HEGEL, NIETZSCHE, AND PHILOSOPHY

This challenging study explores the theme of freedom in the philosophy of Hegel and Nietzsche. In the first half of the book, Will Dudley sets Hegel’s *Philosophy of Right* within a larger systematic account and innovatively deploys the *Logic* to interpret it. The author shows that freedom involves not only the establishment of certain social and political institutions but also the practice of philosophy itself. In the second half, Dudley reveals how Nietzsche’s discussions of decadence, nobility, and tragedy map onto an analysis of freedom that critiques heteronomous choice and Kantian autonomy, and ultimately issues in a positive conception of liberation. In a provocative conclusion, Hegel and Nietzsche are portrayed as complementary, emphasizing different aspects of freedom and modes of philosophical thought, but concurring in the view that freedom is in part attained through philosophical thinking.

In boldly bringing Hegel and Nietzsche together into a conversation, something that is rarely attempted, Dudley has developed a set of original interpretations that will be of considerable importance to students of these philosophers, and more generally to political theorists and historians of ideas.

Will Dudley is Assistant Professor of Philosophy, Williams College.
MODERN EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHY

General Editor
Robert B. Pippin, University of Chicago

Advisory Board
Gary Gutting, University of Notre Dame
Rolf-Peter Horstmann, Humboldt University, Berlin
Mark Sacks, University of Essex

Some Recent Titles
Daniel W. Conway: Nietzsche’s Dangerous Game
John P. McCormick: Carl Schmitt’s Critique of Liberalism
Frederick A. Olafson: Heidegger and the Ground of Ethics
Günther Zöller: Fichte’s Transcendental Philosophy
Warren Breckman: Marx, the Young Hegelians, and the Origins of Radical Social Theory
William Blattner: Heidegger’s Temporal Idealism
Charles Griswold: Adam Smith and the Virtues of the Enlightenment
Gary Gutting: Pragmatic Liberalism and the Critique of Modernity
Allen Wood: Kant’s Ethical Thought
Karl Ameriks: Kant and the Fate of Autonomy
Alfredo Ferrarin: Hegel and Aristotle
Cristina Lafont: Heidegger, Language and World-Discourse
Nicholas Wolterstorff: Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology
Daniel Dahlstrom: Heidegger’s Concept of Truth
Michelle Grier: Kant’s Doctrine of Transcendental Illusion
Henry Allison: Kant’s Theory of Taste
Allen Speight: Hegel, Literature and the Problem of Agency
J. M. Bernstein: Adorno
HEGEL, NIETZSCHE,
AND PHILOSOPHY

Thinking Freedom

WILL DUDLEY

Williams College
For Earl and Louise Dudley,
my first and best teachers
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments                                             xiii
List of Texts, Translations, and Abbreviations               xv

Introduction: Freedom and Philosophy                         1
1. The Significance of Freedom: From Politics to Philosophy   1
2. Competing Conceptions of Freedom                          3
   Liberal Freedom                                            3
   Kantian Freedom                                            4
3. Hegel and Nietzsche                                       7
4. Goals and Structure of the Book                           8

PART I. FREEDOM IN AND THROUGH HEGEL’S PHILOSOPHY

1 The Place of Freedom in Hegel’s Philosophy                   15
   1. The Parts of Hegel’s System: Logic, Nature, Spirit      15
   2. The Logical Concept of Freedom                          17
   3. The Philosophy of Spirit as an Account of Freedom       21
   4. Structure and Method of Part 1                          24

2 The Freedom of Willing: Hegel’s Philosophy of Right          28
   1. The Logical Concept of Judgment                         29
   2. The Initial Conception of the Will and Its Development  31
   3. The Moral Conception of the Will                        39
   4. The Incomplete Freedom of the Moral Will                42
   5. The Institutions of Ethical Freedom: Family, Civil Society, State  56

3 Freedom beyond Willing: From the Philosophy of Right to Absolute Spirit  69
   1. The Place of Willing in the Philosophy of Spirit        70
   2. The Logical Concept of Purposiveness                    75
## CONTENTS

3. The Incomplete Freedom of Willing 79
4. From Willing to Art, Religion, and Philosophy 91

4 Freedom through Hegel’s Philosophy 101
1. Art, Religion, and Philosophy: Overcoming the Subjectivity of Willing 101
2. Philosophy as Conceptual Systematization 102
3. Freedom through Systematic Philosophy 106
4. Epilogue: Reconciliation, Resignation, Theory and Practice 109

**PART II. FREEDOM IN AND THROUGH NIETZSCHE’S PHILOSOPHY**

5. The Place of Freedom in Nietzsche’s Philosophy 123
1. Nietzsche’s Lack of System 123
2. Nietzsche’s Unsystematic Account of Freedom 125

6. The Freedom of Willing: Decadence and Nobility 128
1. The Decadent Failures to Will Freely: Two Types of Sickness
   - Disgregation: The Unfreedom of Not Willing 128
   - The Morality of Selflessness: The Incomplete Freedom of Willing Nothing 134
   - The Contagious Circle of Decadence 143
2. From Decadence to Nobility: Convalescence 146
   - Destruction of the Moral Will 146
   - The Dangers of Destruction 156
   - Noble Health: The Establishment of a Free Will 160

7. Freedom beyond Willing: From Nobility to Tragedy 175
1. The Incomplete Freedom of Nobility 175
   - Destruction of the Noble Will: Healthy Reinfection 178
   - The Dangers of Destruction Redux 187
   - Beyond Nobility and Decadence: The Endless Cycle of Sickness and Convalescence 189
2. Tragic Great Health 195
   - Affirmation out of Overfullness 197
   - Amor Fati and Eternal Return 201
   - The Glad Tidings of Worldly Self-Redemption 207

8. Freedom through Nietzsche’s Philosophy 213
1. The Language of Tragedy as a Condition of Freedom 214
2. Philosophy as a Source of Tragic Language 219

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
Contents

 xi

Conclusion: Philosophy and Freedom 227
1. The Freedom of Willing and Its Limitations 227
2. Freedom through Philosophy: System and Genealogy 230
3. The Complementarity of System and Genealogy 235
4. The Significance of Freedom: From Philosophy back to Politics 239

Notes 243
Index 319
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would not have been capable of completing this book were it not for the people who prepared, inspired, and guided me along the way, only a few of whom I can mention here. My parents taught me to read and write with care and to pursue all challenges, including those of the intellect, to the utmost of my ability. Alan White introduced me to philosophy when I was an undergraduate, provided the example that first led me to consider devoting myself to it, and offered generous comments on two drafts of this book. John McCumber introduced me to Hegel, showed me how philosophical scholarship should be done, and gave sage advice at every stage of this project. Stephen Houlgate planted the seeds that became the idea for this book, and set a standard for reading Hegel to which I will always aspire. Peter Fenves helped me to understand how my interpretations of Hegel and Nietzsche could be connected, and gave me invaluable feedback on my attempts to articulate that connection. Kevin Hill assisted me in finding my way through Nietzsche’s texts and the vast secondary literature that has grown up around them. Ardis Collins, David Kolb, Robert Pippin, Jana Sawicki, and several anonymous reviewers read drafts of all or part of the book; their encouragement sustained my effort, and their criticisms improved the result. Terence Moore, Stephanie Achard, and Russell Hahn provided expert editing and guidance throughout the production process. Isaac Dietzel, my former student, proofread the final manuscript. Donna Chocal handled many administrative details and lent much-needed sanity and perspective to the enterprise. Williams College hired me, making the continued pursuit of philosophy possible, and has surrounded me with colleagues and students who make that pursuit enjoyable and stimulating.

The conversation and companionship of many friends have been a source of pleasure and support throughout the development of this book, and I am grateful to all of them. Finally, and most importantly, Janette Kessler Dudley has joined me for the last ten years in working to build a home in which we can both become who we are; Nicholas Kessler Dudley
and Elizabeth Kessler Dudley have, more recently, done their best to ensure that our home is never dull.

TEXTS, TRANSLATIONS, AND ABBREVIATIONS


I have used the following translations (which I have often modified) of various volumes of the Suhrkamp Werke:


I have also made use of and reference to:


Numbered sections, which are the same in the German and English editions, are referred to whenever possible. In these cases, an “A” (for Anmerkung) following the paragraph number indicates one of Hegel’s own remarks on the paragraph, and a “Z” (for Zusatz) indicates material, usually taken from notes on Hegel’s lectures, appended by earlier editors. When no paragraph numbers are available, I refer to page numbers, giving both the German and the English pagination, separated by a slash.

All citations of Nietzsche are from Sämtliche Werke: Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden (abbreviated KSA), ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari, 15 vols. (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1980).

I have used the following translations (which I have often modified) of various volumes of the Sämtliche Werke:

A = The Antichristian, translated by Walter Kaufmann as The Antichrist, in PN (see below).


DS = “David Strauss, the Confessor and the Writer,” tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in UB (see below).

EH = Ecce Homo, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in BW.

FWag = *The Case of Wagner*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in BW.

GD = *Twilight of the Idols*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in PN (see below).

GM = *On the Genealogy of Morals*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in BW.

GT = *The Birth of Tragedy*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in BW. SK indicates the “Attempt at a Self-Criticism” added by Nietzsche to the second edition.

JGB = *Beyond Good and Evil*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in BW.

M = *Dawn*, translated by R. J. Hollingdale as *Daybreak* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).


NN = “On the Uses and Disadvantages of History for Life,” tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in UB (see below).


SE = “Schopenhauer as Educator,” tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in UB (see below).


WB = “Richard Wagner in Bayreuth,” tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in UB.


Z = *Thus Spoke Zarathustra*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in PN.

Numbered sections, which are the same in the German and English editions, are referred to whenever possible. References to KSA provide the volume followed by the page number.