Thinking in Education
Second Edition

The first edition of Thinking in Education made a case for inserting thinking into all levels of education by infusing critical thinking into existing disciplines. Matthew Lipman, a leading education theorist, provided procedures to enable students at all levels of education to become more thoughtful, more reasonable, and more judicious.

In the twelve years since the first edition was published, the author has broadened his approach to teaching thinking. While critical thinking is important and highly valuable, it is not sufficient; students must develop creative and caring thinking as well. This new edition provides methods for integrating emotive experience, mental acts, thinking skills, and informal fallacies into a concerted approach to the improvement of reasoning and judgment. It also shows how the community of inquiry can be utilized for the reduction of violence in the classroom and for the improvement of the education of children at risk.

Matthew Lipman is professor of philosophy at Montclair State University, New Jersey. Previously, he was professor of philosophy at Columbia University for eighteen years. He has written fourteen books and coauthored nine more. He has been a consultant for the U.S. Department of Education, ASCD, N.J. Department of Education, N.J. Department of Higher Education, and UNESCO.
Thinking in Education

Second Edition

MATTHEW LIPMAN
Montclair State University
## Contents

*Preface*  
Introduction to the Second Edition  

**PART ONE: EDUCATION FOR THINKING**  
1 The Reflective Model of Educational Practice  
   Rationality as an organizing principle  
   Schooling without thinking  
   Normal versus critical academic practice  
   Restructuring educational practice  
   *Education as inquiry*  
   *Community of inquiry*  
   *Sensitivity to what is problematic*  
   *Reasonableness*  
   *Relationship and judgment*  
   *Thinking in the disciplines*  
   *Conversational apprenticeship*  
   *Autonomy*  
   *Reflective thinking*  

2 Approaches in Teaching for Thinking  
   Enter the critical thinking movement  
   *How we got to where we are*  
   *Some more recent origins of critical thinking*  
   *Dewey and the Deweyans*  

Page xi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>Introduction to the Second Edition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART ONE: EDUCATION FOR THINKING</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Reflective Model of Educational Practice</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rationality as an organizing principle</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Schooling without thinking</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Normal versus critical academic practice</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Restructuring educational practice</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Education as inquiry</em></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Community of inquiry</em></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Sensitivity to what is problematic</em></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Reasonableness</em></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Relationship and judgment</em></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Thinking in the disciplines</em></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Conversational apprenticeship</em></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Autonomy</em></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Reflective thinking</em></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Approaches in Teaching for Thinking</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enter the critical thinking movement</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>How we got to where we are</em></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Some more recent origins of critical thinking</em></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Dewey and the Deweyans</em></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Analytic skills and cognitive objectives</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The emergence of informal logic</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other conversations, other voices</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The educational assimilation of critical thinking</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical thinking and the inculcation of belief</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative approaches to teaching practical reasoning</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The guidance of practice by reasons</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion-based performance</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The guidance of practice by hypotheses and consequences</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching for bridging, transfer, and translation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some characterizations of critical thinking</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Obstacles and Misconceptions in Teaching for Thinking</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual obstacles to the strengthening of thinking</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagreements over the nature of thinking</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagreements over the proper psychological approach</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagreements over the role of philosophy</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagreements over the preferred educational approaches</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some misconceptions regarding teaching for critical thinking</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 1: Teaching for thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 2: Reflective teaching will necessarily result in reflective learning</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 3: Teaching about critical thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 4: Teaching for critical thinking requires drill in thinking skills</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 5: Teaching for logical thinking is equivalent to teaching for critical thinking</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception 6: Teaching for learning is just as effective as teaching for critical thinking</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Thinking in Community</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What produces the community and what the community produces</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Following the argument where it leads</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The logic of conversational discourse</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The art of conversation</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

The structure of dialogue 90
Dialogue and community 91
Learning from the experience of others 93
The role of the community of inquiry in education 94
Toward the formation of classroom communities of inquiry 100
The epistemological status of discussion in the community of inquiry 103

5 The Community of Inquiry Approach to Violence Reduction 105
   Education, not indoctrination 105
   To what criteria can we appeal?
      We can cite our own experience 108
      We can appeal to the child’s own experience 109
      We can attempt to persuade the child 110
      We can make use of reason 110
      All of the above 111
   Violence and justification 111
   The strengthening of judgment through cognitive work 116
   Educating for values and meanings through the community of inquiry 119
   Reducing violence in a school setting 121

PART THREE: ORCHESTRATING THE COMPONENTS 125

6 The Emotions in Thinking and in Education 127
   Emotion and education 127
   Is there a paradigmatic version of emotive thinking? 130
   Can we educate with regard to emotions? 131
   Emotions and language 132
   Word clusters for building verbal fluency about emotions 135

7 Mental Acts 139
   Consciousness and the performance of mental acts 139
   Being aware of our mental acts 141
   Mental acts as performances 143
   Propositional attitudes 145
### Contents

Epistemic movement: Mental acts and states can develop into thinking skills  
148

The development of mental moves into philosophical dialogue  
150

Through the magnifying glass: A closer look at how philosophy can improve thinking  
156

8 Thinking Skills  
162

On teaching thinking skills to children  
162

Skills and meanings  
172

Four major varieties of thinking skills  
178

*Inquiry skills*  
178

*Reasoning skills*  
179

*Information-organizing skills*  
180

*Translation skills*  
185

Is teaching reasoning worthwhile?  
186

Skills and their orchestration  
186

From basic skills to elementary school subjects  
189

The boundaries of skill  
191

PART FOUR: EDUCATION FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF THINKING  
195

9 The Transactive Dimensions of Thinking  
197

A multidimensional thinking approach  
197

The right to thinking capability  
203

10 Education for Critical Thinking  
205

Critical thinking: What it can be  
205

*The outcomes of critical thinking are judgments*  
209

Critical thinking relies on criteria  
212

Metacriteria and megacriteria  
215

Criteria as bases of comparison  
215

The indispensability of standards  
217

Critical thinking is self-corrective  
218

Critical thinking displays sensitivity to context  
219

Practical reasoning behaviors that signify closure  
223

Professional education and the cultivation of judgment  
226

Critical thinking and informal fallacies  
230

*The fallacies as a rogues’ gallery of reasoning defects*  
230

The significance of the value-principles  
231

*Using validities to establish standards of reasonableness*  
235
Contents

A table of validities 238

The role of value-principle exercises in teaching for critical thinking 241

11 Education for Creative Thinking 243

The primary aspect of the work of art as the standard of the work 243

Creative thinking in critical perspective 244

Freshness, problematicity, and intelligibility 247

Amplificative thinking 249

Defiant thinking 251

Maieutic thinking 252

Creative and caring thinking 253

Creative and critical thinking 254

Cognitive moves in the creative thought process 255

Creativity and dialogue in the community of inquiry 255

Creativity and thinking for ourselves 257

12 Education for Caring Thinking 261

The place of the passions in thinking 261

Caring thinking as concern for matters of importance 262

Some kinds of caring thinking 264

Appreciative thinking 264

Affective thinking 266

Active thinking 267

Normative thinking 268

Empathic thinking 269

13 Strengthening the Power of Judgment 272

Why not teach for better judgment? 272

Judgment as critical, creative, and caring 274

The juncture of the universal and the particular 276

Three orders of judgment 279

Generic judgments 281

Mediating or procedural judgments 283

Focal or culminating judgments 288

The balance wheel of judgment in educational settings 289

Judgments as expressive of persons 292

Bibliography 294

Index 299
Preface

I am grateful to the students and visiting scholars who have read and commented on various sections of this work at a number of stages of its development. Their criticisms were very helpful and resulted in numerous improvements in what was, in my opinion, a manuscript with many difficulties. I want to express my appreciation to Samantha Spitaletta, from the Office of Publications at Montclair State University, for her contribution to the preparation of the artwork. I also want to express my gratitude to Manuela Gómez for her help in developing this manuscript so as to fit the enlarged outlook of the second edition onto the foundation represented by the first edition. If the result turns out to be successful, no small part of the credit should be given to her; I am alone responsible for the shortcomings that remain. Likewise, I am indebted to Joanne Matkowski, who lavished care on the manuscript through each of its various incarnations.

I am also grateful for permission to reprint my following articles:


Preface

