

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
Susan Youens  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## HEINRICH HEINE AND THE LIED

More than any other poet, Heinrich Heine has provided composers for almost two hundred years with texts for music: over eight thousand compositions to date. Nineteenth-century composers were drawn in particular to a limited selection of Heine's early lyrical works from the *Buch der Lieder* and the *Neue Gedichte* for their songs; poems such as "Du bist wie eine Blume," "The sea hath its pearls" and "Was will die einsame Träne?" were set to music over and over again. In this book, Youens examines some of the reasons for Heine's popularity, especially the fact that composers in the second quarter of the nineteenth century were drawn to him for songs in radical styles, songs that redefined what Lieder could be and do. Specific topics of this book include Schubert's fusion of reinvented song traditions with radical tonal procedures and the political meanings of poetry and song in Schumann's time.

SUSAN YOUENS is J. W. Van Gorkom Professor of Music at the University of Notre Dame. She has written numerous scholarly articles on nineteenth-century song and is the author of seven books on the songs of Schubert and Wolf, including *Hugo Wolf and his Mörike Songs* and *Schubert's Late Lieder: Beyond the Song Cycles* (Cambridge, 2000 and 2002, respectively). Selected honors include four fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Guggenheim Foundation, the National Humanities Center, and the Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
Susan Youens  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# HEINRICH HEINE AND THE LIED

SUSAN YUENS



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
Susan Youens  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo  
Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK  
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521823746](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521823746)  
© Susan Youens 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-0-521-82374-6 hardback

---

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such  
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of music examples</i>	viii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxviii
1 In the beginning: Schubert and Heine	1
2 Missing links: The Heine songs of Franz Lachner and Johann Vesque von Püttlingen	89
3 A tale of three ballads: Heine and the Schumanns	174
4 “A flower by any other name”: Song, sex, society, and “Du bist wie eine Blume”	266
<i>Notes</i>	317
<i>Select bibliography</i>	353
<i>Index</i>	367

## *Illustrations*

Fig. 2.1a	Lithograph of Franz Lachner by Andreas Staub, c. 1830	page 91
Fig. 2.1b	Portrait of the elderly Franz Lachner, artist unknown	92
Fig. 2.2	Moritz von Schwind, <i>Lachnerrolle</i> (1862) – Lachner's lessons with Johann Kaspar Ett. With kind permission from the Städtische Galerie im Lenbachhaus, Munich. Graphische Sammlung, G 2091.	98
Fig. 2.3	Moritz von Schwind, <i>Lachnerrolle</i> (1862) – Officials questioning Lachner, Lachner in despair at an inn. With kind permission from the Städtische Galerie im Lenbachhaus, Munich. Graphische Sammlung, G 2091.	99
Fig. 2.4	Moritz von Schwind, <i>Lachnerrolle</i> (1862) – Lachner and Beethoven playing four-hand piano music; Lachner, Schwind, Bauernfeld, and Schubert serenading Julie Royko. With kind permission from the Städtische Galerie im Lenbachhaus, Munich. Graphische Sammlung, G 2091.	99
Fig. 2.5	Moritz von Schwind, <i>Lachnerrolle</i> – Lachner visiting Schubert's and Beethoven's graves. With kind permission from the Städtische Galerie im Lenbachhaus, Munich. Graphische Sammlung, G 2091.	101
Fig. 3.1	Nicolas-Toussaint Charlet, <i>Napoleon Bidding Farewell to the Imperial Guard at Fontainebleau, 20 April 1814.</i>	180
Fig. 3.2	Anonymous engraving, <i>Napoleon, on the Ile d'Aix, Departs for St. Helena, 15 July 1815.</i>	181
Fig. 3.3	Title-page engraving, Count Emmanuel de Las Cases, <i>Mémorial de Sainte-Hélène par le Cte. de Las Cases: suivi de Napoléon dans l'exil, par MM. O'Meara et Antonmarchi, et de L'Histoire de la translation des restes mortels de l'empereur Napoléon aux Invalides</i> , vol. 1. Paris: Ernest Bourdin, 1842.	186

	<i>List of illustrations</i>	vii
Fig. 3.4	Engraving to illustrate Pierre-Jean de Béranger, “Les deux grenadiers” from <i>Chansons de P.-J. de Béranger anciennes et posthumes, nouvelle édition populaire</i> , p. 361. Paris: Perrotin, 1866.	187
Fig. 3.5	Illustration by Paul Thumann of Heinrich Heine, “Die Grenadiere” in <i>Heinrich Heine’s Buch der Lieder</i> , facing p. 38. Leipzig: Adolf Titze, 1883.	189
Fig. 3.6	Title-page engraving for Carl Gollmick, “Die beiden Grenadiere. Gedicht von Heine. Duett für Baritone und Bass,” op. 60. Mainz and London: B. Schott’s Söhne.	202
Fig. 3.7	Illustration by Paul Thumann of Heinrich Heine, “Belsazar” in <i>Heinrich Heine’s Buch der Lieder</i> , facing p. 48. Leipzig: Adolf Titze, 1883.	221
Fig. 3.8	Gustave Doré, <i>La Nixe à la harpe</i> , illustration for Joseph Xavier Boniface Saintine, <i>La Mythologie du Rhin</i> , p. 262. Paris: Editions du Trident, 1862.	240
Fig. 3.9	Illustration by Birket Foster for Henry Mayhew, <i>The Rhine and Its Picturesque Scenery. Rotterdam to Mayence</i> , facing p. 305. London: David Bogue, 1866.	245
Fig. 3.10	Heinrich Proch, title-page illustration for “Die Lorelei,” op. 222. Vienna, Friedrich Schreiber.	260
Fig. 3.11	Title-page for Leonhard Emil Bach, “Die neue Loreley,” op. 28. Berlin, C. A. Challier, 1878.	265
Fig. 4.1	Illustration by Paul Thumann of Heinrich Heine, “Der bleiche, herbstliche Halbmond” in <i>Heinrich Heine’s Buch der Lieder</i> , facing p. 94. Leipzig: Adolf Titze, 1883.	269

## *Music examples*

Ex. 1.1	Ludwig van Beethoven, "Allegro con brio ed appassionato," mm. 18–21, from the Sonata, op. 111	page 16
Ex. 1.2	Rafael Behn, "Ich stand in dunkeln Träumen," mm. 1–15, from <i>Lieder und Gesänge</i> , op. 6, no. 2. Berlin: Ries & Erler, n.d.	36
Ex. 1.3	Jakob Rosenhain, "Ich stand in dunkeln Träumen," from <i>Sechs deutsche Lieder</i> , op. 40, p. 16. Leipzig: C. F. Peters, 1848.	37
Ex. 1.4	Marie Hinrichs, "Ihr Bild," from <i>Neun Gesänge</i> , op. 1. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1846.	40
Ex. 1.5	Clara Schumann, "Ich stand in dunkeln Träumen," mm. 1–13, from <i>Sechs Lieder</i> , op. 13, no. 1. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1844.	44
Ex. 1.6	Franz Schubert, "Die Gestirne," D. 444, mm. 1–3, text by Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock (June 1816)	67
Ex. 1.7	Franz Schubert, "Die Allmacht," D. 852, mm. 1–6, text by Johann Ladislaus Pyrker (August 1825)	67
Ex. 1.8	Johann Sebastian Bach, "Fuga IV a 5 voci" in C-sharp minor, mm. 1–9, from <i>Das wohltemperierte Klavier</i> , Part 1, BWV 849	79
Ex. 2.1	Franz Lachner, "Es rauben Gedanken," mm. 1–22, from <i>Sechs Lieder für eine Altstimme</i> , op. 152 (composed 1871, dedicated to "Frau Amalie Joachim"). Leipzig, R. Seitz	96
Ex. 2.2	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 1–9, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33 (composed 30 October 1831). Vienna, Tobias Haslinger	106
Ex. 2.3	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 10–20, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33. Vienna, Tobias Haslinger	109
Ex. 2.4	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 27–35, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33. Vienna, Tobias Haslinger	110
Ex. 2.5	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 43–59, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33.	112

	<i>Music examples</i>	ix
Ex. 2.6	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 73–79, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33.	114
Ex. 2.7	Franz Lachner, "Wasserfahrt," mm. 84–102, from <i>Sängerfahrt</i> , op. 33.	115
Ex. 2.8	Franz Lachner, "Eine alte Geschichte," mm. 1–15, from <i>Deutsche Gesänge</i> , op. 49, no. 2 (dedicated to "Miss Julie Royko," composed 1831/32). Mainz, B. Schott's Söhne	124
Ex. 2.9a	Franz Lachner, "Eine alte Geschichte," mm. 16–22, from <i>Deutsche Gesänge</i> , op. 49, no. 2.	126
Ex. 2.9b	Franz Schubert, "Im Frühling," D. 882, mm. 49–50, text by Ernst Schulze (composed March 1826)	127
Ex. 2.10	Franz Lachner, "Eine alte Geschichte," mm. 37–55, from <i>Deutsche Gesänge</i> , op. 49, no. 2.	129
Ex. 2.11	Maude Valérie White, "A Youth Once Lov'd A Maiden," mm. 1–10, from <i>Album of German Songs</i> . Boston: Oliver Ditson & Co., n.d.	134
Ex. 2.12	Maude Valérie White, "Aus den Himmelsaugen droben," mm. 1–11, from <i>Album of German Songs</i> . Boston: Oliver Ditson & Co., n.d.	135
Ex. 2.13	Franz Lachner, "Der Zimmermann," mm. 1–10, from <i>Deutsche Gesänge</i> , op. 29. Mainz, B. Schott's Söhne	137
Ex. 2.14	Franz Lachner, "Der Zimmermann," mm. 31–51, from <i>Deutsche Gesänge</i> , op. 29.	138
Ex. 2.15	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. XX ("Still ist die Nacht"), mm. 1–16, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine's Reisebildern</i> . Vienna: Aus der kaiserlich-königlichen Hof- und Staatsdruckerei, 1851.	158
Ex. 2.16	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. XX ("Still ist die Nacht"), mm. 28–46, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine's Reisebildern</i> .	160
Ex. 2.17	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. VIII ("Du schönes Fischermädchen"), mm. 66–85, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine's Reisebildern</i> , pp. 33–36.	161
Ex. 2.18	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. XVI ("Am fernen Horizonte"), mm. 1–5, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine's Reisebildern</i> , p. 56.	163
Ex. 2.19	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. XXIV ("Ich unglücksel'ger Atlas!"), mm. 1–19, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine's Reisebildern</i> , pp. 75–76.	165



x	<i>Music examples</i>	
Ex. 2.20	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. LXXIX (“Doch die Bewussten klagten”), mm. 21–31, postlude in mm. 34–39, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine’s Reisebildern</i> , pp. 200–203.	168
Ex. 2.21	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. XXXVI (“Mensch, verspottete nicht den Teufel”), mm. 1–10, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine’s Reisebildern</i> , p. 103.	171
Ex. 2.22	Johann Vesque von Püttlingen, No. LV (“Ich wollte bei dir weilen”), mm. 1–16, from <i>Die Heimkehr. Achtundachtzig Gedichte aus H. Heine’s Reisebildern</i> , p. 148.	172
Ex. 3.1	Robert Schumann, “Die beiden Grenadiere,” mm. 1–2, from the <i>Romanzen und Balladen</i> , Heft II, op. 49, no. 1. Leipzig: F. Whistling, [c. 1847].	176
Ex. 3.2	Christian Gottlieb Reissiger, “Der brave Grenadier,” mm. 1–14, poem by O. L. B. Wolff, from Rudolf Hirsch, ed., <i>Album für Gesang</i> , pp. 58–59. Leipzig: L. H. Boesenberg, 1842.	182
Ex. 3.3	Michail Wielhorski, “Du bist wie eine Blume,” mm. 1–8, from <i>Sechs Lieder von Heine für 2 Frauenstimmen</i> , dedicated to Pauline Viardot-Garcia. Berlin: Bote & Bock, 1846.	193
Ex. 3.4	Robert Schumann, “Die beiden Grenadiere,” mm. 3–10, from the <i>Romanzen und Balladen</i> , Heft II, op. 49, no. 1. Leipzig: F. Whistling, [c. 1847].	196
Ex. 3.5	Robert Schumann, “Die beiden Grenadiere,” mm. 36–38, from the <i>Romanzen und Balladen</i> , Heft II, op. 49, no. 1. Leipzig: F. Whistling, [c. 1847].	197
Ex. 3.6	Franz Schubert, “Jägerlied,” D. 204, mm. 1–4, composed 26 May 1815	197
Ex. 3.7	Franz Schubert, “Der Lindenbaum,” mm. 6–8, from <i>Winterreise</i> , D. 911	198
Ex. 3.8	Robert Schumann, “Waldesgespräch,” no. 3 in <i>Liederkreis</i> , op. 39, mm. 33–44, text by Joseph von Eichendorff	199
Ex. 3.9	Robert Schumann, “Die beiden Grenadiere,” mm. 53–60, from the <i>Romanzen und Balladen</i> , Heft II, op. 49, no. 1. Leipzig: F. Whistling, [c. 1847].	200
Ex. 3.10	Friedrich Hieronymus Truhn, “Die beiden Grenadiere,” op. 43 (“Dem Dichter grösster Hochachtung voll gewidmet”), mm. 1–13. Magdeburg: G. Schmilinsky, n.d.	203

*Music examples*

xi

- |          |  |     |
|----------|--|-----|
| Ex. 3.11 | Johannes Dittberner, "Die beiden deutsche Grenadier (Dichtung frei nach Heine)," mm. 1–16. Breslau: C. Becher, 1914.   | 206 |
| Ex. 3.12 | Robert Schumann, "Belsatzar. Ballade von H. Heine, für eine tiefe Singstimme und Pianoforte," op. 57, mm. 1–6. Leipzig: Siegel & Stoll, 1846.  | 227 |
| Ex. 3.13 | Robert Schumann, "Belsatzar," op. 57, mm. 14–18  | 229 |
| Ex. 3.14 | Robert Schumann, "Belsatzar," op. 57, mm. 28–36  | 232 |
| Ex. 3.15 | Robert Schumann, "Belsatzar," op. 57, mm. 51–58  | 233 |
| Ex. 3.16 | Robert Schumann, "Belsatzar," op. 57, mm. 84–99  | 236 |
| Ex. 3.17 | Joseph Klein, "Loreley. Ballade von H. Heine" (Cologne, Eck), mm. 65–88  | 242 |
| Ex. 3.18 | Clara Schumann, "Loreley," composed 8 June 1843, mm. 4–12. Reproduced with kind permission from Clara Schumann, <i>Seven Songs</i> , ed. Kristin Norderval. Bryn Mawr, Pennsylvania: Hildegard Publishing Company, 1933. | 255 |
| Ex. 3.19 | Clara Schumann, "Loreley," mm. 44–50. Reproduced with kind permission from Clara Schumann, <i>Seven Songs</i> , ed. Kristin Norderval. Bryn Mawr, Pennsylvania: Hildegard Publishing Company, 1993.                      | 258 |
| Ex. 3.20 | Clara Schumann, "Loreley," mm. 62–69. Reproduced with kind permission from Clara Schumann, <i>Seven Songs</i> , ed. Kristin Norderval. Bryn Mawr, Pennsylvania: Hildegard Publishing Company, 1993.                      | 259 |
| Ex. 3.21 | Heinrich Proch, "Die Lorelei," op. 222, mm. 36–46. Vienna: Friedrich Schreiber, [ca. 1850?].   | 262 |
| Ex. 3.22 | Gotthard Wöhler, "Die Loreley," mm. 44–52, from <i>Drei Balladen von H. Heine</i> , op. 1. Leipzig, Breitkopf & Härtel.  | 263 |
| Ex. 4.1  | Clara Schumann, "Sie liebten sich beide," mm. 4–10, from <i>Sechs Lieder</i> , op. 13, no. 2   | 268 |
| Ex. 4.2  | Robert Schumann, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 1–5, from <i>Myrthen</i> , op. 25, no. 24   | 279 |
| Ex. 4.3  | Robert Schumann, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 6–9, from <i>Myrthen</i> , op. 25, no. 24   | 281 |
| Ex. 4.4  | Robert Schumann, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 14–20, from <i>Myrthen</i> , op. 25, no. 24   | 283 |
| Ex. 4.5  | Marie Hinrichs, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 1–8, from <i>Neun Gesänge</i> , op. 1. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1846.  | 287 |
| Ex. 4.6  | Frances McCollin, "Thou Art Like Unto A Flower." mm. 10–20. Philadelphia: Theodore Presser Co., 1911.  | 288 |

- Ex. 4.7 Giovanni Sgambati, "Tu sei proprio come un fiore = Thou'rt like a tender flow'ret," mm. 1–9, from *Canti per una voce*. Mainz: B. Schott, [between 1886 and 1888]. 290
- Ex. 4.8 Elise von Waldeck, "Oh! thou art like a flower," mm. 9–13. London: Lamborn Cock, 1881. 292
- Ex. 4.9 John Ford Barbour, "Thou'rt like a lovely flower," mm. 26–31, from *Album of Songs*, pp. 12–15. Chicago: Clayton F. Summy, 1896. 293
- Ex. 4.10 Garrett Colyn, "Thou art like unto a flower," mm. 14–18, from *Two Songs*, pp. 2–3. New York: G. Schirmer, 1888. 294
- Ex. 4.11 William Harold Neidlinger, "Du bist wie eine Blume / A gentle flower thou art," mm. 31–40, from *Songs and Ballads*, pp. 2–3. New York: G. Schirmer, 1895. 295
- Ex. 4.12 C. A. Barry, "Thou Art E'en As A Flower," mm. 30–38, from *Six Songs with English & German Words*, op. 2, pp. 12–13. London: Ewer & Co., n.d. 296
- Ex. 4.13 Alexander Winterberger, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 14–18, from *12 Gesänge*, op. 12, no. 2, pp. 4–5. Mainz: B. Schott's Söhne, 1865. 297
- Ex. 4.14 Anton Rubinstein, "Lied," mm. 19–28, from *Rubinstein-Album. 24 Lieder, op 32. 33. 34*, pp. 15–16. Leipzig: Kistner, 1900. 298
- Ex. 4.15 Arthur Rosenstein, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 6–13, from *Zwei Lieder*, pp. 2–3. New York: G. Schirmer, 1911. 299
- Ex. 4.16 A. Reichel, "Lied," mm. 10–16, from *Sechs Lieder*, op. 13, pp. 6–7. Düsseldorf: W. Bayrhofer, n.d. 301
- Ex. 4.17 Vernon Spencer, "Thou Art So Like a Flower," mm. 18–22. Cincinnati: The John Church Company, 1913. 302
- Ex. 4.18 James H. Rogers, "Thou Art Like Unto a Flower," mm. 18–30, words after Heinrich Heine, pp. 2–3. Boston: The Boston Music Company, 1896. 303
- Ex. 4.19 Edwin Aler, "Thou Art Like Unto A Flower (Du bist wie eine Blume)," mm. 5–9, from *Five Songs*, pp. 3–5. Washington, DC: John F. Ellis & Co., 1894. 304
- Ex. 4.20 Otto Cantor, "Oh fair, oh sweet and holy," mm. 36–43. Boston: White-Smith Music Publishing Co., 1896. 305
- Ex. 4.21 Carl Stiehl, "Du bist wie eine Blume," mm. 1–6, from *Lieder und Gesänge*, op. 2, no. 1, p. 3. Hamburg: A. Cranz, n.d. 306
- Ex. 4.22 Félix Fox, "Thou'rt like unto a Flower (Du bist wie eine Blume)," mm. 15–21, from *Two Poemaps by Heinrich*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
Susan Youens  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

	<i>Music examples</i>	
	<i>Heine</i> , pp. 3–5. Boston: The Boston Music Company, 1908.	xiii
Ex. 4.23	Walter Händel Thorley, “A floweret thou resemblest,” mm. 1–9, from <i>Sieben Lieder</i> , pp. 8–9. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, [1885?].	307
Ex. 4.24	Eugen von Buri, “Du bist wie eine Blume,” mm. 1–8, op. 25, p. 2. Offenbach: Johann André, n.d.	309
Ex. 4.25	Paul Geisler, <i>Gesänge. Zwölf Dichtungen von Heine und Rückert</i> , p. 3, mm. 1–8. Berlin: Bote & Bock, 1876.	310
Ex. 4.26	A. Leigher, “Love Song,” mm. 4–15, from <i>Six Songs, Translated From the German of HEINE. by R. W. Fullerton, Esquire</i> . London: Robert W. Ollivier, n.d.	311
		313

## Preface

Anyone who ventures into the vast unexplored reaches of German song territory encounters a juggernaut almost immediately. Over and over again, the supplier of the words is identified as Heinrich Heine (1797–1856), a very great poet, to be sure, but other great poets did not leave the same mammoth imprint on music history as this man. In the Poet–Composer catalogue at the Unter den Linden branch of the Berlin State Library, entries for songs to his poems occupy more file drawers than any other poet, even Goethe – and these are only the songs in Berlin’s keeping, not the sum total of Heine settings on earth. Günter Metzner’s catalogue, *Heine in der Musik* (Heine in Music), consumes twelve oversize volumes, and both Peter Shea and I have found settings not included in this Herculean source.<sup>1</sup> Those who peruse Ernst Challier’s *Großer Lieder-Katalog* (Great Song Catalogue) of 1884<sup>2</sup> soon discover that composers post-1850 frequently chose Heine for their op. 1 entrée onto the scene, as if setting Heine to music was a rite of passage, a guarantee that attention would be paid. In jocular exaggeration, Brahms in his later years spoke of having set “almost all of Heine” to music when he was young, and Wolf too turned to Heine in his compositional youth for a *Liederstrauß* (song-bouquet) of songs in Schumann’s style. It is not long before one begins asking, “Why?”, and the usual answers somehow do not suffice. Yes, Heine was a master of pellucid profundity, of simple words arranged to say un-simple things; yes, he could concoct images guaranteed to inspire music; yes, he became famous immediately and therefore one knew his name and read his verse where less notorious figures might go unnoticed; and yes, he was a master-practitioner of contradiction, and hence, there is a “Heine” for many different purposes. But the sheer size and scope of the phenomenon go beyond these pat explanations; deeper currents must surely run beneath this immense river of music. It is as if Heine were somehow synonymous with song.

And not just German song: he crops up in many surprising places.<sup>3</sup> There is the Hungarian Heine, the American Heine, the British Heine, the Portuguese Heine, the Romanian Heine, the Swedish, Danish, and Finnish Heines, even a Welsh Heine. The French loved him and converted him into turn-of-century song texts; one of Debussy’s lost early works, “Tragédie,” was on a poem by Léon Valade “after Heine.”<sup>4</sup> There

was a cottage industry in Russian translations of this poet, and composers followed suit: Tchaikovsky is a Heine composer, and so are Alexander Glazunov, Borodin, and many others. And the chameleon-like variety of musical styles to which Heine was fitted can make one's head spin. There are folksong-like settings, virtuoso concert songs,<sup>5</sup> late Romantic richness, lean modernity, atonality, the smallest of small songs, and cycles ranging from modest to immense.<sup>6</sup> There are Italian ditties on words by "Enrico Heine" of a lushness to inspire laughter,<sup>7</sup> and there is Luigi Dallapiccola's exquisite twelve-tone chamber work, *An Mathilde*, based on three deeply moving poems Heine wrote to his wife when he was near death.<sup>8</sup> Whatever Heine's complicated feelings about "coal smoke and Englishmen," the British found their way to his verses early and often. One amusing example is "This Heart of Mine (Das arme Herz). Song, composed and respectfully dedicated to the Baroness James de Rothschild" by Alexander Reichardt (and one recalls that Heine knew the Rothschilds), with its early Victorian version of "Und wüßten's die Blumen, die kleinen": "The daisies that round me are peeping / Were they of my pain aware, / Would now with me lie weeping / My load of grief to share." One is not surprised to find the indication "Con molto sentimento" at the start of the song.<sup>9</sup> There is a proliferation of Heine songs by American composers in the Gay Nineties, a repertory mostly in a regressive diatonic style on the poet's most familiar works. Nothing as radical as Schubert's "Die Stadt" composed some seventy years earlier is to be found in this body of song, tailored to the middle-class parlor, dripping with nostalgia, musically conservative, sweet to a degree.<sup>10</sup> Both the German Forty-Eighters who came to the United States in the wake of revolution and their children hymned the Fatherland in music that harks back to earlier times.

The restriction to a few familiar texts is another of the conundrums one encounters when tracing the Heine juggernaut on its way to World War I. "How many settings of 'Du bist wie eine Blume' / 'Thou art like a flower' and 'The sea hath its pearls' *are* there?", I asked as the examples multiplied, not just in America but elsewhere. Was there anyone in the Western world at the turn-of-century who did not know this poem? "Du bist wie eine Blume," implicated as it is in the century's constructions of gender and desire, is a cultural phenomenon in its own right, as we shall see in chapter 4. It is one of the richest ironies to follow in the wake of this master of irony that many of the composers who set this poem to music were actually in agreement with the same social forces Heine so subtly skewers in his cynical masterpiece. Until the first battle divisions took aim in World War I, most composers behaved as if Heine had died immediately after completing the *Buch der Lieder* (Book of Songs) and the *Neuer Frühling* (New Spring) section of the *Neue Gedichte* (New Poems), the latter including such favorites as "Gekommen ist der Maie" (May has arrived), "Der Schmetterling ist in die Rose verliebt" (The butterfly is in love with the rose), "Es war ein alter

*Preface*

xvii

König" (There was an old king), and, above all, "Leise zieht durch mein Gemüt" (Softly chiming through my mind), a poem that rivals "Du bist wie ein Blume" in popularity. It is not that composers were wrong to do so. "Leise zieht durch mein Gemüt" is a gem devoid of all gall but Heine recognized even as he wrote it that it was no longer possible to escape into crystalline realms of beauty and thereby turn one's back on injustice in the world. There were exceptions to nineteenth-century musicians' avoidance of Heine's more abrasive side, but they are exceptions that prove the rule, and such songs prompted only puzzlement from critics and quick consignment to oblivion. The vast majority of composers, from inept amateur to genius, stuck with a shortlist of sanctioned poems by Heine and refused to budge from it until the world was a very different place many decades later. It is too easy to say that the production of commercially viable music for the home entailed composers' choosing the semblance of sentimentality over the more savage, if always suave, strains of irony in the early verse or that the explorations of carnal pleasure in the poems from Heine's Parisian exile offended bourgeois sensibilities. If there is undoubted truth to these assertions, it cannot be the whole truth.

Most of the "shortlist" of composers' favorite Heine poems are – on the surface – variations on themes of unrequited or betrayed love; both the poems and the songs belong thereafter to the history of emotional life in the nineteenth century. I often think that Heine at his best has more layers than any onion (and can produce the same bitter tears), and his seeming love poems have been read in a variety of ways. Earlier, his fascination with this subject was chalked up to versified autobiography, but while such naive explanations were popular with the reading public for quite a while, transactions between life and art are seldom so straightforward. We know little about Heine's erotic history in his youth, and what we do know is at odds with two different flavors of myth: that his early poetry stemmed from his disappointed passion for Amalie and Therese, the two daughters of his uncle, Salomon Heine and that he was a promiscuous rakehell in Paris. The discovery that he visited brothels in Hamburg during his brief mercantile apprenticeship put paid to notions of the ethereal, suffering lover, and, conversely, it seems unlikely that his experiences in Paris were nearly as dissolute as he made them out to be in his poems from the 1830s. Other critics turned the autobiographical readings upside down when they asserted that Heine, rebelling against Goethe's so-called "poems of experience," simply lied in rhyme, producing pseudo-autobiography meant to deceive. In a later school of interpretation, the passive lover who can do nothing to alter his unhappy situation is read as a stand-in for the Jew in Germany, the impossibility of love in Heine's early poetic universe thus signifying the Christian Fatherland's refusal to accept those artists who happened to be of Jewish birth. That I occasionally agree with such readings of a poet keenly aware of his stigmatized status (in the



wonderful “An Edom,” or “To Edom,” Heine encapsulates the tortured, intertwined relationship of German Jew and Christian in his day<sup>11</sup>) is evident in my discussion of Franz Lachner’s “Wasserfahrt” in chapter 2. Still other readers locate the fault-lines of nineteenth-century gender roles and codes of desire in these poems, and here again, I occasionally concur. If social critique was hardly the sole *raison d’être* for this poetry, it nevertheless constitutes a red thread throughout many of his best-known works. In Freud’s wake, still other critics have had recourse to psychoanalytic theories in their perusal of this poet and therefore find early childhood trauma leading to neurosis in his life, letters, and verse, although the source of the trauma has proven quite difficult to pin down.

Others, recognizing that Heine made his place in the poetic scheme of things a recurring subject of versified investigation, ground their readings in the making of poetry. According to Karl Heinz Götze, Heine inherited not only the formal arsenal of Romanticism – its folk-poetic borrowings, its imagery of nightingale, lotus, lily, witches, and knights – but the problem at its core, one that had been brewing throughout the eighteenth century. In earlier times, one was born into an earthly estate, whereby the sons of noblemen administered the family holdings or became army officers, farmers’ sons became farmers, blacksmiths’ sons became blacksmiths, and so on. The source of material existence was in most instances a certainty, and things metaphysical were consigned to religion’s schemas of salvation. By Heine’s day, this was no longer the case. Members of the bourgeoisie could attain cultivation through education, but this did not provide them with the means by which to subsist in real life. That the world is a dream is one of Romanticism’s fundamental propositions, but one cannot actually live in such airy bubbles for long – hence, the Romantic wandering back and forth, lost, between material reality and fantasy worlds of imagination. If the Romantics chose love as their last hope of attachment to the world, it was because love is both body and spirit, Nature and society, in Time and outside of Time, a means to win back the world. But to locate an entire universe in another person’s love cannot ultimately be done, as Wagner would later demonstrate conclusively in *Tristan und Isolde*. As a latecomer to Romanticism, Heine from the beginning to the end would find himself torn by his – inability? refusal? – to relinquish the longing for what cannot be realized in mortal existence merely because he recognized that it was impossible. Knowing that carnal love gives us something unavailable anywhere else in life’s experiences, he could not let go of Romanticism’s demand that poetry and love should create an enduring world. Social contingencies, shame, sexual attraction as something transitory, seduction’s opportunism on either side of the gendered equation: Heine acknowledges such gritty realities of sex in the real world from the beginning, but in the *Buch der Lieder*, he treats them as that which undermines the omnipresent longing for Romanticism’s vision to prevail. Even at the end of his life, one hears in



his realization “that love is what it is, and that is more than anything else can be, the old sadness that love can only be what it is.”<sup>12</sup>

If one approaches the 1827 best-seller from this vantage point, then the adherence of composers in Heine’s own century to a few select poems takes on new significance. When I first began this book, it seemed to me that the vast majority of nineteenth-century composers, with the exception of a privileged few, did not “get it” but rather simplified and sentimentalized Heine to a degree. Did they skim the surface of these poems in their music because they could not understand what Heine was doing, I asked myself? Grumpy types like Jack Stein accused Schubert of missing Heine’s irony altogether and pegging simple [!] songs onto complex words; his critiques belong to a bygone view of song as a genre that necessarily simplifies because too brief, too limited, for profundity. I once thought of entitling this book, “Heine in Song: The History of a Long Misunderstanding,” but that was a misunderstanding on *my* part. In language as sensitive as a seismograph, Heine sets before us the falsity of emotional codes that destroyed both men and women, the constraints preventing the expression of desire, the wars between illusion and reality, all in the service of a new aesthetic of poetry. When pre-World War I composers rejected most of the Parisian poems and ignored the political poetry altogether, when they smothered the small body of poems they would admit into the canon in sounding treacle, they were doing cultural work. By the turn-of-century, the floodtide of sappy songs sounds an insistent note of refutation, of nostalgia for a threatened way of life en route to the catastrophe of World War I. One senses the determination, at times veiled, at times shrill, to perpetuate a social fabric that was sustained by art in covert and overt ways, and the difference between this agenda and earlier uses of Heine is something to ponder. There is a general trajectory (with exceptions) one can trace, from the pre-1848 coupling of Heine and radical musical innovation to the fin-de-siècle repertory of songs drenched in nostalgia. The metamorphosis is all the more arresting because later composers clung to the same poems set by their more daring predecessors. When saturation finally set in, when the institutions that had supported the vast output of song were smashed to bits by the guns of Ypres and Verdun, repudiation of Heine as a source for music was inevitable.

And yet, he resurfaces thereafter in fascinating ways. There is, for example, a gripping tale waiting to be told about the Nazis’ predicament vis-à-vis the Heine songs of the past.<sup>13</sup> The fierce debates in the late nineteenth century about a monument to Heine in his homeland are the prelude to the Third Reich’s attempts to vilify or obliterate him; for example, Carl Paasch in 1890 declared that a memorial to Heine should be built only after every last Jew had been driven out of the land or forced into ghettos.<sup>14</sup> The cultural ministers of the Third Reich, the literary scholars and musicologists in cahoots with Hitler’s regime, had a double dilemma on their hands: when

they extolled Robert Schumann as a German master, they had to account somehow for his attraction to poetry by the Jew Heine, whose books were banned and burned.<sup>15</sup> One solution was to focus on such works as the Eichendorff *Liederkreis*, op. 39 or *Frauenliebe und -leben*<sup>16</sup> and to omit mention of the Heine songs altogether. In Erich Valentin's "Robert Schumann, Werk und Vermächtnis" (Robert Schumann, the Work and the Legacy), not only is Heine nowhere to be found but Schumann is compared to Wagner as a staunch fighter on behalf of German-ness in music.<sup>17</sup> Another solution, adopted by Karl Hasse in *Von deutschen Meistern* (On German Masters), was the declaration that Schumann had ennobled Heine's dross, purging what was "half-true and impertinent" in the poet so that the resulting work of art could "shine forth in a purer and deeper flame."<sup>18</sup> In his giant study of Schumann published in 1941, Ludwig Boetticher asserted that "Schumann's love of Nature, his Sunday walks through life, are the best testimony that he did not belong to the problematic-decadent Heine-type,"<sup>19</sup> but for some, that was not sufficient: Heine had to be drummed out of the canon altogether. The singer Grace Hoffman once told John Wustman of a recital program in which the poet of *Dichterliebe* was identified only as "seit 1932, unbekannt" (since 1932, unknown). When the text of Friedrich Silcher's ineradicable "Die Loreley" was attributed to "anonymous," the notation told those who knew the poetic source that the Jew Heine had been expunged from mention. The famous words remained, but divorced from their creator.

But most of the pages to follow tell not of Heine in the twentieth century, fascinating as that subject is, but of the saga's beginning: the equation of this poet in all his pristine freshness with radicalism in song. From the time he burst onto the literary scene in the 1820s until the 1848 revolutions in Europe, he was the poet of choice for the avant-garde, for those who wanted to redefine what song could be and do. The story begins, of course, with the marvel of Schubert's *Schwanengesang* songs; if he was not the first composer to set Heine's poems to music (that honor probably belongs to the Berliner Joseph Klein<sup>20</sup>), he was the first genius to do so. The songs are still startling, forever capable of evoking a shudder of terror and awe. One enters a fully imagined world when one hears these songs, and it is not, most would agree, a world in which one would want to live: the house is haunted, the persona stricken of soul, the dilemmas irreconcilable, the prospects bleak. It might seem that nothing remains to be said about these songs after almost two centuries of commentary, but Schubert, like all geniuses, can never be fully understood, and every generation will grapple with the complexities of his music in new ways. What I propose to explore in the first chapter is my belief that the history of Heine in song began with a brief, intense affair followed by revulsion. A quarrel with the poet's mask of ironic nihilism is encoded in Schubert's music and culminates in rejection after only six songs. That he understood this verse is evident in

*Preface*

xxi

one compositional decision after another; that he did not like this persona and did not want to live in his poetic world is evident in others. I doubt that we would have had more Heine songs if Schubert had lived longer. What makes us regret his repudiation of this man's poetry is the undeniable fact that Schubert wrote the future of music in these songs, but this futurity is the product of wrestling with the past in Jacob-and-the-angel fashion. Understanding that Heine's dilemmas had to do with vast tensions between bygone or vitiated modes of artistic expression and more current concerns in the world around him, Schubert used his chosen poems for experiments with conventions of song that others took for granted. Baroque borrowings, echo effects, the folksong-like art song, hymnody and chorale, and more are all subjected to an incandescent probing. "How to make song strange" might well be the subtitle of these works.

Other composers took Schubert's cue when they also found in Heine fodder for musical experiment in the years before 1848. In fact, "song" assumed such a variety of shapes and guises in the German-speaking world that writers of music encyclopedias eventually threw up their hands in despair, claiming helpless inability to define the genre with any degree of precision. Like concentric circles spreading outwards in ever-wider rings when a stone is thrown into the water, the history of Heine settings post-Schubert begins with two men who knew him personally and who constitute "missing links" between Schubert and Schumann: the Bavarian-born composer and conductor Franz Lachner, and the Viennese lawyer-diplomat Johann Vesque von Püttlingen; the two were themselves friends, as we discover from their later letters. In the songs they wrote after their friend's death (the degrees of friendship with Schubert differ), one finds distinctive ways of coping with a Schubertian legacy they were not allowed to disclaim and different definitions of what constituted music on the cutting edge. In the early 1830s, Lachner composed over thirty songs on texts by Heine in a manner obviously indebted to the Schubert of *Schwanengesang* but with non-Schubertian hallmarks as well; Lachner has a voice of his own. One of the songs in particular, his setting of "Wasserfahrt" (Journey by water) from Heine's *Junge Leiden* (Youthful Sorrows), is a "find" of the first magnitude.<sup>21</sup> Lachner, however, would not continue down that path. Abandoning such advanced strains in later life, he returned to Heine only on rare occasions to fashion conservative songs from verse he once found so modern. Here, we find encapsulated the larger phenomenon by which Heine the Progressive became Heine the Nostalgic.<sup>22</sup>

If Lachner was multiply drawn to Heine, Vesque von Püttlingen was more Heine's man than anyone else to the present day. When he set all eighty-eight poems of Heine's *Die Heimkehr* to music, the mammoth artifact published in 1851, Eduard Hanslick took note and wrote a long review, actually a disquisition on the contentious topic of what a song should and should not be. Despite his friendship with Vesque, Hanslick thought

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
 Susan Youens  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

xxii

*Preface*

that he had transgressed the limits of composable poetry: “Leise zieht durch mein Gemüt” (Softly chiming through my mind) was fit for music, but “Selten habt Ihr mich verstanden” (Seldom did you understand me) was not. Heine’s seemingly sentimental surfaces over subjectivity’s rifts were admissible, but sexually explicit sarcasm lay beyond the bounds of music. Hanslick was not alone: many a composer voted with his or her feet, avoiding those poems not congruent with various notions of what constituted a proper song in its proper social setting. But such transgression was Vesque’s foremost purpose. If he did not have Schubert’s or Schumann’s genius, he wanted more than anything else to leave his mark on the landscape of lied, and he anticipated by almost forty years things Hugo Wolf would do to a higher power later in the century. A reassessment of his achievement is both overdue and already underway; there is a complete recording of *Die Heimkehr* in three CDs, and Graham Johnson will record others in his forthcoming CDs of songs by Schumann’s contemporaries. For too long we have been content to think that an adequate understanding of the vast song repertory can be gained merely by looking at those comparatively few lied composers who have survived into the twenty-first century, effectively, those famous in other genres. Symphony legitimates song, or used to do so.

Of the canonical song composers, it is Schumann whose name is most inseparable from Heine’s. Boetticher to the contrary, there *was* an elective affinity. They are very different, Schubert and Schumann: in fact, the earlier composer’s quick repudiation of Heine is in stark contrast with Schumann’s allegiance to him, the different responses bespeaking unlike aesthetics of song composition. With a certain perversity modeled on Heine, I will not occupy myself in this volume with *Dichterliebe*, which in any event has recently elicited a book by Beate Perrey, but will instead turn to single songs. Robert appears in chapter 2 in comparisons of his music with Lachner’s and Vesque’s songs, and both Schumanns are the sole occupants of chapter 3. My particular concern is with ballads, especially those with nationalistic under- and overtones. From the start, Heine was a political poet in an age of political poetry, although he took pains to separate *his* poems from those of the “Tendenz-Dichter” (poets of current affairs) he skewers in *Deutschland: Ein Wintermärchen* (Germany: A Winter’s Tale). Well before the “Weberlied” (The weavers’ song), he made the workings of history, social justice, and politics a site for the manufacture of verse; to paraphrase one scholar’s neat quip, Heine thought history too important to leave to the historians.<sup>23</sup> One of Schumann’s most famous songs, the ballad “Die beiden Grenadiere” (The two grenadiers), was born of history and was history’s tool thereafter, its afterlife quite a tale. “Belsatzar” (Belshazzar) too is entwined both in Jewish resistance history (Heine) and in the build-up to the Revolution of 1848 (Schumann) in ways that make one realize yet again how deeply implicated in life’s manifold messiness songs are. What was political/historical/social

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-82374-6 - Heinrich Heine and the Lied  
 Susan Youens  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

*Preface*

xxiii

in the making of the text becomes differently political/historical/social in the making of music, and the counterpoint between them is something I find fascinating. And finally, I conclude the third chapter with a discussion of Clara Schumann's "Loreley," not published until the 1990s. The poem is a reinvention of Homer's sirens in Rhineland-Romantic garb, and Clara's setting is, among much else, homage to the Schubert of "Erlkönig." If Schubert was no longer among the living when Clara composed her Loreley, his Erlking was, and her perception of the subterranean links between Goethe's and Heine's ballads, between Schubert's music and her own, is nothing short of brilliant.

In this book, I have followed a more or less direct chronological path from Schubert to his longer-lived friends to Schumann and beyond. In the last chapter, I go on a stroll through a forest of settings of a single text: "Du bist wie eine Blume," so popular with composers from great to trivial that one is compelled to ask why. Schumann, recognizing the cynicism at the heart of Heine's enterprise, sweeps almost all traces of it aside and replaces it with an epithalamium to his bride, and a horde of other composers also engaged in willful misprision. By World War I, people were sick of the thing, and with reason, but the four hundred-plus songs to these two tiny strophes have tales to tell about song and society, men and women, Heine and music that are rich indeed. Here I go beyond my self-imposed boundary of Heine settings in the poet's lifetime and track what became of this ubiquitous poem in the later nineteenth and even the twentieth centuries. Heine's superb biographer Jeffrey Sammons once mused on this poet's posthumous journeys "into life's strangeness," and the uses made of this poem constitute a case study in that strangeness. Here again, one realizes that songs both participate in and shape the societies that consume them. What, one wonders, would Heine have thought of the settings by those who took him to be endorsing the very values he was condemning? Contemplating these songs, I came to realize that the Heine juggernaut is a perfect test-case for the ways in which the Lied tradition offers a key to music history throughout the long nineteenth century. For composers in the wake of the French Revolution and the Napoleonic upheavals, there was no easy, self-evident way forward but rather a constant, often tortured, re-negotiation with the past at each step. Schubert knew it, Schumann knew it, and the innumerable creators of late Romantic parlor songs enacted it.

To close with an admittedly defensive last note or two or three: confronted with a repertory this immense (some eight thousand pieces of music), one must pick and choose. I have not even covered the songs from the 1820s to c. 1850 in any semi-encyclopediaic way; in fact, the selectivity has been intense. Liszt does not appear here at all except for a brief mention in chapter 3 because I have already discussed some of his Heine songs elsewhere, in a volume of Liszt essays edited by Christopher Gibbs and Dana Gooley for Princeton University Press. Far from wishing to slight Liszt, I consider his settings of "Vergiftet sind meine Lieder" (My songs are

poisoned) and “Anfangs wollt’ ich fast verzagen” (At first, I almost despaired) among the best works in the entire repertory, and my admiration is on display in the Princeton volume. There are various Schumann songs that did not fit comfortably within the bounds of the current endeavor; “Abends am Strand” and “Es leuchtet meine Liebe,” for example, are two of my favorite songs, and maybe there will be room enough and time someday to hold their profound weirdness up for contemplation. Furthermore, many “missing links” and contemporaries of Schubert and Schumann could not find a place within these walls, composers such as Niels Gade, Josephine Lang, Otto Tiehse, Carl Banck, Emil Titl, Carl Reinecke, and a host of others, although Graham Johnson is doing a better job of giving them a renewed day in the sun than I could ever do. And I should warn readers from the outset that I believe strongly in “thick” musicology, in the kind of scholarship that locates musical works in the midst of activity on all fronts, literary, political, personal, religious, philosophical, national, sociological, and more. Digressions from the notes in the score are a necessary component of this approach, especially with regard to that deeply impure genre known as song. As someone who enjoys locating lieder in life beyond the barlines, I hope that readers will find some enjoyment in the pursuit as well. And finally, because I have included so many examples of songs long out-of-print in this book, I have had to forgo examples from Schubert’s *Schwanengesang* songs in chapter 1. Editions of these extraordinary works are, of course, readily available, and I trust that readers will peruse the initial chapter with score in hand.

## NOTES

1. Günter Metzner, *Heine in der Musik. Bibliographie der Heine-Vertonungen*, 12 vols. (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1991).
2. Ernst Challier, *Großer Lieder-Katalog* (Berlin: Privately printed by the author, 1884).
3. See Oliver Boeck, *Heines Nachwirkung und Heine-Parallelen in der französischen Dichtung* (Göppingen: Verlag Alfred Kümmerle, 1972); H. B. Sachs, *Heine in America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1916); Arnim Arnold, *Heine in England and America: A Bibliographical Check-List* (London: Linden Press, 1959); Bernardino Zendrini, “Enrico Heine e i suoi interpreti,” pp. 181–437 of Enrico Heine, *Il Canzoniere*, trans. Bernardino Zendrini, vol. II (Milan: Ulrico Hoepli, 1884, 4th edn.).
4. Examples include Paul Puget, “Le message” from *Chansons brunes et blondes* (Paris, G. Hartmann); Georges Hüe, *Six mélodies pour chant et piano. Paroles tirées de l’Intermezzo d’Henri Heine* (Paris: A. Leduc, [1886]); and J. Guy Ropartz, *Quatre Poèmes, d’après l’Intermezzo de Heine* (Paris: Rouart, Lerolle & Cie., [1900?]).
5. For example, Louis Köhler’s “Nachts am Meere; Gedicht von H. Heine. Concert-Lied für Baryton oder tiefen Tenor,” op. 75 (Leipzig: J. Rieter-Biedermann) – a real work-out both for pianist and singer.
6. One especially interesting example is Adolf Bernhard Marx, *Ein Frühlingsspiel. In dreimal drei Gedichten von Heinrich Heine*, op. 14 (Leipzig: Breitkopf &



Härtel). Not surprisingly, Marx takes his point of departure from Beethoven's *An die ferne Geliebte*, with instrumental corridors leading from one song to the next.

7. The most wonderfully overripe examples are the *Romanze* by Benedetto Junck (Milan: F. Lucca, [1880]), who gravitated to the familiar favorites. In "Quando ti guardo fiso" ("Wenn ich in deine Augen seh"), Junck's persona runs rhapsodically amuck at "Himmelslust," repeating "Paradisiaco" to ever-higher apogees lest we doubt how heavenly the experience of a maidenly bosom really is. See also Niccolò van Westerhout, *An Sie! Album per Canto* (Milan: F. Lucca, [1884]); Giovanni Sgambati, "Serafina – Quando a sera io vado stanco," in *Quattro Melodie per una voce e pianoforte*, op. 35, no. 1 (Mainz: Schott, 1904); and Angelo Bettinelli, "Io sognai: Romanza" for mezzo-soprano or baritone (Milan: Ricordi, 1911).
8. Luigi Dallapiccola, *An Mathilde: Eine Kantate für Frauenstimme und Orchester* (Milan: Edizioni Suvini Zerboni, 1957), a setting of "Den Strauss, den mir Mathilde band," "Keine Messe wird man singen, / Keinen Kadosch wird man sagen," and "Das ist der böse Thanatos."
9. Alexander Reichardt, "This Heart of Mine (Das arme Herz)" (London: Chappell & Co., [1859]).
10. Examples of American Heine songs include Wilson Smith, "Thou'rt like unto a lovely flower" (Cleveland, Ohio: J. H. Rogers, c. 1889); George Chadwick, "Thou art so like a flower" (Boston and New York: Arthur P. Schmidt, 1883); Homer N. Bartlett, "What means this tear so lonely?" from *Three Songs* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1894); John Hyatt Brewer, "Thou art so like a flower" from his *Six Songs*, op. 27, no. 4 (Boston and Leipzig: Arthur Schmidt, 1893); and Frances Allitsen, *Album of Eight Songs. Poems by Heinrich Heine (German and English Words)* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1900). There are hundreds more. These works were preceded in America by such series as the *Gems of German Song, with English and German Words*, published in Boston in the 1840s [?] by Henry Tolman & Co., and *The Germania. New Vocal Gems from the German*, also published in Boston by Oliver Ditson & Co.
11. "Edom" is the Jewish designation for an enemy of the Jews, derived from 4 Moses 20: 14–21.
12. Karl Heinz Götze, "Die unmögliche und die mögliche Liebe. Heines Liebeslyrik in der Geschichte der Gefühle," in *Heine-Jahrbuch*, 38 (1999), pp. 29–45.
13. Almost a quarter-century before his death, Heine was already the target of book-length attacks; see Cruciger [pseud. Friedrich Heinrich von der Hagen], *Neueste Wanderungen, Umtriebe und Abenteuer des Ewigen Juden unter den Namen Börne, Heine, Saphir u.a.* (Wilhelmstadt: Friedrich, 1832). If one looks in the bibliography of the *Antisemiten-Katechismus. Eine Zusammenstellung des wichtigsten Materials zum Verständniß der Judenfrage* (Leipzig: Hermann Beyer, 1893, 25th edn.), pp. 311–324, one finds a list of 277 nineteenth-century pamphlets, books, and newspaper articles. Theodor Fritsch's catechism is in the classic question-and-answer format of Christian catechisms; on pp. 27–28, one finds the twentieth question, "Have not Spinoza, Mendelssohn, and Heine accomplished meaningful things?" Re Heine, the answer is as follows: "Within Heine, a peculiar conflict was waged. It is as if a piece of the German spirit wanted to make him soar to idealistic heights – until suddenly the Jew

in his very bones drew him back down into the swamp, wherein he rolled about happily and mocked all ideals" (p. 28). Heine is targeted at even greater length in Xanthippus (a pseudonym for Franz Sandvoss), *Was dünket euch um Heine? Ein Bekenntnis* (Leipzig: Grunow, 1888), and in multiple books by Adolf Bartels, for whom Heine was an itch that no amount of published scratching could dispel. When his *Heinrich Heine. Auch ein Denkmal* (Dresden and Leipzig: C. A. Koch, 1906), aroused criticism by those who felt that Heine should be lauded with statuary in his native land, Bartels fired back with another book, *Heine-Genossen. Zur Charakteristik der deutschen Presse und der deutschen Parteien* (Dresden and Leipzig: C. A. Koch, 1908, 2nd aug. edn.); Sandvoss (p. 2) puts the matter bluntly: "Heine has become a thorn in our flesh. An operation is needed. The danger that he will pollute Germany's blood, Germany's nature, has risen to the most threatening level."

14. Carl Paasch, *Der jüdische Dämon* (Leipzig: Carl Minde, [1890]), p. 233.
15. See, for example, Martin Kreisig, "Robert Schumann, der Deutsche," in *Die Musik*, 27/9 (June 1935), pp. 657–660. Kreisig asserts that Schumann's interest in folk song and opposition to French music were proto-Nazi before the fact. See also Robert Pessenlehner, "Eugenie Schumann und das letzte Werk ihres Vaters Robert Schumann. Eine Antwort – Verehrte Tochter unseres großen deutschen Meisters," in *Zeitschrift für Musik. Monatsschrift für eine geistige Erneuerung der deutschen Musik*, 105/3 (March 1938), p. 243. This was the Nazis' new name for Schumann's *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*. In Erich Valentin's "Stand by your man" praise of Clara ("Clara Schumann. Gedenkblatt zur 40. Wiederkehr ihres Todestages"), it is the Rückert lieder composed with her husband that are invoked, not "Sie liebten sich beide" or "Ich stand in dunkeln Träumen"; see the *Zeitschrift für Musik*, 107/6 (May 1936), p. 549. Similarly, none of the Heine songs are mentioned in Adolph Meuer, "Clara Schumanns eigenschöpferisches Werk," in *Zeitschrift für Musik*, 106/1 (January 1939), pp. 142–144.
16. In a review of the festival of German Romantic music held in Flensburg, 29 January to 4 February 1939, the lyric tenor Heinz Marten is praised for his performance of the Eichendorff *Liederkreis* and a selection of songs by Pfitzner and Wolf, all composers of whom the Nazis approved; see *Zeitschrift für Musik*, 106/3 (1939), p. 309. There is in that same issue an unintentionally funny rhapsody entitled "Chamisso!" by one Roswitha Collier (pp. 261–264), in which Schumann, inspired by Beethoven and the spirit of Chamisso (who was not yet dead in 1840), composes *Frauenliebe und -leben*. "YOU be my singer!," the incorporeal Chamisso coos to Schumann, "YOU take up my soul's harp and sing what I once spoke, sing my most beautiful, most beloved song."
17. Erich Valentin, "Robert Schumann, Werk und Vermächtnis," in *Zeitschrift für Musik. Monatsschrift für eine geistige Erneuerung der deutschen Musik*, 107/6 (June 1940), pp. 321–324. Near the end, Valentin writes, "The time of the dwarf race [the Jews] is over. Purer, stronger than ever, we raise up those forebears Germany's grateful hearts recognize as their own." See also the same author, *Ewig klingende Weise. Ein Lesebuch vom Wesen und Werden deutscher Musik* (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse Verlag, 1940), pp. 67–69.
18. See Karl Hasse, *Von deutschen Meistern. Zur Neugestaltung unseres Musiklebens im neuen Deutschland*, vol. II (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse Verlag, 1934), and



## Preface

xxvii

the review of this same book by Max Herre in *Zeitschrift für Musik. Monats-schrift für eine geistige Erneuerung der deutschen Musik*, 102/8 (August 1934), pp. 835–842. Both Hasse and Herre were exercised about the “Schwammerl” image of Schubert (insufficiently Aryan); see also Anna Charlotte Wutzky’s “Genug der Schubert-Verschandelung! Ein dringender Mahnruf” [Enough of this disfigurement of Schubert! A pressing appeal], in *Zeitschrift für Musik*, 103/9 (September 1936), pp. 1,133–1,134.

19. Ludwig Boetticher, *Robert Schumann. Einführung in Persönlichkeit und Werk. Beiträge zur Erkenntniskritik der Musikgeschichte und Studien am Ausdrucksproblem des neunzehnten Jahrhunderts* (Berlin: Bernhard Hahnfeld Verlag, 1941), p. 203.
20. Joseph Klein (1802–1862) was the stepbrother of the better-known composer Bernhard Joseph Klein; see Reinhold Sietz, “Klein, Joseph,” in *Rheinische Musiker, 1. Folge (Beiträge zur rheinischen Musikgeschichte*, vol. XLIII) (Cologne: Arno Volk-Verlag, 1960), p. 142. Heine writes approvingly of the composer in his third “Brief aus Berlin” of 7 June 1822, mentioning his songs in particular. Klein’s op. 6 *Acht Lieder und Gesänge* (Bonn, Simrock) includes “Meiner schlafenden Zuleima” and “Wenn ich bei meiner Liebsten bin.” I have not been able to locate a copy of his *Acht Lieder von Heine und Goethe* listed in Adolph Hofmeister’s catalogue for 1844, but his setting of “Loreley” is discussed in chapter 3.
21. Christoph Prégardien, tenor, and Andreas Staier, fortepiano, *Beethoven – Krufft – Lachner Lieder* on Teldec / Das Alte Werk 3984-21473-2 (1991).
22. As I was completing my work on this book, I learned of the publication of Sonja Gesse-Harm’s book *Zwischen Ironie und Sentiment. Heinrich Heine im Kunstlied des 19. Jahrhunderts* (Stuttgart: J. B. Metzler, 2006); I regret not having the benefit of her work before I completed mine, especially her voluminous chapter on Johann Vesque von Püttlingen.
23. Willi Goetschel, “Nightingales Instead of Owls: Heine’s Joyous Philosophy,” in Roger Cook, ed., *A Companion to the Works of Heinrich Heine* (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2002), p. 140.

## *Acknowledgments*

The happiest task for those who write books comes when one can thank those who fostered the enterprise along the difficult path to completion. The idea for this book and the initial stages of research were products of a year on sabbatical in 2001–2002, courtesy of the John Simon Guggenheim Foundation. The boon of time to think and write, *sans* committees and other exigencies of the teaching life, is a pearl beyond price for scholars wrestling with book projects: I am truly grateful to this generous foundation. The middle stages of the manuscript were finished during a halcyon year at the National Humanities Center in Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, of which I have many happy memories, from Corbett Capps introducing me to the mysteries of North Carolina barbecue (not at all what this Texan expected) to a library staff I wanted to kidnap and take home with me. My heartfelt thanks go to Betsy Dain, Eliza Robertson, and Jean Houston for chasing down recondite sources and for ordering large quantities of photocopy and microfilm from out-of-state libraries, and to Marianne Wason for inducting me into the mysteries of PowerPoint, Endnote, and other electronic-digital oracles. The Center, to their amazement, found themselves with five music scholars on their hands that year, and I am indebted to the other four fellows in music – Wendy Allanbrook, Thomas Brothers, Lawrence Zbikowski, and Samuel Floyd – for suggestions they made during our discussion sessions. The final revision of the manuscript is owing to the National Endowment for the Humanities, which gave me a fellowship for 2005–2006. Their support of my scholarship over the past twenty years is something for which I will always be immensely grateful.

I also owe warm thanks to Sam Hammond and the Perkins Rare Book Library at Duke University for permission to consult the Alexander Weinmann Collection. Weinmann, whose business card as an Electrolux vacuum-cleaner “demonstrator” in Vienna’s first district I found tucked away in one of the sets of *lieder* in the collection, assembled a treasure-trove of information about Viennese music publishing in the nineteenth century, as well as a considerable quantity of piano music and songs. It was very kind of Mark Evan Bonds from the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill to introduce me to Mr. Hammond and to join him in giving me a guided tour of that wonderful library. And there are other libraries

### Acknowledgments

xxix

to thank as well. I am eternally grateful to the State Library in Berlin for allowing me to photocopy large stacks of songs, and I am also indebted to the Heinrich Heine Institute in Düsseldorf for songs gathered from that wonderful center of the universe for all Heine scholars. The Harvard libraries were, as always, rich resources for a visiting alumna. It was a black day for my budget when I discovered that one can order photocopies online from the British Library, as well as counting upon their expert help *in situ*, and I am indebted in every way for both services. My thanks also go to the Bibliothèque Nationale for making its superb collection of materials pertaining to Heine in Paris available to me. This was the nicest of excuses for returning to my former haunts from the days when I was a scholar of things French.

The opportunity to present papers and thereby garner helpful suggestions from those in attendance is something all scholars appreciate. I am grateful to Annegret Fauser and Tim Carter for inviting me to try out a portion of the first chapter as a keynote address for the Southeast Chapter meeting of the American Musicological Society at the University of North Carolina, Greensboro in September of 2003; additional thanks are owing to Ethan Lechner and Joseph Singleton for helpful comments made on that occasion. Jane Bernstein and Tufts University gave me the opportunity to present my ideas about Schubert's "Am Meer" to an audience for the first time, and the comments afterwards opened new windows onto the song for me. By now, I feel as if I have a second home in Ireland, where my dear friends Lorraine Byrne, Dan Farrelly, and Harry White invited me in April of 2003 to take part in a conference at Trinity College, Dublin organized by Lorraine Byrne and Dan Farrelly on "Goethe, Schubert, and *Claudine von Villa Bella*." I was more than a little off-center in speaking about Heine rather than Goethe, but I am glad that they permitted the solecism. It was a privilege for me to hear Ian Partridge's recital of Schubert songs and his masterclass, as well as inspiring papers by Walther Dürr, Claus Canisius, Elizabeth Mackay, Lorraine Byrne, Brian Newbould, and many others. Bennett Zon and Annegret Fauser asked me to give the keynote address at the biennial meeting of the Society for Nineteenth-Century Music at Durham University in July 2004, an address subsequently published in *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*. Portions both of the Preface and the fourth chapter first saw the light of day in those two venues, and I am grateful to Professor Zon for permission to reprint this material in revised form. Parts of both the first and second chapters were given a trial outing at Williams College, where my fellow lied scholar Marjorie Wing Hirsch invited me to visit for an enchanted week in April 2004. A section of the third chapter – the discussion of Schumann's "Die beiden Grenadiere" – was first aired at the Royal Academy of Music in London under the sponsorship of Amanda Glauert and Natasha Loges in March 2004 and subsequently published in *The Journal of Musicology* in its 2005 memorial issue

to the late John Daverio. I am also grateful to Jon Finson and to Rufus Hallmark for the helpful suggestions they made on other occasions about the complicated backdrop to Schumann's Napoleon ballad. And I am permanently indebted to Graham Johnson. I have learned and will, I am sure, continue to learn so much from e-mail conversations and the occasional meeting in person with this wonderful musician and book-hound, whose encyclopedic knowledge of song, poetry, and nineteenth-century editions is an invaluable resource, whose friendship props me up at times of discouragement, and whose exquisite performances are a constant source of inspiration. It was Graham who told me about Martha Griebler, the marvelous Austrian artist whose images of nineteenth-century artistic worlds and their personages are nothing short of astonishing. Before her death, she gave me permission to reproduce her haunting image of Heine and Schubert as the cover to this book, and I cannot imagine a better entrée to this endeavor. These portraits speak truths about these two geniuses that lie beyond the reach of my pen or anyone else's.

My thanks go as well to the Institute for Scholarship in the Liberal Arts at the University of Notre Dame for a grant to cover the cost of the music examples and to A-R Editions for their customary painstaking work on those examples. The students in my Spring 2003 and Spring 2005 lied seminars at the University of Notre Dame (especially Michael Vidmar-McEwen, Brent Little, Danielle Svonavec, Elizabeth Zickgraf, and John Harvey) were inspiring in their enthusiasm for all things pertaining to song, although I will work quite hard to forget their comparison of the beginning of Wolf's "Alles endet, was entsteht" to the theme from *Jaws*. No one can make it through life without the support of friends, and I am fortunate to count Mimi Daitz, Jonathan and Maureen Boulton, Terry Aladjem, James McCalla, John Wustman, Sabine Feisst, Joanne Swenson-Eldridge, and Myra Durkin among mine. The wonderful Roger Parker gets a special vote of thanks; with each of my manuscripts, he impels an excited flurry of rewriting because he puts the enterprise in a new light for me. His encouragement means more than I can say.

I have made it a tradition to end the Acknowledgments section of each book I write with the memory of someone dearly loved and lost: Paul Amadeus Pisk, the Viennese-born composer, critic, and teacher extraordinaire who took me under his wing from the 1970s until his death on 12 January 1990. I work on this project in the house that was his gift to me when he died; no biological parent could have been any more tenderly concerned for my wellbeing than he was. This book was born of a casual comment he made twenty years ago about Schubert's Heine songs: "Only six of them," he remarked in passing, "now *that's* food for thought." It is indeed, but then all music was food for thought to him.

South Bend, Indiana