PALESTRINA AND THE GERMAN
ROMANTIC IMAGINATION

Focusing on the reception of Palestrina, this bold interdisciplinary study explains how and why the works of a sixteenth-century composer came to be viewed as a paradigm for modern church music. It explores the diverse ways in which later composers responded to his works and style, and expounds a provocative new model for interpreting compositional historicism. In addition to presenting insights into the works of Bruckner, Mendelssohn and Liszt, the book offers new perspectives on the institutional, aesthetic and ideological frameworks sustaining the cultivation of choral music in this period. This is the first modern publication to provide an overview and analysis of the relation between the Palestrina revival and nineteenth-century composition, and it demonstrates that the Palestrina revival was just as significant for nineteenth-century culture as parallel movements in the other arts, such as the Gothic revival.

JAMES GARRATT is a lecturer in music at the National University of Ireland, Maynooth, specializing in nineteenth-century German music, aesthetics and culture. He is also active as a choral conductor.
CAMBRIDGE MUSICAL TEXTS AND MONOGRAPHS
General editors: John Butt and Laurence Dreyfus

This series has as its centres of interest the history of performance and the history of instruments. It includes annotated translations of authentic historical texts on music and monographs on various aspects of historical performance and instrument history.

Recent titles

John Butt
Bach Interpretation: Articulation Marks in the Sources of J. S. Bach
Nicholas Thistlethwaite
The Making of the Victorian Organ
Christopher Page (trans. and ed.)
Summa musice: A Thirteenth-Century Manual for Singers
Ardal Powell (trans. and ed.)
The Virtuoso Flute Player by Johann George Tromlitz
Beth Bullard (trans. and ed.)
Musica getutscht: A Treatise on Musical Instruments by Sebastian Virdung
David Rowland
A History of Pianoforte Pedalling
John Butt
Music Education and the Art of Performance in the German Baroque
Rebecca Harris Warrick and Carol Marsh
Musical Theatre at the Court of Louis XIV
Le Mariage de la Grosse Cathos
Julianne C. Baird (trans. and ed.)
Introduction to the Art of Singing by Johann Friedrich Agricola
Valerie Walden
One Hundred Years of Violoncello
A History of Technique and Performance Practice, 1740–1840
Bernard Brauchli
The Clavichord
Suzanne J. Beicken (trans. and ed.)
Vocal Performance and Ornamentation by Johann Adam Hiller
Hugh Macdonald (trans. and ed.)
Berlioz’s Orchestration Treatise

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
MUSICAL PERFORMANCE AND RECEPTION
General editors John Butt and Laurence Dreyfus

This series continues the aim of Cambridge Musical Texts and Monographs to publish books centred on the history of musical instruments and the history of performance, while broadening the focus to include musical reception in relation to performance and as a reflection of period expectations and practices.

Published titles

John Butt
Playing with History: The Historical Approach to Musical Performance

James Garratt
Palestrina and the German Romantic Imagination: Interpreting Historicism in Nineteenth-Century Music
PALESTRINA AND THE GERMAN ROMANTIC IMAGINATION

Interpreting Historicism in Nineteenth-Century Music

JAMES GARRATT
To my parents
Contents

Acknowledgements xi
List of abbreviations xiii

Introduction 1

1 Historicism in nineteenth-century art, aesthetics and culture
   Originality: consensus or controversy? 9
   ‘On the benefit and detriment of history’ 12
   Hegel, historicism and the ‘Decay and disintegration of Art’ 28

2 Romanticism and the problem of church music 36
   Hoffmann and the Romantic idealization of Palestrina 36
   Palestrina and the Romantic new mythology 47
   Palestrina and absolute vocal music 52
   Palestrina and the modern composer 57

3 The Protestant Palestrina revival 62
   Old Italian music, Bildung and the German Singvereine 62
   Quasi-liturgical music: Spohr and Nicolai 69
   Mendelssohn and the Berlin Palestrina revival 78
   Winterfeld and the historical Palestrina 93
   Broader trends in performance and composition 98
   Palestrina and the primacy of vocal music 109

4 The Catholic Palestrina revival 133
   Tradition and reform 133
   Witt and the Allgemeine Deutsche Cäcilien-Verein 144
   Broader trends in composition: Palestrinianism 161
   Completing Palestrina: Haberl, Haller and the Gesamtausgabe 168
   Liturgical function and aesthetic value 173
   Liszt, Bruckner and the Palestrina revival 181
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5 Palestrina in the concert hall</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palestrina in secular and non-liturgical music</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wagner’s ‘Stabat mater’ and the poetics of arrangement</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liszt, Wagner and allusion</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Interpreting the secondary discourse of</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nineteenth-century music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: 261  
Bibliography: 296  
Index: 311
Acknowledgements

The Palestrina revival has been at the centre of my concerns for the best part of a decade, and with this book I take leave – at least provisionally – of this fascinating and extraordinarily rich topic. I would like to thank everyone whose help and encouragement have sustained my work in this field. I first began exploring the Palestrina revival via an undergraduate dissertation on the church music of Liszt and Bruckner (the sole copy of which, thankfully, is in my possession), and must thank Roger Parker, John Warrack and Susan Wollenberg for stimulating my interest in this topic. Then, having moved from Oxford to the University of Wales Cardiff, I wrote my Ph.D. thesis under the title of the present book; my research would not have been possible without the financial support of a Research Studentship from Cardiff University. I am very grateful to everyone at Cardiff who gave advice and support, including Kenneth Gloag, Natasha Page, Robin Stowell, Stephen Walsh, Peter Williams and especially my doctoral supervisor, David Wyn Jones.

Although based on my Ph.D. dissertation, this book represents a substantial reworking of my initial ideas; I have also drawn on my more recent work on historiography and performance practice. Some of the new material has appeared in other publications: portions of chapters 3 and 6 were first published in my ‘Mendelssohn’s Babel: Romanticism and the Poetics of Translation’, *Music and Letters* 80 (1999), 23–49; portions of chapters 1 and 2 appeared in a different form in ‘Prophets Looking Backwards: German Romantic Historicism and the Representation of Renaissance Music’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125 (2000), 164–204; and various passages of the book (in the age of ‘copy and paste’, it is hard to be more specific) have appeared in ‘Performing Renaissance Church Music in Nineteenth-Century Germany: Issues and Challenges in the Study of Performative Reception’, *Music and Letters* 83 (2002), 187–236. I am grateful to the Städelisches Kunstinstitut und Städtische Galerie, Frankfurt am Main, for permission to reproduce Philipp Veit’s
Acknowledgements

Die Einführung der Künste in Deutschland durch das Christenthum (left panel: Italia) as the jacket illustration. This idealized representation of Italy (by an artist related to two of the protagonists in the book, Felix Mendelssohn and Friedrich Schlegel), provides a rich and inspiring metaphor for the present topic.

It was John Butt who suggested that I reshape my dissertation into a book, and I am very grateful to him and to Penny Souster for the enthusiasm with which they have pursued this project. I must also thank my colleagues at the National University of Ireland Maynooth for their advice and assistance, especially Barra Boydell, Patrick Devine and Gerard Gillen; in addition, I acknowledge with gratitude the work of all the librarians who have facilitated my research, especially the staff of the Music Department Resource Centre at Cardiff and of the Russell and John Paul II libraries at Maynooth. Most of all, I wish to thank Sinéad Dempsey, who not only typeset the music examples at the very last minute, but who – in its final stages – tolerated the book’s inexorable encroachment into what seemed like every minute of our lives.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AmZ</td>
<td>Leipzig Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CK</td>
<td>Caecilien Kalender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVC</td>
<td>Vereins-Catalog (Begonnen 1870.) Die von dem Referentencollegium des Cäcilien-Vereines für alle Länder deutscher Zunge in den ‘Vereins-Catalog’ aufgenommenen kirchenmusikalischen oder auf Kirchenmusik bezüglichen Werke enthaltend. (Supplement to FB.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC3</td>
<td>Christoph Lückeder, Choral und figurierte Kirchenmusik in der Sicht Franz Xaver Witts anhand der ‘Fliegenden Blätter’ und der ‘Musica sacra’, Regensburg, 1988, Documenta Caeciliana 3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FB</td>
<td>Fliegende Blätter für katholische Kirchen-Musik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSA</td>
<td>Heinrich Heine Sakularausgabe, ed. Fritz Mende et al., 27 vols., Berlin and Paris, 1970–.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KFSA</td>
<td><em>Kritische Friedrich-Schlegel-Ausgabe</em>, ed. Ernst Behler et al., 35 vols., Munich, 1958–.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K7b</td>
<td><em>Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td><em>Musica sacra. Beiträge zur Reform und Förderung der katholischen Kirchen-Musik</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZkK</td>
<td><em>Zeitschrift für katholische Kirchenmusik</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>