

The Economics of Overtime Working

Numerous individuals throughout international labour markets work hours in excess of their standard contractual hours. Overtime working is a vital consideration in the employment and wage decisions of many households and firms. From a policy perspective, overtime is at the centre of interest in the work sharing/ unemployment trade off. Robert Hart presents the first comprehensive economic evaluation of this phenomenon, examining theoretical, empirical and policy aspects of overtime hours and pay. In a comparative assessment of labour supply, labour demand and compensating differential models of overtime behaviour, he utilises detailed international evidence drawn from the United States, Western Europe and Japan. Policy initiatives linked to job creation, work sharing, absenteeism and payroll taxation are critically assessed and presented in an intuitive manner. Displaying analytical rigour and empirical expertise, Robert Hart's work extends far beyond a mere summary of existing research to enliven and inform debate.

ROBERT A. HART is Professor of Economics at the University of Stirling. He is a labour market economist and acknowledged authority on the economics of working time. He is the author of *The Economics of Non-Wage Labour Costs* (1984), *Working Time and Employment* (1987), *Human Capital, Employment and Bargaining* (with Thomas Moutos, 1995) and *Work and Pay in Japan* (with Seiichi Kawasaki, 1999).



The Economics of Overtime Working

Robert A. Hart





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

© Robert A. Hart 2004

http://www.cambridge.org

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Times 10/13 pt. System LATEX 2ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Hart, Robert A.
The economics of overtime working / Robert A. Hart.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-80142-7
1. Overtime. I. Title.
HD5111.A3H37 2004
331.25'72 – dc22 2004043567

ISBN 0 521 80142 7 hardback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



For Shirley, with apologies for all the overtime I have caused.



Contents

	List of figures	page viii
	List of tables	X
	Preface	xi
1	Overview	1
2	Facts and figures	11
3	The overtime decision	43
4	The overtime premium	81
5	Overtime hours and empirical studies	100
6	Overtime pay and empirical studies	117
7	Policy issues	134
8	Is overtime working here to stay?	151
	References	156
	Index of names	164
	Index of subjects	166

vii



Figures

2.1	Weekly overtime hours per employee (all industries): selected countries, 1970–1997	page 13
2.2	Weekly overtime hours per employee (manufacturing): selected countries, 1970–1997	14
2.3	Weekly overtime hours per employee in US manufacturing industry, 1956–2001	15
2.4	Employment and average weekly overtime hours in US manufacturing, 1956–2001	18
2.5	Proportion of workers working overtime in US manufacturing, 1962–1997	21
2.6	Percentage of employees working overtime in Australia and Finland (manufacturing), 1980–1997	21
2.7	Male and female weekly overtime hours in Britain (NES), 1975–2001	22
2.8	Proportion working overtime in Britain (NES), 1975–2001	23
2.9	Total hours and standard hours in the United Kingdom, males and	
	females (NES), 1975–2001	26
2.10	Working time and overtime in Germany, 1960–1997	27
2.11	Weekly contractual hours and overtime hours in Germany (GSOEP),	
	1984–1997	27
2.12	Average standard hourly wage rate, by hours of overtime	
	(NES), 2001	28
2.13	Average weekly earnings, by hours of overtime (NES), 2001	28
2.14	Average hourly rate of earnings, by hours of overtime (NESI), 2001	29
2.15	Average overtime premium and average overtime hours for male	
	non-managerial workers working overtime, United Kingdom (NESPD) 1975–2001	, 33
2.16a	Distribution of average overtime premium, United States	35
2.16b	Distribution of average overtime premium, Japan	35
2.17	Decompositions of the earnings rate, 1962–1997	37

viii



	List of figures	ix
2.18	Average overtime hours (all males, United Kingdom (LFS)),	
	1987–2001	38
3.1	Overtime and 'overemployment'	47
3.2	Overtime and 'underemployment'	49
3.3	Overtime with standard wage compensating differential	49
3.4	Indifference and isoprofit curves	71
3.5	Unpaid overtime and overtime regulation	74
3.6	Known distribution of hours required to complete task	76
A3.1	Cost minimisation and a rise in the overtime premium	79
A3.2	Profit maximisation and a rise in the overtime premium	79
4.1	Average premium, by weekly hours of overtime (NES), 2001	87
4.2	Proportions working overtime, by overtime premium (NES), 2001	88
4.3	Standard hourly wage rate and the premium (NES), 2001	89
4.4	Standard hourly wage rate, by premium and overtime hours	
	(NES), 2001	89
4.5	Income and leisure preferences	92
4.6	Overtime and income/leisure preferences	93
4.7	Wage profile of an overtime worker	97
5.1	Aggregation bias and returns to hours	108
6.1	Pre- and post-war movements in θ : fitters and labourers	
	in the British engineering industry, 1926–1966	123
6.2	Real wage rates, real wage earnings and unemployment in four local	
	labour markets, 1928–1938 (fitters on time-rates)	124
7.1	Stochastic absenteeism	148
8.1	Main British working time agreements, 1994–2001	152



Tables

2.1 British male and female occupations with a high incidence of		
	overtime working (NES), 2001	page 20
2.2	Standard deviations of rates of change of the components of total	
	overtime hours (NES), 1975–2001	24
2.3	British proportions of employees who regularly work overtime or hours	S
	in excess of the normal working week, by largest occupational group	
	within the establishment (paid or unpaid hours)	24
2.4	Legislative limits to standard and overtime working, 1996	31
2.5	Estimated average premium schedule for three countries	34
2.6	Unpaid and paid weekly overtime, by three occupation groups	
	(LFS), in 2001	40
2.7	Paid-for and actual hourly earnings, by occupation (£ per hour),	
	2001	41
2.8	Paid-for and actual earnings by educational qualification	
	(£ per hour), 2001	41
4.1	If you do work overtime or extra hours, what would you say is	
	the main reason you do this? (WERS), 1998	91
5.1	Determinants of overtime hours in Germany, the United Kingdom and	
	the United States (Tobit equations)	102
5.2	Proportions of British and German workers desiring to work	
	more/same/less than their actual working hours	112
6.1	Simulated hourly earnings for metal goods industry at different levels	
	of experience/tenure: workers with graduate education, not married and	i
	non-ethnic	130

X



Preface

Three economists – Frank Brechling, Sherwin Rosen and Ronald Ehrenberg – stimulated my original interest and approach to the study of working time. Their seminal 1960s/early 1970s contributions are highlighted in chapter 1. More recently, Stephen Trejo has provided researchers with fresh insights into the evaluation of working time policy initiatives in relation to overtime working. The direction of Trejo's work has made me realise that the important ideas on working time of H. Gregg Lewis should have also played a part in the early formulation of ideas. I can only plead 'better late than never' and hope that this present contribution makes some amends.

I will not attempt at this stage to persuade potential readers of the value of devoting a complete monograph to overtime working. Chapters 1 and 2 attempt to motivate the entire topic. The overview in chapter 1 presents in an accessible manner most of the core labour market issues that are explored in more depth at later stages. The international facts and figures in chapter 2 also cover many of the key areas of later concern. Chapters 3 and 4 deal with the theory of overtime working from the perspectives of labour supply, labour demand and models that attempt to combine the two sides of the market. Chapter 3 deals with the overtime decision in general while Chapter 4 concentrates specifically on the role and interpretation of the overtime premium. Two empirical chapters follow. Chapter 5 is concerned with studies of the determination and effects of overtime hours while chapter 6 deals with overtime pay. Labour market policy issues form the subject of chapter 7. Finally, chapter 8 contains some brief speculation on the future of overtime work.

Stephen Trejo made a number of very helpful suggestions on a key part of the text. Martyn Andrews, Sarah Brown, Ronald Ehrenberg, Thorsten Schank and Hui Wang also offered useful comments. Recent ideas in this area have benefited from research collaborations with David Bell, Yue Ma, Jim Malley, Robin Ruffell and Ulrich Woitek. Elizabeth Roberts helped me greatly in assembling the graphs and figures. Of course, none of these individuals is implicated in any remaining errors and misconceptions.

Finally, I should like to acknowledge the encouragement and support of Ashwin Rattan who was the Economics Editor at Cambridge University Press when this monograph was commissioned.