BELLY AND BODY IN THE PAULINE EPistles

The belly is today a matter of much concern. Modern cultures, particularly in the West, have developed means to cultivate this part of the body: corsets, exercises, revealing fashions. In this compelling exploration of the ‘belly’ motif, Karl Olav Sandnes asks whether St Paul might be addressing a culture in which the stomach is similarly high on the agenda. The result is a surprising new insight into this writings.

Paul twice mentions the enigmatic phrase ‘belly-worship’ (Phil. 3; Rom. 16). The proper context for these texts is the moral philosophy debate about mastering the desires, and the reputation of Epicurus’ philosophy as promoting indulgence. The belly became a catchword for a life controlled by pleasures. Belly-worship was not only pejorative rhetoric, but developed from Paul’s conviction that the body was destined to a future with Christ.

KARL OLAV SANDNES is Professor in New Testament Theology at The Norwegian Lutheran School of Theology, Oslo. He has published two books in English: Paul – One of the Prophets? A Contribution to the Apostle’s Self-Understanding (1991), and A New Family: Conversion and Ecclesiology in the Early Church with Cross-Cultural Comparisons (1994).
SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

MONOGRAPH SERIES

General Editor: Richard Bauckham

120

BELLY AND BODY IN THE PAULINE EPISTLES
# CONTENTS

**Preface**  page xi
**Abbreviations**  xiii

## Part 1  Prolegomena

1  Introduction, previous solutions, method and Pauline context  4
   1.0  Introduction  4
   1.1  Bible translations  5
   1.2  The scholarly debate  7
   1.3  Methodological considerations  11
   1.4  Belly and body – the Pauline context of the study  14

## Part 2  The Graeco-Roman belly

2  The belly as a sign – ancient physiognomics  24
   2.0  Introduction  24
   2.1  The stomach as a sign  27
   2.2  Summary  34

3  The belly in ancient moral philosophy  35
   3.0  Introduction  35
   3.1  Euripides (born probably in the 480s BC)  37
   3.2  Plato (c. 429–347 BC)  39
   3.3  Xenophon (born around 430 BC)  42
   3.4  Aristotle (384–322 BC)  45
   3.5  Dio Chrysostom (AD c. 40/50–110)  46
   3.6  Musonius Rufus (AD 30–AD 101/102)  47
   3.7  Epictetus (mid first century to second century AD)  49
   3.8  Plutarch (AD c. 50–c. 120)  52
   3.9  Athenaeus (flourished c. AD 200)  54
   3.10  Summary  57

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
### List of contents

#### Part 1 Ancient critique of Epicureanism

4 Ancient critique of Epicureanism 61
   4.0 Epicurus – the popularity and reputation of a doctrine 61
   4.1 Cicero 65
   4.2 Seneca 71
   4.3 Plutarch 74
   4.4 Summary 77

#### Part 2 Banquets – opportunities for the belly

5 Banquets – opportunities for the belly 79
   5.0 Introduction 79
   5.1 Parties for pleasure 80
   5.2 Seneca – the moral philosopher 83
   5.3 Horace and Juvenal – two Roman satirists 86
   5.4 Athenaeus and Alciphron 89
   5.5 Summary 92

#### Part 3 The appropriated belly

6 The belly-topos in Jewish-Hellenistic sources 97
   6.1 Sir. 23:6 97
   6.2 T. Rub. 2:1–3:8 97
   6.3 3 Macc. 7:10–11 98
   6.4 4 Maccabees 101
   6.5 Aristeas to Philocrates 140–1 104
   6.6 T. Mos. 7:2–4 105
   6.7 Cairo Geniza Wisdom 106

7 The belly in Philo’s writings 108
   7.0 Introduction 108
   7.1 Anthropology 109
   7.2 The ‘geography’ of the belly 112
   7.3 The serpent crawling on its belly 113
   7.4 Esau selling his birthright for the sake of his belly 117
   7.5 Joseph and the servants of Pharaoh 121
   7.6 Jewish customs as means of controlling the stomach 123
   7.7 Fasts and Sabbaths 126
   7.8 Food laws 128
   7.9 Conversion – the safest way to rule the belly 130
   7.10 Summary 131

#### Part 4 Belly-worship and body according to Paul

8 The lifestyle of citizens of the heavenly politeuma – Phil. 3:17–21 136
   8.0 Introduction 136
List of contents ix

8.1 ‘Stand firm’ and the rhetoric of examples 138
8.2 ‘Whose god is the belly’ 141
8.3 Opponents? 155
8.4 Belly-worship and body in Philippians 159
8.5 Summary 162

9 ‘Serving the belly’ as kinship with Satan – Rom. 16:17–20 165
9.0 Introduction 165
9.1 Warning against deceivers 165
9.2 Worshipping the belly – Gen. 3:15, Satan and flattery 169
9.3 Why call the adversaries belly-worshippers? 172
9.4 ‘Serving the belly’ and body in Romans 175
9.5 Summary 179

10 The Corinthian belly 181
10.0 Introduction 181
10.1 1 Cor. 15:32: Epicurean lifestyle versus faith in resurrection 181
10.2 1 Cor. 11:17–34: the Lord’s Supper or stuffing one’s own stomach? 187
10.3 1 Cor. 6:12–20: the Christian faith has implications for stomach and sex 191
10.4 1 Cor. 10:7 in context: the belly – a tempting force in Corinth as in the wilderness 199
10.5 Belly and body in 1 Corinthians 212
10.6 Summary 215

Part 5 The earliest expositors of Paul

11 The belly-dicta of Paul in Patristic literature 219
11.1 Clement of Alexandria (c. 150–c. 215) 219
11.2 Tertullian (c. 160–c. 225) 223
11.3 Origen (c. 185–c. 254) 226
11.4 Cyprian (d. 258) 230
11.5 Novatian (d. 257–8) 232
11.6 Methodius of Olympus (d. c. 311) 234
11.7 Ambrosiaster (c. 300) 235
11.8 Pelagius (late fourth and early fifth centuries) 237
11.9 Jerome (c. 345–420) 238
11.10 John Chrysostom (c. 347–407) 244
11.11 Augustine of Hippo (354–430) 252
11.12 Severian of Gabala (fl. c. 400) 256
11.13 Tyrannius Rufinus (c. 345–411) 256
11.14 Theodore of Mopsuestia (c. 350–428) 256
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.15 Theodoret of Cyrirhus (c. 393–c. 460)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.16 Peter Chrysologus (c. 400–50)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.17 Gennadius of Marseilles (fl. 470)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.18 Antiochus, the Patriarch of Antioch (d. 598)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.19 John Climacus (c. 570–c. 649)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.20 Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part 6 Conclusions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>12 Concluding remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Paul’s critique of belly-worship in an ancient setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 Belly-worship and body in Paul’s letters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bibliography

| Works of reference | 275 |
|Sources | 276 |
|Secondary literature | 278 |
|Index of modern authors | 292 |
|Index of Graeco-Roman sources | 295 |
|Index of Old Testament, Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha and other Jewish writings | 303 |
|Index of New Testament and early Christian writings | 311 |
I have incurred many debts in the course of this project. The present study was written during my sabbatical (1998/1999); I am grateful to the Norwegian Lutheran School of Theology (Det teologiske Menighetsfakultet, Oslo), where I teach, for this opportunity. I owe thanks to the library there for patiently providing me with the necessary material. Most of the work was, however, carried out in Cambridge. I am very grateful for the hospitality and access to the library which was given me at Tyndale House. This excellent library for Biblical research made it possible for me to finish most of the work during my time there. I owe special thanks to the head librarian at Tyndale House, Dr David I. Brewer as well as his staff. I am grateful for the fellowship I enjoyed at Tyndale House, and to the scholars who were there together with me. This fellowship stimulated and contributed in various ways to my investigation. I owe special thanks to the Warden, Dr Bruce W. Winter, for his willingness to share his knowledge with me and to bring relevant literature to my attention, and for having introduced me to the Cambridge University Library as well as the library of the Classical Faculty. Without access to these libraries and the kind assistance which I found there, this investigation would not have been possible. These Cambridge days bring to mind also the kind hospitality which I enjoyed in the house of my hostess Mrs Veronica Becho.

Many colleagues at my own school encouraged me in this work; some also read and commented upon my manuscripts. I am grateful for the help I received from Dr Hans Kvalbein, Dr Reidar Hvalvik, Dr Oskar Skarsaune, and Martin Synnes. Special thanks are owed to my colleagues Bjørn-Helge Sandvei and Jan Schumacher, whom I consulted regarding Greek and Latin. My Latin teacher from college, Bjørgulv Rian, kindly assisted me with some Latin passages.

I owe thanks to the Research Council of Norway (Norges Forskningsråd) for granting me the necessary support to improve my English. This work has been done with much enthusiasm and patience.
Preface

by Dr David Pugh, Bergen. His work included critical comments, fruitful suggestions and involvement. His contribution extends beyond working with the language. Although I have benefited from the help of many people, any faults or mistakes remain fully my own responsibility.

I am very grateful to Dr Richard Bauckham, editor of this series, for recommending my study to Cambridge University Press for publication. His comments and suggestions have contributed considerably to the improvement of the manuscript. Senior Publishing Assistant Gillian Dadd and Publishing Director Kevin Taylor and their co-workers have patiently guided me through the publication process itself.

Finally, I owe special thanks to my wife, Tone, who took upon herself the sole care of our home and three youngsters, and thus made it possible for me to stay in Cambridge.
The text of the New Testament is K. Aland et al., *Novum Testamentum Graece* 27th edition, Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft 1993. Abbreviations are those used by the American Academy of Religion and Society of Biblical Literature. Quotations of Biblical texts are drawn from the NRSV. If not stated otherwise, Graeco-Roman sources are quoted in English from the LCL. Texts from Old Testament Pseudepigrapha are quoted according to the OTP. The Philonic works are abbreviated according to the guidelines set out in *Studia Philonica Annual* (1993), p. 256. Text editions from well-known series are not listed in the bibliography, but the series and volume will appear in footnotes. The following abbreviations will be of help to the reader.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANF</td>
<td>The Ante-Nicene Fathers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCL</td>
<td><em>Corpus Christianorum Latinorum</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSEL</td>
<td><em>Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FC</td>
<td><em>The Fathers of the Church, A New Translation</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCS</td>
<td><em>Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der erste Jahrhunderte</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSHRZ</td>
<td>Werner G. Kümmel (ed.), <em>Jüdische Schriften aus hellenistisch-römischer Zeit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCL</td>
<td>Loeb Classical Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSJ</td>
<td>Liddell–Scott–Jones, <em>Greek–English Lexicon</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LXX</td>
<td>The Septuagint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPNF</td>
<td>Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRSV</td>
<td><em>New Revised Standard Version</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTP</td>
<td>J. H. Charlesworth (ed.), <em>The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**List of abbreviations**

- **PG**: J. Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*
- **PL**: J. Migne, *Patrologia Latina*
- **SC**: *Sources Chrétienes*
- **s.v.**: sub voce
- **SVF**: H. von Arnim (ed.), *Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta*
- **TDNT**: G. Kittel, G. Friedrich (eds.), *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*