CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

HEGEL, NIETZSCHE, AND PHILOSOPHY

This challenging study explores the theme of freedom in the philosophy of Hegel and Nietzsche. In the first half of the book, Will Dudley sets Hegel's *Philosophy of Right* within a larger systematic account and innovatively deploys the *Logic* to interpret it. The author shows that freedom involves not only the establishment of certain social and political institutions but also the practice of philosophy itself. In the second half, Dudley reveals how Nietzsche's discussions of decadence, nobility, and tragedy map onto an analysis of freedom that critiques heteronomous choice and Kantian autonomy, and ultimately issues in a positive conception of liberation. In a provocative conclusion, Hegel and Nietzsche are portrayed as complementary, emphasizing different aspects of freedom and modes of philosophical thought, but concurring in the view that freedom is in part attained through philosophical thinking.

In boldly bringing Hegel and Nietzsche together into a conversation, something that is rarely attempted, Dudley has developed a set of original interpretations that will be of considerable importance to students of these philosophers, and more generally to political theorists and historians of ideas.

Will Dudley is Assistant Professor of Philosophy, Williams College.

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

MODERN EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHY

General Editor

Robert B. Pippin, *University of Chicago*

Advisory Board

Gary Gutting, *University of Notre Dame*
Rolf-Peter Horstmann, *Humboldt University, Berlin*
Mark Sacks, *University of Essex*

Some Recent Titles

Daniel W. Conway: *Nietzsche's Dangerous Game*
John P. McCormick: *Carl Schmitt's Critique of Liberalism*
Frederick A. Olafson: *Heidegger and the Ground of Ethics*
Günter Zöller: *Fichte's Transcendental Philosophy*
Warren Breckman: *Marx, the Young Hegelians, and the Origins of Radical Social Theory*
William Blattner: *Heidegger's Temporal Idealism*
Charles Griswold: *Adam Smith and the Virtues of the Enlightenment*
Gary Gutting: *Pragmatic Liberalism and the Critique of Modernity*
Allen Wood: *Kant's Ethical Thought*
Karl Ameriks: *Kant and the Fate of Autonomy*
Alfredo Ferrarin: *Hegel and Aristotle*
Cristina Lafont: *Heidegger, Language and World-Discourse*
Nicholas Wolsterstorff: *Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology*
Daniel Dahlstrom: *Heidegger's Concept of Truth*
Michelle Grier: *Kant's Doctrine of Transcendental Illusion*
Henry Allison: *Kant's Theory of Taste*
Allen Speight: *Hegel, Literature and the Problem of Agency*
J. M. Bernstein: *Adorno*

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

HEGEL, NIETZSCHE, AND PHILOSOPHY

Thinking Freedom

WILL DUDLEY
Williams College

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Will Dudley 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface New Baskerville 10/12 pt. *System* LaTeX 2_ε [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
Dudley, Will, 1967–
Hegel, Nietzsche, and philosophy : thinking freedom / Will Dudley.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-81250-X
1. Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, 1770–1831. 2. Nietzsche, Friedrich Wilhelm, 1844–1900. 3. Liberty. I. Title.
B2949.L5 .D83 2002
123′.5′092243 – dc21 2001052693

ISBN 0 521 81250 X hardback

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

For Earl and Louise Dudley,
my first and best teachers

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments *page* xiii
List of Texts, Translations, and Abbreviations xv

Introduction: Freedom and Philosophy 1
1. The Significance of Freedom: From Politics to Philosophy 1
2. Competing Conceptions of Freedom 3
Liberal Freedom 3
Kantian Freedom 4
3. Hegel and Nietzsche 7
4. Goals and Structure of the Book 8

PART I. FREEDOM IN AND THROUGH HEGEL'S PHILOSOPHY

1 The Place of Freedom in Hegel's Philosophy 15
1. The Parts of Hegel's System: Logic, Nature, Spirit 15
2. The Logical Concept of Freedom 17
3. The Philosophy of Spirit as an Account of Freedom 21
4. Structure and Method of Part 1 24

2 The Freedom of Willing: Hegel's *Philosophy of Right* 28
1. The Logical Concept of Judgment 29
2. The Initial Conception of the Will and Its Development 31
3. The Moral Conception of the Will 39
4. The Incomplete Freedom of the Moral Will 42
5. The Institutions of Ethical Freedom: Family, Civil Society, State 56

3 Freedom beyond Willing: From the *Philosophy of Right* to Absolute Spirit 69
1. The Place of Willing in the Philosophy of Spirit 70
2. The Logical Concept of Purposiveness 75

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

3. The Incomplete Freedom of Willing 79
4. From Willing to Art, Religion, and Philosophy 91

4 Freedom through Hegel's Philosophy 101
1. Art, Religion, and Philosophy: Overcoming the Subjectivity of Willing 101
2. Philosophy as Conceptual Systematization 102
3. Freedom through Systematic Philosophy 106
4. Epilogue: Reconciliation, Resignation, Theory and Practice 109

PART II. FREEDOM IN AND THROUGH NIETZSCHE'S PHILOSOPHY

5 The Place of Freedom in Nietzsche's Philosophy 123
1. Nietzsche's Lack of System 123
2. Nietzsche's Unsystematic Account of Freedom 125

6 The Freedom of Willing: Decadence and Nobility 128
1. The Decadent Failures to Will Freely: Two Types of Sickness 128
Disgregation: The Unfreedom of Not Willing 128
The Morality of Selflessness: The Incomplete Freedom of Willing Nothing 134
The Contagious Circle of Decadence 143
2. From Decadence to Nobility: Convalescence 146
Destruction of the Moral Will 146
The Dangers of Destruction 156
Noble Health: The Establishment of a Free Will 160

7 Freedom beyond Willing: From Nobility to Tragedy 175
1. The Incomplete Freedom of Nobility 175
Destruction of the Noble Will: Healthy Reinfection 178
The Dangers of Destruction Redux 187
Beyond Nobility and Decadence: The Endless Cycle of Sickness and Convalescence 189
2. Tragic Great Health 195
Affirmation out of Overfullness 197
Amor Fati *and Eternal Return* 201
The Glad Tidings of Worldly Self-Redemption 207

8 Freedom through Nietzsche's Philosophy 213
1. The Language of Tragedy as a Condition of Freedom 214
2. Philosophy as a Source of Tragic Language 219

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

Conclusion: Philosophy and Freedom 227
1. The Freedom of Willing and Its Limitations 227
2. Freedom through Philosophy: System and Genealogy 230
3. The Complementarity of System and Genealogy 235
4. The Significance of Freedom: From Philosophy back to Politics 239

Notes 243
Index 319

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would not have been capable of completing this book were it not for the people who prepared, inspired, and guided me along the way, only a few of whom I can mention here. My parents taught me to read and write with care and to pursue all challenges, including those of the intellect, to the utmost of my ability. Alan White introduced me to philosophy when I was an undergraduate, provided the example that first led me to consider devoting myself to it, and offered generous comments on two drafts of this book. John McCumber introduced me to Hegel, showed me how philosophical scholarship should be done, and gave sage advice at every stage of this project. Stephen Houlgate planted the seeds that became the idea for this book, and set a standard for reading Hegel to which I will always aspire. Peter Fenves helped me to understand how my interpretations of Hegel and Nietzsche could be connected, and gave me invaluable feedback on my attempts to articulate that connection. Kevin Hill assisted me in finding my way through Nietzsche's texts and the vast secondary literature that has grown up around them. Ardis Collins, David Kolb, Robert Pippin, Jana Sawicki, and several anonymous reviewers read drafts of all or part of the book; their encouragement sustained my effort, and their criticisms improved the result. Terence Moore, Stephanie Achard, and Russell Hahn provided expert editing and guidance throughout the production process. Isaac Dietzel, my former student, proofread the final manuscript. Donna Chocal handled many administrative details and lent much-needed sanity and perspective to the enterprise. Williams College hired me, making the continued pursuit of philosophy possible, and has surrounded me with colleagues and students who make that pursuit enjoyable and stimulating.

The conversation and companionship of many friends have been a source of pleasure and support throughout the development of this book, and I am grateful to all of them. Finally, and most importantly, Janette Kessler Dudley has joined me for the last ten years in working to build a home in which we can both become who we are; Nicholas Kessler Dudley

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

and Elizabeth Kessler Dudley have, more recently, done their best to ensure that our home is never dull.

This book incorporates, in modified form, portions of several previously published articles. I would like to thank the editors and publishers of those articles for their permission to reprint material from the following: "Freedom in and through Hegel's Philosophy," *Dialogue: Canadian Philosophical Review* 39 (2000): 683–703; "A Limited Kind of Freedom: Hegel's Logical Analysis of the Finitude of the Will," *The Owl of Minerva* 31.2 (Spring 2000): 173–198; "A Case of Bad Judgment: The Logical Failure of the Moral Will," *Review of Metaphysics* 51 (December 1997): 379–404; and "Freedom and the Need for Protection from Myself," *The Owl of Minerva* 29.1 (Fall 1997): 39–67.

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

TEXTS, TRANSLATIONS, AND ABBREVIATIONS

I have used the Suhrkamp edition of Hegel's *Werke*, ed. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel, 20 vols. (Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1970–1).

I have used the following translations (which I have often modified) of various volumes of the Suhrkamp *Werke*:

A = Vol. 13, *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*, tr. T. M. Knox, vol. 1 (of 2) (Oxford: Clarendon, 1975).
EG = Vol. 10, *Hegel's Philosophy of Mind*, tr. A. V. Miller (Oxford: Clarendon, 1971).
EL = Vol. 8, *The Encyclopaedia Logic*, tr. T. F. Geraets, W. A. Suchting, and H. S. Harris (Indianapolis, Ind.: Hackett, 1991).
EN = Vol. 9, *Hegel's Philosophy of Nature*, tr. A. V. Miller (Oxford: Clarendon, 1970).
GP = Vols. 18–20, *Lectures on the History of Philosophy*, tr. E. S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, vols. 1–3 (Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Humanities Press, 1974).
PG = Vol. 12, *Introduction to the Philosophy of History*, tr. Leo Rauch (Indianapolis, Ind.: Hackett, 1988).
PhG = Vol. 3, *Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit*, tr. A. V. Miller (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977).
PR = Vol. 7, *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, ed. Allen W. Wood, tr. H. B. Nisbet (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).
R = Vol. 16, *Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion*, tr. E. B. Speirs and J. Burdon Sanderson, vol. 1 (of 3) (Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Humanities Press, 1974).
WL (vols. 1 and 2) = Vols. 5 and 6, *Hegel's Science of Logic*, tr. A. V. Miller (Atlantic, Highlands, N.J.: Humanities Press, 1969).

I have also made use of and reference to:

K = "Kolleg 1825/26," in *Vorlesungen: Ausgewählte Nachschriften und Manuskripte*, ed. Walter Jaeschke, vol. 6 (Hamburg: Felix Meiner,

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

1983–94), pp. 205–276; translated by Quentin Lauer as "Hegel's Introduction to the History of Philosophy," in his *Hegel's Idea of Philosophy* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1983), pp. 67–142.

PdR = *Philosophie des Rechts: Die Vorlesung von 1819/20 in einer Nachschrift*, ed. Dieter Henrich (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1983).

VG = *Die Vernunft in der Geschichte*, ed. J. Hoffmeister (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1955); translated by H. B. Nisbet as *Lectures on the Philosophy of World History: Introduction, Reason in History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975).

VGP = *Vorlesungen über die Geschichte der Philosophie*, ed. J. Hoffmeister (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1940); translated by T. M. Knox and A. V. Miller as *Introduction to the Lectures on the History of Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985).

VPR = *Vorlesungen über die Philosophie der Religion*, in *Vorlesungen*, ed. W. Jaeschke, vols. 3–5; translated by R. F. Brown, Peter C. Hodgson, and J. M. Stewart, assisted by J. P Fitzer and H. S. Harris, as *Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion*, ed. Peter C. Hodgson, 3 vols. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984–7).

VRP = *Vorlesungen über Rechtsphilosophie, 1818–1831*, ed. K-H. Ilting, 4 vols. (Stuttgart: Frommann-Holzboog, 1973).

Numbered sections, which are the same in the German and English editions, are referred to whenever possible. In these cases, an "A" (for *Anmerkung*) following the paragraph number indicates one of Hegel's own remarks on the paragraph, and a "Z" (for *Zusatz*) indicates material, usually taken from notes on Hegel's lectures, appended by earlier editors. When no paragraph numbers are available, I refer to page numbers, giving both the German and the English pagination, separated by a slash.

All citations of Nietzsche are from *Sämtliche Werke: Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden* (abbreviated *KSA*), ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari, 15 vols. (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1980).

I have used the following translations (which I have often modified) of various volumes of the *Sämtliche Werke*:

A = *The Antichristian*, translated by Walter Kaufmann as *The Antichrist*, in *PN* (see below).

BW = *Basic Writings of Nietzsche*, ed. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Modern Library, 1968).

DS = "David Strauss, the Confessor and the Writer," tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in *UB* (see below).

EH = *Ecce Homo*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *BW*.

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
052181250X - Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy: Thinking Freedom
Will Dudley
Frontmatter
More information

FW = *The Joyful Science*, translated by Walter Kaufmann as *The Gay Science* (New York: Vintage Books, 1974).
FWag = *The Case of Wagner*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *BW*.
GD = *Twilight of the Idols*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *PN* (see below).
GM = *On the Genealogy of Morals*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *BW*.
GT = *The Birth of Tragedy*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *BW*. *SK* indicates the "Attempt at a Self-Criticism" added by Nietzsche to the second edition.
JGB = *Beyond Good and Evil*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *BW*.
M = *Dawn*, translated by R. J. Hollingdale as *Daybreak* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).
MA = *Human, All Too Human*, tr. R. J. Hollingdale (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986).
NN = "On the Uses and Disadvantages of History for Life," tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in *UB* (see below).
PN = *The Portable Nietzsche*, ed. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Viking Press, 1954).
RL = *Friedrich Nietzsche on Rhetoric and Language*, ed. and tr. Sander L. Gilman, Carole Blair, and David J. Parent (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989).
SE = "Schopenhauer as Educator," tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in *UB* (see below).
UB = *Untimely Meditations*, tr. R. J. Hollingdale (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).
WB = "Richard Wagner in Bayreuth," tr. R. J. Hollingdale, in *UB*.
WM = *The Will to Power*, ed. Walter Kaufmann, tr. Walter Kaufmann and R. J. Hollingdale (New York: Vintage, 1968).
Z = *Thus Spoke Zarathustra*, tr. Walter Kaufmann, in *PN*.

Numbered sections, which are the same in the German and English editions, are referred to whenever possible. References to *KSA* provide the volume followed by the page number.

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org