The return of cultural treasures to their homelands has become the subject of heated public debate in recent years, highlighted by the controversial case of the so-called Elgin Marbles. In this important and pioneering work, Jeanette Greenfield analyses and discusses the historical, legal and political issues surrounding many similar cases, involving not only art treasures but also palaeontological and ethnomorphic materials, such as those belonging to the Australian Aborigine, the American Indian and the Greenland Inuit (Eskimo). The exploits of ‘collectors’ such as Aurel Stein and André Malraux are recounted. Dr Greenfield sheds new light on the Marbles debate, with surprising revelations about their removal and about Lord Elgin’s role in the matter. She discusses another highly significant case, that of the Icelandic manuscripts, the return of which set an international precedent. This is the first full account in English of the long and colourful campaign for their return from Denmark. Greenfield goes on to trace the museum and legal developments in North America, especially in the light of the widespread plunder of Mesoamerican archaeological finds, and the practice of Canada and the United States as a progressive model for cultural return. She concludes with some possible solutions to this difficult and emotive issue.

The second revised edition brought the story up to date, with a new chapter on art treasures and museums in Russia after the break-up of the Soviet Union. A further chapter considered the claims against the Vatican for the return of Hebrew manuscripts, and the saga of the Dead Sea Scrolls. The third revised edition completes the story of the Parthenon (Elgin) Marbles and the Icelandic saga manuscripts. The chapter on the art market deals with new issues related to art, archaeology and palaeontology, including dinosaurs. There are three additional chapters: ‘Plunder’ deals with European and Far Eastern spoils of war, stolen museum artefacts from Iraq and Afghanistan, antiquities smuggled from China, and disputes concerning famous paintings stolen by the Nazis; ‘The First People’ considers native rights of retrieval to relics and bones in America, Canada, Africa and Australia; ‘Ground Zero’ discusses the deliberate destruction of art such as occurred in Germany during the Hitler era and in China during the Cultural Revolution. It gives an account of the loss of the Bamiyan buddhas in Afghanistan and important art collections in New York on 9/11.

New cases define the on-going legal, political ethical and aesthetic debate about plunder, provenance, ownership, curating and return. Attention is drawn to the digitization of documentary material and hence the possibility of global repatriation. Some examples of this are projects at Cornell University, the Arnamagnaean and Ærni Magnússon Institutes, the Danish Royal Library and the British Library. The Internet facilitates shared knowledge and linked sites. Laser technology makes perfect copies possible. ‘Virtual’ reconstruction raises the prospect of the ‘restoration’ of lost sites.

Dealing with every aspect of who owns the past, The Return of Cultural Treasures is essential reading for anyone concerned with cultural property. This is an extremely readable account with more than 130 striking illustrations. The select bibliography, including related web sites, makes this an enduring reference work. The interdisciplinary approach makes it accessible to a wide range of readers interested in cultural heritage, archaeology and anthropology, museums, art history, the art market and international law.
THE RETURN OF CULTURAL TREASURES

Third edition

JEANETTE GREENFIELD
Contents

List of illustrations page vi
Preface to the first edition xiii
Preface to the second edition xv
Preface to the third edition xvii
Acknowledgements xix
List of abbreviations xxii

1. The Icelandic manuscripts 13
2. The Elgin Marbles debate 41
3. British and other European practice 97
4. Some British cases 116
5. American and Canadian practice 154
6. Russia and the former Soviet Union 183
7. The Hebrew manuscripts 206
8. International and regional regulation 222
9. Art theft and the art market 238
10. Plunder 263
11. The First People 300
12. Ground zero 343
13. Homecomings: real and virtual 364

Notes 444
List of appendices in microfiche in first edition (1989) 470
List of additional documents referred to 472
Select bibliography 474
Selected web sites 485
Index 487
Illustrations

Frontispiece: The Benin Expedition (The Sphere magazine cover, 24 April 1897; The Illustrated London News Picture Library)

1. Flateyjarbók. Saga of St Olaf
   page 14
2. Flateyjarbók. Grænlendinga Saga (Jónas Kristjánsson; Stofnun Árna Magnússonar, Reykjavík)
   15
3. Codex Regius: the Edda
   16
4. Arrival of manuscripts at Reykjavík Harbour, 21 April 1971
   18
5. Handing over the manuscripts from Denmark to Iceland
   19
6. Page from Gráskinna (Stofnun Árna Magnússonar, Reykjavík)
   37
7. The Parthenon (photograph by Alfred Eisenstadt, Time Life, New York)
   42
8. Plan of the western part of the Acropolis as it existed at the end of the fifth century BC
   43
9. 'Pillars of the Parthenon' (photograph by Edward Steichen, 1921, Museum of Modern Art, New York; reproduced by permission of Joanna Steichen)
   44
10. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, west (left side)
    45
11. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, west (right side)
    45
12. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, east (left side)
    46
13. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, east (right side)
    (Jacques Carrey drawings 10–13 preserved in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris)
    46
14. A view of the east end of the Parthenon showing the position of pediments, metopes and frieze
    47
15. Parthenon Marbles, North frieze, Slabs XXXV–XXXVIII
    48
16. Parthenon Marbles, North frieze, Slab XLII
    49
17. Parthenon Marbles, east pediment
    50
Illustrations

18. Parthenon Marbles, east pediment, Horse of Selene (photographs 15–18 by David Finn and reproduced with his permission) 52
19. The Duveen Gallery (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum) 60
20. JAK cartoon portraying British Museum Trustees besieged by Melina Mercouri (reproduced with kind permission of the Evening Standard) 69
21. The pediments. Drawings of the reconstruction in Basel by Ernst Berger, combining extant fragments with Carrey’s drawings – west and east 72
22. Slabs of frieze separated in London and Athens (photograph by and courtesy of Socratis Mavrommatis) 91
23. The Acropolis restoration (photograph by and courtesy of Socratis Mavrommatis) 95
24. Tomb poles from Melville Island (Vatican Ethnological Museum) 101
25. Totemistic emblem on stone, dingo (Vatican Ethnological Museum) 102
26. Totemistic emblem on stone, emu (Vatican Ethnological Museum) 102
27. Totemistic emblem on stone, snake (Vatican Ethnological Museum) (photographs 24–7 by Fiona McDougall) 102
28. Relief of Kumasi (The Sphere, 21 July 1900; The Illustrated London News Picture Library) 120
29. Ashanti gold mask (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the Wallace Collection) 121
30. Benin punitive expedition, 1897 (Pitt-Rivers Museum, Oxford) 123
31. Benin punitive expedition, 1897 (photograph by expedition member Rear Admiral Mearsham, 1897) 124
32. Collection of plaques deposited in British Museum (The Illustrated London News, October 1897) 126
33. Benin plaque: tattooed boys with necklaces (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum) 127
34. Benin plaques: crocodile catching fish, and warrior bearing sword (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum) 128
35. Ranjit Singh’s throne (Victoria and Albert Museum) 132
36. (A) Diagram of the Buddhist caves at Tunhuang (B) Ancient scrolls from Tunhuang grotto 17 (photograph by Sir Aurel Stein) (C) Old Chinese manuscripts and block prints from walled-up Temple Library of ‘Thousand Buddhas’ site (Ruins of Desert Cathay, 1912) 138
37. The Taranaki panels (National Museum of New Zealand, Wellington) 143
Illustrations

38. London (Pathur) Śivapuram Natarāja (photograph courtesy of the Indian High Commission, London) 149
39. Mayan stela: Jimbal Stela 1, Tikal project, 1965, Guatemala (photographs by Christopher Jones and Joya Hairs) 157
40. Mayan stela: Machaquila Stela 2, in the Hollinshead case (photograph by Ian Graham) 160
41. Tlingit Whale House, 1895 (Winter and Pond Collection, Alaska State Library) 175
42. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: pipe bowl 178
43. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: mittens 178
44. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: moccasins 178
45. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: saddle 178
46. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: container 178
47. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: pouch (photographs 42–7 courtesy of National Museums of Canada) 178
49. The Amber Room restoration awaits the last two panels (photograph by Yuri Kozyrev) 187
50. Cézanne’s Bathers, Vanity Fair, collection of the Hermitage 191
51. Schliemann’s Treasure of Troy, terracotta 198
52. Schliemann’s Treasure of Troy, jewellery (photographs 51–2 The Illustrated London News, 5 January 1878) 199
53. Schliemann’s treasure exhibited in St Petersburg (EPA/photograph by Anatoly Maltsev) 200
54. Fabergé egg (Getty Images, photograph by Yuri Kabodnov, Getty Images/AFP) 204
55. Canon of Medicine of Avicenna, Book 1 (Foto Roncaglia, Biblioteca Universitaria, Bologna) 208
56. Page from Sefer ha Terumah, twelfth century (reproduced by permission of Dr Manfred Lehmann) 211
57. Copper Scroll 218
58. Cutting the Copper Scroll at Manchester University (photographs 57–8 The Manchester Museum, by permission of the Estate of John Allegro) 219
59. Four bronze horses of San Marco 239
60. Museum paintings in a cave at Merkers, 1945 241
61. Edouard Manet’s Wintergarden in a cave at Merkers, 1945 242
62. SS loot, Merkers, 1945 243
63. Florentine art treasures returned, 1945 244
64. Fanfare in Piazza della Signoria on return of Florentine treasures (photographs 59–64 courtesy of the National Archives, Washington) 245
Illustrations

65. Bronze tiger, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan), Beijing (Sotheby’s Picture Library) 255
66. Bronze ox, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan), Beijing (Christie’s Picture Library) 256
67. Bronze monkey, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan), Beijing (Christie’s Picture Library) 256
68. Warka White Lady, Baghdad Museum 265
69. Sacred Vase of Warka, Baghdad Museum 266
70. Waving looters at Isin, Iraq (photograph by and courtesy of Professor John Russell) 268
71. Portrait of Adele Bloch-Bauer (Klimt) (photograph Rudi Blaha, Associated Press) 284
72. Portrait of Dr Gachet (Van Gogh) (Christie’s Picture Library) 288
73. View of Krumau (Schiele) (Sotheby’s Picture Library) 294
74. Boomerang and corroboree tree, Victoria (The Age, Melbourne) 301
75. The ‘extinct’ Tasmanian aborigines (The Illustrated London News, September 1924) 303
76. Dja Dja Wurrung bark etchings (Fairfax Photographs, photograph by Craig Abraham) 306
77. Mjoeberg’s bone collections from Australia (Getty Images/AFP, photograph by Sven Nackstrand) 311
78. Lakota ghost shirt (photograph by Jeff Mitchell, Reuters) 313
79. Long Wolf returns home to Dakota (NI Syndication, The Times, photograph by Eddie Mulholland) 317
80. Haisla pole to be returned to Canada from Sweden (Ethnographic Museum, Stockholm) 319
81. ‘Broken Hill Man’, skull (Zambia) (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum) 339
82. Double Check, John Seward Johnson (Magnum Photographs, photograph by Susan Meiselas) 345
83. The Three Shades, Rodin from the Gates of Hell (Cantor Fitzgerald Collection) 346
84. Ruined Rodin figure from the group The Three Shades (Associated Press, photograph by Kathy Willens) 346
85. Bamiyan buddha (photograph Network Photographs) 348
86. Destruction of Bamiyan buddhas (CNN Photographs, Getty Images) 349
87. Ecuadorian objects returned from Italy, 1983 370
88. Display of Ecuadorian objects returned from Italy (photographs Museo Arqueologico y Galerias de Arte del Banco Central del Ecuador, Quito) 370
89. Toltec engraved disc of jadeite returned to Mexico from the Peabody Museum, Harvard (Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University; photograph by Hillel Burger) 372
Illustrations

90. Prajñāpāramitā statue returned to Indonesia from the Netherlands (National Museum of Ethnology, Leiden)

91. Canoe prow returned to Solomon Islands by Australia (Trustees of the Australian Museum)

92. ‘Missing Links’ exhibition: stirrup vessel in form of fish boat

93. ‘Missing Links’ exhibition: gold masks and beaten gold ornaments

94. ‘Missing Links’ exhibition: stirrup vessel – frogs

95. ‘Missing Links’ exhibition: stirrup vessel – heads

96. ‘Missing Links’ exhibition: silver vases and chrysolyte beads (photographs 92–6 courtesy of the Embassy of Peru, Washington DC)

97. Segesser II, painting from the New World (photograph by Arthur Taylor; reproduced by permission of the Museum of New Mexico, the Palace of the Governors)

98. Warrior bird mural returned to Mexico (M. H. de Young Memorial Museum, the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco)

99. Mary Leakey delivering Proconsul africanus to London from Kenya (photograph from British Airways Press Library)

100. Return of Nefertari to Egypt (EMPICS, photograph by Andrew Parsons)

101. Campeche temple facade returned by Metropolitan Museum of Art to Mexico (reproduced with permission of Joseph Veach Noble)

102. Śivapuram Natarāja statue returned to India from Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena (Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena; photograph by Lee Boltin)

103. Aztec codex (Tonalamatl Aubin) taken from Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris to Mexico (photograph Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris)


105. André Malraux (photograph from Roger-Viollet, Paris, from the Albert Harlingue collection)

106. Page from 1924 L’Impartial, Saigon, showing bas-reliefs from Bantea-Srei (Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Annexe de Versailles)

107. Cambodia, riverbed bas-reliefs, Kbal Spean (photograph by Caroline Gluck)

108. Cambodia, riverbed bas-reliefs, Kbal Spean (photograph by Caroline Gluck)

109. Part of the Hooper collection purchased by the Museum of Tahiti and the Islands: pillow

110. Hooper Collection: breast ornament

111. Hooper Collection: adze
Illustrations

112. Hooper Collection: breadfruit splitter
   (photographs 109–14 courtesy of Musée de Tahiti et des Îles, Christie’s London, A. C. Cooper Ltd) 400
113. Hooper Collection: bark cloth beaters
114. Hooper Collection: fan
   (photographs 109–14 courtesy of Musée de Tahiti et des Îles, Christie’s London, A. C. Cooper Ltd) 400
115. Neo-Sumerian Ur-Ningirsu statue joined together by the Louvre and Metropolitan Museum (courtesy of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York) 402
116. Ur-Ningirsu: head (courtesy of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York) 403
117. Ur-Ningirsu: body (Louvre Museum, Paris, Musées Nationaux) 403
118. Mahler manuscript (Sotheby’s Picture Library) 405
119. Assyrian sculpture (Canford School) 407
120. Mexican stone rattlesnake, stored by British Museum (photograph by James Mortimer) 413
121. Papua New Guinea masks, stored by British Museum (photograph by James Mortimer) 414
122. 'Looty' the Pekingese dog taken from Summer Palace (Illustrated London News, 15 June 1861) 415
123. Missing Dorak treasure (The Illustrated London News, Supplement, 28 November 1939) 416
124. Missing Peking Man (photograph by A. Singer; reproduced by permission of the Department of Library Services, American Museum of Natural History, New York) 418
125. Missing Peking Man reconstruction (reproduced by permission of the Department of Library Services, American Museum of Natural History, New York) 418
126. Sphinx Ptolemy XII Auletes, marine find at Alexandria (NI Syndication, The Times, photograph by Gill Allen) 421
127. Objects from the alleged Croesus gold, otherwise known as the Lydian Hoard (photographs courtesy of Metropolitan Museum, New York: bowl, Mrs Charles S. Payson Gift, 1966 (66.11.21); wine jug, Rogers Fund, 1966 (66.11.23)) 422
128. Chagall, Study for Over Vitebsk (photograph Associated Press The Jewish Museum) 425
129. Dinosaur, *Tyrannosaurus rex* ‘Sue’ (Getty Images/EPA, Photograph by Stan Honda) 426
130. Australian minister hands dinosaur eggs back to China (Fairfax Photographs, photograph by Pat Scala) 429
131. Dorset dinosaur fossil, *Scelidosaurus*, UK (photograph Les W. Wilson, with kind permission of David Sole) 430
132. Guernica by Picasso returned to the Prado Museum by the Museum of Modern Art, New York (Prado Museum; DACS, Design and Artists Copyright Society Limited) 432
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustrations</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>133. London Bridge, sold to Texas, 1968 (photograph by Tom Hanley)</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134. The Scream (Nasjonalgalleriet, Oslo)</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>135. The Mona Lisa examined by French officials (reproduced by permission of Range/Bettman Pictures)</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136. Postcard of Mona Lisa (Milan 1913)</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>137. Manuscript of Archimedes Principle (Associated Press, photograph by Lefteris Pitarakis)</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>138. Virtual site – Jerusalem Archaeological Park (web page)</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>139. British paintings hidden from wartime bombing (photograph, the National Gallery)</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preface to the first edition

A visit in 1980 to the caves of Tunhuang, China, denuded of their scrolls and Buddhist manuscripts by Aurel Stein over seventy years earlier; a book of essays by Magnus Magnusson, one of which described the elation in the 1970s at the return of Iceland’s greatest national treasures, the medieval saga manuscripts; the unending debate over the cause célèbre of cultural return cases, the Elgin Marbles; fascination with the magic of archaeology; curiosity about ethnology and the museum and art collecting phenomenon; international chagrin over the unresolved claims and contentions of cultural return; historic and contemporary resolutions to this dilemma; and the perspectives of international law. These are the main threads woven into the fabric of this book.

But despite its title this is not a book about emptying the great museums of the world of their many treasures. ‘Return’ is part of a wider movement of cultural treasures and need not only mean restitution in the sense of reparation for wrongful taking. It may also refer to other kinds of restoration, reinstatement, and even rejuvenation and reunification. Inevitably museums are often central to this issue. What emerges is that objects ‘migrate’ sometimes legitimately and sometimes not. There are historical, political, legal, material and aesthetic considerations which govern this. A congruent feature of war, colonialism, missionary and archaeological expeditions and other cataclysmic events has been the transportation of art treasures on a global scale. Sometimes objects have also been peacefully and uncontroversially collected and bought. Such movements are a fascinating reflector of human history. Hardly a nation or tribe has remained untouched by this experience. All manner of individuals have participated, from common looters to men who attained high rank and office. The route of objects has sometimes been no less colourful and dramatic than that of the persons who initiated their journey.

There is a distinction to be made between historically removed treasures and the contemporary illicit traffic in art objects. The issue of return should be determined on the criteria of the means of acquisition and the nature of the object. This book makes out a case primarily on historic and aesthetic grounds, but within a legal framework, for the return of certain kinds of objects. It points out that such ‘returns’ have taken place under different guises in the past and that it is by no means a novel occurrence setting into motion unacceptable precedents. The role to be played by the scholars and conservators in the great institutions in
this course of action is not to be underestimated. A purely politicized view of the locations of cultural treasures can be shown to be quite futile, as evidenced by the many instances of wasteful returns resulting only in the reappearance of the same treasures on the international art market. A legalistic approach can be applied as leverage in obtaining returns or stemming the illicit flow of art treasures. The United States especially has followed that course of action, whereas the United Kingdom has no such approach. European institutions remain conservative while the Oceanic countries, such as Australia and New Zealand, take a more liberal view.

The issue of cultural return remains a perennial one which arouses passions and emotive argument, often because it is connected more with a restitution aspect than any other, and connected too with the existential dilemma of identity. There are cynical and material aspects, but the issue also has something to do with the charisma of objects and their language, or semiology. They represent creativity, continuity, and concreteness in the face of what is evanescent.

On the whole it has to be said that there is in this matter no magnanimity without duress, no voluntary codes applied voluntarily, no easy restoration of loaned materials recalled, no internationally accepted code of practice, no simple formulas to resolve cultural return.

There is a romantic, educative, inspirational aspect to museums. But there is another. It serves us well to remember that the Prague Museum of Judaica, which contains an unparalleled collection, was established by the Nazis and called the ‘museum of an extinct race’. The Tasmanian Aboriginal Centre in 1985, seeking the return of the human remains of their people, were informed by the National History Museum of Vienna that the Tasmanian aborigines are ‘extinct’.

This book deliberately crosses ‘territories’ in more than one sense in order to understand a phenomenon which has been debated for hundreds of years and to appreciate the real worth of the objects fought over. Sometimes enlightened cooperation emerges and the result can be a noble one, as in the case of the Icelandic manuscripts returned from Denmark. In the words of Iceland’s Literary Nobel Laureate, Halldór Laxness, without the sagas Iceland would have remained ‘as just another Danish island’.

Jeanette Greenfield
Since this book was first published at the end of 1989 the world has seen momentous political change, such as the extinction of Soviet communism and South African apartheid. There has also been widespread catastrophic human displacement in Europe and Africa and more barbarian destruction and cultural loss especially in Eastern Europe – notably in the Ukraine, the former Czechoslovakia and the former Yugoslavia. So many new states have been created in addition to a reunited Germany that cartographers have temporarily abdicated. The emergence of Russia and its new accessibility through the ending of the Soviet State have generated more questions than answers about many missing treasures, both Russian and foreign, and there are also new challenges to its national cultural monuments. Cultural iconography changes with lost ideology, and the former worth of things evaporates. Now massive sculptural monuments to former Soviet icons have been pulled from their plinths and lie broken in the dust like Shelley’s ‘Ozymandias’, irrespective of their aesthetic merit. The sometimes Orwellian demands of the state as the true guardian of cultural heritage are still made against the individual. Thus, Olga Ivinskaya, the model for Lara in the book *Dr Zhivago*, could not retrieve the love letters she wrote so many decades ago to the Russian Nobel prize winner Boris Pasternak. Once confiscated as inimical to the state they are now retained as its cultural property. The uphill task of making cultural progress in this area seems Sisyphean.

Yet ideas about past wrongs, cultural completeness and the rights of indigenous peoples continued to be reappraised. Cultural angst is being re-evaluated, and this now permeates contemporary thought. Cultural raiders are always at work. Theft is pandemic. But clarity of provenance can no longer be ignored. For instance, the Vatican has now established formal relations with the Jewish state of Israel; but the Papal role over hundreds of years in the collection and destruction of Hebrew manuscripts is being questioned. Elsewhere, focused efforts have resulted in some largely unexpected cultural returns such as that of the Lydian Hoard (*Croesus gold*) from the Metropolitan Museum in New York to Turkey, and the return of many human relics to Australian Aborigines, Greenland Eskimos, and North...
Preface to the second edition

American Indians. The Sisyphean boulder of cultural meaning has been rolled forward.

Jeanette Greenfield
1994
After the Cold War ended in the 1990s other dangers emerged. Shakespeare’s Julius Ceasar proclaimed ‘Cry havoc and let slip the dogs of war’. The havoc of fire, sword and famine have been let loose again, from the terror attack on 9/11 (2001) in New York to the wars in Afghanistan and Iraq and Africa. The deliberate destruction of the Bamiyan buddhas in Afghanistan was a prelude to the descent into archaeological and museum plunder and murder. Crimes of intolerance and natural catastrophes have rendered the certainties of cultural preservation more fragile. The beginning of the third millennium was thus marked by the need to reconsider the issues of cultural war and of recovery and salvage.

The hallmark of the advances made since the second edition of this book has been the heightened awareness of the rights of indigenous peoples to the restoration of their cultural heritage through the retrieval of their relics and bones. It is recognized that the deliberate removal of cultural treasures from vulnerable aboriginal peoples was intended to obliterate their cultural identity. A dedicated Museum of the American Indian has been established in Washington. Australia has successfully persuaded a number of institutions in the United Kingdom to return aboriginal bones. Sweden has been at the forefront of enlightened indigenous returns to Australia and Canada. The Glasgow Council and Kelvingrove Museum returned a Lakota ghost shirt to the Sioux Indians and the South Dakota Museum. In America important legal decisions have been made to prescribe the correct balance between Native American rights to bones and artefacts and the rights of archaeologists to scientific research.

More than fifty years after the Second World War the continued right of the individual to collect and own art, contrary to earlier Nazi laws, and the right to restitution for misappropriation, has been internationally recognized. Museums have had to review globally the legitimacy of their holdings. In particular American courts have recognized descendants’ claims to Nazi-plundered art as human rights issues connected to genocide and hence without time limit. Many famous paintings, such as the Gustav Klimt Portrait of Adele Bloch-Bauer in the Altmann case, or Egon Schiele’s View of Kramau, have been sought. They have served as a poignant reminder of the lives of the family owners whose stories have become part of the life of the paintings.

As a major art market destination America has set the benchmark in establishing bilateral arrangements with archaeologically rich countries to prevent
contemporary illicit export. However the old question of wartime-acquired ‘trophy’ art has not been resolved between Russia and Germany because of the arguments over mutual repatriation. Some prominent museums have resisted the notion of the return of historically removed objects by espousing a concept of the ‘universal museum’. This contrasts with the desire of countries such as China, which will take any steps necessary to retrieve its cultural heritage irrespective of when it was lost.

The matter of return is now a widely accepted heritage issue. The international practice of cultural rescue, restitution and return by many means and for different reasons has evolved. The Internet facilitates the creation of data bases and the tracking of stolen objects. The prospect of global reunification and repatriation through digitization projects such as those involving the Danish Royal Library, Cornell University, the British Library, the Arnamagnæan and Árni Magnússon Institutes and others has broadened the concept of ‘return’. The new technologies have made possible collaborative preservation projects such as that between the Mellon Foundation and the Tunhuang Institute. Virtual reconstructions of objects and sites such as Jerusalem mean that the greatest cultural treasures may be preserved and so ‘returned’ in perpetuity to the mind’s eye.

Nazi genocide, the Cultural Revolution in China, and the 9/11 attack on New York in 2001 reveal how crimes against people connect to crimes against art. Einstein once said ‘He who cherishes the values of culture cannot fail to be a pacifist.’ When the Iraq war erupted in 2003 the concerns of international scholars who petitioned the United Nations and UNESCO for the preservation of archaeological sites and museum collections of world importance were ignored. The deliberate destruction of art of recognized stature is held in America to be an offence against the artist. Such acts ought to be viewed as crimes against the artist and civilization, and wherever they occur they are the storm warning.

Jeanette Greenfield
2005
Acknowledgements

I am indebted to the late Glyn Daniel, Emeritus Disney Professor of Archaeology, University of Cambridge, who read the original draft and whose comments and observations were illuminating.

I also wish to express my indebtedness to the many individuals and institutions who directly or indirectly contributed to the content of the first edition of this book, and in particular: Jónas Kristjánsson, Director of the Manuscript Institute, Reykjavík, and Magnus Magnusson, broadcaster, for assisting me with access to the Icelandic and Danish materials, and for their invaluable corrections and advice concerning the account of the return of the Icelandic manuscripts; Sir David Wilson, Director of the British Museum, and Janet Wallace, archivist at the British Museum, for access to, and assistance with, documents relating to the Elgin Marbles and the Benin collection; Harry Prasad, archivist at the Museum of Mankind, for access to the archives; David Lance of the National Museum of Australia, and Michael Mansell of the Aboriginal Legal Service, Hobart, for furnishing significant additional information on the matter of aboriginal relics; David Collison, film producer, for access to preparation materials for the BBC Tribal Eye series; Susie Wong, London, for assistance on Chinese and other Asian source materials; Peter Thompson of the Press Office, Greek Embassy, London, for providing detailed information about the Parthenon and the Greek case; Geraldine Norman, The Times saleroom correspondent, for permitting me to consult her in her area of expertise and in particular in relation to the art market map; Yudhisthir Raj Isar, Catherine André-Verdellen and Christine Wilkinson, Division of Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, Paris, and Claude Chopelet, archive section, Division of Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, Paris, for assistance with obtaining all the relevant UNESCO documents and the UNESCO bibliography which appears on the fiche; Adrian Butler of the Council of Europe, Strasbourg, Press and Information Services, for assistance with obtaining Council of Europe documents; Ron Swerczek of the Washington Archives, for assistance in obtaining photographic copies of US documents; Mr Ashok Mehta, First Secretary for Trade, High Commission for India, London, for permitting me to have the transcript of the 1988 London Natarāja High Court case; David Finn, New York, Joseph Noble, New York, Christopher Jones, University of Pennsylvania, and Ian Graham, Harvard University, for generously contributing their photographs to the book; Luis Ponce, Alfonso Espinosa and Rosa Maria Wallach, Cultural
 Acknowledgements

Department of the Peruvian Embassy, Washington, Elizabeth Simpson of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Rosangela Adoum, Jefe de la Unidad Fondo Arquelogico, Ecuador, Sara Campbell and Cheryl Barton of the Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena, Dave Phillips, Palace of the Governors, Museum of New Mexico, and Charlene Androes of Stanford University Press for assistance in securing photographs contributed to the book; Professor Robert J. Sharer, University of Pennsylvania; Barbara Isaac, Peabody Museum, Harvard University; Chris Kirby, National Museums of Canada, Ottawa, for assistance in locating specific photographic material; Marie Claire Quiquemelle, Paris, for assistance in researching the André Malraux pictures; Hermione Waterfield, director of the Tribal Art Department, Christie’s, London, for her expertise in locating the relevant photographs from the Hooper Collection; Neeta Mainee of Zaiwalla and Co. for providing the photograph of the London Nataraja; Elin Gerslund, Cambridge, for a detailed translation of the Danish legal cases and parliamentary debates; Inger Glahn, Danish Embassy, London, for assistance with Danish terms; Paul Kuek, Melbourne, for Figs. 8, 14 and 20 and all the map drawings; Anne Robinson, Oxford, for her expertise in typing the manuscript; Vera Madan, London, for computer-setting the index.

For this first edition my thanks to my editor at Cambridge University Press, Peter Richards.

For the second edition of this book, I would also like to add my thanks to Professor Elizabeth Simpson who chaired the international symposium ‘The Spoils of War’ at the Bard Graduate Center for Studies in the Decorative Arts, New York, 19–21 January 1995. This provided a memorable and stimulating discussion of postwar cultural recovery issues. The Russian–German dialogue in particular has partly informed the additional chapter on Russia.

I thank Manfred Lehmann of New York for allowing me access to primary materials for the additional chapter on Hebrew manuscripts, and for his comments and corrections.

I also thank Dr Jessica Kuper, my editor at the Cambridge University Press, Dr Anne Dunbar-Nobes for the meticulous copy-editing, and Magnus Magnusson for reading and correcting all of the new material for this edition.

Professor Ian Brownlie CBE, Oxford University once observed that this book was amongst other things a law book with pictures. In this third edition its international law aspect continues to owe much to him and the late Sir Robbie Jennings, Cambridge University.

For this edition of the book my thanks for permitting the use of their images go to Socratis Mavrommatis, Professor John Russell, Caroline Gluck, and Les Wilson. Also thanks to Sue Daly for locating the images in Sotheby’s picture library and additional literature relating to the sale of the Mahler manuscript, and to Stella Calvert-Smith for locating the images in Christie’s picture library.

Thanks to Professor Elizabeth Simpson, Bard Graduate Centre for Studies in the Decorative Arts, New York, for comments on the additional Near Eastern content; Nadia Tarzi of the Association for the Protection of Afghan Archaeology
Acknowledgements

for comments on the Afghanistan material; Maurice Davies, Deputy Director of the Museums Association for information about the work of the former (UK) Museums and Galleries Commission; Joanne Inciardi, Corporate Art Curator at Cantor Fitzgerald, New York, for information regarding the 9/11 (2001) losses; Ivan Boserup, Keeper of Manuscripts and Rare Books, the Royal Library, Copenhagen, for information regarding library digitization projects, and Dr Mathew Driscoll, Arnamagnaeon Institute, University of Copenhagen, for the update on the digitization of the Árni Magnússon collection of Icelandic manuscripts; to Jongsok Kim, Senior Curator, National Folk Museum of Korea, Seoul, for sources relating to the Korean content; Professor Chung-wen Shih, George Washington University, for comments on the Cultural Revolution; and to Susie Wong MBE, London, for the sources and insights into the material relating to China.

For this third edition thanks to Frances Nugent for the expert copy editing, and production editors Jayne Aldhouse and Jodie Barnes.

I also thank Simon Whitmore and Sarah Parker, my editors at Cambridge University Press, and Magnus Magnusson KBE for reading and correcting all of the new material for this edition.
Abbreviations

All ER  All England Law Reports
All LR  Alberta Law Reports
EEC  European Economic Community
F.2d  Federal Reporter 2d Series
ICJ  International Court of Justice
ICOM  International Council of Museums
ILR  International Law Reports
Interpol  International Criminal Police Organization
IOPA  International Organization for the Protection of Works of Art
JHS  Journal of Hellenic Studies
MR  Master of the Rolls
TLR  Times Law Reports
UN  United Nations
UNESCO  United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNIDROIT  International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
UNTS  United Nations Treaty Series
USC  United States Code

ON THE UNESCO DOCUMENTS

CLT  Culture Section Series
CONF or C  Conference
CC  Culture and Communications (Section)
COM  Communications (Section)

TERMS RELATING TO INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS

Signature: to sign and authenticate (prior to agreement becoming binding)
Ratification: confirmation of previous act not formerly binding (done by state parliament or equivalent)
Accession: absolute or conditional acceptance by one or several states of a treaty already concluded between other states

xxii