

Hugo Riemann and the Birth of Modern Musical Thought

Generally acknowledged as the most important German musicologist of his age, Hugo Riemann (1849–1919) shaped the ideas of generations of music scholars, not least because his work coincided with the institutionalisation of academic musicology around the turn of the last century. This influence, however, belies the contentious idea at the heart of his musical thought, an idea he defended for most of his career – harmonic dualism.

By situating Riemann's musical thought within turn-of-the-century discourses about the natural sciences, German nationhood and modern technology, this book reconstructs the cultural context in which Riemann's ideas not only 'made sense' but advanced an understanding of the tonal tradition as both natural and German. Riemann's musical thought – from his considerations of acoustical properties to his aesthetic and music-historical views – thus regains the coherence and cultural urgency that it once possessed.

ALEXANDER REHDING is Cotsen Fellow at the Princeton Society of Fellows. He is co-editor of *Music Theory and Natural Order from the Renaissance to the Early Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, 2001). He was awarded the Jerome Roche Prize of the Royal Musical Society in 2001.



New perspectives in music history and criticism

GENERAL EDITORS
JEFFREY KALLBERG, ANTHONY NEWCOMB AND RUTH SOLIE

This series explores the conceptual frameworks that shape or have shaped the ways in which we understand music and its history, and aims to elaborate structures of explanation, interpretation, commentary, and criticism which make music intelligible and which provide a basis for argument about judgements of value. The intellectual scope of the series is broad. Some investigations will treat, for example, historiographical topics, others will apply cross-disciplinary methods to the criticism of music, and there will also be studies which consider music in its relation to society, culture, and politics. Overall, the series hopes to create a greater presence for music in the ongoing discourse among the human sciences.

PUBLISHED TITLES

Leslie C. Dunn and Nancy A. Jones (eds.), *Embodied Voices:* Representing Female Vocality in Western Culture

Downing A. Thomas, Music and the Origins of Language: Theories from the French Enlightenment

Thomas S. Grey, Wagner's Musical Prose

Daniel K. L. Chua, Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning

Adam Krims, Rap Music and the Poetics of Identity

Annette Richards, The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque Richard Will, The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Christopher Morris, Reading Opera Between the Lines: Orchestral Interludes and Cultural Meaning from Wagner to Berg

Emma Dillon, Medieval Music-Making and the 'Roman de Fauvel' David Yearsley, Bach and the Meanings of Counterpoint

Alexander Rehding, Hugo Riemann and the Birth of Modern Musical Thought

David Metzer, Quoting Music within Music: Quotation and Cultural Meaning in the Twentieth Century



Hugo Riemann and the Birth of Modern Musical Thought

ALEXANDER REHDING





Published by the press syndicate of the university of cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Alexander Rehding 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Palatino 10/12 pt System \LaTeX [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 82073 1 hardback



CONTENTS

	Acknowledgements	page ix
	Introduction	1
1	Hugo Riemann's moonshine experiment	15
2	The responsibilities of nineteenth-century music theory	36
3	Riemann's musical logic and the 'As if'	67
4	Musical syntax, nationhood and universality	113
5	Beethoven's deafness, exotic harmonies and tone imaginations	162
	Epilogue	182
	Glossary: Riemann's key terms as explained in the Musik-Lexikon (5th edn, 1900)	186
	Bibliography	199
	Index	212

vii



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project has incurred many debts over the years. First and foremost, this book would not have come into existence without the long-standing support of John Deathridge. In continuing acts of generosity, he helped me open up an intellectual world in which to situate Riemann's theories — especially those parts that seem at first utterly counterintuitive. And from the other side of the Atlantic, Brian Hyer has also watched over this project from its very inception to its final state. In hundreds of emails he has shared his thoughts and musical insights on Riemann's theories with me over the years. I could not have benefited from a better intellectual axis than John and Brian.

Scott Burnham and Suzie Clark must be thanked for indulging my interest in nature and legitimation in music theory, and for their patient reading of earlier drafts of the script. I have shared many interesting conversations with both Scott and Suzie – so many more than I expected after a hilariously unpromising start when I first met with Scott one sunny autumn afternoon in Princeton.

I have recently had the opportunity to share my interest in harmonic dualism at a workshop organised by Ian Bent at the first Summer School on historical aspects of music theory at the Mannes School of Music in 2001. Ian's conscientious reading of Riemann's article 'Das Problem des harmonischen Dualismus' happily coincided with my working of the final draft of this script. I am grateful to all the participants for stimulating discussions, and particularly to Edward Gollin, who read the entire script.

The list of friends and colleagues at Cambridge and Penn who have contributed in one way or another would be impossible to complete. Nevertheless, I shall make an attempt to name at least those who contributed in a more immediate way: Julie Brown, Bojan Bujić, Daniel Chua, Nicholas Cranfield, Martin Dixon, Daniel Grimley, Christopher Hasty, Richard Jones, Cristle Collins Judd, Anthony Gritten, Jeff Kallberg, David Kasunic, Larry Klein, E. Dean Kolbas, Roger Parker, Susan Rankin, Jim Samson, Lucy Shanno, W. Dean Sutcliffe, Simon Werrett and Paul J. D. Yates. Penny Souster has scrupulously watched over this project at all stages. The series editors have given me thoughtful



Acknowledgements

and careful advice, and my copy-editor Michael Downes must be thanked for his infallible hawk-eye scrutiny.

Some passages in this book have appeared in print: 'The Quest for the Origins of Music in Germany circa 1900', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 53 (2000), pp. 345–85; 'Music Theory and the Human Touch', *Music Theory Spectrum* 24 (2002), pp. 283–93, and 'Wie können Untertöne in der Geschichte der Musiktheorie hörbar gemacht werden?', in *Musiktheorie zwischen Historie und Systematik*, ed. Ludwig Holtmeier and Clemens Kühn (in press). I am grateful to the original publishers for their permission to reuse material.

Like most projects, this one could not have been finished without financial support. I am grateful to the British Academy, the *Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes* and Queens' and Emmanuel Colleges, Cambridge, for the supportive framework they provided. Support of an invaluable kind I received from my two families, Gabi, Wolf, and Gerardo, for whom I could find no better words than Riemann's own motto: *Amor constans vincit*.