

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America

Advances and Setbacks

The late twentieth century witnessed the birth of an impressive number of new democracies in Latin America. This wave of democratization since 1978 has been by far the broadest and most durable in the history of Latin America, but many of the resulting democratic regimes also suffer from profound deficiencies. What caused democratic regimes to emerge and survive? What are their main achievements and shortcomings? This volume offers an ambitious and comprehensive overview of the unprecedented advances as well as the setbacks in the post-1978 wave of democratization. It seeks to explain the sea change from a region dominated by authoritarian regimes to one in which openly authoritarian regimes are the rare exception, and it analyzes why some countries have achieved striking gains in democratization while others have experienced erosions. The book presents general theoretical arguments about what causes and sustains democracy and analyses of nine theoretically compelling country cases.

Frances Hagopian is the Michael P. Grace II Associate Professor of Latin American Studies in the Department of Political Science and former Director of the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. She is the author of *Traditional Politics and Regime Change in Brazil* (Cambridge University Press, 1996), which was named a Choice Outstanding Book in Comparative Politics, and several articles on democratization that have appeared in *World Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, and several other publications. Her current research focuses on economic liberalization and political representation in Brazil, Argentina, Chile, and Mexico. Hagopian previously taught at Harvard, Tufts, and MIT.

Scott P. Mainwaring is Eugene Conley Professor of Political Science and Director of the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. Among his books are *Democratic Accountability in Latin America* (2003), *Christian Democracy in Latin America* (2003), *Rethinking Party Systems in the Third Wave of Democratization: The Case of Brazil* (1999), *Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 1997), and *Building Democratic Institutions: Party Systems in Latin America* (1995). He received a John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation fellowship in 2000 for work on a project on authoritarianism and democracy in Latin America from 1945 to 2000.

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America

Advances and Setbacks

Edited by

FRANCES HAGOPIAN

University of Notre Dame

SCOTT P. MAINWARING

University of Notre Dame



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and
 Setbacks
 Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521824613

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

The third wave of democratization in Latin America : advances and setbacks / edited by
 Frances Hagopian, Scott P. Mainwaring.

p. cm.

Originated in a conference held Apr. 23–24, 2001, University of Notre Dame.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-82461-3 (HB)

ISBN-10: 0-521-82461-3 (HB)

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-61320-0 (PB)

ISBN-10: 0-521-61320-5 (PB)

I. Democratization – Latin America. 2. Democratization – Latin America – History –
 20th century. 3. Latin America – Politics and government – 1980– I. Hagopian, Frances.
 II. Mainwaring, Scott, 1954–

JL966.T47 2005

320.98 – dc22

2004062942

ISBN-13 978-0-521-82461-3 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-82461-3 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-61320-0 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-61320-5 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
 the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
 third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book
 and does not guarantee that any content on such
 Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and
Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For our children,

Michael Messina and

Benjamin Mainwaring and Grace Mainwaring

With our love

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
Introduction: The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America <i>Scott Mainwaring and Frances Hagopian</i>	I
1. Latin American Democratization since 1978: Democratic Transitions, Breakdowns, and Erosions <i>Scott Mainwaring and Aníbal Pérez-Liñán</i>	14
PART I THREE DEMOCRATIC GIANTS WITH AUTHORITARIAN PASTS: ARGENTINA, BRAZIL, AND MEXICO	
2. Argentina: Democratic Survival amidst Economic Failure <i>Steven Levitsky</i>	63
3. The Growing Sustainability of Brazil's Low-Quality Democracy <i>Kurt Weyland</i>	90
4. The Demise of Mexico's One-Party Dominant Regime: Elite Choices and the Masses in the Establishment of Democracy <i>Beatriz Magaloni</i>	121
PART II UNEXPECTED DEMOCRACIES IN UNLIKELY COUNTRIES: BOLIVIA, EL SALVADOR, AND GUATEMALA	
5. Bolivia's Democracy at the Crossroads <i>René Antonio Mayorga</i>	149
	vii

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii	<i>Contents</i>
6. Challenges to Political Democracy in El Salvador <i>Elisabeth Jean Wood</i>	179
7. Democracy on Ice: The Multiple Challenges of Guatemala's Peace Process <i>Mitchell A. Seligson</i>	202
PART III DEMOCRATIC EROSIONS IN THE THIRD WAVE: COLOMBIA, PERU, AND VENEZUELA	
8. From "Restricted" to "Besieged": The Changing Nature of the Limits to Democracy in Colombia <i>Ana María Bejarano and Eduardo Pizarro</i>	235
9. Peru 1980–2000: Chronicle of a Death Foretold? Determinism, Political Decisions, and Open Outcomes <i>Martín Tanaka</i>	261
10. Explaining Democratic Deterioration in Venezuela through Nested Inference <i>Michael Coppedge</i>	289
PART IV CONCLUSIONS	
11. Conclusions: Government Performance, Political Representation, and Public Perceptions of Contemporary Democracy in Latin America <i>Frances Hagopian</i>	319
<i>References</i>	363
<i>Index</i>	399

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Figures

1.1	Evolution of Democracy in Latin America, 1945–2003	<i>page</i> 17
1.2	Evolution of the Polity Score in Latin America, 1903–1945	18
4.1	Extensive Form Game: The Creation of an Independent Electoral Institute	132
4.2	PRI's National Vote Share and Election Year Growth Rate, 1952–2000	138
4.3	Effects of Modernization on National Vote Trends	139
4.4	Municipal Governments by Deprivation Conapo Index, 1986–1999	140
4.5	Opposition Municipalities, 1980–1999	142
7.1	GNP and GDP Tax Revenue	217
7.2	Indigenous Population and Lynchings, 1996–2000	224
7.3	Preference for Democracy: Guatemala in Comparative Perspective	228
9.1	Vote Share of “Traditional” Political Parties, Peru, 1978–2000	267
9.2	Approval Levels for President and Opposition, Peru, 1990–2000	272
9.3	Approval for President's Administration and Economic Program, Peru, 1990–2000	273
9.4	Number of Strikes and Workers Involved, Peru, 1970–1994	274
9.5	Growth Rate of GDP, Peru, 1988–1999	275
9.6	Number of Subversive Actions, Peru, 1980–1998	276
10.1	Democracy and Per Capita Income	298
10.2	Actual versus Expected Democracy in Venezuela	301
10.3	Remaining Puzzles: Residuals of Model 1.3	303
10.4	The Pivotal Role of Parties in Venezuela's Democratic Deterioration	308
10.5	Paths to Major Party Decline	312
11.1	Democracy in Latin America: Performance and Perceptions	335

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Tables

I.1	Classification of Latin American Political Regimes, 1945–2003	<i>page</i> 3
I.1	Rate of Transitions and Democratic Breakdowns, 1945–1999	16
I.2	Mean Values of Independent Variables for Years of Dictatorship in Latin America, 1946–1977 and 1978–1999	26
I.3	Predictors of Democratic Transitions, 1946–1999	28
I.4	Predicted Impact of Selected Variables on the Probability of Transition	29
I.5	Transitions Models with Changing Effects in Two Historical Periods	31
I.6	Mean Values of Independent Variables for Years of Democracies and Semidemocracies in Latin America, 1946–1977 and 1978–1999	33
I.7	Predictors of Democratic Breakdown, 1946–1999	34
I.8	Predicted Impact of Selected Variables on the Probability of Regime Breakdown	36
I.9	Predictors of Democratic Breakdown, 1946–1977	37
I.10	Changes in Polarization, International Environment, and Attitudes toward Democracy, 1946–1977 versus 1978–1999	47
I.11	Support for Democracy, 1996–2003	50
I.12	Economic Performance Indicators and Transparency International Rating of Corruption, 1993–2002	53
I.13	Predictors of Democratic Erosion, 1980–2001	55
5.1	Party System Characteristics, 1979–2002	153
5.2	Votes and Seats by Party in Bolivia, 1985–2002	156
6.1	Legislative and Municipal Elections, 1994–2003	192
7.1	Key Targets and Accomplishments of the Guatemalan Peace Accords	214
7.2	Lynchings in Guatemala, 1996–2000	222

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
7.3 Vote Turnout in Guatemala for Presidential Elections, 1950–1999	229
8.1 Colombia: Freedom House Scores, 1972–2000	238
8.2 Colombia: Regime Subtypes in the Twentieth Century	239
8.3 Number of Parties and Lists Presented in Congressional Elections, 1990–1998	246
8.4 Colombia: Total Violent Deaths and Population Growth, 1970–1997	248
9.1 Percentage of Lima Residents Who Approve of the President's Administration, by Social Sector, 1990–2000	276
9.2 Vote Intention for President, Peru, 1999–2000	283
10.1 General Models of Democratization	299
10.2 What Magnified the Impact of the Economy in Venezuela?	306
11.1 Freedom House Ratings of Political Rights and Civil Liberties: Twelve Latin American Countries, 1993–2003	329
11.2 Democratic Governance in Twelve Latin American Countries, 2002	330
11.3 Citizen Perceptions of Democracy in Latin America, 2003	334
11.4 Popular Perceptions of Market-Oriented Reforms: Latin America, 2003	340
11.5 Globalization and Economic Openness: Latin America	342
11.6 Most Salient Problems in Twelve Latin American Countries	346
11.7 Popular Experience with Salient Problems: Latin America, 2003	348
11.8 Interpersonal Trust, Trust in Government, Trust in Political Institutions: Latin America, 2003	356

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Contributors

Ana María Bejarano is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. She holds a Ph.D. in Political Science from Columbia University. She previously was professor of Political Science at the Universidad de Los Andes in Bogotá, where she also served as Director of the Center for Social and Legal Research (CIJUS). She co-edited *Elecciones y Democracia en Colombia, 1997–1998* (Bogotá, 1998). Recent publications include articles in *Constellations* and the *Canadian Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*. She is finishing a book on the historical origins and divergent trajectories of democracy in Colombia and Venezuela. Her current research deals with regime change, institution building, and constitution making in the Andes.

Michael Coppedge is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science and a Fellow of the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. He previously taught at Yale, Princeton, Georgetown, Johns Hopkins, and the Universities of Belgrano and Salamanca. He has published *Strong Parties and Lame Ducks: Presidential Partyarchy and Factionalism in Venezuela*, as well as book chapters and articles in journals including *Comparative Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, and *Journal of Democracy*. Coppedge has received World Society Foundation, Fulbright-Hays, and Tinker grants. His current research focuses on approaches to democratization, democratic diffusion, and the causes and consequences of party-system characteristics in Latin America.

Frances Hagopian is the Michael P. Grace II Associate Professor of Latin American Studies in the Department of Political Science and former Director of the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. She is the author of *Traditional Politics and Regime Change in Brazil* (Cambridge University Press, 1996), which was named a Choice Outstanding Book in Comparative Politics, and articles on democratization that have appeared in *World Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, and several other publications. Her

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

List of Contributors

current research focuses on economic liberalization and political representation in Brazil, Argentina, Chile, and Mexico. Hagopian previously taught at Harvard, Tufts, and MIT, and she has held fellowships from the Center for Latin American Studies and The Howard Heinz Endowment of the University of Pittsburgh, the Social Science Research Council, the American Council of Learned Societies, and the U.S. Department of Education (Fulbright-Hays program). She is a former member of the Executive Council of the American Political Science Association.

Steven Levitsky is John L. Loeb Associate Professor of the Social Sciences at Harvard University. He specializes in comparative and Latin American politics. His areas of research include political parties and party change, informal institutions, and political regimes and regime change. He is author of *Transforming Labor-Based Parties in Latin America: Argentine Peronism in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2003). He has published articles on Argentine politics in *Comparative Politics*, *World Politics*, *Comparative Political Studies*, *Latin American Research Review*, *Journal of Latin American Studies*, and *Journal of Democracy*. He is currently writing a book on the emergence and dynamics of hybrid political regimes in the post-Cold War era.

Beatriz Magaloni is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Stanford University. She is currently finishing a book on the politics of party hegemony and its demise. Her research interests also include the politics of clientelism and vote buying, the rule of law and the courts, democratization and market-oriented reforms in Latin America, and voting behavior. She has been a Visiting Fellow in the Political Science Department at Harvard University and a Visiting Professor at the Political Science Department at UCLA. Before arriving at Stanford, Magaloni was the Director of Political Science at ITAM (Instituto Tecnológico Autónomo de México) from 1997 to 1999. Some of her articles have appeared in the *Journal of Theoretical Politics* and *Política y Gobierno*. She also has published various chapters in edited volumes on Mexican and Latin American politics.

Scott Mainwaring is Eugene Conley Professor of Political Science and Director of the Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. His books include *Democratic Accountability in Latin America* (Oxford University Press, coedited, 2003), *Christian Democracy in Latin America* (Stanford University Press, coedited, 2003), *Rethinking Party Systems in the Third Wave of Democratization: The Case of Brazil* (Stanford University Press, 1999), *Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, coedited, 1997), and *Building Democratic Institutions: Party Systems in Latin America* (Stanford University Press, coedited, 1995). He received a John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation fellowship in 2000 for work on a project on authoritarianism and democracy in Latin America from 1945 to 2000.

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of Contributors*

xv

René Antonio Mayorga is a Senior Researcher at the Centro Boliviano de Estudios Multidisciplinarios (CEBEM). He is also Professor of Political Science at the Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales (FLACSO) in Ecuador, and in the Joint Master's Program of CEBEM, FLACSO, and the Universidad Complutense of Madrid. He has been a visiting professor at the universities of Salamanca, Berlin, and Notre Dame, among others. His books include *De la Anomía Política al Orden Democrático?* (La Paz, CEBEM, 1991), *Antipolítica y Neopopulismo* (La Paz, CEBEM, 1995), and *La cuestión militar en cuestión: Democracia y Fuerzas Armadas* (La Paz, CEBEM, 1994). He is editor of *Democracia y Gobernabilidad en América Latina* (Caracas, Nueva Sociedad, 1992). He also contributed to *Transitional Justice and the Rule of Law in New Democracies* (Notre Dame, 1997) and to *Mixed-Member Electoral Systems: The Best of Both Worlds?* (Oxford University Press, 2001).

Aníbal Pérez-Liñán is Assistant Professor of Political Science and a member of the Center for Latin American Studies at the University of Pittsburgh. His research focuses on democratic institutions and governability. He has published articles in *Electoral Studies*, *Latin American Research Review*, and *Legislative Studies Quarterly*, among other journals. He is currently completing a book on presidential impeachment in Latin America.

Eduardo Pizarro is Professor at the Universidad Nacional de Colombia in Bogotá and served as Director of its Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Relaciones Internacionales (IEPRI). He was a Visiting Fellow at the Kellogg Institute for International Studies in 2000–01. He has published several scholarly analyses of the conflict in Colombia, including *Una Democracia Asediada. Balance y perspectivas del conflicto armado en Colombia* (Editorial Norma, 2004), and he is a weekly contributor to the national newspaper *El Tiempo*.

Mitchell A. Seligson is Centennial Professor of Political Science at Vanderbilt University and Director of the Latin American Public Opinion Project. He previously held the Daniel H. Wallace Chair of Political Science at the University of Pittsburgh, where he also served as Director of the Center for Latin American Studies. His current work involves survey research projects in Mexico, Guatemala, El Salvador, Honduras, Nicaragua, Costa Rica, Panama, Colombia, Ecuador, and Bolivia. Seligson has held grants and fellowships from the Rockefeller Foundation, the Ford Foundation, the National Science Foundation, Fulbright, USAID, and others; he has published more than eighty articles and more than a dozen books and monographs. His recent published books include *Elections and Democracy in Central America, Revisited* (University of North Carolina Press) and *Development and Underdevelopment: The Political Economy of Global Inequality* (Lynne Rienner).

Martín Tanaka holds a Ph.D. in Political Science from the Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales (FLACSO) in Mexico City. Currently he is Senior

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi

List of Contributors

Researcher and Research Director at the Instituto de Estudios Peruanos in Lima. Tanaka has written about Peruvian politics, Latin American politics, and social movements and participation in Peru. He is author of *Los espejismos de la democracia. El colapso del sistema de partidos en el Perú, 1980–1995, en perspectiva comparada* (Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 1998) and “The Political Constraints on Market Reform in Peru,” in Carol Wise, Riordan Roett, and Guadalupe Paz, eds., *Post-Stabilization Politics in Latin America* (Brookings Institution Press, 2003).

Kurt Weyland is Professor of Government at the University of Texas at Austin. He is the author of *Democracy without Equity: Failures of Reform in Brazil* (University of Pittsburgh Press, 1996); *The Politics of Market Reform in Fragile Democracies: Argentina, Brazil, Peru, and Venezuela* (Princeton University Press, 2002); and numerous refereed journal articles on democratization, market reform, social policy, and populist politics in Latin America. His current book project focuses on the diffusion of innovations in Latin American social sector reform; an edited volume on this topic, *Learning from Foreign Models in Latin American Policy Reform*, was published by Woodrow Wilson Center Press in 2004.

Elisabeth Jean Wood teaches comparative politics at Yale University. Her research interests include social movements, democratization, political violence, civil wars, and development in Latin America and in Africa. She is the author of *Forging Democracy from Below: Insurgent Transitions in South Africa and El Salvador* (Cambridge University Press, 2000) and *Insurgent Collective Action and Civil War in El Salvador* (Cambridge University Press, 2003).

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Many people have supported our efforts in producing *The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America*. This project had its origins in a conference held at the University of Notre Dame on April 23–24, 2001. Our first debt is to the Coca-Cola Corporation for its financial support for this conference and to the Kellogg Institute for International Studies, which hosted it. The staff of the Kellogg Institute spent long hours arranging the travel of participants, designing posters, and making sure that everyone was fed and watered. Several discussants – Diego Abente Brun, Michael Coppedge, Gretchen Helmke, Guillermo O’Donnell, Luis Tonelli, Francisco Weffort, and Rubén Zamora – provided stimulating comments during the conference. Our greatest gratitude is owed to the contributing authors, who walked the fine line between doing justice to the countries they know better than anyone else and at the same time conforming to the broader questions we asked them to address.

This volume is of course a product of the editors and authors. It is also a Kellogg Institute product. Since its inception in 1982, the Kellogg Institute has attempted to promote outstanding research on some of the most important normative issues that confront humanity, including democracy. Our scholarly interests and perspectives have been shaped by the rich intellectual debate at the Kellogg Institute on this theme. Seven of the authors in this volume are former Visiting Fellows of the Institute, three contributors are current Kellogg Faculty Fellows, and one is a former graduate student of the University of Notre Dame. Six of seven discussants who enriched our conference have been either Visiting or Faculty Fellows. We especially thank our colleague, Guillermo O’Donnell, who since the 1970s has set the agenda on debates about democratization.

We also wish to acknowledge the steadfast support of Lew Bateman and the insightful comments of two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press. Scott Mainwaring acknowledges the financial support of the John Simon Guggenheim Foundation. Elizabeth Rankin provided invaluable help with copyediting and preparing the volume for publication.

Cambridge University Press

0521824613 - The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks

Edited by Frances Hagopian and Scott P. Mainwaring

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xviii

Acknowledgments

Working with each other has been a pleasure. We began our conversations about democracy in Latin America with each other 17 years ago. In that time, we have benefited from formal collaboration as well as from informal collegiality. However, if the secret should be revealed, what we talk about much of the time with each other is not the latest theories of democratization, but rather the love of our families. For that, and for their patience with us, we are deeply grateful. Only Tony and Sue know just how much we have to thank them for. We dedicate this book to our children – Michael Messina, Benjamin Mainwaring, and Grace Mainwaring – in recognition of our love for them, and with the profound hope that they may live in a world in which governments are democratic and just and provide decent lives for all their citizens.