Creativity in product innovation

Jacob Goldenberg

and

David Mazursky
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Introduction: characterization and illustration of Creativity Templates | 1 |

## Part I Theoretical framework

### 1 Codes of Product Evolution – a Source for Ideation | 13

- Market-based vs. product-based information | 13
- Sources of information for new products | 13
- Critical evaluation of market-based information at the micro level: limitations of current product users | 16
- Critical evaluation of market-based information at the macro level: the diffusion of awareness about a new idea | 17
- Implications of the S-shaped curve analysis | 21
- A proposition, a derivative and a dilemma | 22
- Information inherent in the product reflects market needs | 23
- The value of market research reconsidered | 26
- References | 27 |

### 2 Revisiting the View of Creativity | 29

- Operational definition of creativity | 29
- Igniting the “creative spark” | 30
- Typology of research streams: the creative person, process and idea | 31
- Balancing surprise and regularity | 35 |
3 A Critical Review of Popular Creativity-enhancement Methods

Brainstorming 45
Lateral thinking 53
“Six Thinking Hats” 54
Mind mapping 54
Random stimulation 54
References 55

Part II The Creativity Templates

4 The Attribute Dependency Template

An antenna in the snow – a detailed illustration 59
A disadvantage turned into an advantage 62
Generalization of the Attribute Dependency Template – an innovative lipstick 62
The basic principle of Attribute Dependency 63
How to compete with “Domino’s Pizza” – a hypothetical case 66
Making a better candle 71
Are accidents necessary for locating ideas for new products? 73
Attribute Dependency – between attributes vs. within attributes dependency 74
Cycles of dependencies 75
Summary 75
References 75
## 5 The Forecasting Matrix

- Searching for Attribute Dependency 76
- Classification of variables 76
- The forecasting matrix 78
- Forecasting matrix – analyzing baby ointment 89
- Managing the ideation process issues 94
- Improving scanning efficiency through heuristics 96
- Summary 97
- Operational prescription 98
- References 98

## 6 The Replacement Template

- What is the Replacement Template? 99
- Implementation of the Replacement Template 104
- Case study 1 – a chair 109
- Case study 2 – a scanner 114
- Case study 3 – butter patties 116
- When is exclusion appropriate? 119
- Case study 4 – Nike-Air® ads 119
- Case study 5 – Bally shoe ads 122
- Replacement vs. Attribute Dependency 122
- Operational prescription 123
- References 123

## 7 The Displacement Template

- What is the Displacement Template? 124
- Displacement is not unbundling 127
- Implementation of the Displacement Template 128
- Observations on the Displacement Template 130
- Operational prescription 132
- References 133
8 The Component Control Template

What is the Component Control Template? 134
The thought process inherent in applying the Component Control Template 137
Component Control without the need for a change in the product 140
Observations on the Component Control Template 142
Operational prescription 143
References 143

Part III A closer look at Templates

9 Templates in Advertising 147

Introduction 147
The fundamental templates of quality advertisements 148
Approaching creative advertising 152
Demonstrating Templates in advertising 153
Template distribution 163
Implications of Creativity Templates on creative execution in advertising 164
References 166

10 Further Background to the Template Theory 168

Space 168
Characteristics 168
Links 169
Configuration 170
Operators 171
Creativity Templates as macro operators 173
References 176
Part IV Validation of the Templates theory

11 Demarcating the Creativity Templates

Mapping research: toward a product-based framework for Templates definition 179
Can Templates explain and predict the emergence of blockbuster products? 180
Can training in Templates improve creativity and quality of product ideas? 184
How effective are the Templates? 185
How effective is the Attribute Dependency Template? 188
Conclusions 194
References 195

12 The Primacy of Templates in Success and Failure of Products 197

Introduction 197
Predicting new product success 197
Early determinants 200
Project-level determinants of new product success 202
Hypotheses regarding the predictive power of Templates and other early determinants 204
Study 1: predicting success of patented products 205
Study 2: the unified model 206
Why early determinants can predict success 211
Conclusions of the empirical studies 213
Appendix 214
References 216

Index 219
Introduction: Characterization and Illustration of Creativity Templates

Creativity Templates depict discernable, measurable and learnable regularities or patterns in innovations and novelties emergence. They enable us to understand general mechanisms of past product alterations, as well as to foresee the next alteration in the series.

The Creativity Templates approach is a counter-intuitive view for product emergence and a novel method for ideation, yet it does not contradict any current marketing theory. It does, however, add an important perspective to the process of product innovation by drawing on the primacy of the idea itself as a driving force toward new product success. Creativity templates are derived by inferring patterns in the evolution of products, such as those that can be inferred from the following illustrations.

Gates, computers and extraterrestrial intelligence

Thomas Alva Edison – Life Magazine’s “Number One Man of the Millennium” – was one of the outstanding geniuses in the history of technology. Listed under his name are 1,093 US patents (including the incandescent light bulb, the phonograph and the motion picture projector). Many tales are told of this colorful personality.

One legend about Edison tells that Edison’s guests were always complaining that the gate to his house opened with great difficulty, and they were required to exert great force in order to open it. Jokes were rampant about the obstinate gate and the clever inventor who could not find a way to fix it. At the end of his days, Edison was finally willing to explain: the gate was connected to a water pump, and anyone who opened the gate unknowingly pumped up water to fill Edison’s private swimming pool.

Can anything be learned about creativity and innovation from this amusing story? Would information about the form of Edison’s brain, his modes of thinking or his lifestyle aid us to be more creative?
We have no information about the form of Edison's brain, but this, in any case, would not help us much. For instance, scientists have recently debated whether one part of Einstein's brain (the inferior parietal region) was indeed physically extraordinary – but how can such information be useful to us in search for ideation methods?

Studying Edison's modes of thinking would not be of much use either. The following are some of his own words about the creative process: “A genius is a talented person who does his homework.” “Good fortune is what happens when opportunity meets with preparation.” “All you need to be an inventor is a good imagination and a pile of junk.” “I didn't fail ten thousand times. I successfully eliminated, ten thousand times, materials and combinations which wouldn't work.” “The three things that are essential to achievement are: hard work, stick-to-it- evenness, and common sense.” And finally: “Genius is one percent inspiration and ninety-nine percent perspiration.” You may have been thinking of flashes of genius, thunder and lightning – this is obviously not the case here.

Edison's lifestyle may also not be a worthy source of explanation. He had only a few months of formal education. He went to work on a train at the age of twelve, and set fire to that train. He was fired from his work as a telegrapher for almost causing a collision of two trains. As an employer, he was jealous of the most talented of his employees, and took credit for other men's work. He did not pay his bills, treated his wives badly, neglected his children, and “did not ever sleep the requisite eight hours a night.”

It seems, therefore, that it is not from Edison's biography that we may learn about creativity. Is there another source of information concealed in his story? Before we answer this question, let us present another example drawn from a remote context.

Compaq Computer Corporation is a Fortune Global 100 company, the second largest computer company in the world and largest global supplier of personal computers. In mid-1999, the Compaq Corporation announced a new innovation: a Notebook® computer whose battery is recharged by typing on the keyboard. The ingenuity of this invention lies in the fact that the very activity that discharges the battery serves also to recharge it. The target population for this computer is businessmen on the move. Its benefits are obvious: its weight is reduced by eliminating the need to carry a spare battery and by reducing the size of the main battery.

Can you see any difference in the basic structure of the above two illustrations (Edison's gate and the new configuration of the Compaq computer)? In both cases, the innovators harnessed an energy source from the immediate
environment (Edison’s guests or Compaq end-users) in order to fulfill a necessary function (water pumping or battery recharging). This similarity may point to certain regularities or patterns (or, as we call them, Creativity Templates) which are the subject of this book.

The Creativity Templates approach precludes the need to enter the brains and the thought processes of innovators such as Edison and the Compaq engineers. It discovers and traces the regularities underlying creative ideas or products. These regularities can be conceived as codes embedded in the product itself and are revealed by observing the pattern in product evolution.

Can such patterns (or Creativity Templates) be applied to problems other than those involving energy sources? Let us illustrate further a brilliant innovation in the category of extended cellular phone speakers installed in cars. The research and development (R&D) team of Wirefree Ltd, a company that specializes in such speakers, have noticed an interesting contradiction: The barrier to the quality of the sound is the miniature loudspeaker, which is one of the most expensive parts in this product. Normally, we expect that improvement in the quality of a product would entail higher costs and consequently a more expensive product. Relying on the pattern in idea emergence that was identified above (Edison’s gate and Compaq computer) we may expect an idea that will break this vicious circle.

But first, let us generalize further the template structure underlying this type of idea: An internal component that performs a certain function (Edison himself, a battery) is drawn from the system’s configuration. In order to fulfill its function an external resource (energy from the guests in the case of the gate and energy from the user in the case of the computer) is used to replace the internal component that was drawn out. This replacement is designed in such a way that the new resource bears the same function as that of the removed component. Let us examine the speaker in view of this rule: It is quite obvious that in order to eliminate the size problem the cellular phone loudspeaker has to be removed. The remaining question is whether there is a resource in the vicinity of the system (car) that can carry the function of the removed loudspeaker. A perfect candidate would probably be the loudspeaker of the stereo system in the car itself.

The invention introduced in 1999 by Wirefree was to assign the function of the loudspeaker to the stereo system, enabling major cost savings and, at the same time, a substantial improvement of the sound (see Figure I.1).

It is interesting to note that the firm re-used this template in implementing the connection between the speaker and the radio system: Instead of producing a connector for each radio system, the appliance transmits the signals (in FM) to the radio. It turns off the radio while the telephone is activated.
One abstract template surfaces from all of the above ideas, based on a code underlying them – harnessing resources from the immediate environment to replace a component that fulfills a needed function of the product. We can therefore generalize:

**Replacement Template:** The utilization of resources available in the immediate environment to replace a component that fulfills a needed function of the product.

This is but one code of innovation emergence that characterizes product evolution. It signifies a certain rule in evolutionary processes. Clearly, it is not the only one. Another template may be extracted from the following illustrations.

---

**What is the shared structure of a multicolored car and pizza delivery?**

**Multicolored car**

In 1995, Volkswagen Motor Co. launched a new model of the Polo car, named “Polo Harlequin.” The Polo, marketed until then as a solid, dependable car,
acquired a new attribute: each part of the car was painted a different color (see Figure I.2). This configuration gave the car an original, mischievous look that appealed to a sizable market share. A short time after its launching, the Harlequin could be found all over Europe. The only detail that was changed in the production process was the order of assembly: instead of feeding the robot assembling the car with parts of the same color, it was fed with multicolored parts.

The curious detail about this story is that this model was originally intended as an April Fools’ Day joke. Although this joke was coordinated with the PR Department of the firm who distributed multicolored posters to go with the launching (including details of two models produced in this configuration), the company did not intend to implement this concept and launch such an odd product.

To Volkswagen’s great surprise, the idea captivated many customers, and a great uproar arose the next day. Orders for this (nonexistent) car started piling up in the sales department, and interest kept growing. The next step was obvious: the model was to be offered on the suddenly awakened market.

In a conventional car there is no connection between the type of outer body component of the car (e.g., doors, engine cover, top) and its color – all of the components are of the same color. The Harlequin has the characteristic of a new connection between the type of component and its color: different components have different colors. This may be illustrated in graphical form as shown in Figure I.3.

Is this procedure unique to the development of the Polo Harlequin®, or is there a recurrent pattern here that we may use in other, different and seemingly remote cases? From the realm of automobile-industry products, we shall move to an illustration from the realm of food-industry services.
Basically there is no difference between products and services, let us examine the same template manifestation in a famous service – pizza deliveries.

**Pizza delivery**

Domino’s Pizza is a world leader in pizza delivery. Its success was partially due to the introduction of a novel idea: a promise to reduce the price of the pizza whenever delivery takes longer than 30 minutes. This new and original promise has caused a boom in Domino’s business. In addition to the firm’s obligation to fast service, there is an interesting gamble in ordering a pizza: the customer may hope that the delivery will be late and the price reduced.

Free deliveries, even a promise of fast delivery, and tasty pizzas existed before Domino’s appeared on the scene. Once again an innovation can be formulated (graphically) in the same transition from a constant (straight line) to a step-function (see Figure I.4).

In this illustration, a new dependency was created by a step-function between two previously independent variables: price and time. A similar dependency could be created between two other independent variables, e.g., price and temperature. A promise would be given to deliver the pizza to the customer while hot; otherwise the price would be reduced.

Surprisingly enough, Figure I.4 presents exactly the same pattern of change
as that for the Polo Harlequin®. What does this mean? Is there a common superstructure behind these ideas that may be extracted and generalized? Before drawing a conclusion, let us look at one more illustration.

The wonderful Lighthouse of Alexandria

The Lighthouse of Alexandria, built in 286–246 BC, is considered one of the Seven Wonders of the World. Many years of planning and a great engineering project led to the erection of this 134-meter tall lighthouse. It was built in order to light the seamen’s way to port on stormy nights, but also to extol the name of Alexandria and its rulers. A brilliant architect directed the project. King Ptolemy II who sponsored the project wished to put a stamp of ownership on this immense asset.

The Greek architect was a genius, and put great store by the credit he would receive for his achievement. The money and vision of Ptolemy were valuable, but the architect wanted to assure recognition of his own genius and accomplishments by future generations. Such problems are solved today with the aid of a battery of lawyers dealing with intellectual or physical property, and by negotiations leading to a compromise. But those were the days of Ptolemy, when kings had no use for legal decisions in such petty matters. The architect realized that even raising the idea of credit would shorten his life considerably.

In many cases, a creative idea is expressed in the solution to a dilemma (a state in which there are two simultaneous conflicting demands). In our case the architect’s dilemma was clear: the two conflicting ideas were the wish to achieve fame through the project, and the wish to continue living. The greater the fame, the shorter his life; the longer his life, the less the fame. This brilliant man needed a creative idea by which both of these requirements could be fulfilled. A compromise would be the obvious first step to take, therefore could not be termed creative even if it would solve the problem. The architect could, for example, inscribe his name in such small letters that the chance of the king seeing it would be minimized. In this case both demands would be only partially fulfilled – the credit would be small, but the risk of shortening his life would still exist (although minimized). He could also have requested in his will that his heirs should engrave his name on the lighthouse wall, but this would entail a measure of risk for them.

The architect was creative enough to find another solution. He engraved his name on the stone of the lighthouse, including a blessing for those who read his lines. He then covered the stones (and the engraving) with plaster, inscribing
in it with great pomp the name of Ptolemy II, with praises for his deeds. Both
king and architect eventually joined their forefathers, but the forces of nature
worked incessantly. Erosion by sun, wind and salt air caused the peeling o
and removal of the layers of plaster. The name of Ptolemy slowly disappa
peared, and the name of the architect – Sastratus of Cnidus – appeared in its
place (See figure I.5). Thus he succeeded in bringing about his own renown
as the constructor of the lighthouse (which has since collapsed as a result of
an earthquake) for as long as 2,000 years after his time, without risking his
life.

Legend has it that the heirs of Ptolemy enjoyed the idea so much that they
did not efface the architect’s name or re-plaster the area upon which he had
stealthily “inherited” their ancestor’s glory.

The architect of the Lighthouse of Alexandria established dependency
between two formerly unrelated variables: Credit, nonexistent at first, was
achieved only with the passing of time (Figure I.6). We term this pattern
Attribute Dependency Template. The illustrations of the Polo Harlequin®
(color and components) and Domino’s Pizza (price and time or price and tem-
perature) also fall in this category.
Attribute Dependency Template: Finding two independent variables and establishing dependency between them.

Another pattern used by the architect is the Replacement Template, which was demonstrated in the cases of Compaq portable computer and the cellular phone speaker. He utilized resources available in the immediate environment of the lighthouse (humidity, water and salt) in order to fulfill the function of immortalizing his name. It is consistent with the pattern obtained in the illustrations of Edison’s gate (guests’ work energy and water pumping), Compaq’s Notebook® (typing energy and recharging of battery) and Wirefree’s speakers.

The above illustrations of the Replacement Template and the systematic change between the previous and the current mode indicate that the Templates may also be used for problem-solving. In such case the goal of the problem is known a priori, and we seek ways to achieve it.

From antiquity to modernity

Practically, we don’t have to search for Creativity Templates in ancient Egypt or Greece. Our argument is that some templates have survived over history, and have preserved their structure even though the context has been changed. As in every evolutionary process, “the fittest survives.” Adaptable historical templates – those more successful and effective – have survived well, and the information embedded in them may be used in the framework of creative thinking. Therefore, it suffices to locate templates embedded in creative ideas that have survived in the twentieth century, in which acceleration of innovative processes is witnessed and documented. The realm of new products has undergone a genuine revolution in the past 50 years, characterized by an avalanche of innovative ideas and providing evidence for the existence of Templates and possibilities for using the information embedded in them.

This introductory chapter has pointed the way to Creativity Templates and offered some clues about their meaning and operation. In Part I, the various
sources used traditionally in generating new product ideas are compared with the source which underlies the Creativity Template approach. The templates approach is the one which relies on a relatively unexplored source – the information inherent in the product itself and the evolution of products over time. Part II illustrates and discusses more fully each of the major Creativity Templates. Among these templates, found to account for almost 70% of new product emergence, four templates, namely Attribute Dependency Replacement, Displacement, and Component Control, are detailed providing prescribed procedures for their implementation. Part III examines the generalizability of the notion of templates, illustrating the ways templates are derived and formulated in the context of advertising. Following identification of templates as a generalizable phenomenon, a more detailed analysis of the templates as a well-defined framework is provided. Part IV provides the empirical basis of the Creativity Templates approach – its validation in the realm of new products.