

# Index

The text under consideration, by its nature, has much overlapping of concepts and variation of terminology and approach. The index normally adopts the terminology in use at any given moment coupled with a liberal use of cross-references to indicate where alternative approaches are to be found.

References to countries are subsumed in the subject headings either as subheadings or (where the references are many) as part of a main heading. To avoid unwieldy and repetitious lists, cross-references usually omit this country element. Equally to avoid unwieldiness and repetition, references to countries are omitted where this would seem not to add significant information.

- actio de in rem verso*, 444, 513, 520, 578–9, 595–7, 602, 617–18, 621–2, 666, 682 n. 149, 683
- actio in quantum locupletior factus est*, 248, 682 n. 149, 700
- actio quod metus causa*, 202–3
- agency. *See* fiduciary obligations, restitutionary damages for breach
- Anweisungsfall, 540
- assignatus utitur iure auctoris*, 461
- aufgedrängte Bereicherung*, 312
- bad faith
  - See also* good faith
  - condictio causa data causa non secuta* and, 141–2, 145
  - England, 123–4, 141–3, 155–6, 169–70, 176, 506
  - France, 444
  - Germany, 142 n. 42, 169–70, 179, 595, 675
  - Quebec, owner/possessor relationship and, 595
  - Roman law, 142 n. 43
  - Scotland, 141 n. 41, 142, 145–6, 155–6, 392, 396–404, 722–3
  - South Africa, 396 n. 49
- Bereicherung in sonstiger Weise*, 4, 540, 544
- betterment acts, 376–8
- betting debt, 43–4, 72
- bona fide* purchase for value, 311–12
- bonus iudex varie ex personis causisque constituet*, 370
- breach of contract. *See* contract, restitutionary damages for breach; frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution
- burden of proof
  - civil law, 126–7
  - England, 23, 92, 97, 99–100, 126–7
  - Germany, 79, 85, 213
  - Netherlands, 208
  - Scotland, 390 n. 26, 482, 722–3
  - South Africa, 212–13
- casum sentit dominus/res perit domino*, 133, 273–4
- causation
  - See also* three-party situations; tracing
  - ‘at the expense’ requirement
    - England, 553–4

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

- Germany, 554
- South Africa, 562
- constructive trusts
  - Scotland, 584–7, 665–8
  - United States, 555–6
- delict/tort and, United States, 557
- factual/legal, 556–8
- insolvency and, United States, 555–6
- parity of creditors and
  - England, 559–60
  - France (*Boudier*), 560
  - Scotland, 558–9, 723–6, 729
- South Africa, 565
- two-party situations, United States, 555–8
- cessio legis*, 577–8
- change of position
  - restitutio in integrum* and, 243–85
  - restitution without enrichment and, 227–42
  - unwinding of contract and, 24, 259–60, 282–5
- change of position (England), 642–3, 654–5, 703
  - bad faith and, 506
  - defendant, 23–4, 51, 164, 168–74
  - devaluation of counter-restitution and, 187
  - estoppel/personal bar distinguished, 24, 275
  - plaintiff, 180–2
  - tort/unjust enrichment claims distinguished, 589
  - undue influence and, 24, 170–1, 174
- change of position (Germany)
  - on basis of contract with incompetent party, 233–4
  - defendant, 23–4, 164, 168–74, 179
  - enrichment, relevance, 227–42
  - plaintiff, 179–80
  - three-party situations, 522
  - undue influence and, 24, 74, 170–1
  - unwinding of contract and, 259–60
- change of position (Scotland)
  - condictio indebiti* and, 703
  - estoppel/personal bar distinguished, 24, 275
- change of position (United States)
  - on basis of contract with incompetent party, 233–4
  - enrichment, relevance, 227–42
- Clive Code (1996), 26–7, 482–5, 644, 660
  - n. 15, 670, 691–3, 702
- coactus volui* principle, 17, 221
- commodum eius esse debet, cuius periculum est*, 274
- compulsion, 210, 446–7, 700–1
- condictio causa data causa non secuta*
  - condictio ob causam finitam* distinguished, 144
  - England, 67, 129–35, 153, 154–6
  - Germany, 40–1, 67, 73, 142, 156
  - Roman law, 67, 142
  - Scotland, 26, 129–35, 143–4, 145, 154–5, 254, 386, 387–8, 404–6, 467 n. 29, 699
- condictio ex causa furtiva*, 591–3, 705–6
- condictio indebiti*
  - civil law, 135–6
  - England, 4, 38–9, 65, 73–4, 76, 92–3, 98, 136–7, 139
  - Germany, 38, 40–1, 55, 206, 207–8, 212–13, 258
  - Italy, 683
  - Louisiana, 683
  - Netherlands, 683
  - Quebec, 683
  - Roman law, 37–8
  - Scotland, 42 n. 15, 73, 75, 136, 213
    - n. 80, 249 n. 14, 386, 387–8, 390 n. 26, 406–7, 414, 464–5, 467, 476–7, 696–7, 703–4
  - South Africa, 212–13, 683
- condictio ob causam finitam*, 135, 136–7, 144
- condictio ob turpem vel iniustam causam*, 135, 217–18, 467, 696–7
- condictio obligandi/donandi causa*, 135, 137
  - Scotland, 699–700
- condictio possessionis*, 594
- condictio sine causa*, 30, 38, 136–7, 143–6, 217–18, 712–13
  - Scotland, 142–6, 386, 387–8, 696–7
  - separability of *causa*, 147–8
- condictio sine causa specialis*, South Africa, 217–18
- condictiones*
  - fraud/duress and, 202
  - retention without a legal basis (*sine causa*) as underlying principle, 135–6
  - unjust factors compared, 135–6
- consent of plaintiff. *See* fraud/duress as ground for rescission, vitiation/qualification of plaintiff's consent

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 732 INDEX

- consideration in English law
  - See also* failure of consideration
  - as *causa*, 16, 139, 147–9, 154–6
  - as condition governing transfer of benefit, 105, 120–1, 128–9, 139–40
  - benefit to claimant, 104
  - without performance, 105
  - condictio causa data causa non secuta* and, 129–35
  - contractual and restitutionary meanings distinguished, 69, 103–5, 128–9, 151–6
  - ‘Coronation’ cases, 128–9
  - Fibrosa*, 129, 133–4
  - performance without benefit to claimant, 104–5, 187–8
- constructive trusts
  - England, 667–8
  - Scotland, 584–7, 665–8, 676, 722–3, 729
  - South Africa, 667
  - United States, 555–6
- contract
  - See also* contract, restitutionary damages for breach; failure of consideration as ground for restitution (England); frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution; illegality of contract; rescission; restitution in case of void transactions; unwinding of contract
  - equality of parties, 356–9
- contract (England)
  - allocation of risk, 10, 110–11, 112–13, 131, 139, 274
- non-operative
  - as requirement for remedy of restitution, 10, 109–11, 131
  - civil law distinguished, 110
  - determination as, 109
  - measure of enrichment and, 10, 110–11
- separability of interest and capital, 114–15
- termination
  - for breach, 255–6
  - judicial, 247–8
- contract (France), termination by court (article 1184 of Civil Code), 451–4
- contract (Germany)
  - allocation of risk, 274
  - casum sentit dominus/res perit domino*, 273–4
  - mutuality, 178–9, 259, 271–3
    - Synallagma*, 271 n. 79
  - normative Kraft des Faktischen*, 272–3
  - reliance principle, 272
  - termination
    - for breach, 66, 260
    - judicial, 248 n. 10
  - will of the parties, relevance, 271–2
    - Willenserklärung*, 200–1
- contract, restitutionary damages for breach (England), 10–11, 327–47, 678. *See also* encroachments, restitutionary liability; measure of enrichment/damages
  - Attorney-General v. Blake*, 10–11, 327, 330–4
  - criticisms of, 337–47
  - City of New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association*, 337–9
  - contract/property right distinction, 355
  - defective compensatory measures and, 334–7, 354
  - displacement of contractual remedies (*Adras*), 332–4, 354
  - in lieu of injunction, 328–9
  - loss to claimant, relevance, 11, 337–9, 354
  - measure
    - ‘consumer surplus’, 335, 341–2
    - contractual basis, 328–9
    - restitution/compensation divide, 329, 342–7
  - mitigation of loss requirement, 332–4
  - performance interest and, 334–7
  - skipped performance, 337–42
- contract, restitutionary damages for breach (Israel), 354–9
  - Adras Building Material Ltd v. Harlow and Jones GmbH*, 332–4, 354
- measure
  - market value, 355–9
  - profits accruing to defendant, 354–9
- contract (Scotland)
  - allocation of risk, 274
- condictio sine causa* in case of breach, 142–6
- counter-restitution. *See also* measure of enrichment/damages; restitution; *Saldotheorie*
- counter-restitution (England), 116–17
  - as *restitutio in integrum*, 173, 256, 271
  - bad faith and, 176

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

- contractual mistake and, 46–7
- equity/common law distinguished, 116–17
- incontrovertible benefit and, 185–6
- liability mistake and, 46–7
- partial failure of consideration and, 16, 116–17, 277–8
- rescission in case of impossibility, 40, 174–8, 182, 203–5, 204 n. 46, 209, 258, 260, 262–3, 272, 312 n. 12
- restoration of *status quo ante*, as object, 180 n. 80
- slow development of concept, 116
- subjective devaluation, 187
- third party as beneficiary, relevance, 187–8
- counter-restitution (Germany), 174–5, 261
- counter-restitution (Scotland)
  - reduction in case of impossibility, 204 n. 46, 252–5, 272, 407–9
  - void transactions and, 267–8
- culpa in contrahendo*, 221
- damages for breach of contract. *See* contract, restitutionary damages for breach (England)
- datio ob rem*, 206 n. 57
- debt. *See* betting debt; insolvency; payment of another's debt without authorisation; performance of another's obligation
- Deckungsverhältnis*, 540
- defences
  - See also* change of position; estoppel/personal bar; fraud/duress as ground for rescission; illegality as defence; limitation periods; mistake; restitution without enrichment
  - enrichment by transfer and, 703–5
- defences (England)
  - detrimental reliance on payment, 55
  - discharge of obligation, 19, 53–4
  - failure to comply with legal formalities, 71–2
  - knowledge of claimant, 58–9, 73–4, 165–6
  - moral/natural obligation, 56
  - payment under unenforceable promise, 98
  - 'submission to an honest claim', 58–62, 120 n. 53
- defences (Germany), 88–90
  - aufgedrängte Bereicherung*, 312
  - bona fide* purchase for value, 311–12
  - failure to comply with legal formalities, 71–2, 88–9
  - fulfilment of moral duty, 56
  - good faith of defendant, 18, 59, 322
  - knowledge of claimant, 38–9, 58–9, 73, 204–5
    - bad faith and, 169
    - fraud/duress and, 213
    - mistake of law and, 55
    - unjust factors and, 192–3
    - venire contra factum proprium*, 204
  - natural obligation, 56, 90
  - valid contract, 39, 65–7
- defences (Netherlands), knowledge of claimant, 213
- defences (Scotland)
  - knowledge of claimant, 73 n. 127
  - 'submission to an honest claim', 703–4
- delict (Germany), unjustified enrichment remedies distinguished, 12, 220–2
- delict/tort
  - causation/tracing and, 557
  - interface with unjust/unjustified enrichment, 12–13, 177, 220–2, 510–12, 589–93, 653–4, 679–80, 705–6, 727
- disgorgement, 11, 678 n. 121, 679–80
- dolo facit qui petit quod redditurus est*, 216
- dolus*, 195 n. 5, 199. *See also* fraud/duress
- Durchgriffskondiktion*, 540
- duress. *See* fraud/duress
- EC Directive on the Protection of Consumers in respect of Distance Contracts, 426
- Eingriffskondiktion*, 4, 12 n. 35, 162, 206, 311 n. 8, 467, 510–11, 517–18, 554, 675, 679, 705–6
- encroachments, restitutionary liability
  - See also* *Eingriffskondiktion*
  - diversity of measures, 351–2
  - 'encroachment', 349 n. 2
- measure
  - compensation for harm to plaintiff, 351–2
  - market value, 352
  - profits accruing to defendant, 351–2
- mixed public/private basis, 348–65
- Olwell v. Nye & Nissen*, 348–50, 352

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 734 INDEX

- encroachments, restitutionary (*cont.*)  
 on patrimonial rights (Scotland), 680, 705–7  
 three-party transactions and, 517–18  
 unauthorised alienation/unauthorised use distinguished, 352–3  
*enrichissement sans cause*, 441–2, 444–5, 448, 454  
 enrichment. *See* unjust/unjustified enrichment  
 equitable considerations (England), 589–90, 610–13, 672–3  
 counter-restitution, 116–17  
 property rights, 294–8  
 equitable considerations (United States), 551–2  
 estoppel/personal bar, 312 n. 12  
 change of position distinguished, 24, 275  
*restitutio in integrum*/counter-restitution distinguished, 275  
*ex turpi causa non oritur actio*, 298, 312–13, 315–16  
*exceptio doli*, 276, 405  
*exécution en nature*, 449–50  
*exécution forcée en nature*, 449  
 exploitation. *See* fraud/duress  
*faculté de remplacement*, 449–50, 452, 454–5  
 failure of consideration as ground for restitution (England)  
*See also* frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution; mistake as ground for restitution (England)  
 acceptance by other party, need for, 142–3  
 as unjust factor, 15–16, 77, 81–3, 91–2, 93, 94, 97–8, 108–9, 135–6, 155–6  
 bad faith and, 123, 141–3  
 breach of contract and, 66–7, 107  
 broad-ranging nature, 136–40  
 Coronation cases, 131  
 failure of condition, 155–6  
 frustration and, 256–7  
 mistake as cause of action distinguished, 39–40, 41–3, 44–6, 137–41  
 partial failure as basis for restitution, 16, 147–9, 154–6  
 advantages, 16, 117–18, 127  
 counter-restitution and, 16, 116–17, 277–8  
 exceptions to ‘total failure’ requirement and, 115  
 setting-aside of contract and, 148–9  
 proprietary consequences, 107–8  
*Quistclose* trust, 108  
 restitution in absence of failure  
 insurance contracts, 71–2  
 minors’ contracts, 70–1  
 separability of contract and, 132  
 swaps litigation and, 14–15, 68–9, 81–3, 107–8, 118–22, 139–40, 152–4, 618  
 total failure requirement, 16, 111–12, 131, 133–5, 146–9, 256, 257  
 collateral benefit and, 113, 115  
*condictio causa data causa non secuta* and, 132, 153–6  
 contract as determining factor, 113  
 counterclaims and, 132–3  
 ‘entire contract’ and, 112–13  
 historical context, 117  
 separability of contract and, 114–15, 132  
 ultra vires demands and, 64–5, 82–3, 107–8, 118–22  
 unjust enrichment arising from, 108–9, 111, 123  
 valid contract and, 93, 155–6  
 vitiation/qualification of plaintiff’s consent and, 140–3  
 void contract as result of failure, 67–72, 78, 310  
 void contract causing, 76, 105–6, 118–20, 121  
 failure of consideration as ground for restitution (Germany), as unjust factor, 260  
 failure of consideration as ground for restitution (Scotland)  
*See also* restitution in case of frustration or fundamental breach of contract, Scotland  
 breach of contract and, 143–6  
 total failure requirement, *Cantieri*, 132–3, 154–5  
 fault, examples, 382. *See also* bad faith  
 fiduciary obligations, interface with unjust/unjustified enrichment, 11, 360–4, 395–6, 408–9, 672, 678–9

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX 735

- fiduciary obligations, restitutionary  
 damages for breach, 360–4  
 deterrence and, 361–3  
 enrichment, relevance, 363  
 inequality of parties, 362  
 measure, profits accruing to defendant,  
 361–4  
*Snepp v. United States*, 360–4  
 voidable nature of transaction, 408–9
- fraud/duress. *See* change of position;  
 fraud/duress as ground for rescission;  
 fraud/duress, definitions; fraud/duress,  
 effect on; rescission; restitution without  
 enrichment (*Wegfall der Bereicherung*);  
*Saldotheorie*; unwinding of contract
- fraud/duress as ground for rescission  
 (England), 159–93  
 alternative ‘unjust factors’, 210–11  
 as independent cause of action, 17–18  
 as unjust factor, 4, 17–18, 77, 164–6,  
 209–10  
 bad faith and  
   defendants’, 169  
   minors, 169–70  
 by third party, 165–6  
 compulsion and, 210  
 constructive fraud/exploitation  
   constructive notice, 161  
   misrepresentation, 161, 168, 197–8  
   *O’Brien* doctrine, 165, 167–8, 172–4,  
   187–8, 504  
 unconscientious receipt, 166–7  
 unconscionability, 161, 168–9, 170 n. 46  
 undue influence, 161, 167–8, 170–2, 174,  
 198  
 due legal process as, 78  
*in pari delicto* rule and, 301  
 unconscientious procurement, 166  
 vitiation/qualification of plaintiff’s  
   consent and, 164, 165
- fraud/duress as ground for rescission  
 (Germany)  
   remedies, 258–60  
   right of rescission, 258  
   three-party situations, 675
- fraud/duress, definitions 196–200. *See also*  
 fraud/duress as ground  
   for rescission  
 compulsion or threat, 210, 700–1  
 duress, 198–200  
   civil law, 199–200  
   common law concept, 198  
   England, 210  
   Germany, 198–9  
   Netherlands, 198–9  
   South Africa, 199  
   undue influence distinguished, 198  
 duress, fraud and exploitation, 164–8  
 fraud/fraudulent misrepresentation  
   common law concept, 196  
   England, 197–8  
   Germany (*arglistige Täuschung*), 196,  
   198  
   Netherlands (*bedrog*), 196–7, 198  
   South Africa, 197
- fraud/duress, effect on  
 remedies (civil law), 200–24  
   as delicts, 220–2  
   basis of restitution obligation, 222  
   due transfers and, 213–18  
 remedies (England),  
   vitiation/qualification of plaintiff’s  
   consent and, 164  
 remedies, (Germany)  
   as delicts, 221–2  
   bad faith and, 169–70  
   declaration of intent and, 164,  
   214–16  
   due transfers and, 214–18, 231  
   lack of legal cause/ground and, 17,  
   192–3  
   *Leistungskondiktion* and, 207–8  
 remedies (Roman-Dutch law), due  
   transfers and, 214  
 remedies (South Africa), as delicts, 221
- transfer of ownership  
   civil law, 218–20, 222–3  
   Germany, *Verpflichtungsgeschäft*/  
   *Verfügungsgeschäft* distinction, 218–19  
   Netherlands, 220  
   South Africa, 219–20  
   *rei vindicatio*, 219–20
- frustration or fundamental breach of  
 contract as ground for restitution  
 (England), 65–7, 107, 109, 265–6. *See also*  
 failure of consideration as ground for  
 restitution (England)  
 breach of contract and invalidity *ab*  
   *initio* distinguished, 112, 265–6  
 in case of valid contract, 65–7  
*condictio causa data causa non secuta*,  
 relevance, 67, 129–35

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 736 INDEX

frustration or fundamental (*cont.*)  
 consideration/expectation of  
 counterperformance and, 16, 66–72,  
 77, 106, 107, 153  
 frustrating event as invalidation of  
 obligation to pay, 66–7  
 payments outstanding at time of  
 frustration, 66  
 payments prior to frustration, 66  
 requirements  
 non-operation of contract, 10, 109–11,  
 123–4, 155  
 total failure of consideration  
 requirement, 115, 256–7  
 statutory basis, 115  
 frustration or fundamental breach of  
 contract as ground for restitution  
 (Germany), 65–6  
*condictio causa data causa non secuta*,  
 relevance, 67  
 rescission affecting terms of contract as  
 basis, 66  
 unjust enrichment as basis, 15,  
 66  
 other than on grounds of unjust  
 enrichment, 12  
 frustration or fundamental breach of  
 contract as ground for restitution  
 (Scotland), 265–6  
 bad faith and, 141 n. 41  
 breach of contract and invalidity *ab*  
*initio* distinguished, 265–6  
*condictio causa data causa non secuta*,  
 132–3, 143–4, 154–5, 254, 699  
 fault and, 141 n. 41, 145–6  
 total failure of consideration  
 requirement and, 143–6, 254–5  
*furtum*, 591–3, 594  
 fundamental breach of contract as ground  
 for restitution, *See* frustration or  
 fundamental breach of contract as  
 ground for restitution  
*Gestaltungsrecht*, 247  
*gestion d'affaires*, 441–5, 454, 488  
 gifts  
 England  
 mistake as ground for restitution,  
 47–8, 52, 54  
 nature of obligation, 44–5  
 Germany, as binding contract, 44

good faith  
*See also* bad faith  
 Germany  
 illegality and, 322  
*venire contra factum proprium* and,  
 274–6  
 Israel, contract, 332 n. 26  
 Netherlands, illegality and, 322  
 ignorance as unjust factor, 77 n. 7, 91,  
 672–3, 707–8, 719–22, 728  
 illegality as cause of action (England), 290,  
 300–9  
*in pari delicto potior est conditio defendentis*,  
 301–2  
 ‘protected class’ cases. *See* vitiated  
 consent distinguished *below*  
 ‘repentance’ cases, 305–9  
 ultra vires acts of public authorities,  
 62–5  
 vitiated consent distinguished, 300–5,  
 308–9  
 duress, 301  
 inequality of parties, 302–3  
 non-voluntary transfer, 301–2  
 illegality as defence  
 discretionary approach  
 Israel, 321  
 Netherlands, 321–4  
 New Zealand, 321  
 justification, 312–15  
 deterrence/punishment, 313–15  
*nemo auditur turpitudinem suam*  
*allegans*, 24–5, 312–13, 315–16  
 payment of costs as middle way, 324  
 Roman law basis, 310  
 illegality as defence (England), 290, 291–9  
 cause of action distinguished, 290, 306  
 common law, 292–4, 296–8  
 discretionary approach, 322  
 equity, 294–8  
*ex turpi causa non oritur actio*, 298, 315–16  
*in pari delicto potior est conditio defendentis*,  
 298–9, 316  
 property rights not generated by unjust  
 enrichment  
 common law, 292–8  
 equity, 294–8  
 restitution of unjust enrichment, 298–9  
 illegality as defence (Germany), 311 n. 4  
 discretionary approach, 321–3

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX 737

- good faith and, 322
- in pari turpitudine melior est causa possidentis*, 316–21
- mutual performance, 320–1
- nemo auditur turpitudinem suam allegans*, 311 n. 4, 315–16
- quantum meruit* action and, 316–21
- unilateral performance, 317–20
- illegality of contract
  - England
    - effect, 289, 303
    - examples, 289–90
  - Germany, whether justifying restitution, 86–8
- improvement of another's property as ground for restitution
  - England
    - absence of remedy, 369 n. 1
    - US law distinguished, 369–71
  - France, right to require removal, 416 n. 128
  - Germany, 22, 371 n. 9
    - forced exchange, duty in tort to mitigate damages compared, 381
  - Italy, right to require removal, 416
  - Roman law, 21–2
  - South Africa, voluptuary expenses, 394 n. 38, 427
- improvement of another's property as ground for restitution (Scotland)
  - accession, 392, 413–17
    - other than by accession, 393, 417–21
  - bad faith and, 392
  - Bankton's *Institutions*, 393–4
  - basis of owner's liability
    - condictio causa data causa non secuta*, 404–6
    - condictio indebiti*, 406–7, 709
    - implied contract, 411
    - lack of legal cause/ground, 402–3
    - unjust use, 411
  - donation and, 392, 405 n. 87
  - EC Directive on the Protection of Consumers in respect of Distance Contracts, 426
  - English law distinguished, 411
  - examples, 384
  - male fide* improvers, 396–8
  - measure of enrichment, 413
    - mode of enrichment, relevance, 412–13
  - objective approach, 424–6
    - quantum meruit*, 407 n. 98, 429–30
    - saved expense, 403, 418, 428–9
    - subjective devaluation, 421–4
      - where value of improvement realized through sale or lease, 423–5
  - mistake, relevance, 398–404
  - necessary, profitable and voluptuary expenses, relevance, 394
  - Newton v. Newton*, 398–400, 424–5
  - recoverable 'enrichment', 419–21
  - remedies
    - diversity, 22, 386–9
    - forced exchange, 414
    - money equivalent, 414
    - recompense, 398, 708–9
    - retention, 393–4
    - right of removal (*ius tollendi*), 394, 415–16
    - right to require removal, 416–17
    - waiver, 417 n. 131
  - Shilliday v. Smith*, 385–9, 404–5, 427, 465–6, 585
  - Stair's *Institutions*, 387–9, 391–3
  - tenant's right, 392
  - title/possession, relevance, 398–402
  - unnecessary improvements, 398–401
  - void contract and, 406–7
  - voidable contract and
    - Adamson v. Glasgow Corporation Water-Works Commissioners*, 409
    - Boyd & Forrest v. Glasgow & South Western Railway*, 407–11
    - York Buildings Co. v. Mackenzie*, 394–6, 419, 424
- improvement of another's property by mistake as ground for restitution (United States)
  - alternative remedies, 22–3, 370, 375–6
  - betterment acts, 376–8
  - deferred relief, 375
  - English law distinguished, 369–71
  - fault, relevance, 382, 383
  - measure of enrichment, 22–3, 371–83
    - fault/relative hardship and, 373
    - incontrovertible benefit to owner/cost to improver dichotomy, 12, 22–3, 372–3
    - liquidity and, 373–5
    - market value, 381–2
    - owner's own revaluation, 374–5



Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 738 INDEX

- improvement of another's property (*cont.*)  
     saved expense, 374  
     remedies  
         forced exchange, 22, 375–6, 378–81  
         lien, 22  
         tender to improver at unimproved value, 22  
     *Restatement of Restitution* (1936), 371 n. 8, 375 n. 16, 381–2  
*in pari delicto potior est conditio defendentis/in pari turpitudine melior est causa possidentis*, 298–9, 301–2, 316–21  
 incompetence of contracting party  
     *See also* minors  
     Germany  
         change of position and, 233–4  
         void transaction, 260  
     Scotland, 699–700  
     United States, change of position, 233–4  
*indebitum solutum*, 683–4. *See also* *condictio indebiti*  
 inequality of parties, 57, 64–5, 167–8, 231–2, 301–3, 356–7, 362  
 insolvency  
     constructive trusts, Scotland, 584–7, 665–8, 722–3, 729  
     interface with unjust/unjustified enrichment, Scotland, 677–8, 723–6  
     parity of creditors (*paritas creditorum*)  
         France, 560  
         Scotland, 723–6  
         United States, 558, 586, 723–6  
     proprietary restitution and, 577–8, 584–7  
     subrogation/*cessio legis*, 577–8, 665–8  
     tracing, United States, 555–6  
 insurance contracts, 71–2, 577, 680–1  
 interest  
     England, delay in payment of debt and, 455  
     France (article 1153 of Civil Code), 454–5  
*ius in personam ad rem acquirendam*, 579  
*ius tollendi*, 394, 415–16  
 just factors (Germany). *See* defences (Germany)  
 knowledge of claimant defence. *See* defences, knowledge of claimant  
 lack of legal cause/ground (Germany), 5, 14–15, 17–18, 37, 38, 79. *See also* performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*)  
     *condictiones*, 135–6  
     duress and. *See* fraud/duress  
     unjust enrichment and, 311, 494  
     unjust factors, relevance, 18, 192–3, 649–50  
*laesio enormis*, 231  
 leapfrogging. *See* three-party situations  
*Leistung/Leistungskondiktion*  
     England, 82, 92–3, 702–3  
     Germany, 4, 5, 17, 40–1, 162, 205–8, 224, 467–9, 479, 539–41, 544–7, 554, 616–17, 701. *See also* performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*) (Germany)  
     Scotland, 467–9  
*Leistungskette*, 540 n. 46  
*Leistungsprinzip*, 539, 541  
 liens and hypothecs, proprietary  
     restitution in case of, 578–9, 665  
 limitation periods  
     England  
         failure of consideration, 83, 125–6  
         mistake, 125–6  
         right to payment, 56–8  
     Germany, 56, 90  
     subsidiarity and, 608–9  
*mandament van spolie*, 216 n. 99  
*mandat*, 441, 442–3, 445  
 measure of enrichment/damages  
     *See also* contract, restitutionary damages  
     for breach; encroachments,  
     restitutionary liability; improvement  
     of another's property as ground for  
     enrichment; *quantum lucratus*; *quantum meruit/quantum valebat*; *restitutio in integrum*  
     in absence of unjust factor, 185–6  
     compensation for harm to plaintiff,  
     351–2  
     ‘consumer surplus’, 335, 341–2  
     contract as determinant, 10–11, 110,  
     184–5, 327–9  
     non-operative contract, 10, 110–11  
     defendant's enrichment, 183–5  
     difficulty in case of non-money benefits,  
     373–4

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX 739

- disgorgement, 11, 678 n. 121, 679–80
- fault/relative hardship and, 373
- incontrovertible benefit to owner/cost to improver dichotomy, 12, 22–3, 372–3
- law of delict as determinant, 12
- liquidity and, 373–5
- market value, 352, 355–9, 381–2
- mode of enrichment, relevance, 412–13
- mutual restitution in money and, 177–8, 182–3
- non-contractual situation, 184
- objective approach, 182–3, 424–6
- owner's own revaluation, 374–5
- plaintiff's enrichment, 185–6
- policy-motivated, 13
- profits accruing to defendant, 351–2, 361–4, 653–4
- punitive damages, 654 n. 129
- quantum meruit*, 407 n. 98, 428–30
- restitution/compensation divide, 329, 342–7
- saved expense, 374, 403, 418, 428–9
- subjective devaluation, 421–4, 485
- unjust factors, relevance, 168, 182–3, 185–6
- where value of improvement realized through sale or lease, 423–5
- metus*, 195 n. 5, 199
- metus reverentialis*, 199
- minors
  - See also incompetence of contracting party
  - England
    - bad faith, 169–70
  - failure of consideration as ground for restitution, 70–1
  - Germany
    - bad faith, 169–70, 179
    - unwinding of contract, 260
  - Scotland, unwinding of contract, 253, 281
- mise en demeure*, 450–1
- misrepresentation* (England), 161, 168, 197–8
- mistake as ground for restitution* (England), 37–62, 73–4, 120, 311
  - as 'unjust factor', 15–16, 21, 72, 77, 93, 94, 504, 704–5
- causal mistake, 49–53, 73–4, 125
  - neglect of recipient's interests, 53
- contractual mistake, 46–7
  - counter-restitution and, 46–7
  - degrees of mistake, relevance, 48, 52
  - failure of consideration
    - as cause of action distinguished, 125, 136–40, 618
    - as ground, 125, 136–40, 618
  - formation of intention/absence of legal ground distinguished, 46, 311
  - gift, 47–8, 52, 54
  - 'legal ground' approach and, 5, 27–8, 43, 48, 53–4, 58, 65, 75
  - liability mistake, 38–40, 45, 46–7
    - contractual mistake distinguished, 39–40, 41–3, 44–6, 137–41
    - mistaken assumption of valid contract, 68
    - unenforceable obligation and, 46
  - limitation period, 125–6
  - mistake of fact, 38–9, 50, 124–6
  - mistake of law, 16–17, 29, 55–8, 59–60, 72–5, 83–5, 97, 107 n. 15, 124–6, 508, 655, 663–4
  - judicial change in the law and, 28, 74–5, 83–5, 93
  - non-liability mistake, 43–54
    - as origin of remedy, 46–7
  - objective approach, 5
  - right of rescission, 40, 258
  - unenforceable obligation and, 41–8
- mistake as ground for restitution
  - Germany, as 'unjust factor', 85–6
  - Roman law, 37–8
- mistaken assumption of liability (Scotland)
  - condictio indebiti*, 42 n. 15, 73, 75, 136, 213 n. 80, 249 n. 14, 696–7
  - mistake, need for, 696–9
- mitigation of damages (England), 456–7
  - breach of contract, 332–4
  - duty in tort, 381
  - reasonableness test, 456–7
- money
  - bad faith and, 675
  - tracing, 673–6
- mora creditoris*, 438, 446
- mutual restitution. See counter-restitution; mutual restitution; restitution; *Saldotheorie*
- nam hoc natura aequum est neminem cum alterius detrimento et iniuria fieri locupletiores*, 3

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 740 INDEX

*negotiorum gestio*

civil/common law compared, 652–3

classification, 652–3, 681

England, 652–3

Germany, 19, 98 n. 58, 459–60, 511 n. 61

Quebec, 594

Scotland, 462–3, 472–4, 476, 487–9, 681, 729

agency of necessity distinguished, 463

improvements to another's property,

398 n. 58

*nemo auditur turpitudinem suam allegans*,

312–13, 315–16

*Nichtleistungskondiktion*, 496, 499–500,

511–12

*normative Kraft des Faktischen*, 272–3*obligations de faire*, 454–5*paiement*, 434–5, 441, 454*paritas creditorum*, 558, 585–6

## parity of creditors

causation and, 558–60, 723–6, 729

hypothec, 665

insolvency and, 558, 560, 586, 677–8, 723–6

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation, civil/common law

compared

assignability of debt, 461–2

consent of creditor, need for, 461

Scots law lessons, 485–9

'unjust factor' requirement, 462

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation (England), 19–20, 28–9, 50

n. 28

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation (France), 19–20, 28–9

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation (Germany), 50 n. 28

as special category of enrichment, 468–9

creditor's right of refusal, 471–2

*negotiorum gestio*, 19, 459–60, 468*Rückgriffskondiktion*, 19, 467–9, 480, 488,

710–11

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation (Scotland), 462–72

basis of liability, 715–18

by mistake, 477–82

Clive Code, 482–5

creditor's right of refusal, 484–5

discharge of debt, 469–72, 481–2, 486–7, 710–11

## right of

recompense, 474–6, 710–11, 715

recovery on basis of *negotiorum gestio*,

472–4, 487–9

repetition (*condictio indebiti*), 476–7, 481–2, 714–15*Rückgriffskondiktion*, 467–9, 480, 488,

710–11

subrogation, 463 n. 16

## payment of another's debt without

authorisation (South Africa)

discharge of debt, 536–8

*First National Bank v. B & H Engineering*,

478–9, 535–8

*Govender v. The Standard Bank of South**Africa*, 478–9, 481–2, 534–5performance of another's obligation, *See**also* payment of another's debt without

authorisation

## performance of another's obligation

(England)

as 'vicarious performance', 445–6, 457

by mistake, 477–82, 504

creditor's right of refusal, 445–6, 460–1

'officious intermeddling', 447–8, 460

discharge of debt, 19, 446–7

intervention under compulsion of law,

446–7

necessity, 447

loan at interest, 455–7

as mitigation of damage, 456–7

right of recovery, 447

subrogation, 447 n. 70

substitute performance, 455–7

tender of due performance, effect, 446

## performance of another's obligation

(France)

*action in de rem verso*, 444 n. 55

bad faith and, 444

by interested third party, 439–40, 448,

454

by non-interested third party, 440–4

*enrichissement sans cause*, 441–2, 444–5,

448, 453–4

*gestion d'affaires*, 441–5, 448, 454*mandat*, 441, 442–3, 445

right of recovery, 441–4

## Civil Code

article 1142, 448–55

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

- article 1144, 433, 435, 443, 448–57, 461 n. 6
- article 1236, 433, 436, 439–45, 454
- article 1237, 436–8
- consent of creditor, need for, 437–9
  - right of refusal, 438–9, 445
- English law distinguished, 445–8, 455–7
- judicial authorisation of performance at
  - debtor's expense, 433, 448–57, 461 n. 6
  - exécution en nature*, 449–50
  - exécution forcée en nature*, 449
  - faculté de remplacement*, 449–50, 452, 454–5
  - judicial discretion and, 451–5
  - mise en demeure*, 450–1
  - obligations de faire*, 454–5
- subrogation, 19, 439–42, 445, 463 n. 16
- terminology, 433–5
  - débiteur*, 434
  - paiement*, 434–5, 441, 454
  - prestation*, 434, 437–9
- performance/transfer without legal basis
  - condictiones*, 135–6
  - duress and. *See* fraud/duress
  - relevance of other factors, 18, 192–3
  - unjust enrichment and, 311
- performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*) (Germany), 4, 17, 40–1, 205–8, 467–9. *See also* undue transfers
  - duress/fraud and, 207–8, 213, 215, 224
  - failure of purpose, relevance, 206–7, 215–16, 224
  - Leistungsprinzip*, 539, 541
  - Nichleistungskondiktion*, 496, 539, 544
  - unenforceable obligations, 40–1
- performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*) (Scotland), 693–713
  - 'transfer', 694–5
- personal bar. *See* estoppel/personal bar
- powerlessness as unjust factor, 672, 707–8
- prestation*, 434, 437–9
- promises in English law
  - enforceability, 41–3
  - restitution distinguished, 42–3
- payment under unenforceable promise, 98
- proportionality, England,
  - counter-restitution and, 177–8
- proprietary basis for unwinding of contracts, 268–70
  - proprietary restitution, 268–70. *See also* subrogation/*cessio legis*
  - definitions
    - property, 352–3
    - proprietary, 571–2, 676–7
  - insolvency and, constructive trusts, 584–7, 665–8
  - interface with unjust/unjustified enrichment, 12–14, 268–70, 290–1, 292–8, 392, 588–96, 665–71, 705–8, 726–7
  - liens and hypothecs, 578–9, 665
  - personal rights and, 579
  - property rights, 707
  - rei vindicatio*. *See* vindictory remedies/*vindicatio*
  - vindictory action as enrichment action, 574–5
- quantum lucratus*, 244, 428–9
- quantum meruit/quantum valebat*, 25, 244, 313–14
  - England, 122–3, 177, 312 n. 11
  - Germany, 316–21
  - Scotland, 407 n. 98, 429–30
- Quistclose* trust, 108
- réception/répétition de l'indu*, 434 n. 6, 594–5, 599, 682–3
- Rechtsgeschäft*, 200–1
- rechtshandeling*, 201
- recompense (Scotland)
  - as general remedy, 464–9
  - mistake, relevance, 398 n. 59, 474–6, 708–9
  - relevance of term, 428–9
  - remedy/liability distinguished, 389–90
  - unauthorised payment of another's debt, 474–6, 710–11
- reduction of contract (Scotland), 248 n. 10, 267–268, 427
  - impossibility of restitution/
    - counter-restitution and, 204 n. 46, 252–5, 267, 272, 407–9, 583–4
  - real/personal effect, 581–4
  - third party rights and, 270
  - void contract, 267
- reduction of contract (Scotland). *See* reduction of contract (Scotland)
- relief as unjust enrichment remedy (Scotland), 387 n. 7, 428, 463 n. 15, 680

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 742 INDEX

- repetition (Scotland)
    - condictio indebiti* and, 464–5, 476–7
    - mistake, need for, 464–5
    - restitution distinguished, 388–9, 405
      - n. 84
  - res perit domino*, 133, 273–4
  - rescission (England)
    - See also* counter-restitution; fraud/duress
      - as ground for rescission (England);
      - restitution
    - in case of worthless contract, 180 n. 81
    - classification of remedy, 250–1
    - contract/unjust enrichment interface, 161
    - German law distinguished, 86, 137
      - n. 21, 174–7, 250
    - impossibility of restitution/
      - counter-restitution and, 40, 174–8, 182, 204 n. 46, 258, 260, 262–3, 272, 312 n. 12
    - partial rescission, 173–4, 186–7, 189–91
    - restitution as consequence, 40, 86, 161, 163
    - termination distinguished, 262–5
    - third party rights and, 270
  - rescission (Germany) (*Anfechtung*)
    - classification of remedy, 250
    - English law distinguished, 86, 137 n. 21, 174–7, 250
    - grounds, 86, 258
    - impossibility of restitution/
      - counter-restitution and, 203–5, 258, 260, 261
    - rendering contract void *ab initio*, 86
    - restitution on basis of underlying
      - ground for rescission, 86
    - right of, 247, 258
    - termination distinguished, 263–5
    - vertragsähnliches Recht*, 137 n. 21
  - rescission (Netherlands), impossibility of
    - restitution/counter-restitution and, 204, 209
  - rescission (Scotland)
    - See also* reduction of contract
    - termination distinguished, 265
  - Restatement of Contracts (Second)*, 233
  - Restatement of Restitution*, 371 n. 8, 375
    - n. 16, 381–2, 506 n. 43, 647–8
  - restitutio in integrum*, 24. *See also* measure of enrichment/damages
    - arguments in favour of principle, 270–7, 281–5
    - as contractual concept, 203, 221
    - change of position and, 24, 243–85
  - England
    - in case of, 265–6
    - transactions, 267–8
    - counter-restitution as, 173, 256, 271
    - definition, 281–2
  - Germany, 203–5, 261
    - void transactions, 267
  - rescission and, 202–5
  - Roman law, 202–3
  - Scotland
    - in case of, 265–6
    - transactions, 267–8
  - definition, 281–2
  - frustration, 265–6
  - improvements to another's property, 407–9, 427–8
  - limitation to rescission of legal act, 253
  - South Africa, 203, 221
  - unwinding of contract and, 24, 243–77
- restitution
- See also* contract, restitutionary damages
    - for breach; failure of consideration as ground for restitution (England);
    - frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution;
    - frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution;
    - improvement of another's property as ground for restitution; mistake as ground for restitution; proprietary restitution; *restitutio in integrum*;
    - restitution without enrichment;
    - subsidiarity; *ultra vires* acts of public authorities (England)
  - history, 227–9
  - private/public law régimes, *ultra vires* acts, 664–5
  - scope of remedy, 41–2, 312 n. 12
  - unjust enrichment, equivalence, 3, 497, 647–9
  - variety of meanings, 647–8
- restitution (civil law), bad faith and, *condictio causa data causa non secuta*, 141–2
- restitution (England)
- alternative grounds/remedies, 124–6, 135–6, 581, 590–1, 653–4, 703
  - limitation periods and, 83, 125–6
  - basis, vitiation of consent, 49, 140–3

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

- in case of
  - moral obligation, 41–2, 312 n. 12
  - unenforceable obligation, 47–8, 55–8, 70–2
- civil law distinguished, 76
- counterclaims and, 133–4
- evolving system, 127
- monetization, 174–8, 182
- mutual, 177–82
- policy-motivated, 55–9, 61, 78–9, 84, 93–8, 170–1, 176–7
  - court's discretion in respect of illegal transactions, 94–5
  - Insolvency Act, 1986 93–5
  - Law of Property (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act, 1989 95–7
  - time-barred claim, 55
- proportionality, 177–8
- proprietary nature, 175–6
- requirements
  - enrichment. *See* restitution without enrichment
  - non-operation of contract, 10, 109–11, 123–4, 155
  - unjust factors, 76
- rescission and. *See* rescission
- restoration of parties to previous position as objective, 116
- scope of remedy, 106–7
  - benefit to claimant as basis, 106–7
  - failure of consideration, relevance, 107–9
- restitution (France), 436
- restitution (Germany)
  - alternative grounds/remedies, 594
  - policy-motivated, 59
  - secondary enrichment, 182–3
- restitution (Quebec), alternative grounds/remedies, *negotiorum gestio*, 594
- restitution (Scotland)
  - in case of wrong of third party, 673–4
  - linkage with unjust enrichment, *condictio causa data causa non secuta*, 26, 386, 404–6
  - repetition distinguished, 388–9, 405 n. 84
- restitution in case of void transactions (England), 67–9, 76, 78–9, 82–3, 84–5, 95–7, 109, 237–8, 616–17, 701–2
- betting debt, 43–4, 72
- breach of contract distinguished, 112
- consideration/expectation of
  - counterperformance and, 67–72, 105–6, 109, 118–22
- illegal transaction, 289, 303, 310
- impossibility of restitution/
  - counter-restitution and, 267–8
- lack of clarity of concept, 72, 267–8
- mistake of law and, 45, 72–5, 84–5, 92–3, 107 n. 15
- remedy in tort, 256–7
- unjust factor, need for, 701
- void/unenforceable distinction, 70
- void/voidable distinction, 94, 201 n. 37, 267–8
- without failure of consideration, 69–72
- restitution in case of void transactions (Germany), 80, 86–6. *See also* lack of legal cause/ground (Germany)
  - avoidance of *nichtig* where right to restitution not intended, 87–8, 93, 99
  - clarity of concept, 72, 267–8
  - condictio causa data causa non secuta*, relevance, 67 n. 98, 73
  - consideration/expectation of
    - counterperformance and, 67 n. 98
  - illegal transactions as, 86–8, 310
  - impossibility of
    - restitution/counter-restitution and, 267–8
  - incompetence of party, 260
  - intended discharge of contract as basis of payment, 67
  - rescission (*Anfechtung*) giving rise to, 86, 268
  - restitution without enrichment (*Wegfall der Bereicherung*) and, 235–8
  - right to claim back transferred goods, 260
  - void/voidable distinction, 267–8
- restitution in case of void transactions (Netherlands), void/voidable distinction, 201 n. 37
- restitution in case of void transactions (Scotland), 254, 406–11, 702
  - impossibility of restitution/
    - counter-restitution and, 267–8
- restitution in case of void transactions (United States), void/unenforceable distinction, 70

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 744 INDEX

- restitution without enrichment, 227–42.
  - See also* change of position; contract, restitutionary damages for breach; fraud/duress, effect on, transfer of ownership; frustration or fundamental breach of contract as ground for restitution; proprietary restitution; *restitutio in integrum*
- restitution without enrichment
  - fiduciary relationship, 363
  - improvement of another's property and, 381–3
  - retained ownership and, 573–5
- restitution without enrichment (England), void transactions, 237–8
- restitution without enrichment (Germany) (*Wegfall der Bereicherung*), 229–42
  - cases outside doctrine
    - bona fide* purchaser, 230
    - change of position on basis of contract with incompetent party, 233–4
    - exploitation, 231–2
    - liability for actions of sub-contractor, 238–9
    - void transactions, 235–8
    - wrongful appropriation of benefit, 232
- restitution without enrichment (United States), 239–42
  - cases outside doctrine
    - change of position on basis of contract with incompetent party, 233–4
    - liability for actions of sub-contractor, 238–9
    - void transaction, 236–7
    - wrongful appropriation of benefit, 232–3
- restitutionary damages for breach of contract. *See* contract, restitutionary damages for breach
- right of recovery, 447
- risk, allocation of, 10, 110–11, 112–13, 131, 139, 273–4. *See also* *res perit domino*
- splitting the loss, 280–1
- Rückgriffskondiktion*
  - Germany, 4, 19, 467–9, 480, 488
  - Scotland, 19, 467–9, 710–11
- Rücktrittsrecht*, 260, 263
- Saldotheorie*, 178–80, 188, 205, 234–5, 258–61, 267, 279
- description, 178–9
- displacement, 179, 205
- Zweikondiktionenlehre* and, 179, 192, 205, 258
- solutio*, 214
- specificatio*, 517
- subcontractors. *See* restitution without enrichment; three-party situations
- subrogation/*cessio legis*
  - See also* tracing
- insolvency and, 577–8
- Scotland, 665–8
- insurance contracts, 577, 680–1
- payment of another's debt without authorisation, 463 n. 16
- performance of another's obligation
  - England, 447 n. 70
  - France, 19–20, 439–42, 445, 463 n. 16
- special patrimonies/trusts, 577
- trusts, 577
- subsidiarity, 596–623
  - actio de in rem verso* and, France, 597, 602, 617, 622 n. 122, 666
  - applicability of different set of legal principles, 597–607
  - availability of alternative remedies, 581, 596, 607–9
  - Quebec, 607–8
- in case of
  - contractual remedy, 599–602
  - defendant's contract with third party
    - Germany, 605
    - Quebec, 605–6
  - illegal, void or unenforceable transactions, 598
  - plaintiff's contract with third party
    - Canada, 603–4
    - France, 602
    - Germany, 604
    - Quebec, 602–3
  - range of unjustified enrichment remedies, 598–9
  - tort/delict
    - France, 705
    - Germany, 608
- justification, 609–13
- Leistung* and, Germany, 599, 604
- potential for conflict, 612–13
- prescription and, 608–9
- in three-party situations, 558–66, 602–7, 617 n. 108
- England, 559



Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

- France, 560  
 Germany, 561–2  
 Italy, 559–60, 617 n. 108  
 Scotland, 558–9  
 South Africa, 562–6  
 weak subsidiarity, Quebec, 597  
 swaps litigation (England)  
   *See also* ultra vires acts of public  
   authorities  
   description of problem, 80–1, 149–51  
   failure of consideration and, 14–15,  
   68–9, 81–3, 107–8, 118–22, 139–40,  
   152–4, 618  
   interrupted swap, 81–2  
*Synallagma*, 271 n. 79
- tantum et tale* doctrine (Scotland), 676
- taxonomy  
   *See also* unjust factors; unjust/unjustified  
   enrichment, definitions;  
   unjust/unjustified enrichment,  
   interface with *and under separate*  
   *subject headings*  
 Birks, 4–5, 39–40, 49, 164–6, 659–60,  
   670–1, 688, 691, 693–4, 715  
 Burrows, 688–91, 693–4  
 Clive Code (1996) (Scotland), 26–7,  
   482–5, 644, 644 n. 85, 660 n. 15, 670,  
   691–3, 702  
 codification and, 643–4  
 common law/equity dualism, 672–3  
 harmonisation, scope for, 659–61  
 importance, 632–44  
 lack of attention to (England),  
   628–57  
   *Lipkin Gorman*, 630, 641–3, 668  
 liability/remedy, 388–90, 412–13  
 ‘proprietary rights’, ‘personal rights’,  
   trusts, 676–7  
 ‘restitution’, ‘recompense’, ‘repetition’  
   and ‘relief’ (Scotland), 427–30, 464–9,  
   474, 682, 684–6, 691  
 the ‘three Rs’ (Scotland), 427–30, 693  
 Wilburg/von Caemmerer, 4, 91–2, 539  
   n. 39, 686–7, 693–713. *See also*  
   performance/transfer without legal  
   basis (*Leistungskondiktion*)
- taxonomy (Scotland), confusion of  
 terminology, 26–7
- third party rights, 187–8, 270, 336. *See also*  
 performance of another’s obligation
- three-party situations  
   *See also* causation; insolvency; payment  
   of another’s debt; performance of  
   another’s obligation; subsidiarity;  
   tracing  
 diversity of approach, 526–30, 542, 562  
 fraud/duress and, 675  
 other than payment of another’s debt,  
   20  
 policy considerations underlying  
   liability, 530–3, 557–8, 566–7  
 sub-contractor’s rights against  
   beneficiary of performance, 20,  
   542–52, 561–6, 606–7
- three-party situations (England)  
 agency, 513–14  
 alignment with two-party situations,  
   672–3  
 causation, leapfrogging, 518–24  
 change of position defence, 522  
 interceptive subtraction, 506–12  
 leapfrogging, 493, 504, 512–24  
   proprietary connection and, 515–19  
*Lipkin Gorman*, 514–15, 517–19, 528, 575,  
   668  
 other than payment of another’s debt, 20  
 restitution based on ‘encroachment’,  
   517–18  
 sub-contractor’s rights against  
   beneficiary of performance, 20, 547–50  
   *The Trident Beauty*, 548–50, 560  
 third party beneficiary of contract,  
   501–6  
   putative contract, 504–6, 510–12  
   valid contract, 502–4  
 traceability, 519
- three-party situations (France)  
*actio de in rem verso*, 513, 578–9, 602, 682  
   n. 149, 683  
*Boudier*, 560, 578–9, 602, 682
- three-party situations (Germany)  
*actio de in rem verso*, 513  
 Canaris principles, 20, 616  
 change of position defence, 522  
 compensation for necessary expenses  
   (Civil Code provision (*BGB*) (ss 944ff)),  
   561–2  
 enrichment, need for, 539–42  
 interceptive subtraction, 512  
*Leistungskondiktion* and, 527–8, 539–41,  
   544–7, 554, 616–17



Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 746 INDEX

- three-party situations (Germany) (*cont.*)
  - sub-contractor's rights against
    - beneficiary of performance, 20, 544–7, 561–2
    - Elektrogerätefall*, 544–5
  - third party beneficiary of contract, putative contract, 504–6, 510–12
- three-party situations (Scotland)
  - bad faith and, 722–3
  - divergence from two-party transactions, 672
  - strict liability, 729
  - sub-contractor's rights against
    - beneficiary of performance, 546–7
    - contract with contractor as bar, 20, 558–9
- three-party situations (South Africa)
  - enrichment, need for
    - First National Bank v. B & H Engineering*, 535–8
    - Govender v The Standard Bank of South Africa*, 534–5
  - sub-contractor's rights against
    - beneficiary of performance, 562–6
    - ABSA*, 564–6
    - Buzzard Electrical*, 542–4, 546–7, 563–4
  - unjust(ified)ness of enrichment, relevance, 542–4
- three-party situations (United States)
  - enrichment, need for, 537–8
  - strict liability, 718–19
  - sub-contractor's rights against
    - beneficiary of performance, 550–2
    - Commerce Partnership 8098 LP v. Equity Contracting Co.*, 551–2
  - third party beneficiary of contract, putative contract, 504
- tracing of money or other property, 13–14, 553–4, 667, 671–6. *See also* subrogation
- transfer of ownership. *See* fraud/duress, effect on; undue transfers; unwinding of contract
- trusts
  - See also* constructive trusts
  - Scotland, 676–7
  - subrogation, 577
- ultra vires acts of public authorities (England), 62–5, 107–8, 118–22, 655, 664–5. *See also* swaps litigation
- illegality of demand, 62–5
- public authority liability in Germany distinguished, 62
- unjust factors and, 4, 27–8, 62–5, 664–5
  - failure of consideration, 64–5, 82–3, 107–8, 118–22
- undue influence (England), 24, 170–1, 174, 198
- undue influence (Germany), 24, 74, 170–1, 198–9
- undue transfers
  - See also* performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*)
  - mistake, relevance, 697–9, 728
- undue transfers (France), *répétition de l'indu*, 434 n. 6, 683, 697–8
- undue transfers (Netherlands)
  - See also* performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*) (Germany)
- unjust enrichment/undue payment distinguished, 194–5
- fraud/duress and, 208–9, 224
- undue transfers (Scotland), 682
- compulsion and, 700–1
- undue transfers (South Africa), *condictio indebiti* and, 212–13
- unjust factors
  - See also* failure of consideration as ground for restitution; fraud/duress; fraud/duress as ground for rescission; illegality as cause of action (England); inequality of parties; lack of legal cause/ground (Germany); measure of enrichment/damages; mistake as ground for restitution; performance/transfer without legal basis (*Leistungskondiktion*); ultra vires acts of public authorities
  - advantages of system, 160–1, 191–3, 649–51
  - lack of legal ground and, 18, 192–3, 649–51
- unjust factors (England)
  - condictio indebiti* and, 38–9, 65, 73–4, 76, 92–3, 98, 139
  - condictiones* compared, 135–6
  - exploitation of claimant's weakness, 77–8, 185–6
  - ignorance, 77 n. 7, 91, 672, 707–8, 719–22, 728

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX 747

- lack of coherent system, 5–6, 135, 159–60, 162–3, 649–51, 665, 672–3, 690–1
- need for, 58–9
- powerlessness, 672, 707–8, 728
- unjust factors (Germany)
  - illegality, 88
  - immorality, 88
  - mistake, 85–6
  - relevance of concept, 159–64, 192
- unjust factors (Scotland),
  - non-voluntariness, 211
- unjust/unjustified enrichment
  - as corrective, 610–12, 619–21
  - definitions, 3–8, 647–9
    - ‘enrichment’, 651–2
    - loss, relevance, 500–1
  - by wrong/enrichment ‘by subtraction’
    - distinguished, 4–5, 164, 497–9, 524–5, 553
  - /possession distinction and, 573
  - ownership remains unchanged, 578, 589–96
  - ‘unjust’, 654–6
  - unjust enrichment/restitution,
    - equivalence, 3, 497, 647–9
  - ‘unjust’/‘unjustified’ distinguished, 79, 530 n. 16
  - ‘unjustified unless’, 691–3
  - ‘enrichment’, corresponding loss,
    - relevance, 11, 500–1, 509–12
  - general action, 192, 593–4, 595–6, 617–18, 621–2, 686–7
  - history of concept, 8–9, 227–9
  - interface with
    - contract law, 9–12, 202–9, 262–4, 497–9, 524–5, 543–4, 546–7, 598–607, 614–19, 678, 701–3, 727
    - criminal law, 663–4
    - delict/tort, 12–13, 177, 220–2, 510–12, 589–93, 653–4, 679–80, 705–6, 727
    - /duress, 220–2
    - as defence, 312–13
    - fiduciary obligations, 11, 360–4, 395–6, 408–9, 672, 678–9
    - insolvency law, 677–8, 723–6
    - law of wrongs, 12, 608, 619, 621–2
    - property law, 12–14, 268–70, 290–8, 392, 588–96, 619–21, 665–71, 705–8, 726–7
  - /possession/transfer of property,
    - 13–14, 398–402
  - remedies, 574–5, 669–71
  - repetition of the undue, 682
  - trusts, 676–7
  - where ownership remains unchanged,
    - Scotland, *condictio ex causa furtiva*, 705–6
  - unjust/unjustified enrichment (England)
    - as independent source of rights and obligations, 9
    - burden of proof, 126–7
    - ‘enrichment’
      - ‘at the expense of’, 493–525, 553–4, 562, 565
      - subtraction, 506–12
      - by performance/other than by performance, 496, 499–500
    - causation, 553–4
    - corresponding loss, relevance, 11, 500–1, 509–12
    - unjust(ified)ness, relevance, 547–50
  - failure of consideration giving rise to, 108–9, 111
    - non-monetary enrichment, 122–3
  - measure of enrichment. *See* measure of enrichment/damages
  - property rights distinguished, 290–1, 292–8, 575–7, 666–71, 707–8
  - quantum meruit/quantum valebat* actions
    - and, 122–3, 177
  - ‘unjust’, 110, 111
    - ‘unjust factors, relevance, 77
  - unjust/unjustified enrichment (France),
    - ‘enrichment’, corresponding loss, relevance, 705
  - unjust/unjustified enrichment (Germany)
    - See also* restitution without enrichment
    - ‘at the expense of’, causation, 554
    - Civil Code provision (*BGB*) (§ 812(1)), 4, 79, 496, 561, 593–4
    - condictio indebiti/condictio sine causa* and, 38, 40–1, 55
    - proposed revision, 696
    - sweeping nature, 79–80, 88, 93, 205
  - codification of law, effect, 194
  - ‘enrichment’
    - ‘at the expense of’, 493–4, 496

Cambridge University Press

0521808200 - Unjustified Enrichment: Key Issues in Comparative Perspective

Edited by David Johnston and Reinhard Zimmermann

Index

[More information](#)

## 748 INDEX

- unjust/unjustified enrichment (*cont.*)
  - by performance (*Leistung*)/other than
    - by performance (*Nichtleistung*), 80,
    - 91, 496, 499–500, 511–12, 539, 604,
    - 686–7
  - incurred by claimant (*Verwendungen*), 4, 554
  - corresponding loss, relevance, 496
    - n. 12, 500–1, 510–12
  - ‘in another way’ (*Bereicherung in sonstiger Weise*), 4, 544
  - general action, 192, 593–4, 686–7
  - where ownership remains unchanged, 593–4
    - condictio possessionis*, 594
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (Netherlands), general action, 683
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (Quebec)
  - Civil Code provisions, 594–6
  - general action, *actio de in rem verso* as, 595–6, 617–18, 621–2
  - réception de l'indu*, 594–5, 599, 608 n. 80
  - where ownership remains unchanged, 594–6
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (Roman law)
  - where ownership remains unchanged, 591–3
    - condictio ex causa furtiva*, 591–3
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (Scotland)
  - See also improvement of another's property as ground for restitution (Scotland)
  - Clive Code (1996), 26–7, 482–5, 644, 660
    - n. 15, 670, 691–3, 702
  - delict/contract, 498–9
  - diversity of remedies, 387–9, 488
  - encroachment on claimant's property (*Eingriff*), 680, 705–7
  - ‘enrichment’, 411–13, 417–21, 651–2
    - ‘at the expense of’, 554
    - and, 663–4
    - by performance/other than by performance, 684–6, 694–705
    - ‘transfer’, 694–5
    - unjust(ified)ness, relevance, 545–7
    - ‘unjustified unless’, 691–3
    - where ownership remains unchanged, liens and hypothecs, 578
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (South Africa)
  - ‘enrichment’
    - ‘at the expense of’, 554, 562, 565
    - corresponding loss, relevance, 534–8
    - unjust(ified)ness, relevance, 542–4, 546–7
  - general action, 684
- unjust/unjustified enrichment (United States)
  - ‘enrichment’
    - ‘at the expense of’, 493
    - unjust(ified)ness, relevance, 550–2
  - unwinding of contract
    - change of position defence and, 24, 259–60, 282–5
  - effect on
    - contract, 244, 252–70
    - possession, 245
    - transfer of property, 244–5
  - failure of consideration and, 260, 262–3
  - methods
    - automatic, 248, 266
    - classification of remedy, 250–70
    - effect on contract, 252–70
    - exceptio* against plaintiff, 248
    - judicial, 247–8
    - obligational, 247, 266
  - proprietary basis, 268–70
  - reasons, 248–50
  - terms to be avoided, frustration, 244–6
  - unified system, desirability, 262–70
- unwinding of contract (England)
  - breach of contract, 256
  - defective goods, 255
  - frustration, 256–7
  - mistake, fraud, force or fear, 255
  - where transfer of property rendered void, 257–8
- unwinding of contract (Germany), 258–60
  - breach of contract, 260
  - minority, 260
  - mistake, fraud, force or fear, 258–60
  - rescission/termination distinction, 263–5
  - splitting the loss, 261, 280–1
  - Zweikondiktionenlehre*, 261, 278–9
- unwinding of contract (Scotland)
  - minority, 253, 281
  - mistake, fraud, force or fear, 252–3
- Valutaverhältnis*, 540
- venire contra factum proprium*, 204, 274–6.
  - See also estoppel/personal bar
- Verfügungsgeschäft*, 218–19

<i>Verpflichtungsgeschäft</i> , 218–19	fraud/duress as ground for rescission;
<i>vertragsähnliches Recht</i> , 137 n. 21	illegality as cause of action (England)
<i>Verwendungskondiktion</i> , 4, 467, 554	void/voidable transactions
‘vicarious performance’, 445–6,	<i>See also</i> restitution in case of void
457	transactions
vindictory remedies/ <i>vindicatio</i> , 13–14,	right to claim back transferred goods,
573–5, 596, 619–21, 669–71, 675	260
England, 13, 591	subsidiarity in case of, 598
Germany, 218–20, 249, 250–1, 268–9,	Vorleistungsfälle, 137 n. 25
594	
interface with unjust/unjust	<i>Wandelung</i> , 247
enrichment, 574–5, 669–71	<i>Wegfall der Bereicherung</i> , 227–42
Roman law, 591–3	<i>Willenserklärung</i> , 200–1
South Africa, 219–20, 564	
vitiatio/qualification of plaintiff’s	<i>Zuweisungsgehalt eines Rechts</i> , 511
consent. <i>See</i> failure of consideration as	<i>Zweikonditionenlehre</i> , 179, 192, 205, 258,
ground for restitution (England);	261, 278–9