

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81282-5 - Thinking in Education, Second Edition
Matthew Lipman
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Thinking in Education

Second Edition

The first edition of *Thinking in Education* made a case for inserting thinking into all levels of education by infusing critical thinking into existing disciplines. Matthew Lipman, a leading education theorist, provided procedures to enable students at all levels of education to become more thoughtful, more reasonable, and more judicious.

In the twelve years since the first edition was published, the author has broadened his approach to teaching thinking. While critical thinking is important and highly valuable, it is not sufficient; students must develop creative and caring thinking as well. This new edition provides methods for integrating emotive experience, mental acts, thinking skills, and informal fallacies into a concerted approach to the improvement of reasoning and judgment. It also shows how the community of inquiry can be utilized for the reduction of violence in the classroom and for the improvement of the education of children at risk.

Matthew Lipman is professor of philosophy at Montclair State University, New Jersey. Previously, he was professor of philosophy at Columbia University for eighteen years. He has written fourteen books and coauthored nine more. He has been a consultant for the U.S. Department of Education, ASCD, N.J. Department of Education, N.J. Department of Higher Education, and UNESCO.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81282-5 - Thinking in Education, Second Edition
Matthew Lipman
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Thinking in Education

Second Edition

MATTHEW LIPMAN
Montclair State University



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81282-5 - Thinking in Education, Second Edition
Matthew Lipman
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521812825

© Matthew S. Lipman 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003
Reprinted 2006, 2007

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Lipman, Matthew.

Thinking in education / Matthew S. Lipman. – 2nd ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-81282-8 (HB) – ISBN 0-521-01225-2 (PB)

1. Thought and thinking – Study and teaching. 2. Critical thinking – Study and teaching. 3. Creative thinking – Study and teaching. 4. Judgment in education. I. Title.

LB1590.3 .L57 2003

2002023089

371.3 – dc21

ISBN 978-0-521-81282-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-01225-6 Paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2009

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	page xi
Introduction to the Second Edition	1
PART ONE: EDUCATION FOR THINKING	7
1 The Reflective Model of Educational Practice	9
Rationality as an organizing principle	11
Schooling without thinking	12
Normal versus critical academic practice	14
Restructuring educational practice	18
<i>Education as inquiry</i>	20
<i>Community of inquiry</i>	20
<i>Sensitivity to what is problematic</i>	21
<i>Reasonableness</i>	21
<i>Relationship and judgment</i>	22
<i>Thinking in the disciplines</i>	22
<i>Conversational apprenticeship</i>	24
<i>Autonomy</i>	25
<i>Reflective thinking</i>	26
2 Approaches in Teaching for Thinking	28
Enter the critical thinking movement	28
<i>How we got to where we are</i>	30
<i>Some more recent origins of critical thinking</i>	32
<i>Dewey and the Deweyans</i>	34

vi	<i>Contents</i>
<i>Analytic skills and cognitive objectives</i>	38
<i>The emergence of informal logic</i>	40
<i>Other conversations, other voices</i>	42
<i>The educational assimilation of critical thinking</i>	44
Critical thinking and the inculcation of belief	46
Alternative approaches to teaching practical reasoning	49
<i>The guidance of practice by reasons</i>	50
<i>Criterion-based performance</i>	51
<i>The guidance of practice by hypotheses and consequences</i>	51
Teaching for bridging, transfer, and translation	54
Some characterizations of critical thinking	56
3 Obstacles and Misconceptions in Teaching for Thinking	64
Conceptual obstacles to the strengthening of thinking	64
<i>Disagreements over the nature of thinking</i>	64
<i>Disagreements over the proper psychological approach</i>	66
<i>Disagreements over the role of philosophy</i>	68
<i>Disagreements over the preferred educational approaches</i>	69
Some misconceptions regarding teaching for critical thinking	72
<i>Misconception 1: Teaching for thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</i>	72
<i>Misconception 2: Reflective teaching will necessarily result in reflective learning</i>	73
<i>Misconception 3: Teaching about critical thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</i>	75
<i>Misconception 4: Teaching for critical thinking requires drill in thinking skills</i>	76
<i>Misconception 5: Teaching for logical thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</i>	78
<i>Misconception 6: Teaching for learning is just as effective as teaching for critical thinking</i>	79
PART TWO: COMMUNITIES OF INQUIRY	81
4 Thinking in Community	83
What produces the community and what the community produces	83
Following the argument where it leads	84
The logic of conversational discourse	87
The art of conversation	89

<i>Contents</i>	vii
The structure of dialogue	90
Dialogue and community	91
Learning from the experience of others	93
The role of the community of inquiry in education	94
Toward the formation of classroom communities of inquiry	100
The epistemological status of discussion in the community of inquiry	103
5 The Community of Inquiry Approach to Violence Reduction	105
Education, not indoctrination	105
To what criteria can we appeal?	108
<i>We can cite our own experience</i>	108
<i>We can appeal to the child's own experience</i>	109
<i>We can attempt to persuade the child</i>	110
<i>We can make use of reason</i>	110
<i>All of the above</i>	111
Violence and justification	111
The strengthening of judgment through cognitive work	116
Educating for values and meanings through the community of inquiry	119
Reducing violence in a school setting	121
PART THREE: ORCHESTRATING THE COMPONENTS	125
6 The Emotions in Thinking and in Education	127
Emotion and education	127
Is there a paradigmatic version of emotive thinking?	130
Can we educate with regard to emotions?	131
Emotions and language	132
Word clusters for building verbal fluency about emotions	135
7 Mental Acts	139
Consciousness and the performance of mental acts	139
Being aware of our mental acts	141
Mental acts as performances	143
Propositional attitudes	145

viii	<i>Contents</i>
Epistemic movement: Mental acts and states can develop into thinking skills	148
The development of mental moves into philosophical dialogue	150
Through the magnifying glass: A closer look at how philosophy can improve thinking	156
8 Thinking Skills	162
On teaching thinking skills to children	162
Skills and meanings	172
Four major varieties of thinking skills	178
<i>Inquiry skills</i>	178
<i>Reasoning skills</i>	179
<i>Information-organizing skills</i>	180
<i>Translation skills</i>	185
Is teaching reasoning worthwhile?	186
Skills and their orchestration	186
From basic skills to elementary school subjects	189
The boundaries of skill	191
PART FOUR: EDUCATION FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF THINKING	195
9 The Transactive Dimensions of Thinking	197
A multidimensional thinking approach	197
The right to thinking capability	203
10 Education for Critical Thinking	205
Critical thinking: What it can be	205
<i>The outcomes of critical thinking are judgments</i>	209
<i>Critical thinking relies on criteria</i>	212
<i>Metacriteria and megacriteria</i>	215
<i>Criteria as bases of comparison</i>	215
<i>The indispensability of standards</i>	217
<i>Critical thinking is self-corrective</i>	218
<i>Critical thinking displays sensitivity to context</i>	219
Practical reasoning behaviors that signify closure	223
Professional education and the cultivation of judgment	226
Critical thinking and informal fallacies	230
<i>The fallacies as a rogues' gallery of reasoning defects</i>	230
<i>The significance of the value-principles</i>	231
<i>Using validities to establish standards of reasonableness</i>	235

<i>Contents</i>	ix
<i>A table of validities</i>	238
<i>The role of value-principle exercises in teaching for critical thinking</i>	241
11 Education for Creative Thinking	243
The primary aspect of the work of art as the standard of the work	243
Creative thinking in critical perspective	244
Freshness, problematicity, and intelligibility	247
Amplificative thinking	249
Defiant thinking	251
Maieutic thinking	252
Creative and caring thinking	253
Creative and critical thinking	254
Cognitive moves in the creative thought process	255
Creativity and dialogue in the community of inquiry	255
Creativity and thinking for ourselves	257
12 Education for Caring Thinking	261
The place of the passions in thinking	261
Caring thinking as concern for matters of importance	262
Some kinds of caring thinking	264
<i>Appreciative thinking</i>	264
<i>Affective thinking</i>	266
<i>Active thinking</i>	267
<i>Normative thinking</i>	268
<i>Empathic thinking</i>	269
13 Strengthening the Power of Judgment	272
Why not teach for better judgment?	272
Judgment as critical, creative, and caring	274
The juncture of the universal and the particular	276
Three orders of judgment	279
<i>Generic judgments</i>	281
<i>Mediating or procedural judgments</i>	283
<i>Focal or culminating judgments</i>	288
The balance wheel of judgment in educational settings	289
Judgments as expressive of persons	292
<i>Bibliography</i>	294
<i>Index</i>	299

Preface

I am grateful to the students and visiting scholars who have read and commented on various sections of this work at a number of stages of its development. Their criticisms were very helpful and resulted in numerous improvements in what was, in my opinion, a manuscript with many difficulties. I want to express my appreciation to Samantha Spitaletta, from the Office of Publications at Montclair State University, for her contribution to the preparation of the artwork. I also want to express my gratitude to Manuela Gómez for her help in developing this manuscript so as to fit the enlarged outlook of the second edition onto the foundation represented by the first edition. If the result turns out to be successful, no small part of the credit should be given to her; I am alone responsible for the shortcomings that remain. Likewise, I am indebted to Joanne Matkowski, who lavished care on the manuscript through each of its various incarnations.

I am also grateful for permission to reprint my following articles:

To Venant Cauchy, "Educating for Violence Reduction and Peace Development," in Venant Cauchy (ed.), *Violence and Human Coexistence*, vol. 2 (Montréal: Éditions Montmorency, 1994), pp. 363–78.

To Thea Jelcich Zanfabro, "Thinking Skills Fostered by Philosophy for Children," in Judith W. Segal, Susan F. Chipman, and Robert Glaser (eds.), *Thinking and Learning Skills*, vol. 1, *Relating Instruction*

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81282-5 - Thinking in Education, Second Edition
Matthew Lipman
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xii

Preface

to Research (Mahwah, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1985), pp. 83–7.

To Armen Marsoobian, “On Children’s Philosophical Style,” *Metaphilosophy* 15 (1984), pp. 318–30.

To Oxford University Press for permission to reprint Edwin Muir, “The Question,” in *Collected Poems* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1965).