreements, illegality of 307, 312
- pre-existing treaty, non-derogation from  
 332–3
- treaty interpretation and 257
- treaty norms and 103
- Vienna Convention and 363
- particular international law 155
- binding nature of 155
- complementary nature of 155
- corpus of 155
- general international law, prevailing over  
 150, 391
- norms of 156
- Pellet, Alain
- public international law, definition of  
 28
- Perelman, Chaim
- conflict, interpretation of 168
- permissions/exemptions, conflict between  
 163
- politics, WTO rules and 79
- positive integration
- EC law 75
- international law, growth of *erga omnes*  
*partes* obligations in 66
- WTO rules embodying 71

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

## 516 INDEX

- pre-normative elements, international law of 6
- presumption against conflict 212–13, 215, 488
  - WTO treaty and 491
- prevention of conflict 490
- private interest groups, transnational paradigm 16
- public international law disciplines
  - involved in resolution of conflict 275
- regional and multilateral treaties, between 377
- time, factor in 14
- treaty clauses, priority over earlier norms 333
- treaty interpretation, presumption against 207
- treaty norms: between 18, 19; supervening custom and 384
- principle of contemporaneity, treaty interpretation and 264
- principle of effectiveness
  - conflict, presumption against, limiting 251
  - treaty interpretation, use in 248–50
- public interest norms 67
  - criticism of 101, 102
  - custom, transformed into 105
  - pacta tertiis* and 106
  - third parties bound by 104–5, 106
- public international law, WTO law, relationship with 5
- Pufendorf, Samuel von 387
  - lex specialis* and 387
- Quoc Dinh, Nguyen
  - public international law, definition of 28
- ratione materiae* 161
  - WTO panels, applicable law before 459–60
- ratione personae* 162, 254
  - WTO panels, applicable law before 459–60
- ratione temporis* 254
  - WTO panels: applicable law before 459–60; jurisdiction subject to 443
- realist theories, state interests, international law and 14
- relative normativity 21
- res judicata* 110
  - conflicting judicial decisions and 115
  - homogenous legal relations and 115
  - judicial decisions in international law 110
  - new facts, discovery of 111
  - WTO, non-application to 111
- Resolution of the Institute of International Law 1995
  - jus cogens*, norm of, preference for 134
  - later custom, treaty modified by 138
  - particular international law and 155
- Riphagen, Willem 217
  - treaty norms, implicit derogation by 217
- Ruggie, John 34
- Salmon, Jean 144
  - lacunae and 419
- Sands, Philippe
  - Vienna Convention Art. 31(3)(c), treaty interpretation, role in 253, 254, 269
- Schachter, Oscar 48, 54, 70
  - treaties, prominence over custom 134–5
- Schermers, Henry
  - international organisations, international law, bound by 324–5
- Schoenbaum, Thomas 118
- Secretariat of the International Plant Protection Convention 349
- self-defence, law on 408–9
- Simma, Bruno 12
- Sinclair, Sir Ian
  - lex specialis* principle, view on 366
  - treaties, timing of 372
  - Vienna Convention Art. 30, view on 364
  - Vienna Convention Art. 31(3)(c), view on 255
- Spelliscy, Shane
  - divergent international case law 124
- SPS agreement 352
- standing judicial body, state consent to 441
- state consent
  - current expression, defining 388
  - legal claims for 441
  - norms created by 95
  - source of international law 13, 133, 441, 488
- state practice 90
- state responsibility 39
  - AB/AC conflict and 427, 429, 432–3, 438, 489
  - acts of other states and 430
  - applicable law, conflict in 327
  - conflict and 275, 276
  - countermeasures 106, 229
  - diplomatic law and 36
  - GATT: breach of 276–7; contracting out of 229
  - general international law, rules of 271
  - Islamic law and 432
  - norms, breach of 278, 299
  - remedies, countermeasures 53
  - self-contained law of 39
- state sovereignty 33
  - contractual freedom, international law hierarchy and 38

- international law, consequence of 33
- limit in international law 154
- trade law, underlying assumption 33
- states
  - co-existence, international law in 17, 19
  - co-operation, evolution in international law 17, 18, 19, 31, 32
  - conflict avoidance, negotiation and 239
  - contractual freedom of 183, 328, 331, 487; AB/AC conflict resolution 426; conflict clause conflicting with 335; conflict of norms, resolution of 436; current expressions of intent 437; factual/subjective elements of 388; *lex posterior* and 362, 381; *lex specialis* and 388; treaty conflict clauses and 437
  - diversity of 487
  - domestic law, origin of *lex posterior* rule in 97
  - equality of 13, 95, 126
  - erga omnes partes* obligations, owed to 100
  - free-riders 101; environmental protection and 101; political considerations 105
  - freedom of 185
  - intent of 437
  - international law, subjects as 95
  - jus cogens*, bound by consent notwithstanding 105
  - law-takers 7–8
  - legal relationships between 487
  - legislative intent 374
  - norms created by 418
  - self-defence, right of 126
  - selfhelp, right of 126
  - unilateral acts: binding obligations 92, 143, 144; existing obligations, detracting from 144; later norm, prevailing over 144
- subsequent practice
  - international organisations and 49, 50
  - treaty norms, change by 50
  - treaty rules, further clarification by 50
  - Vienna Convention 49
  - WTO 49
- synallagmatic obligations 65
- third parties
  - public interest norms binding 104–5
  - treaties binding 103, 332
  - treaty norms not affecting 437
- time, international law, effect on 14
- trade
  - concessions, legitimate expectation and 455
  - instrumental form of 73
  - international and bilateral nature of 72
  - liberalisation, beneficial effects of 78
  - obligations, reciprocal nature of 65
  - restrictions 20
  - Trade Policy Review Mechanism 42
  - travaux préparatoires* 6
- treaties
  - bilateral 18, 22; AB/AC conflicts 18; international environmental norm, conflict with 462
  - bilateral obligations 66, 67; legal standing to invoke 63
  - breach allowing suspension of 53–4
  - conclusion, date of 370, 371, 373
  - conflict: AB/AC type 423; amendments, caused by 376; multilateral conflicting with bilateral 375; same subject matter 367
  - conflict rules 328–9, 331–2; *pacta tertiis* and 332
  - consensus and 13
  - continuing 378–9, 380, 406, 408, 438
  - contracting out: explicit 216, 488; *expressio unius est exclusio alterius* and 214; general international law 212; presumption against 212–23, 488
  - custom: prominence over 134–5; source of 48
  - customary international law: dilemma between 156, 157; distinction between 131–2; evolution from 156
  - definition of 41
  - desuetude 143
  - distinction 61
  - drafting, norms, conflict avoidance and 237
  - erga omnes* obligations 61
  - error in, defence based on 484
  - ‘fall-back’, to general international law 201–2
  - human rights and environmental, object and implementation of 72
  - increased use of 17
  - inter se* agreements: legality of 436; prohibition on 280–1, 302, 304, 305–7; supplemented by 342; third party rights affected by 309, 312, 320
  - interdependent nature type 58–9
  - international communications, norms of 108
  - international organisations, *inter se* deviation from 325
  - international tribunals, jurisdiction of 114, 115
  - interpretation *see* treaty interpretation
  - invalidity 280, 282; *jus cogens*, conflict with 279, 280, 281, 282
  - later custom modifying 138, 139–40; ILC view on 140–1

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

518 INDEX

treaties (*cont.*)

later terminating earlier, same subject matter 284  
 legislative intent, fiction of 368–9, 372  
*lex specialis* 129  
 modern international law, role in 9  
 modification: implied consent by 143;  
 subsequent practice by 50, 143  
 multilateral 22; conflict between 375;  
 ‘contracting out’ of 37; *inter se*  
 modifications to 53, 280–1; *inter se*  
 suspension of 60  
 multilateral obligations: distinguishing  
 67; legal standing to invoke 63, 64  
 negative integration 161  
 negotiation 237–8  
 norms *see* treaty norms  
 objects, determination of 56  
 obligations *see* treaty obligations  
 pre-existing, non-derogation 332–3  
 prevailing over custom 134–6  
*a priori* exclusion of 468  
 private interest groups, effect on 15, 16  
 reciprocal and integral, breach, remedies  
 for 69  
 reciprocal obligations 53, 58, 64, 65, 66,  
 67; breach of 65  
 regional and multilateral, conflict  
 between 377  
 sub-regimes 9  
 subsequent, effect on existing customary  
 law 136–7  
 third parties bound by 103, 104, 105  
 timing of 370, 371, 372  
 voidable, breach of earlier treaty  
 obligation 425

treaty interpretation  
 application and, distinction 204  
 bilateral treaties, use of 258–9  
 canons of 126  
 conflict, presumption against 207  
 contemporaneity, principle of 264, 266  
 divergent case law on 123–4  
 effectiveness, principle of 248–50  
 evolutionary basis for 267–8  
 general international law, fall-back 273–4  
 historical background and 252  
 international law, relevant rules and 253,  
 254–5, 263–4  
 international norms and 490  
*lex specialis*, role in 414  
 limitation on 254  
 limits of 245  
*Oxford English Dictionary*, use in 262, 268  
*pacta tertiis*, principle of 257  
 parties, common intentions of 257, 258  
 pre-normative elements and 6

subsequent practice 223, 252, 258  
*travaux préparatoires* and 252, 330

treaty norms

change by subsequent practice 50  
 conflict 18, 19, 134, 364–5  
 contracting out 217  
 fall-back position 488  
 general principle, derogation from 127  
 general rule, prevailing over custom 134  
 hierarchical role of 133  
 increase in 18  
 integral nature of 64  
 interpretation, Vienna Convention and  
 251–2  
 interpretation of 247, 251  
*lex specialis* 134, 391–2  
 negotiation of 328–9  
*pacta tertiis* and 103  
 precedence given to later customary  
 norm 134  
 public interest 67  
 state consent and 133  
 subsequent custom modifying 138  
 supervening custom, conflict with 384  
 third party rights and obligations and 437

treaty obligations  
 global commons 66  
 integral 53, 58, 65, 67  
 reciprocal 53, 58, 64, 65  
 reciprocal and integral, distinction 54,  
 55, 58, 64, 65–6, 67  
 suspension of 106  
 WTO MFN obligation 69

TRIPS agreement *see* Agreement on  
 Trade-Related Intellectual Property  
 Rights

UNCLOS

existing norms, prevailing over 331, 468  
*inter se* agreements, acceptability of 342  
 undertakings, WTO members by 52

United Nations

conflict, attribution of power between  
 organs 285–6  
 decisions, judicial review of 292  
 Economic and Social Council,  
 co-ordination and consultation function  
 238  
 organisation, limits of 287  
 UN Security Council, mandate of 100  
 WTO, source of conflict 20, 21, 24, 403  
 WTO judiciary, risk created by conflict  
 443

United Nations Charter

Art. 103: conflict clause 337, 437, 489;  
 customary international law and 340; ICJ  
 judgments and 339–40; interpretation of

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

- 339, 340–2; *lex posterior* and 339; *lex specialis* and 387; non-UN members and 338; obligations under 338–9  
international law, status in 99  
United States, unilateralism 485  
Uruguay Round 24, 41  
use of force, obligation to refrain from 107
- Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties  
29, 41  
AB/AC conflict, resolution under 426–7  
Art. 30: *lex specialis* and 412; priority rules, successive treaties 363–4; treaties, different parties to 381; treaties, same subject matter 364, 367  
Art. 31(3)(c) 251–2, 253, 254–5; temporal scope of 264, 267–8  
customary international law rules and 407  
integral obligations, no *inter se* deviation from 436  
*inter se* modification, multilateral treaties 280–1, 302, 304, 305–7, 310, 314, 321  
*jus cogens*: conflict, preference for 173; peremptory norm 60, 98, 134, 149; treaty in conflict with 279  
*lex posterior* rule in 96, 173, 362, 366, 367, 375–6, 380, 408, 437  
*lex specialis* 392  
material breach: termination/suspension as remedy for 59; treaty suspended for 53–4  
norms, suspension/termination under 106–7  
*pacta tertiis* rule in 363  
reciprocal and integral obligations, distinction 64  
reservations, prohibition on 56–7  
state intent, *lex posterior*, determination by 437, 438  
states, contractual freedom of 183, 381  
subsequent practice and 49  
suspension permitted by 60  
treaties: distinction 59; interpretation under 245; termination 284, 285  
treaty formation, error in 484  
treaty norms, interpretation of 251–2  
WTO treaty, amendments and modifications to 474–5
- Vierdag, E. W.  
conflict, amended treaties and 376  
*lex posterior*, effect of 374  
treaty norms, two conflicting 365  
Vienna Convention, termination of treaties by 284  
Vienna Convention Art. 30, criticism of 377
- Vienna Convention Art. 59, termination of treaties by 284, 285
- Villiger, Mark E.  
criticism of 140  
subsequent treaties, pre-existing customary law and 136–7  
treaties, revision and termination by later custom 140
- Waldock, Sir Humphrey  
conflict, interpretation of 168  
*inter se* agreements, Vienna Convention prohibition on 305  
invalid treaty, *jus cogens*, conflict with 279, 280  
treaty interpretation, subsequent practice and 258
- Weil, Prosper 21  
graduated normativity, view of 99  
*non liquet*, views on 151  
public interest norms, criticism of 102  
relative normativity 21
- Weiler, Joseph  
GATT, institutional ethos 34–5
- WIPO conventions  
subsequent DSB authorisation, conflict with 384  
TRIPS agreement, incorporation into 346
- Wolfke, Karol, treaty rules, prevailing over custom 135–6
- World Trade Organization (WTO)  
accessions, covered agreements, status of 43  
*actio popularis*, no basis for 85  
advisory opinions, lack of 293  
*amicus curiae* procedures 119  
Appellate Body *see* WTO Appellate Body  
arbitrators 445–7  
bilateral settlements: arbitration clauses and 44; unenforceable under DSU 44  
co-operation agreements, with international organisations 238–9  
compulsory dispute resolution 8  
compulsory jurisdiction of 442, 443  
conflict: potential for 24; source of 20; within 286  
countermeasures: *lex specialis* 389; remedy as 76  
covered agreements: applicable international law and 460, 470; operation, levels of 460, 473; panel and Appellate Body jurisdiction 465; WTO panels, substantive jurisdiction of 478  
customary international law 47, 48, 49  
dispute settlement 5; decisions, binding effect 27, 28; remedial measures 27  
dispute settlement rules, intention of 297

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

## 520 INDEX

- World Trade Organization (WTO) (*cont.*)  
 Doha Declaration, WTO rules and MEAs, application of 472  
 enforcement mechanism 447  
 fishing disputes and 23  
 human rights disputes and 23  
 IMF, legal relationship between 480  
 implementation panels, jurisdiction of 446  
 inconsistent judicial decisions in 121  
 integral rules 70, 71  
 intellectual property 71  
 international agreements, concluded by 45  
 jurisprudence: judicial economy, principle of 449; jurisdiction, presumption in favour of 450–1  
 jurisprudence and publicists, judicial references to 471  
 law *see* WTO law  
 legal structure 44  
 legal system: nature of 35; *non liquet* in 152–3  
*lex specialis*, examples of 389–90, 393  
 members *see* WTO members  
 most favoured nation obligations: breach, consequences of 69; collective bilateral concessions and 79; norm of 160  
 obligations *see* WTO obligations  
 Oilseed agreement, status of 345  
 organs *see* WTO organs  
 panels *see* WTO panels  
 permissions and exemptions, health reasons 160  
 pillars of 24  
 practice, treaty interpretation, role in 50  
 purpose of 33  
 regional integration agreement, examination by WTO panels 295  
*res judicata*, non-application of 111  
 scope and functions of 287  
 specialised international tribunals, binding preliminary rulings 121, 124  
 SPS and TBT agreements: dispute settlement provisions 352; mutual exclusivity 360; national measures, consistency with 349  
 standing: burden of proof 83; 'legal interest' and 81, 82; proof of breach and 86  
 Subsidies agreement, export credits, treatment of 348  
 suspension, remedy of 77  
 territorial border disputes 23  
 Tokyo Round Codes 23  
 waiver 45
- WTO agreements  
 authoritative interpretation of 112, 113  
 breach, bilateral nature of 87  
 concluded post-1994 43  
 conflict: definition of 188; regulation of 188–9  
 country-specific schedules of concessions 42, 43  
 covered agreements enforceable under DSU 42, 43, 44, 451, 460  
 Final Act 41  
 legal norms, status as 29, 42  
*lex specialis* and 142  
 Marrakesh Agreement 41, 42; amendment procedures in 43, 45  
 member-specific schedules 42  
 multilateral nature of 52  
 non-static nature of 43  
 plurilateral agreements 42, 43  
 supervening custom, revision by 142  
 Uruguay Round 24, 41
- WTO Appellate Body  
 case law of 52  
 competence derived from DSU 289  
 conflict, definition of 194, 195  
 'exhaustible natural resources', interpretation of 485  
 expert opinion, use by 119  
 general international law, 'fall-back' to 208  
 IMF rules, application of 480–1  
 judicial decisions by 51  
 jurisdiction of 465  
 non-WTO convention, reliance upon 464–5  
 precautionary principle, application of 481–2  
 recommendations by 442  
 working procedures 361
- WTO law 5, *see also* DSB, DSU, GATT, General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), WTO treaty 5  
 breach of 68  
 compliance, worldwide welfare increase 80  
 conflict, broader definition in 197, 198, 199  
 conflicting commands in 180  
 customary international law, engine of growth for 48  
 Doha Declaration and 472  
 GATT 1947 panels, applicable law before 456  
 general principles of international law and 130, 461  
 indirect effect of 68

- individual economic operators, effect on 68
- individuals, relevance to 68
- inter se* agreement modifying human rights or MEA obligations 322
- interpretation: members' common intentions 490; practice, role in 50
- lex prior*, later *inter se* modification 323
- negative integration 184
- non-WTO rules: facts, as 463–5; impact of 478; incorporation of 445
- norms: international law overruling 492; negative obligations 160
- political considerations 79
- public international law, part of 25, 26, 27, 29, 37, 38
- reciprocal obligations under 69
- rules of law, subsidiary means for determining 471
- sources of 40–1, 91
- specific market access 73
- state responsibility, exclusion of 39
- state sovereignty and self-interest 33
- status of 467–8
- sub-system, international law of 38
- subsequent practice, development of 49
- suspension, breach, as response to 228–9
- WTO members
- acts inconsistent with rules, burden of proof 241
- agreement, act of organ, distinction between 47
- claims on others' behalf 84, 85
- collective non-compliance mechanism established by 78
- common intention of, WTO treaty interpretation and 260, 263
- compulsory jurisdiction granted by 442
- consensus of 47
- countermeasures, availability of 231
- developing countries, priorities of 486
- economic interests of 491
- free-riders 101
- inter se* relations, contractual freedom to change 318, 320
- international standards: Codex Alimentarius Commission 349, 445; International Office of Epizootics 349; Secretariat of the International Plant Protection Convention 349
- legally binding act of organisation, effect on 145
- national measures, conformity with SPS or TBT agreements 349
- organs, acting as 45, 286
- pacta sunt servanda* and 38
- schedules, standing in WTO legal order 357
- self-interest of 33
- standing: no objection to lack of 84; trade flows and 83; wide standard of 84
- state responsibility incurred by 91
- trade obligations, bilateral nature of 65–6
- trade restrictions imposed by 276–7
- treaty amendment, agreement to 45
- UN Charter, obligations under 351
- undertakings by 52
- unilateral action by 52, 235
- unilateral statements by 143–4
- WTO panels, compulsory jurisdiction conferred on 445–6
- WTO obligations 52
- AB/AC type conflicts: examples of 433–4; resolution of 435–6
- bilateral: enforcement 76; negotiation 75–6
- binding nature of 26
- breach, economic effects of 72
- cessation, sanction for breach of 27
- definition of 52, 53
- erga omnes partes*, *inter se* modifications to 54
- lex generalis* 87
- MFN 69
- multilateral, *inter se* modifications to 54
- reciprocal nature of 13, 54, 55, 75, 76, 83, 491
- WTO organs 44
- acts of 44–5; Marrakesh Agreement, consistent with 146
- agreement by, distinction between agreement of members 47
- competence of 287
- customary practice 49
- decisions, validity of 296
- DSB, decisions of 46
- judicial acts, *ultra vires* 289
- judicial review, decisions of 293, 298
- norms enacted by 45
- other international organisations, relations with 344
- WTO panels
- ad hoc* jurisdiction granted by parties 444
- ad hoc* tribunals 442
- applicable law 459–60, 476; interpretation of 476
- competency 286, 289
- compulsory jurisdiction conferred by members 445–6
- conflict, definitions adopted by 190–1, 193–4
- covered agreements, applicable law and 470

Cambridge University Press

0521824885 - Conflict of Norms in Public International Law: How WTO Law Relates to other Rules of International Law

Joost Pauwelyn

Index

[More information](#)

522 INDEX

WTO panels (*cont.*)

defences, treaty formation, error in 484  
 implied jurisdiction of 450  
 international law rules, application of 468–70, 473  
 judicial review, waiver decisions of 296  
 jurisdiction 353, 443, 465, 472, 476;  
 covered agreements and 443, 473;  
 non-WTO law claims 449–50, 451, 453, 455, 456, 459–60; presumption in favour of 450–1  
 legal standing, breach of reciprocal obligation 54  
*non liquet*, declaration by 454  
 non-violation cases, applicable law of 455, 456  
 non-WTO treaties, application of 486  
 non-WTO tribunal having greater jurisdiction 455  
 norms emerging subsequent to WTO treaty 463  
 other international tribunals and 120  
 recommendations by, legally binding force of 442  
 repeat claim under DSU Art. 9 121  
 reports: inconsistencies between 122;  
 judicial decisions, status as 51  
 status of 442  
 substantive jurisdiction 45, 460, 478; lack of 454  
 unilateral statements, member bound by 143–4  
 working procedures 361  
 WTO jurisprudence and publicists, application of 471  
 WTO treaty *see also* DSB, DSU, GATT, General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), WTO law  
 amendment procedure 45  
 amendments and modifications to 474–5  
 application, public international law context of 413  
 binding nature of 28  
 cessation 218  
 composition of 23  
 concessions, suspension of 222  
 conflict: definition of 189, 190  
 conflict clauses: internal 6, 354, 355, 356, 399; summary of 361  
 conflict rules in 459–60  
 ‘continuing’ nature of 379  
 contracting out: countermeasures 228, 232, 233, 236; general international law of 215; remedies 218, 226

countermeasures, *lex specialis* and 231  
 ‘fall-back’, to general international law 205, 207  
 GATT 1994 effect on 345  
 general conflict clause, absence of 344, 345  
 general international law, resolution by 404  
 General Interpretative Note: conflict between SCM and GATT 1994 197;  
 conflict definition in 189, 190–1, 192, 199; *lex specialis* and 397–9  
 IMF rules, relationship between 347–8  
*inter se* agreements: deviating from 315;  
 modifying 53, 316, 322–3; trade, effect on 316, 317–18, 320  
*inter se* modifications to 478  
 international law, contracting out of 40  
 interpretation 245, 258–9, 269, 270, 271;  
*abus de droit*, doctrine of 269; customary international trade usage 272;  
 international law and 253–4, 255, 256, 263–4, 274; members, common intention of 260, 263; non-WTO rules and 252, 256, 268; principles of 249, 268, 269;  
 state responsibility and 271; subsequent agreement and practice and 223, 252;  
*travaux préparatoires* and 252  
*lex posterior* rule in relation to 375–6  
*lex specialis* 233, 397–9, 411  
 Marrakesh Agreement and conflict 356  
 multilateral environmental agreements, relationship between 350  
 negative integration and 161  
 negotiation 26  
 non-WTO norms, prevalence of 491  
 non-WTO rules, defence relying on 473  
 norms: distinguished from acts of organs 45; effectiveness, principle of 249–50;  
 GATT panel reports as 46; interpretation 247; MFN obligations 160  
 organs acting contrary to 45  
 overlapping provisions, GATT and GATS 401–2, 403  
 presumption against conflict 491  
 remedies 218–19  
 reparation, for past damage 221  
 subsequent norms and 463  
*travaux préparatoires* 189  
 WTO organ decisions, validity under 296