

The Success of India's Democracy

How has democracy taken root in India in the face of a low-income economy, widespread poverty, illiteracy, and immense ethnic diversity? Atul Kohli brings together some of the world's leading scholars of Indian politics to consider this intriguing anomaly. They do so by focusing not so much on socioeconomic factors, but rather on the ways in which power is distributed in India. Two processes have guided the negotiation of power conflicts. First, a delicate balance has been struck between the forces of centralization and decentralization and, second, the interests of the powerful in society have been served without fully excluding those on the margins. These and related themes are addressed by the editor in his introduction, which is followed by an essay on the historical origins of Indian democracy, and two further sections, one on the consolidation of democratic institutions, and the other on the forces which motivate or inhibit democratic growth. While the book offers a clear and coherent approach to the subject, individual authors have their particular take on the subject. It is this combination that will entice a wide variety of readers, from students on the one hand, as a guide to one of the world's largest democracies, to scholars on the other, who are looking for a new approach to this controversial and much debated subject.

This book has been written under the auspices of the Center of International Studies, Princeton University.

ATUL KOHLI is Professor of Politics and International Affairs at Princeton University. His publications include *Democracy and Discontent: India's Growing Crisis of Governability* (1991) and (with Joel Migdal and Vivienne Shue) *State Power and Social Forces: Domination and Transformation in the Third World* (1994).



Contemporary South Asia 6

Editorial board JAN BREMAN, G. P. HAWTHORN, AYESHA JALAL, PATRICIA JEFFERY, ATUL KOHLI, DHARMA KUMAR

Contemporary South Asia has been established to publish books on the politics, society and culture of South Asia since 1946. In accessible and comprehensive studies, authors who are already engaged in researching specific aspects of South Asian society explore a wide variety of broad-ranging and topical themes. The series will be of interest to anyone who is concerned with the study of South Asia and with the legacy of its colonial past.

- I Ayesha Jalal Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia: A Comparative and Historical Perspective
- 2 Jan Breman Footloose Labour: Working in India's Informal Economy
- 3 Roger Jeffery and Patricia Jeffery Population, Gender and Politics: Demographic Change in Rural North India
- 4 Oliver Mendelsohn and Marika Vicziany The Untouchables: Subordination, Poverty and the State in Modern India
- 5 Robert Jenkins Democratic Politics and Economic Reform in India



THE SUCCESS OF INDIA'S DEMOCRACY

Edited by

Atul Kohli

Princeton University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521801447

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The Success of India's Democracy / edited by Atul Kohli

p. cm. – (Contemporary South Asia; 6)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 80144 3 - ISBN 0 521 80530 9 (pb.)

- 1. Democracy India. 2. India Politics and government 1947-
- 3. Central–local government relations India. I. Kohli, Atul. II. Contemporary South Asia (Cambridge, England); 6.

JQ281.S84 2001

320.954-dc21 00-067439

ISBN-13 978-0-521-80144-7 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-80144-3 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-80530-8 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-80530-9 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2006



In memory of Myron Weiner (1931–1999) who led the way



Contents

List of contributors Acknowledgments		page xi xiv
I	Introduction ATUL KOHLI	I
I	Historical origins	21
2	Indian democracy: the historical inheritance SUMIT SARKAR	23
II	Political institutions and democratic consolidation	47
3	India's federal design and multicultural national construction JYOTIRINDRA DASGUPTA	n 49
4	Center-state relations JAMES MANOR	78
5	Making local government work: local elites, <i>panchayati raj</i> and governance in India SUBRATA K. MITRA	103
6	Redoing the constitutional design: from an interventionist to a regulatory state LLOYD I. RUDOLPH AND SUSANNE HOEBER RUDOLPH	127
7	The dialectics of Hindu nationalism AMRITA BASU	163
III	Social demands and democratic deepening	191
8	The struggle for equality: caste in Indian politics MYRON WEINER	193
		ix

© Cambridge University Press



x	Contents	
9	Sharing the spoils: group equity, development, and democracy PRANAB BARDHAN	226
10	Social movement politics in India: institutions, interests, and identities MARY KATZENSTEIN, SMITU KOTHARI, AND UDAY MEHTA	242
Bibli Inde	iography x	270 287



Contributors

PRANAB BARDHAN is Professor of Economics, University of California at Berkeley. He is currently working on the political economy of governance and decentralization in the delivery of public goods and services, the effects of inequality on cooperation in the management of local commons, and the limits to redistribution posed by globalization. His recent books include *The Role of Governance in Economic Development* (OECD Development Center, Paris, 1997), *Development Microeconomics* (Oxford University Press, 1999) and *Readings in Development Economics* (MIT Press, 2000), the latter two books written jointly with Christopher Udry.

AMRITA BASU is Professor of Political Science and Women's and Gender Studies at Amherst College. Her publications include Appropriating Gender: Women's Activism and Politicized Religion in South Asia (Routledge, 1998), and "The Transformation of Hindu Nationalism: Towards a Reappraisal," in Francine R. Frankel, Zoya Hasan, Rajeev Bhargava, and Balveer Arora, eds., Transforming India: Social and Political Dynamics of Democracy (Oxford University Press, 2000).

JYOTIRINDRA DASGUPTA is a Professor of Political Science Emeritus at the University of California at Berkeley. He is the author of Authority, Priority, and Human Development (Oxford University Press, 1981) and Language Conflict and National Development: Group Politics and National Language Policy in India (University of California Press, 1970).

MARY KATZENSTEIN is a Professor of Government and a member of the faculty of the Women's Studies Program at Cornell University. She is the author of Ethnicity and Equality: The Shiv Sena Party and Preferential Policies in Bombay (Cornell University Press, 1979) and Faithful and Fearless: Moving Feminist Protest inside the Church and Military (Princeton University Press, 1998).

ATUL KOHLI is Professor of Politics and International Affairs and Director of the Program in Comparative and Regional Studies at

хi



xii List of contributors

Princeton University. His publications include *Democracy and Discontent: India's Growing Crisis of Governability* (Cambridge University Press, 1990) and *State Power and Social Forces: Domination and Transformation in the Third World* (Cambridge University Press, 1994). He is currently completing a book on the state's role in late industrialization.

- SMITU KOTHARI is one of the founders of Lokayan ("Dialogue of the People"), a center in India promoting active exchange between non-party political formations and concerned scholars and other citizens from India and the rest of the world. He has recently been a visiting professor at Cornell and Princeton universities. He has published extensively on critiques of contemporary economic and cultural development, the relationship of nature, culture and democracy, developmental displacement and social movements.
- JAMES MANOR is Professorial Fellow at the Institute of Development Studies, Sussex, England. His recent interests include Indian slum dwellers' relations to state agencies, politicians' survival strategies and democratic decentralization in Asia and Africa. He is the author of The Political Economy of Democratic Decentralization (World Bank, 1999) and Democratic Decentralization in South Asia and West Africa: Participation and Performance in Comparative Perspective (Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- UDAY METHA is a Professor of Political Science at Amherst College. His publications include two important books in political theory, *The Anxiety of Freedom* (Cornell University Press, 1992), and *Liberalism and Empire* (University of Chicago Press, 1999).
- SUBRATA K. MITRA is currently Professor and Head, Department of Political Science, South Asia Institute, University of Heidelberg and Visiting Fellow at the Center for the Study of Developing Societies, New Delhi. He has written extensively on Indian politics including Culture and Rationality: The Politics of Social Change in Post-Colonial India (Sage Publications, 1999).
- LLOYD I. RUDOLPH AND SUSANNE HOEBER RUDOLPH'S most recent book is *Reversing the Gaze: The Amar Singh Diary, a Colonial Subject's Narrative of Imperial India* (Westview Press, 2000). Their current projects are: the politics of multiculturalism in India; the effects of economic reform on the Indian federal system; and a book of essays on Gandhi.

SUMIT SARKAR is a Professor of History at Delhi University in India.



List of contributors

xiii

He is the author of *Writing Social History* (Oxford University Press, 1997) and *Modern India:* 1885–1947 (Macmillan, 1989).

MYRON WEINER was the Ford Professor of Political Science at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology at the time of his death in 1999. He has written extensively on India and other comparative issues including his well-known book *The Child and the State in India: Child Labor and Education Policy in Comparative Perspective* (Princeton University Press, 1991).



Acknowledgments

Research and conferences leading up to this volume were financially supported by the Liechtenstein Research Program in Self-Determination (LRPSD) at Princeton University. I owe a profound gratitude to LRPSD's Director, Wolfgang Danspeckgruber, for the financial support as well as for enthusiasm, good cheer, and friendship. The two conferences - one in Vaduz, Liechtenstein and the other at Princeton University – during which the essays in this volume were crafted, would certainly not have been possible without Wolfgang's full support. Thanks are also due to Michael Doyle, the Director of Princeton's Center of International Studies that houses LRPSD. From behind the scenes, Mike provided the quiet encouragement that academic leaders need to provide. The intellectual role of a sizable number of conference participants – who cannot all be listed here – also needs to be acknowledged; not only did they make the Princeton conference lively, but their comments helped paper writers refine their arguments. Karthick Ramakrishan, P.S. Srikanth, and Maia Davis provided research assistance and Edna Lloyd performed the heroic task of creating a unified manuscript out of disparate contributions. Finally, thanks to Marigold Acland, editor at Cambridge University Press, for her encouragment, and to Jeffrey Hawthorn, an academic editor of the Contemporary South Asia book series, for his suggestions and support.

xiv