Conversation and Cognition

Written by some of the leading figures in the fields of conversation analysis, discursive psychology and ethnomethodology, this book looks at the challenging implications of new discourse-based approaches to the topic of cognition. Up to now, cognition has primarily been studied in experimental settings. This volume shows how cognition can be reworked using analyses of engaging examples of real life interaction such as conversations between friends, relationship counselling sessions and legal hearings. It includes an extended introduction that overviews the history and context of cognitive research and its basic assumptions to provide a frame for understanding the specific examples discussed, as well as surveying cutting edge debates about discourse and cognition. This comprehensive and accessible book opens up important new ways of understanding the relation between language and cognition.

HEDWIG TE MOLDER is a senior lecturer in Discourse Analysis in the Communication Science Section at Wageningen University, The Netherlands. She has published on a number of topics including government communicators' talk, online interaction and discourse on food choice.

JONATHAN POTTER is Professor of Discourse Analysis in the Social Sciences Department at Loughborough University, UK. He has published eight books, including *Discourse and Social Psychology* (with Margaret Wetherell, 1987), more than forty book chapters and sixty journal articles.

Conversation and Cognition

Edited by Hedwig te Molder Jonathan Potter



> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Plantin 10/12 pt. System $L^{T}EX 2_{E}$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Conversation and cognition / edited by Hedwig, te Molder, Jonathan Potter.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 79020 4 – ISBN 0 521 79369 6 (pb)
1. Discourse analysis – Psychological aspects. 2. Cognition.
I. Molder, Hedwig te. II. Potter, Jonathan, 1956P302.8.C66 2004
401'.41 – dc22

ISBN 0 521 79020 4 hardback ISBN 0 521 79369 6 paperback

To the memory and inspiration of Robert Hopper

Contents

	List of contributors Acknowledgements	<i>page</i> ix xi
	Transcription conventions	xiii
	Talking cognition: mapping and making the terrain JONATHAN POTTER AND HEDWIG TE MOLDER	1
Part I	The interface between cognition and action	
2	Validating 'observations' in discourse studies: a methodological reason for attention to cognition ROBERT E. SANDERS	57
	Language without mind JEFF COULTER	79
4	Using participants' video-stimulated comments to complement analyses of interactional practices ANITA POMERANTZ	93
5	From paradigm to prototype and back again: interactive aspects of 'cognitive processing' in standardized survey interviews NORA CATE SCHAEFFER AND DOUGLAS W. MAYNARD	114
6	A cognitive agnostic in conversation analysis: when do strategies affect spoken interaction? ROBERT HOPPER	134
Part II	Cognition in action	
	Is <i>confusion</i> a state of mind? PAUL DREW	161

vii

viii	Contents	
8	Cognition in discourse JOHN HERITAGE	184
9	From process to practice: language, interaction and 'flashbulb' memories ROBIN WOOFFITT	203
10	'My memory has been shredded': a non-cognitivist investigation of 'mental' phenomena MICHAEL LYNCH AND DAVID BOGEN	226
11	Discursive psychology, mental states and descriptions DEREK EDWARDS AND JONATHAN POTTER	241
	References Index	260 279

Contributors

- PROFESSOR DAVID BOGEN Executive Director, Institute for Liberal Arts & Interdisciplinary Studies, Emerson College, Boston, USA.
- PROFESSOR JEFF COULTER Department of Sociology, Boston University, USA.
- PROFESSOR PAUL DREW Department of Sociology, University of York, UK.
- PROFESSOR DEREK EDWARDS Discourse and Rhetoric Group, Department of Social Sciences, Loughborough University, UK.
- PROFESSOR JOHN HERITAGE Department of Sociology, University of California, Los Angeles, USA.
- PROFESSOR ROBERT HOPPER Late of the Department of Speech Communication, The University of Texas, Austin, USA.
- PROFESSOR MICHAEL LYNCH Department of Science & Technology Studies, Cornell University, Clark Hall, USA.
- PROFESSOR DOUGLAS MAYNARD Department of Sociology, University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA.
- PROFESSOR ANITA POMERANTZ Department of Communication, State University of New York (SUNY), Albany, USA.
- PROFESSOR JONATHAN POTTER Discourse and Rhetoric Group, Department of Social Sciences, Loughborough University, UK.
- PROFESSOR NORA CATE SCHAEFFER Department of Sociology, University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA.
- PROFESSOR ROBERT SANDERS Department of Communication, State University of New York (SUNY), Albany, USA.
- DR HEDWIG TE MOLDER Communication Science, Wageningen University, The Netherlands.
- DR ROBIN WOOFFITT Department of Sociology, University of York, UK.

Acknowledgements

This collection brings together a unique group of leading scholars from the fields of conversation analysis, discursive psychology and ethnomethodology. It features cutting edge debates about discourse and cognition along with illustrative and engaging examples of real life interaction. Some contributors argue that the notion of cognition in interaction analysis can and should be abandoned, others that it should be reworked and others again that it must be preserved but clarified. We hope that this volume provides a thought-provoking overview and reappraisal of the role of mental concepts in the empirical study of text and talk.

When we started it, too many years ago, we could not have imagined the journey that would follow. In many ways, the major issue on which it is focused turns out to be different from what we suspected: more heterogeneous, less definitive in its boundaries and place, and, overall, very much alive. During the process of writing and editing, we never got bored with any of the contributions, and we are grateful that the contributors never got (really) bored with waiting. Their past work has defined the contours of the debate and they show themselves to be ideally placed to move it forward.

Several people have been a continuous source of inspiration and helpful criticism to us. We wish to thank Derek Edwards, Alexa Hepburn and Liz Stokoe as well as the stimulating intellectual context of Loughborough's Discourse and Rhetoric Group. Communication Science at Wageningen University has provided a supportive and challenging environment for discourse work. Frank de Groot has given valuable technical support in preparing the chapters for publication. We gratefully acknowledge the continuing support, patience and good humour of Catherine Max and Sarah Caro at Cambridge University Press.

The book is dedicated to Professor Robert Hopper, who died in December 1998, and was the first to complete his contribution for this volume. After being invited to a pre-conference on discourse and cognition, his enthusiasm for the topic was contagious and he felt no hesitation in writing about it. We hope the spirit with which he explored the convolutions inside these complicated questions will shine throughout the book.

Transcription conventions

The following conventions were developed by Gail Jefferson.

[]	Square brackets mark the start and end of overlapping speech. Position them in alignment
	where the overlap occurs.
↑↓	Vertical arrows precede marked pitch movement, over and above normal rhythms of speech. They are for marked, hearably significant shifts – and even then, the other symbols (full stops, commas, question marks) mop up most of that. Like with all these symbols, the aim is to capture
	interactionally significant features, hearable as
	such to an ordinary listener – especially
	deviations from a common sense notion of
	'neutral', which admittedly has not been well
	defined.
\rightarrow	Side arrows are not transcription features, but
	draw analytic attention to particular lines of text.
	Usually positioned to the left of the line.
Underlining	Underlining signals vocal emphasis; the extent of
	underlining within individual words locates
	emphasis, but also indicates how heavy it is.
CAPITALS	Capitals mark speech that is obviously louder
	than surrounding speech (often occurs when
	speakers are hearably competing for the floor,
	raised volume rather than doing contrastive
	emphasis).
°↑I know it,°	'Degree' signs enclose obviously quieter speech
	(i.e., hearably produced as quieter, not just
	someone distant).
that's r*ight.	Asterisks precede a 'squeaky' vocal delivery.

xiii

Cambridge University Press 0521793696 - Conversation and Cognition Edited by Hedwig te Molder and Jonathan Potter Frontmatter More information

xiv Transcription conventions				
(0.4)	Numbers in round brackets measure pauses in seconds (in this case, 4 tenths of a second). Place on new line if not assigned to a speaker.			
(.)	A micropause, hearable but too short to measure.			
((text))	Additional comments from the transcriber, e.g. context or intonation.			
she wa::nted	Colons show degrees of elongation of the prior sound; the more colons, the more elongation.			
hhh	Aspiration (out-breaths); proportionally as for colons.			
.hhh	Inspiration (in-breaths); proportionally as for colons.			
Yeh,	'Continuation' marker, speaker has not finished; marked by fall-rise or weak rising intonation, as when enunciating lists.			
y'know?	Question marks signal stronger, 'questioning' intonation, irrespective of grammar.			
Yeh.	Periods (full stops) mark falling, stopping intonation ('final contour'), irrespective of grammar and not necessarily followed by a pause.			
bu-u-	Hyphens mark a cut-off of the preceding sound.			
>he said<	'Greater than' and 'lesser than' signs enclose speeded-up talk. Sometimes used the other way round for slower talk.			
solid.=	'Equals' signs mark the immediate 'latching' of			
=We had	successive talk, whether of one or more speakers, with no interval. Also used as below (lines 3–5), where an unbroken turn has been split between two lines to accommodate another speaker on the transcript page.			
heh heh	Voiced laughter. Can have other symbols added, such as underlinings, pitch movement, extra			
sto(h)p i(h)t	aspiration, etc. Laughter within speech is signalled by 'h's in round brackets.			

For further details see Hepburn (in press), Hutchby and Wooffitt (1998), Jefferson (1985), Psathas and Anderson (1990) and ten Have (1999).