

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

“Characteristic” is the most common of several terms used in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries to indicate instrumental music in which a subject is specified, usually by a text. Over 225 orchestral works qualify, some with sentences and paragraphs describing each of several movements, or what modern listeners would call a program, and others with only a word or two characterizing a single movement or a whole work (see Appendixes 1 and 2, pp. 249–98 below). They are “symphonies” according to the way in which the word was used at the time, to encompass orchestral pieces of many shapes and sizes rather than solely the three- and four-movement examples that match later conceptions of the genre.¹ The disparity in their texts reflects varying compositional ambitions as well as chronological development, the more elaborate characterizations appearing mostly after 1770 and then with increasing frequency as the years pass.

But however long their texts and whatever their length or structure, symphonies bearing written characterizations in the years 1750–1815 are drawn together by a marked affinity for a few common subjects. Titles consisting of only one or a few words identify over 70 examples as pastoral (Appendix 2), 15 as military, 15 as hunts, 10 as storms, and more than 30 as expressions of national or regional characters – in sum, nearly 150 symphonies or movements as representations of five subject categories (Appendix 3a–d). The lengthier descriptions incorporate the same ingredients into scenarios original to the composers or adapted from literature and current events (Appendix 3e–f). Beethoven’s *Pastoral* Symphony (1808) and related works combine multiple pastoral scenes with storms, and his *Wellington’s Victory* (1813) belongs to a tradition (at least 16 works for orchestra and over 150 for other instrumental scorings) that absorbs the military style, pastoral interludes, storms, and all variety of national songs and dances into enactments of battles. In the *Werther* of Gaetano Pugnani (1795), the *Télémaques* of

¹ Neal Zaslaw, “Mozart, Haydn, and the *Sinfonia da chiesa*,” *Journal of Musicology* 1 (1982): 106–07; see also pp. 5–8 below. Throughout this book I use “symphony” in this broad sense and indicate when the reference is specifically to three- and four-movement works.

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*The characteristic symphony*

Ignazio Raimondi (1777) and Antonio Rosetti (1791?), and the twelve symphonies on Ovid's *Metamorphoses* of Carl Ditters von Dittersdorf (1781–86), further pastoral settings along with storms (in Goethe and Fénelon) and hunts and battles (in Ovid) keep the focus on familiar topics. The characteristic symphony is first and foremost a genre of pastoral idylls, thunderstorms, military conflicts, hunts, and political identities.

Each of these subjects encompasses such diverse meanings that the possibilities for interpretation are inexhaustible: no two pastoral symphonies are quite the same despite their shared reliance on a single musical style. In addition, settings and events serve often as a pretext for introducing a second set of subjects, the human emotions, whose qualities and change over time are a preoccupation that envelops works of many kinds. In the tradition of an eighteenth-century keyboard genre known as the “character piece,” some symphonies represent feelings in the abstract: Dittersdorf's *Il combattimento delle passioni umane* (no later than 1771) portrays *Il Amante*, *Il Contento*, *Il Malinconico*, and others in separate movements or sections (Appendix 3g). More commonly, composers assay the inner lives of dramatic protagonists or of communities caught up in political and natural-world events. In Haydn's *Seven Last Words of Our Savior on the Cross* (1787), the crucifixion becomes a panorama of hope, anger, love, despair, and resignation, each nuanced through the elaboration of the musical ideas, while in Dittersdorf's *Metamorphoses* gods, goddesses, and mortals bare their souls in similarly developmental “arias.” In musical battles and other politically inspired works, societies dance for joy or weep for lost comrades, and in pastoral symphonies they express pleasure in idyllic settings or shudder before storms. The most “pictorial” moments – storms, battles, hunts – are overhung by affective connotations, confusing the emotional and the physical in ways that were central to the music's contemporary reception (Chapter 3). There is no subject, however “objective” it may seem, that does not also imply feeling.

Within a few richly significant contexts, then, the characteristic symphony explores the development and definition of human identities by representing the unfolding of emotions through time. To do so using only an orchestra and an unsung, unacted text seems an undertaking more typical of Hector Berlioz and the generations following, but it was no less timely in an age when discussion about music focused on its expressive potential, and when instrumental works with text, as is argued below, encapsulated a paradox whereby music was considered to be at once meaningful and indefinite. In addition, tracing the development of human identities engaged the social and political concerns of a milieu beset by sweeping change. Like the eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century symphony as a whole, the characteristic symphony was the product largely of central Europe and especially of

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

the cities, courts, and religious principalities presided over from Vienna by the Habsburgs. The histories of the genre and the empire are closely entwined, beginning with the two most compelling (and, in their own time, most famous) examples from before the French Revolution, Dittersdorf's *Metamorphoses* and Haydn's *Seven Last Words*. Both treat their subjects so as to reflect on the Enlightenment as it was being imposed on Austria during the 1780s by Emperor Joseph II, Dittersdorf by interpreting Ovid's tales as allegories of an idyllic court society undermined by violent change, and Haydn by writing a *Passion* that underscores both the "rational" morality of Joseph's reformed church and the "irrational" faith of a more traditional theology (Chapters 1–2). After the Revolution, concerns about a perceived acceleration of history and the emergence of new political forces find echo in Beethoven's *Pastoral* and *Eroica* Symphonies and in a subgenre of works marking the battles, treaties, and deaths of the Revolutionary and Napoleonic Wars. The *Pastoral* revisits an idyllic setting to suggest how it might be rescued from the onslaught of time, and the politically inspired symphonies weigh the competing claims of individual heroes and newly recognized "nations" in the assigning of responsibility for military success (Chapters 4–5). Reflecting a culture in flux, identities both rational and unfathomable, empowered and passive, individual and collective jostle against one another in a discourse in which the emotions, not surprisingly, run high: if some characteristic symphonies exhibit the comic flair of *opera buffa*, the prevailing affinity is for *opera seria* or Revolutionary drama with their grand tableaux, overwhelming passions, paradises and hells and protagonists pushed to the limits of tolerance. The immediacy of the topics requires that feelings be intense, and often ordered so as to juxtapose the extreme states of courage and terror, joy and sorrow, hope and foreboding.

Composers did not see the symphony with text as the ideal medium for exploring aesthetic paradox or social transformation; if they had, there would be more than 225 examples from a period that produced several thousand symphonies (in the broad sense of the term) according to the most comprehensive listing to date.² On the other hand, just as symphonies with more and less detailed texts have elements in common, so too do symphonies with and without text, particularly where generalized subjects like the pastoral or the military are concerned. In such contexts many characteristic symphonies do little more than write out the associations that other instrumental works trigger with evocative rhythms, textures, harmonies, or melodic gestures; it might have been impossible to suggest a specific classical myth or historical battle without

² Jan LaRue, *A Catalogue of Eighteenth-Century Symphonies*, vol. I, *Thematic Identifier* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988), xii.

The characteristic symphony

verbal prompting, but the idyllic, or violent, or emotive scenes that made up such plots belong to an expressive dialect shared by all music of the time. What the characteristic repertory offers is the opportunity to observe familiar subjects linked explicitly to contemporary musical and social dilemmas, a connection both interesting in its own right and suggestive for instrumental music as a whole. Borrowing language to demonstrate how an otherwise wordless medium might speak, these works stress the potential for symphonies to participate in the most fundamental cultural debates.

Character and characteristic

The primacy of feeling in most characteristic symphonies is implied by the label itself, whose root term, “character,” was used partly as a synonym for affect in the eighteenth century.³ It also carried strong overtones of unity: taking their cue from the “characters” of Theophrastus and La Bruyère, short essays that described a single personality type or temperament, the character pieces for keyboard by Couperin, C. P. E. Bach, and the northern German composers who kept the tradition alive into the 1770s and 80s generally limit themselves to one affect, one nation, one person or personality type of the sort known as “moral characters.”⁴ Johann Friedrich Reichardt recommends this narrow focus as a means of avoiding the “höchst unnatürlichen Vermischung der entgegengesetzten Leidenschaften . . . unsrer jetztigen Instrumentalmusik” (highly unnatural combination of the opposed passions . . . in our modern instrumental music), a reference to the quick changes of style, modeled on Italian comic opera, that German critics had long distrusted in symphonies and sonatas.⁵ In the same paragraph Reichardt also declares it “psychologisch und physikalisch fast unmöglich” (psychologically and physically almost impossible) for a single composer to express contrasting emotions equally well, an opinion that is also found in

³ Jacob de Ruiter, *Der Charakterbegriff in der Musik. Studien zur deutschen Ästhetik der Instrumentalmusik 1740–1850*, Beihefte zum Archiv für Musikwissenschaft 29 (Stuttgart: Steiner, 1989), 26–33; Mary Sue Morrow, *German Music Criticism in the Late Eighteenth Century: Aesthetic Issues in Instrumental Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 77.

⁴ See Ruiter, *Der Charakterbegriff*, 48–79; Darrell Berg, “C. P. E. Bach’s Character Pieces and his Friendship Circle,” in Stephen L. Clark, ed., *C. P. E. Bach Studies* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), 1–32; and David Fuller, “Of Portraits, ‘Sapho’ and Couperin: Titles and Characters in French Instrumental Music of the High Baroque,” *Music & Letters* 78 (1997): 149–74.

⁵ *Musikalisches Kunstmagazin* 1 (1782): 25. Cf. Ruiter, *Der Charakterbegriff*, 50–51; Morrow, *German Music Criticism*, 47–48, 139–50; and Bellamy Hosler, *Changing Aesthetic Views of Instrumental Music in 18th-Century Germany* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1981), 6–8 *et passim*.

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

the influential *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* of Johann Georg Sulzer and that means, in effect, that founding a keyboard piece on one appropriate “character” ensures coherence both in the music and between the music and its creator.⁶ At the end of the century Christian Gottfried Körner uses the term in a related sense, identifying character with a consistent tone or “ethos” that runs through the multiplicity or “pathos” of a given piece and is its marker of human agency: “Das erste Erforderniß eines Kunstwerkes ist unstreitig, daß es sich als ein menschliches Produkt durch Spuren einer ordnenden Kraft von den Wirkungen des blinden Zufalls unterscheide” (The first requirement of an artwork is indisputable; through signs of an ordering power, it must distinguish itself as a human product, in contrast to the outcome of blind coincidence).⁷ Soon enough it would become commonplace to read musical works as instances of artistic self-expression: an important preparation is this connection of musical characters, understood as unifying essences, with the creative personas of their composers.

With the emergence of works naming multiple persons or affects as their subject, “character” and “characteristic” acquire more general meanings. Connotations of unity and human creativity remain; Beethoven’s *Eroica* and *Pastoral* Symphonies focus to some degree on a single declared style or idea, and any instrumental work that announces its subject reveals something of the “ordering power” behind it.⁸ But when Paul Wranitzky published his *Grande Sinfonie caractéristique pour la paix avec la République françoise* (1797), the qualifier in his title referred to the simple presence of specified subjects, or “caractères” as he calls them in the accompanying explanation, which include the French Revolution,

⁶ “Es ist sehr wichtig, daß der Künstler sich selbst kenne, und wenn es bey ihm steht, nichts unternehme, das gegen seinen Charakter streitet” (It is important that the artist know himself, and whenever possible decline undertaking anything contrary to his character): Sulzer, *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste*, 2nd expanded edn., 4 vols. (Leipzig, 1792–94), I: 271; trans. in Nancy Kovaleff Baker and Thomas Christensen, eds., *Aesthetics and the Art of Musical Composition in the German Enlightenment: Selected Writings of Johann Georg Sulzer and Heinrich Christoph Koch* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 51. Biographical essays called “Charakteristiken” in German musical journals sought to encapsulate composers’ styles and affective leanings (e.g., in the *Musikalisches Taschenbuch* [1803]: 251–92 and [1805]: 338–78), and Muzio Clementi wrote a *Musical Characteristics ... Composed in the Style of Haydn, Kozeluch, Mozart, Sterkel, Vanhal, and the Author* (1787).

⁷ Körner, “Über Charakterdarstellung in der Musik,” *Die Horen* 5 (1795), repr. in Wolfgang Seifert, *Christian Gottfried Körner, ein Musikästhetiker der deutschen Klassik* (Regensburg: Bosse, 1960), 147, trans. in Robert Riggs, “‘On the Representation of Character in Music’: Christian Gottfried Körner’s Aesthetics of Instrumental Music,” *Musical Quarterly* 81 (1997): 613. See also Carl Dahlhaus, “Ethos und Pathos in Glucks *Iphigenie auf Tauris*,” *Die Musikforschung* 27 (1974): 289–300.

⁸ The implication of unity is the focus of F. E. Kirby, “Beethoven’s *Pastoral* Symphony as a *Sinfonia caratteristica*,” *Musical Quarterly* 56 (1970): 605–23.

The characteristic symphony

the execution of Louis XVI, and the “cries of joy” greeting the Treaty of Campo Formio between Austria and Napoleon. “Characteristic” applies to similarly mixed scenes and emotions on the title pages of several post-Revolutionary battle pieces for keyboard;⁹ in the titles of overtures to spoken plays;¹⁰ in a letter of Justin Heinrich Knecht about his symphony *Tod des Herzogs von Braunschweig*;¹¹ on the first page of the sketches for Beethoven’s *Pastoral* Symphony, the title page of a first violin part for his *Leonore* Overture No. 1, and in a letter concerning the “Les Adieux” Sonata;¹² and in reviews and commentaries on *The Seven Last Words*, the *Metamorphoses* Symphonies, and other works with comparably elaborate texts.¹³ Its purview spreads further in the *Essay on Practical Musical Composition* (1799) by Augustus Frederic Christopher Kollmann, which includes the orchestral interludes in Georg Benda’s melodrama *Ariadne auf Naxos* under the rubric “characteristic symphony”; their meaning being “prescribed” by the surrounding dialogue, they are to his mind conceptually parallel to opera overtures or *The Seven Last Words*.¹⁴ Defining the same term retrospectively, the music dictionary (1826) of Peter

⁹ See the thematic index in Karin Schulin, *Musikalische Schlachtengemälde in der Zeit von 1756 bis 1815* (Tutzing: Schneider, 1986), 259–334.

¹⁰ E.g., Georg Joseph Vogler, *Charakteristische Ouvertüre zu dem Schauspiel Die Kreuzfahrer* (1803), and Johann Anton André, *Charakteristische Ouvertüre zum Schauspiel Die Hussiten vor Naumburg*, op. 36 (c. 1818). “Charakteristische Sinfonien” is taken to mean opera overtures that represent the nature of the drama, or events preceding the rise of the curtain, in Daniel Gottlob Türk, *Klavierschule* (Leipzig and Halle, 1789), 392. Discussion of relevant examples by Gluck and Mozart is in Constantin Floros, “Das ‘Programm’ in Mozarts Meisterouvertüren,” *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 26 (1964): 140–86, and Daniel Heartz, *Mozart’s Operas*, ed. Thomas Bauman (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990), 318–41 (an expanded version of “The Overture to *La Clemenza di Tito* as Dramatic Argument,” *Musical Quarterly* 64 [1978]: 29–49).

¹¹ Printed in the *Musikalische Realzeitung* (24 February 1790): cols. 59–60.

¹² *Pastoral* Symphony Sketchbook, fol. 2r (Beethoven, *Ein Skizzenbuch zur Pastoral-symphonie op. 68 und zu den Trios op. 70, 1 und 2*, ed. Dagmar Weise, 2 vols. [Bonn: Beethovenhaus, 1961], II: 5, and the first facsimile page); Gustav Nottebohm, *Beethoveniana* (Leipzig: C. F. Peters, 1872), 60–61; letter to Breitkopf und Härtel, 23 September 1810 (Ludwig van Beethoven: *Briefwechsel Gesamtausgabe*, ed. Sieghard Brandenburg, 7 vols. [Munich: Henle, 1996–98], II: 154). See also Constantin Floros, *Beethovens Eroica und Prometheus-Musik: Sujet-Studien* (Wilhelmshaven: Heinrichshofen, 1978), 116–19.

¹³ E.g., *Musikalische Realzeitung* “Probeblatt” (5 March 1788): 1, and *Musikalisches Taschenbuch* (1803): 80. Dittersdorf and his apologist Johann Timotheus Hermes refer to the *Metamorphoses* Symphonies as “characterized” (charakterisierte, caractérisées) in Dittersdorf, *Lebensbeschreibung, seinem Sohne in die Feder diktiert*, ed. Karl Spazier (Leipzig, 1801; modern edn. by Norbert Miller, Munich: Kösel, 1967), 221, and Hermes, *Analyse de XII Métamorphoses tirées d’Ovide, et mises en musique par Mr. Charles Ditters de Dittersdorf* (Breslau, 1786; repr. in Carl Krebs, *Dittersdorffiana* [Berlin, 1900]), 167.

¹⁴ Kollmann, *An Essay on Practical Musical Composition, According to the Nature of That Science and the Principles of the Greatest Musical Authors* (London, 1799), 15–16.

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

Lichtenthal shrinks its compass back to independent orchestral works but in that context still mentions the *Metamorphoses*, Haydn's Symphony No. 60 (originally written as music for Regnard's comedy *Le Distrain*), and also military, pastoral, tempest, hunting, and "fire" symphonies – in short, the whole range of orchestral pieces that are found with texts in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.¹⁵

Alternatives were proposed but never accepted. At the premiere of his *Télémaque* symphony in Amsterdam in 1777, Ignazio Raimondi distributed what a report called "un espèce de Programme."¹⁶ The journalist was undoubtedly thinking of ballet, where "programmes" detailing content had been used occasionally since the advent of the "ballet d'action" in the 1750s.¹⁷ Later, in 1800, two notices from Paris refer to "Symphonies à programmes," which was subsequently the subject of entries both in Lichtenthal's *Dizionario* and in Heinrich Christoph Koch's earlier *Musikalisches Lexikon* (1802).¹⁸ All the writers have in mind essentially the same repertory that was also called characteristic, listing the *Metamorphoses* and, in Koch as well as the reports from Paris, *The Seven Last Words* and the *Télémaque* of Rosetti.¹⁹ The later nineteenth century would of course use "program music" to refer to the works of Berlioz and others, and in the twentieth century "programmatic" became in many contexts a generic term for all instrumental music with text or representational ambitions, one whose greater familiarity to modern readers (in comparison to characteristic) led me to adopt it in my earlier work on eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century symphonies.²⁰ But "Symphonie à programme" itself achieved no real currency before the 1830s,²¹ and a German equivalent proposed by the editor of one of the Parisian notices, "historische [Sinfonie]," appears only there and in a few battle pieces.²² Other possibilities were tried

¹⁵ Lichtenthal, *Dizionario e bibliografia della musica*, 2nd edn., 4 vols. (Milan, 1836; 1st edn. 1826), II: 198.

¹⁶ *L'Esprit des journaux* (March 1777): 301.

¹⁷ Bruce Alan Brown, *Gluck and the French Theatre in Vienna* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), 171–75, 290–92.

¹⁸ *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* (hereafter *AmZ*) 2 (1800): cols. 747–48n.; *Journal générale de la littérature de France* 3 (1800): 63; Koch, *Musikalisches Lexikon* (Frankfurt am Main, 1802), cols. 1384–85; Lichtenthal, *Dizionario*, II:198.

¹⁹ See also Ruiter, *Der Charakterbegriff*, 108–13; and Roland Schmenner, *Die Pastorale: Beethoven, das Gewitter und der Blitzableiter* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1998), 44–45.

²⁰ Will, "Programmatic Symphonies of the Classical Period" (Ph.D. diss., Cornell University, 1994); and "Time, Morality, and Humanity in Beethoven's *Pastoral* Symphony," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 50 (1997): 271–329.

²¹ Albrecht von Massow, "Programmusik," in Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht and Albrecht Riethmüller, eds., *Handwörterbuch der musikalischen Terminologie* (Stuttgart: Steiner, 1992), 2–4.

²² *AmZ* 2 (1800): cols. 747–48n.; Schulin, *Musikalische Schlachtengemälde*, 279, 305, 327.

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*The characteristic symphony*

but once: “analoge Sinfonie,” for Haydn’s *Il distratto*;²³ “allegorische Symphonien,” for the *Metamorphoses*;²⁴ and “dramatische Sonaten,” for the *Metamorphoses* again along with *Le Portrait musical de la nature* (1785) of Knecht and the *Bataille à deux orchestres* (1777) of Johann Friedrich Klöffler.²⁵ At least one of these terms, “dramatic,” might well better describe a symphony based on a classical, pastoral, or military narrative than does “characteristic,” but like the others it represents not a standard usage but an isolated attempt to capture what was, thanks to its rarity, an unfamiliar musical phenomenon.

Only one term rivalled the popularity of characteristic, but it was loaded: “painting” (“Malerei,” “Gemälde”; also “malend” or “malerisch,” “pictorial”). Some writers employ the two words interchangeably – “Charakterstücke, oder wenn man lieber will, musikalische Malereien” (character pieces or, if one prefers, musical paintings) is how one review describes *The Seven Last Words*²⁶ – and others use “musical painting” as if it were just the name of a genre, among them the author of an enthusiastic early review of the *Pastoral Symphony*.²⁷ However, that Beethoven felt obliged to subtitle the same work *Mehr Ausdruck der Empfindung als Malerei* (more the expression of emotion than tone-painting) suggests that the term was not neutral, and indeed by his day it had been used for over a century to refer to the musical representation of physical objects and motion, a practice that was itself highly controversial (see Chapter 3). None of the symphonies discussed in this book is called “painting” in the musical sources, and of the related works that are, a number of battle pieces for keyboard, most have the qualifier “characteristic” as well (as in “charakteristische Tongemälde”).²⁸ It clearly was the safer alternative, its connotations of emotion, unity, and humanity being preferable to the objectivity and crossing of artistic boundaries implied by painting.

From a modern perspective, one advantage to the widespread use of “characteristic,” even where “dramatic” or “historical” might be more accurate, is that it reiterates the continuity between seemingly disparate

²³ *Realzeitung* (Vienna, 13 January 1776), 107, cited in Carl Ferdinand Pohl, *Joseph Haydn*, 2 vols. (Leipzig: Breitkopf and Härtel, 1878–82), II: 76. See also Ruiter, *Der Charakterbegriff*, 83–89, and Elaine R. Sisman, “Haydn’s Theater Symphonies,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 43 (1990): 302, 311–20.

²⁴ *Brünner Zeitung* (23 June 1786), cited in Dexter Edge, “Review Article: Mary Sue Morrow, *Concert Life in Haydn’s Vienna*,” *Haydn Yearbook* 17 (1992), 151; and Walther Brauneis, “Die Familie Ditters in Wien und Umgebung,” in Hubert Unverricht, ed., *Carl Ditters von Dittersdorf: Leben, Umwelt, Werk* (Tutzing: Schneider, 1997), 56.

²⁵ *Magazin der Musik*, ed. Carl Friedrich Cramer, 2 (1786): 1309.

²⁶ *Musikalische Realzeitung* “Probeblatt” (5 March 1788): 1.

²⁷ Friedrich Mosengeil, in *Zeitung für die elegante Welt* (5 July 1810): col. 1049.

²⁸ Schulin, *Musikalische Schlachtengemälde*, 261, 276, 281, 309, 324.

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

examples. Like a number of other eighteenth-century “pastoral” symphonies, for instance, the *Sinfonia pastorale* (1754–57) of Johann Stamitz has no characterization beyond the single adjective in its title and no greater ambition than to evoke the general associations of the style. There is no series of countryside scenes, with storm, as in Beethoven’s *Pastoral* or Knecht’s *Portrait musical de la nature*. On the other hand, all the works use horn calls, drones, simple harmonies, song-like melodies, and other elements of a common musical vocabulary, and they all suggest a comparable range of sacred and secular meanings associated with the pastoral (see Chapters 2 and 4). They belong to the opposite ends of a continuum rather than in different categories altogether. The same can be said of “military” symphonies and full-blown battle enactments, which, again, are distinguished by the specificity of their semantics but linked by subject matter and musical style. Close by lies the question of whether symphonies always need text to be “characteristic,” if the term is taken in Kollmann’s sense to mean, in effect, any instrumental music in which a subject is specified by any means. In some cases it is not clear that titles like “pastoral” or “military” were seen by anyone other than the performers; they do appear on some concert programs, and more elaborate descriptions were declaimed out loud or made available in print,²⁹ but listeners familiar with contemporary opera and sacred music would hardly have needed to be told that a symphony with drones and shepherd horn imitations was “pastoral.” On the contrary, there are several instances in which titles were applied after audiences, performers, copyists, or publishers recognized an association that the composer did not originally name: three Haydn symphonies became “military,” in two cases with his approval,³⁰ and two others of a comparably martial splendor, by Mozart and Dittersdorf, acquired what

²⁹ See the reports on Raimondi’s *Télémaque* (*L’Esprit des journaux* [March 1777]: 301), Klöffler’s *Bataille à deux orchestres* (repr. in Ursula Götze, “Johann Friedrich Klöffler” [Diss., University of Münster, 1965], 105–18), Dittersdorf’s *Metamorphoses* as performed in Naples in 1786 (John A. Rice, “New Light on Dittersdorf’s Ovid Symphonies,” *Studi musicali* 29 (2000): 471–73), Wranitzky’s *Grande sinfonia caratteristica* (Arnold Schering, *Musikgeschichte Leipzigs*, vol. III, *Johann Sebastian Bach und das Musikleben Leipzigs im 18. Jahrhundert* [Leipzig: Fr. Kistner and C. F. W. Siegel, 1941], 612–13), Rosetti’s *Télémaque* (*AmZ* 2 [1800]: col. 750); Beethoven’s *Pastoral* (*AmZ* 11 [1809]: col. 267), Pugnani’s *Werther* (*Souvenirs de F. Blangini [1797–1834] dédiés à ses élèves, et publiés par son ami Maxime de Villemarest* [Paris, 1834], 368–69), and Bernhard Heinrich Romberg’s *Trauer-Sinfonie* (*AmZ* 14 [1812]: cols. 275–76).

³⁰ Symphony No. 100 in G (1793/94) was christened the “Military” by audiences, and Haydn subsequently used the title in his fourth London notebook (Georg August Griesinger, *Biographische Notizen über Joseph Haydn* [Leipzig, 1810], 53); a keyboard arrangement of No. 69 in C (mid-1770s) was named after the Austrian war hero Ernst Gideon Laudon, with Haydn’s approval (letter to Artaria, 8 April 1783, in *Gesammelte Briefe und Aufzeichnungen: Unter Benützung der Quellensammlung von*

Cambridge University Press

0521802016 - The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven

Richard Will

Excerpt

[More information](#)*The characteristic symphony*

was, thanks to its connotations of power and rulership, the appropriate sobriquet “Jupiter.”³¹ The same might have happened to many other works, in response not only to general stylistic characters but also to quite specific references such as the hunting signal, the announcement of the kill, that Joseph Martin Kraus incorporates without written comment into the finale of his Symphony in A (van Boer 128, 1768–72).³² Little if anything separates such a movement from one actually called “la chasse,” whose title may have been mostly a courtesy, a warning about upcoming characteristic effects for players who, in eighteenth-century orchestras especially, sometimes performed with little or no rehearsal.

That subjects might be specified by sounds as well as words is further suggested by the fact that “associative listening,” to use a term coined by Carl Dahlhaus, seems to have been as common as associative music in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.³³ A powerful strand within contemporary aesthetics assumed that music always expressed feelings or approximated prelinguistic forms of human communication; as a consequence, listeners may have been predisposed to hear more or less concrete meaning in all musical works.³⁴ Conventions of performance suggest that they were in fact accustomed to making associations

H. C. Robbins Landon herausgegeben und erläutert von Dénes Bartha [Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1965], 127; and the first movement of No. 48 in C (c. 1768–69), also called “Laudon” in some sources, became the “Victoire” section of an inauthentic piano trio entitled “La Grande Bataille d’Haydn” (Anthony van Hoboken, *Joseph Haydn: Thematisch-bibliographisches Werkverzeichnis*, 3 vols. [Mainz: Schott, 1959–78], I: 724). The authenticity of many of the titles given to Haydn’s symphonies is surveyed in James Webster, *Haydn’s “Farewell” Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), 236–38; and Horst Walter, “Über Haydns ‘charakteristische’ Sinfonien,” in Gerhard J. Winkler, ed., *Das symphonische Werk Joseph Haydns* (Eisenstadt: Burgenländisches Landesmuseum, 2000), 65–68. Oddly, Walter denies that Symphony No. 69 has military overtones, although the march rhythms in its first movement and its use of trumpet and drums have clear parallels with No. 48, whose “latent military character” he does recognize (65, 74–76n.). It is true, as he notes, that Haydn expressed only economic motivations in approving the title Laudon (in Haydn’s words, it “wird zu Beförderung des Verkaufes mehr als zehen Finale beytragen”), but it is unlikely that he or Artaria would have tried to sell the piece under that name did they not think the music was appropriate.

³¹ Dittersdorf, Symphony in D (Grave D24, no later than 1772); on the naming of Mozart’s “Jupiter,” K. 551, see Neal Zaslaw, *Mozart’s Symphonies: Context, Performance Practice, Reception* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), 441–42.

³² In a comparable case, performers or copyists who recognized Haydn’s quotation of a Gregorian melody did add a title to his Symphony No. 30 in A (1765), “Alleluia,” which appears in early sources but not in the autograph (*Joseph Haydn: Werke* [Munich: Henle, 1958–], I/4: vi).

³³ Carl Dahlhaus, “Thesen über Programmusik,” in Dahlhaus, ed., *Beiträge zur musikalischen Hermeneutik* (Regensburg: Bosse, 1975), 189, 195–96.

³⁴ See pp. 130–36 below, and Downing A. Thomas, *Music and the Origins of Language: Theories from the French Enlightenment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), esp. 34–142.