Learning to read in medieval Germany meant learning to read and understand Latin as well as the pupils’ own language. The teaching methods used in the medieval Abbey of St. Gall survive in the translations and commentaries of the monk, scholar and teacher Notker Labeo (ca. 950–1022). Notker’s pedagogic method, although deeply rooted in classical and monastic traditions, demonstrates revolutionary innovations that include providing translations in the pupils’ native German, supplying structural commentary in the form of simplified word order and punctuation, and furnishing special markers that helped readers to perform texts out loud. Anna Grotans examines this unique interplay between orality and literacy in Latin and Old High German, and illustrates her study with many examples from Notker’s manuscripts. This study has much to contribute to our knowledge of medieval reading, and of the relationship between Latin and the vernacular in a variety of formal and informal contexts.

Anna Grotans is Associate Professor of German at The Ohio State University, where she teaches medieval Germanic Studies and has served as Associate Director of the Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies. She is co-editor of *The St. Gall Tractate: A Classroom Guide to Rhetorical Syntax* (1995) and *De Consolatione Philologiae* (2000), and has published in the fields of Old High German, medieval paleography and text editing.
Cambridge Studies in Palaeography and Codicology

FOUNDED BY

Albinia de la Mare
Rosamond McKitterick  Newnham College, University of Cambridge

NEW SERIES

David Ganz  King’s College London
Teresa Webber  Trinity College, University of Cambridge

This series has been established to further the study of manuscripts from the Middle Ages to the Renaissance. It includes books devoted to particular types of manuscripts, their production and circulation, to individual codices of outstanding importance, and to regions, periods, and scripts of especial interest to scholars. The series will be of interest not only to scholars and students of medieval literature and history, but also to theologians, art historians, and others working with manuscript sources.

ALREADY PUBLISHED

Bernhard Bischoff, translated by Michael Gorman  Manuscripts and Libraries in the Age of Charlemagne

Richard Gameson  The Early Medieval Bible: Its Production, Decoration and Use

Nancy Netzer  Cultural Interplay in the Eighth Century: The Trier Gospels and the Making of a Scriptorium at Echternach

William Noel  The Harley Psalter

Charles F. Briggs  Giles of Rome’s De regimine principum: Reading and Writing Politics at Court and University, c. 1275–c. 1525

Leslie Brubaker  Vision and Meaning in Ninth-Century Byzantium: Image as Exegesis in the Homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus

Francis Newton  The Scriptorium and Library at Monte Cassino, 1058–1105

Lisa Fagin Davis  The Gottschalk Antiphonary: Music and Liturgy in Twelfth-Century Lambach

Albert Derolez  The Palaeography of Gothic Manuscript Books: From the Twelfth to the Early Sixteenth Century

Alison I. Beach  Women as Scribes: Book Production and Monastic Reform in Twelfth-Century Bavaria

Yitzhak Hen and Rob Meens, editors  The Bobbio Missal: Liturgy and Religious Culture in Merovingian Gaul

Marica Tacconi  Cathedral and Civic Ritual in Late Medieval and Renaissance Florence: The Service Books of Santa Maria del Fiore
Aviis carissimis, Helenae,
Antoniae, et Milae
Contents

List of plates ix
Acknowledgments xi
List of abbreviations xiii
Manuscript punctuation and other symbols xv

Introduction 1

1 Medieval reading 15
   Literacy and orality 15
   Grammatica and the classical past 23
   The monastic “present” 28
   Legibility and comprehension 33
   Reading and writing German 39

2 Education at St. Gall 49
   The St. Gall “schools,” pupils and teachers 53
   Teaching methods and curriculum 67
   Primary education 71
   Secondary education 76
   Tenth-century curricular changes 79
   Reading Notker’s texts 91
   The readers of Notker’s texts 101

3 Language use and choice 111
   Diglossia 112
   Ekkehard IV on language 121
   Languages of instruction 131
   The “natural method” 132
   The “eclectic method” 138
   Code-switching and Notker’s mixed prose 145
## Contents

4 The St. Gall Tractate 155  
	Tenth-century *lectio* 158  
	Structural analysis 161  
	Circumstances of action 161  
	The *ordo naturalis* 164  
	Sentence movement 173  
	Performance analysis 179  

5 Discretio in the classroom 199  
	Simplified word order 200  
	Syntactical punctuation 223  
	Performance cues and markers 226  
	Verbal performance cues 228  
	Graphic performance markers 235  

6 Accentus 249  
	Notker’s accentuation “system” 250  
	The “rules” 253  
	Exceptions to the “rules” 254  
	Sloppy scribes or shifting system? 261  
	Traditions of accentuation 267  
	The Latin context 267  
	Vernacular accentuation 275  
*Accentus* applied to reading in Notker’s texts 277  

7 Spelling for reading 285  
	Writing German 285  
	Notker’s “*Anlautgesetz*” 288  
	Classical and medieval *orthographia* and pronunciation 293  
	Alcuin’s spelling reform 297  
	Notker’s German spelling 300  
	Reading from written texts 302  
	The “*Anlautgesetz*” applied 307  

Bibliography 311  
Index of manuscripts 355  
General index 357
Plates

1. Latin/OHG grammatical terminology, St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 556, p. 401. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek.


3. An example of syntactical punctuation from Notker’s translation/commentary of the Latin De interpretatione (Ni 4). St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 818, p. 144. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek.


5. Marginal structural commentary in the hand of Ekkehard IV. The text is Eugyppius’ Thesaurus to Augustine. St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 176, p. 55. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek.


7. Correction of the “Anlautgesetz” in the copy of Notker’s translation/commentary of Boethius, De consolatione, III, m9 (Nb 149) in Zurich, Zentralbibliothek MS C121, f. 50r. Reproduced by permission of the Zurich Zentralbibliothek.
Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. 304
I am indebted to many friends and colleagues for their assistance, support, and encouragement throughout the course of this project. I owe a special debt of gratitude to my doctoral advisor and mentor, Evelyn S. Firchow, who first introduced me to Notker Labeo and has for many years encouraged and supported my research. Many a summer I spent with her in the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek and her summer cabin at “Fircoves,” discussing, debating, sharing and learning. Her guidance and friendship have been invaluable. Harold Anderson, Frank Coulson and David Porter offered their expert advice with difficult Latin and paleographical questions and provided valuable insights into early medieval pedagogy and glossing techniques. Frank Coulson, Nicholas Howe, Neil Jacobs, Hartwig Mayer, and Harry Vredeveld read parts of this study at various stages of its progress and offered helpful suggestions and comments. Conversations with Kathryn Corl, Rebecca Haidt, Nikolaus Henkel, Andrea and Wernfried Hofmeister, C. Stephen Jaeger, Christopher A. Jones, Anneli Luhtula, Haruko Momma, Malcolm Parkes, Harald Saller, Beat von Scarpadetti, Karl Schmuki, and Carin Ruff were insightful and encouraging. A special thanks to Ernst Hellgardt and the medievalists at the University of Munich for their support during my research year there. I would also like to thank Maartje Scheltens, Assistant Literature Editor, and Rosamond McKitterick, David Ganz and particularly Tessa Webber, my series editors at Cambridge University Press, through whose patience and expert criticism this book has been much improved. Thanks to Debby Banham for her expert copy-editing.

I am indebted to the late Peter Ochsenbein and the late Werner Vogler, who opened for me the doors of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek and Stiftsarchiv and were always willing to help me with materials and queries; Cornel Dora, Ruedi Widmer and the staff at the “Stibi” gave not only their support but also friendship. Thanks also go to the following libraries and directors for extending their research courtesies: the Zurich Zentralbibliothek, in particular Christoph Eggenberger and Marlis Stähli, the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich, the Deutsche Staatsbibliothek
Acknowledgments

in Berlin, and the Vatican Film Library at St. Louis University, in particular the late Charles Ermatinger.

For research support I am grateful to the Council for International Exchange of Scholars for a Fulbright Research Grant, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Mellon Foundation, the College of Humanities and the Department of Germanic Languages and Literatures at The Ohio State University.

Finally, I want to express my deepest gratitude to many friends, both here and abroad, who have supported me throughout this project: Ingrida Cazers, Jutta Groll, Peter, Katti and Bonzi Firchow, Peter and Beatrice Kalberer, Henriette Mäurer, Theresa Rabitsch, Jenny Shimp, Judith and Meinrad Unteregger, and Dorothea Waitz. The members of my family, in particular my parents John and Ilze Grotans, have been unfailing in their support and encouragement. This book is dedicated to my grandmothers, who did not live to see its completion.
Abbreviations

CCCC  Corpus Christi College, Cambridge
CCCM  Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis
CCM  Corpus Consuetudinum Monasticarum
CCSL  Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
CSEL  Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
DA  Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters
GL  Grammatici Latini
JEGP  Journal of English and Germanic Philology
MGH  Monumenta Germaniae Historica
Cap  Capitularia
Conc  Concilia
Epist  Epistolae
Poet  Poetae
SS  Scriptores (in folio)
SRGSch  Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi
SRM  Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum
MLN  Modern Language Notes
MLR  Modern Language Review
Nb  Notker Labeo, De consolatione Philosophiae
Nc  Notker Labeo, De nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii
Ncom  Notker Labeo, Computus
NcL  Latinus volume to Nc
Ndef  Notker Labeo, De definitione
Ndia  Notker Labeo, De dialectica
Ndis  Notker Labeo, Distributio
Ni  Notker Labeo, De interpretatione
Nk  Notker Labeo, De categoriis
Abbreviations

NkS  Notker Labeo, *Die kleineren Schriften*
NkSL  *Latinus* volume to NkS
NI  Notker Labeo, *De partibus logicae*
Nm  Notker Labeo, *De musica*
Np  Notker Labeo, *Psalter*
Nr  Notker Labeo, *De arte rhetorica*
Ns  Notker Labeo, *De syllogismis*
OE  Old English
OHG  Old High German
PBB  Beiträge zur deutschen Sprache und Literatur
PL  *Patrologia Latina*
SGT  Notker Labeo, *St. Gall Tractate*
ZfdA  Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum
ZfdPh  Zeitschrift für deutsche Philologie
Manuscript punctuation and other symbols

When citing texts from manuscripts, I follow the punctuation practice adopted by the ATB edition of Notker Labeo's works. The subdistinctio/media distinctio, a point on the line or slightly above the line, is represented by a period with a space before and after (e.g., “Subdistinctio est . punctus ad imam litteram”). A distinctio finalis, a high point above the line, is represented by a period with no preceding space (e.g., “Haec sententia est plena.”). The punctus interrogativus <.~> is rendered with the modern punctuation mark <.?> in text passages. Other punctuation and symbols used in this study are:

- \text{~} = \text{punctus elevatus}
- ; = \text{punctus versus}
- \text{~} or \text{\textdagger} = \text{punctus (circum)flexus}
- .~ = \text{punctus interrogativus}
- \text{.~} = \text{“heavy pointing” used at the end of paragraph}