

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PALESTRINA AND THE GERMAN ROMANTIC IMAGINATION

Focusing on the reception of Palestrina, this bold interdisciplinary study explains how and why the works of a sixteenth-century composer came to be viewed as a paradigm for modern church music. It explores the diverse ways in which later composers responded to his works and style, and expounds a provocative new model for interpreting compositional historicism. In addition to presenting insights into the works of Bruckner, Mendelssohn and Liszt, the book offers new perspectives on the institutional, aesthetic and ideological frameworks sustaining the cultivation of choral music in this period. This is the first modern publication to provide an overview and analysis of the relation between the Palestrina revival and nineteenth-century composition, and it demonstrates that the Palestrina revival was just as significant for nineteenth-century culture as parallel movements in the other arts, such as the Gothic revival.

JAMES GARRATT is a lecturer in music at the National University of Ireland, Maynooth, specializing in nineteenth-century German music, aesthetics and culture. He is also active as a choral conductor.

Cambridge University Press
 0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
 in Nineteenth-Century Music
 James Garratt
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE MUSICAL TEXTS AND MONOGRAPHS
 General editors: John Butt and Laurence Dreyfus

This series has as its centres of interest the history of performance and the history of instruments. It includes annotated translations of authentic historical texts on music and monographs on various aspects of historical performance and instrument history.

Recent titles

John Butt

**Bach Interpretation: Articulation Marks in the Sources
 of J. S. Bach**

Nicholas Thistlethwaite

The Making of the Victorian Organ

Christopher Page (trans. and ed.)

Summa musicæ: A Thirteenth-Century Manual for Singers

Ardal Powell (trans. and ed.)

The Virtuoso Flute Player by Johann George Tromlitz

Beth Bullard (trans. and ed.)

**Musica getutscht: A Treatise on Musical Instruments
 by Sebastian Virdung**

David Rowland

A History of Pianoforte Pedalling

John Butt

**Music Education and the Art of Performance in the
 German Baroque**

Rebecca Harris Warrick and Carol Marsh

Musical Theatre at the Court of Louis XIV

Le Mariage de la Grosse Cathos

Julianne C. Baird (trans. and ed.)

Introduction to the Art of Singing by Johann Friedrich Agricola

Valerie Walden

One Hundred Years of Violoncello

A History of Technique and Performance Practice, 1740–1840

Bernard Brauchli

The Clavichord

Suzanne J. Beicken (trans. and ed.)

Vocal Performance and Ornamentation by Johann Adam Hiller

Hugh Macdonald (trans. and ed.)

Berlioz's Orchestration Treatise

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music
James Garratt
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

MUSICAL PERFORMANCE AND RECEPTION
General editors John Butt and Laurence Dreyfus

This series continues the aim of Cambridge Musical Texts and Monographs to publish books centred on the history of musical instruments and the history of performance, while broadening the focus to include musical reception in relation to performance and as a reflection of period expectations and practices.

Published titles

John Butt

**Playing with History: The Historical Approach to
Musical Performance**

James Garratt

**Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting
Historicism in Nineteenth-Century Music**

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PALESTRINA AND THE
GERMAN ROMANTIC
IMAGINATION

Interpreting Historicism in Nineteenth-Century Music

JAMES GARRATT



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

<http://www.cambridge.org>

© James Garratt 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Baskerville Monotype 11/12.5 pt *System* L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 80737 9 hardback

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To my parents

Cambridge University Press
 0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
 in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
1 Historicism in nineteenth-century art, aesthetics and culture	9
Originality: consensus or controversy?	9
‘On the benefit and detriment of history’	12
Hegel, historicism and the ‘Decay and disintegration of Art’	28
2 Romanticism and the problem of church music	36
Hoffmann and the Romantic idealization of Palestrina	36
Palestrina and the Romantic new mythology	47
Palestrina and absolute vocal music	52
Palestrina and the modern composer	57
3 The Protestant Palestrina revival	62
Old Italian music, <i>Bildung</i> and the German <i>Singvereine</i>	62
Quasi-liturgical music: Spohr and Nicolai	69
Mendelssohn and the Berlin Palestrina revival	78
Winterfeld and the historical Palestrina	93
Broader trends in performance and composition	98
Palestrina and the primacy of vocal music	109
4 The Catholic Palestrina revival	133
Tradition and reform	133
Witt and the <i>Allgemeine Deutsche Cäcilien-Verein</i>	144
Broader trends in composition: Palestrinianism	161
Completing Palestrina: Haberl, Haller and the <i>Gesamtausgabe</i>	168
Liturgical function and aesthetic value	173
Liszt, Bruckner and the Palestrina revival	181

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x	<i>Contents</i>	
5	Palestrina in the concert hall	214
	Palestrina in secular and non-liturgical music	214
	Wagner's 'Stabat mater' and the poetics of arrangement	222
	Liszt, Wagner and allusion	227
6	Interpreting the secondary discourse of nineteenth-century music	241
	<i>Notes</i>	261
	<i>Bibliography</i>	296
	<i>Index</i>	311

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music
James Garratt
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

The Palestrina revival has been at the centre of my concerns for the best part of a decade, and with this book I take leave – at least provisionally – of this fascinating and extraordinarily rich topic. I would like to thank everyone whose help and encouragement have sustained my work in this field. I first began exploring the Palestrina revival via an undergraduate dissertation on the church music of Liszt and Bruckner (the sole copy of which, thankfully, is in my possession), and must thank Roger Parker, John Warrack and Susan Wollenberg for stimulating my interest in this topic. Then, having moved from Oxford to the University of Wales Cardiff, I wrote my Ph.D. thesis under the title of the present book; my research would not have been possible without the financial support of a Research Studentship from Cardiff University. I am very grateful to everyone at Cardiff who gave advice and support, including Kenneth Gloag, Natasha Page, Robin Stowell, Stephen Walsh, Peter Williams and especially my doctoral supervisor, David Wyn Jones.

Although based on my Ph.D. dissertation, this book represents a substantial reworking of my initial ideas; I have also drawn on my more recent work on historiography and performance practice. Some of the new material has appeared in other publications: portions of chapters 3 and 6 were first published in my ‘Mendelssohn’s Babel: Romanticism and the Poetics of Translation’, *Music and Letters* 80 (1999), 23–49; portions of chapters 1 and 2 appeared in a different form in ‘Prophets Looking Backwards: German Romantic Historicism and the Representation of Renaissance Music’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125 (2000), 164–204; and various passages of the book (in the age of ‘copy and paste’, it is hard to be more specific) have appeared in ‘Performing Renaissance Church Music in Nineteenth-Century Germany: Issues and Challenges in the Study of Performative Reception’, *Music and Letters* 83 (2002), 187–236. I am grateful to the Städtisches Kunstinstitut und Städtische Galerie, Frankfurt am Main, for permission to reproduce Philipp Veit’s

Cambridge University Press
0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

Acknowledgements

Die Einführung der Künste in Deutschland durch das Christenthum (left panel: *Italia*) as the jacket illustration. This idealized representation of Italy (by an artist related to two of the protagonists in the book, Felix Mendelssohn and Friedrich Schlegel), provides a rich and inspiring metaphor for the present topic.

It was John Butt who suggested that I reshape my dissertation into a book, and I am very grateful to him and to Penny Souster for the enthusiasm with which they have pursued this project. I must also thank my colleagues at the National University of Ireland Maynooth for their advice and assistance, especially Barra Boydell, Patrick Devine and Gerard Gillen; in addition, I acknowledge with gratitude the work of all the librarians who have facilitated my research, especially the staff of the Music Department Resource Centre at Cardiff and of the Russell and John Paul II libraries at Maynooth. Most of all, I wish to thank Sinéad Dempsey, who not only typeset the music examples at the very last minute, but who – in its final stages – tolerated the book's inexorable encroachment into what seemed like every minute of our lives.

Cambridge University Press
 0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
 in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

- AmZ* Leipzig *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*
- BR* *Atti del secondo convegno internazionale di studi Palestriniani: Palestrina e la sua presenza nella musica e nella cultura europea dal suo tempo ad oggi (Palestrina, 1986)*, ed. Lino Bianchi and Giancarlo Rostirolla, Palestrina, 1991.
- CK* *Caecilien Kalender*
- CU* *Der Caecilianismus: Anfänge – Grundlagen – Wirkungen. Internationales Symposium zur Kirchenmusik des 19. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Hubert Unverricht, Tutzing, 1988, Eichstätter Abhandlungen zur Musikwissenschaft 5.
- CVC* *Vereins-Catalog. (Begonnen 1870.) Die von dem Referentencollegium des Cäcilien-Vereines für alle Länder deutscher Zunge in den 'Vereins-Catalog' aufgenommenen kirchenmusikalischen oder auf Kirchenmusik bezüglichen Werke enthaltend.* (Supplement to *FB*.)
- DC1* Franz Xaver Witt, *Reden an den Cäcilien-Verein*, ed. Christoph Lickleder, Regensburg, 1983, Documenta Caeciliana 1.
- DC2* Franz Xaver Witt, *Das kgl. bayerische Cultus-Ministerium, die bayerische Abgeordneten-Kammer und der Cäcilien-Verein. 1. Abtheilung*, ed. Christoph Lickleder, Regensburg, 1983, Documenta Caeciliana 2.
- DC3* Christoph Lickleder, *Choral und figurierte Kirchenmusik in der Sicht Franz Xaver Witts anhand der 'Fliegenden Blätter' und der 'Musica sacra'*, Regensburg, 1988, Documenta Caeciliana 3.
- FB* *Fliegende Blätter für katholische Kirchen-Musik*
- HÄ* Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *Ästhetik*, ed. Friedrich Bassenge, 2 vols., 2nd edn, Berlin and Weimar, 1965.
- HSA* *Heinrich Heine Säkularausgabe*, ed. Fritz Mende *et al.*, 27 vols., Berlin and Paris, 1970–.

Cambridge University Press
 0521807379 - Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism
 in Nineteenth-Century Music

James Garratt
 Frontmatter

[More information](#)

- xiv *List of abbreviations*
- HSW* Johann Gottfried Herder, *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. Bernhard Suphan, 33 vols., Berlin, 1877–99; repr. Hildesheim, 1967–8.
- HW* *Die Ausbreitung des Historismus über die Musik: Aufsätze und Diskussionen*, ed. Walter Wiora, Regensburg, 1969, *Studien zur Musikgeschichte des 19. Jahrhunderts* 14.
- KFSA* *Kritische Friedrich-Schlegel-Ausgabe*, ed. Ernst Behler *et al.*, 35 vols., Munich, 1958–.
- KJb* *Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch*
- MGG* *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart. Allgemeine Enzyklopädie der Musik*, ed. Friedrich Blume, Kassel, 1949–68, 1973–9.
- MGG₂* *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart. Allgemeine Enzyklopädie der Musik begründet von Friedrich Blume*, 2nd edn, ed. Ludwig Finscher, Kassel and Stuttgart, 1994–.
- MS* *Musica sacra. Beiträge zur Reform und Förderung der katholischen Kirchen-Musik*
- NG* *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 20 vols., ed. Stanley Sadie, London, 1980.
- PGA* *Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrinas Werke. Erste kritisch durchgesehene Gesamtausgabe*, ed. Franz Xaver Haberl *et al.*, 33 vols., Leipzig, 1862–1903.
- PK₁* *Palestrina und die Kirchenmusik im 19. Jahrhundert*, vol. I: *Palestrina und die Idee der klassischen Vokalpolyphonie im 19. Jahrhundert: zur Geschichte eines kirchenmusikalischen Stilideals. Bericht über ein Symposium in Frankfurt am Main*, ed. Winfried Kirsch, Regensburg, 1989.
- PK₃* *Palestrina und die Kirchenmusik im 19. Jahrhundert*, vol. III: *Palestrina und die klassische Vokalpolyphonie als Vorbild kirchenmusikalischer Kompositionen im 19. Jahrhundert*, ed. Martina Janitzek and Winfried Kirsch, Kassel, 1995.
- POC* *Le opere complete di Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina*, ed. Raffaele Casimiri *et al.*, Rome, 1939–65, 1973–.
- RW* *Religiöse Musik in nicht-liturgischen Werken von Beethoven bis Reger*, ed. Walter Wiora, Regensburg, 1978, *Studien zur Musikgeschichte des 19. Jahrhunderts* 51.
- ZkK* *Zeitschrift für katholische Kirchenmusik*