Jane Austen on Screen

*Jane Austen on Screen* is a collection of essays exploring the literary and cinematic implications of translating Austen's prose into film. Contributors raise questions of how prose fiction and cinema differ, of how mass commercial audiences require changes to script and character, and of how continually remade films evoke memories of earlier productions. The essays represent widely divergent perspectives, from literary “purists” suspicious of filmic renderings of Austen to filmmakers who see the text as a stimulus for producing exceptional cinema. Theoretical issues are explored in balance with the practical concerns of literature-to-film conversions: casting choices, authenticity of settings, script “amputations” of the original prose, anachronisms, relevance for modern mass audiences, and the intertextuality informing the production of much-remade works. This comprehensive study, including an exhaustive Austen bibliography and filmography, will be of interest to students and teachers alike.


**ANDREW MACDONALD** teaches at Loyola University in New Orleans. He is the author of *Howard Fast* (1997).

Together the Macdonalds have published *Mastering Writing Essentials* (1996), *Shapeshifting: Images of Native Americans in Recent Popular Fiction* (2000), and *Shaman or Sherlock? The Native American in Recent Detective Fiction* (2001). They were coeditors of the *TESOL Intensive English Newsletter*, and they are regular contributors to *Creative Screenwriting*. 
Colonel Brandon’s (Alan Rickman’s) quiet, gentlemanly courtship of Marianne Dashwood (Kate Winslet) in a scene from Columbia Pictures/TriStar Pictures’ 1995 *Sense and Sensibility*
Jane Austen on Screen

Edited by
Gina Macdonald
Nicholls State University, Thibodaux, Louisiana
and
Andrew Macdonald
Loyola University, New Orleans
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521793254

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-79325-4 Hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2009

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel
timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at
the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee
the accuracy of such information thereafter.
Contents

List of illustrations ... page vii
List of contributors ... ix
Acknowledgments ... xii

Introduction ... 1
GINA MACDONALD AND ANDREW MACDONALD

1 Short “Takes” on Austen: summarizing the controversy between literary purists and film enthusiasts ... 9
A few skeptical thoughts on Jane Austen and film ... 10
ROGER GARDE

Sense and Sensibility: Ang Lee’s sensitive screen interpretation of Jane Austen ... 12
GAYLENE PRESTON

Commodifying Austen: the Janeite culture of the Internet and commercialization through product and television series spinoffs ... 15
KATE BOWLES

2 Janeite culture: what does the name “Jane Austen” authorize? ... 22
HARRIET MARGOLIS

3 “Such a transformation!”: translation, imitation, and intertextuality in Jane Austen on screen ... 44
JOCELYN HARRIS

4 Two Mansfield Parks: purist and postmodern ... 69
JAN FERGUS

5 Sense and Sensibility in a postfeminist world: sisterhood is still powerful ... 90
PENNY GAY
Contents

6 Regency romance shadowing in the visual motifs of Roger Michell’s *Persuasion* 111
   PAULETTE RICHARDS

7 Filming romance: *Persuasion* 127
   TARA GHOSHAL WALLACE

8 Emma, interrupted: speaking Jane Austen in fiction and film 144
   HILARY SCHOR

9 Reimagining Jane Austen: the 1940 and 1995 film versions of *Pride and Prejudice* 175
   ELLEN BELTON

10 *Emma* and the art of adaptation 197
    DAVID MONAGHAN

11 Clues for the clueless 228
    JOHN MOSIER

Questions for discussion 254

Filmography 260
Bibliography 266
Index 281
Illustrations

Frontispiece. Colonel Brandon’s (Alan Rickman’s) quiet, gentlemanly courtship of Marianne Dashwood (Kate Winslet) in a scene from Columbia Pictures/TriStar Pictures’ 1995 Sense and Sensibility

1 Elinor Dashwood (Emma Thompson) with Edward Ferrars (Hugh Grant) from Columbia Pictures/TriStar Pictures’ 1995 Sense and Sensibility (Photo: Clive Coote) 13

2 A thwarted romance rekindled: Anne Elliot (Amanda Root) and Captain Wentworth (Ciaran Hinds), from Jane Austen’s Persuasion, a Sony Pictures Classics Release, 1995 35

3 Emma (Gwyneth Paltrow) watches as Mr. Knightley (Jeremy Northam) engages in target practice with bow and arrow in Douglas McGrath’s Emma, a 1996 Miramax Films release 47

4 Fanny Price (Frances O’Connor) confronts Sir Thomas Bertram (Harold Pinter) in Patricia Rozema’s 1999 Miramax Films’ Mansfield Park (Photo: Clive Coote) 60

5 Christian (Justin Walker) fools the clueless Cher (Alicia Silverstone), who is blind to his sexual preferences, in the 1995 Paramount Pictures release Clueless (Photo: Elliott Marks) 64

6 Fanny Price (Frances O’Connor) and Henry Crawford (Alessandro Nivola) in Patricia Rozema’s 1999 Miramax Films’ Mansfield Park (Photo: Clive Coote) 74

7 Fanny Price (Frances O’Connor) and Edmund Bertram (Jonny Lee Miller) in Patricia Rozema’s 1999 Miramax Films’ Mansfield Park (Photo: Clive Coote) 87

8 Willoughby (Greg Wise) bringing the injured Marianne (Kate Winslet) a bouquet of wild flowers, while her sisters Margaret (Emilie François) and Elinor (Emma Thompson) look on, in a scene from Columbia Pictures/TriStar Pictures’ 1995 Sense and Sensibility: note the foregrounding of the
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Elinor (Emma Thompson) and Marianne (Kate Winslet) with their mother Mrs. Dashwood (Gemma Jones) in front of their country cottage, in a complex emotional scene from Columbia Pictures/TriStar Pictures’ 1995 <em>Sense and Sensibility</em> (Photo: Clive Coote)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>An excursion on the waterfront at Lyme from <em>Jane Austen’s Persuasion</em>, a Sony Pictures Classics Release, 1995. The navy leads the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The accident on the waterfront at Lyme with Captain Wentworth (Ciaran Hinds) and Anne Elliot (Amanda Root) attending the injured Louisa while Captain Benwick looks on helplessly, from <em>Jane Austen’s Persuasion</em>, a Sony Pictures Classics Release, 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>An imposing-looking but tortured Captain Wentworth (Ciaran Hinds), from <em>Jane Austen’s Persuasion</em>, a Sony Pictures Classics Release, 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Elizabeth Bennet (Greer Garson) and Mr. Darcy (Lawrence Olivier) on the terrace at the Netherfield garden party in the 1940s MGM production of <em>Pride and Prejudice</em> (Property of the National Screen Service Corp.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Sisters Elizabeth Bennet (Greer Garson), Jane Bennet (Maureen O’Sullivan), and Mary Bennet (Marsha Hunt) confer, in the 1940s MGM production of <em>Pride and Prejudice</em> (Property of the National Screen Service Corp.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Elizabeth Bennet (Jennifer Ehle) and Mr. Darcy (Colin Firth) in the 1995 BBC production of <em>Pride and Prejudice</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>The Bennets, a family grouping, in the 1995 BBC production of <em>Pride and Prejudice</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>An accessorized Cher (Alicia Silverstone) in the 1995 Paramount Pictures release <em>Clueless</em> (Photo: Elliott Marks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Emma (Gwyneth Paltrow) and Mr. Knightley (Jeremy Northam) lead the dance line in Douglas McGrath’s <em>Emma</em>, a 1996 Miramax Films release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Mr. Elton (Alan Cumming) helps Emma (Gwyneth Paltrow) decorate in Douglas McGrath’s <em>Emma</em>, a 1996 Miramax Films release</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Ellen Belton is Dean of Undergraduate Studies and Professor of English and a former Chair of the English Department and of the Faculty Council at Brooklyn College of the City University of New York; she is the author of poetry and articles on the plays of Shakespeare, John Webster, and Thomas Heywood and on “The Detective Plots of Jane Austen,” and the recipient of the 1998 Theodore M. Hesburgh Award for Faculty Development to Enhance Undergraduate Teaching and Learning and of the 1999 Noel-Levitz Retention Excellence Award.

Kate Bowles is Lecturer in Communication and Cultural Studies at the University of Wollongong, South Wales, Australia; she has published on the legal and cultural implications of the Internet, on television soap opera, and on television fandom.

Jan Fergus is Professor in the Department of English, Lehigh University, Bethlehem, PA, USA, author of several essays on Austen and two books (Jane Austen and the Didactic Novel and a biography, Jane Austen: A Literary Life) as well as a number of articles on the reading public during Austen’s time.

Roger Gard is an English Austen scholar, author of Jane Austen’s Novels: The Art of Clarity and Emma and Persuasion (Penguin Critical Studies).

Penny Gay is an Associate Professor, Department of English, University of Sydney, Australia; she has published on the theatrical performance of gender (As She Likes It: Shakespeare’s Unruly Women, Routledge, 1994), with monographs on Jane Austen (Jane Austen’s “Emma,” 1995, and Jane Austen’s “Pride and Prejudice,” 1990, and with articles on the three Emma films. She has recently published Jane Austen and the Theatre (Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Jocelyn Harris is the holder of a personal chair at the University of Otago, New Zealand. She edited Samuel Richardson’s History of Sir
List of contributors

Charles Grandison (Oxford University Press, 1972); she has explored the Grandison link in Jane Austen and the Art of Memory (CUP, 1989), reviewed the Jane Austen film versions, written on eighteenth-century women poets, and introduced Richardson’s published commentary on Clarissa for Pickering & Chatto (1998).

Andrew F. MacDonald is an Associate Professor at Loyola University, New Orleans, LA, USA, with a Ph.D. from the University of Texas, Austin, in Renaissance; he has published widely on popular fiction for Bruccoli Press, Salem Press, St. Martin’s and St. James Press, among others; he is the author of Howard Fast, coauthor of Shapeshifting and Shaman or Sherlock?, and a regular reviewer for Creative Screenwriting.

Virginia (Gina) L. MacDonald is an Assistant Professor at Nicholls State University, Thibodaux, LA, with a Ph.D. from the University of Texas, Austin, in Renaissance and Nineteenth-Century British Fiction; she has published widely for Bruccoli Press, Salem Press, St. Martin’s and St. James Press, among others, including several books for Greenwood Press on popular fiction (James Clavell, Robert Ludlum, and is coauthor of Shapeshifting and Shaman or Sherlock?), editor of the Bruccoli Press edition of British Mystery and Detective Fiction since 1960, and a regular reviewer for Creative Screenwriting.

Harriet Margolis is a senior lecturer in film at Victoria University of Wellington, Aotearoa New Zealand, who previously taught film, literature, women’s romance novels, and related subjects at various universities in the USA; she is the author of The Cinema Ideal: An Introduction to Psychoanalytic Studies of the Film Spectator, and articles on film or literature that have appeared in various books and journals internationally; she is the editor of Jane Campion’s “The Piano” (Cambridge University Press). She is on the editorial board of Screening the Past, an electronic journal available at http://www.latrobe.edu.au/www/screeningthepast.

David Monaghan is Professor of English at Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, author of Jane Austen: Structure and Social Vision (1980), and editor of Jane Austen in a Social Context (1981) and the New Casebooks volume on Emma (1992). His teaching and research interests have expanded in recent years to embrace popular literature, film, and cultural studies. His most recent book, The Falklands War: Myth and Countermyth (1998), combines all of these interests through a study of written and visual texts that range from Margaret Thatcher’s speeches, through Steve Bell’s cartoons to films such as The Ploughman’s Lunch.
List of contributors

**John Mosier** is a Professor at Loyola University, New Orleans, USA, where he regularly teaches Jane Austen; a member of the Camera d’Or Jury at Cannes; author of articles on film adaptations for *Kino, Americas, PMLA, the New Orleans Review, and the New Orleans Art Review*, where he is currently a contributing editor; a founding member of Film Historia (Barcelona), whose essays on film have appeared in Russian, Italian, Spanish, French, Slovak, German, and Portuguese; author of *Men and Women Together* (1986), *The Myth of the Great War: A New Military History of the First World War* (2000), and *The Blitzkrieg Myth* (2003).

**Gaylene Preston** is a New Zealand director, producer, and screenwriter known for *Ruby and Rata*, 1989; *War Stories our Mothers Never Told Us*, 1995, among other films.

**Paulette Richards** is an Associate Professor at Loyola University, New Orleans, USA, where she teaches African-American Literature and Creative Writing; author of *Terry McMillan* (1999), articles on French, Spanish, and Romance novels, translations in *Callaloo*, and papers on African-American Science Fiction for National Popular Culture Association conferences; an avid romance fan with a Certificate in Multimedia Production from Georgia Tech University.

**Hilary Schor** is an Associate Professor of English at the University of Southern California, Los Angeles; a specialist in Victorian and feminist studies; author of *Dickens and the Daughter of the House* (Cambridge University Press, 1999) and *Scheherezade in the Marketplace: Elizabeth Gaskell and the Forms of the Heroine’s Plot* (1992). She has contributed a chapter to a critical study entitled *Great Expectations* (1995), and articles in *Carlyle Studies Annual, Dickens Studies Annual*, and *Novel*.

Acknowledgments

This book is dedicated to the memory of Roger Gard, a contributor to this text, a respected scholar and teacher, and an eighteenth-century specialist whose critical books (*Jane Austen’s Novels: The Art of Clarity* and *Emma and Persuasion*) continue to engage readers.

Our thanks go to professional screenplay writer Bill Witliff and novelist and screenplay writer Hugh Selby, Jr. for sharing with us their experience with their craft, and to Andrew Horton for his encouragement and support. Thanks too go to Erik Bauer, editor of *Creative Screenwriting*, Jim Shepard at Collectors Book Store, Hollywood, Hollywood Book & Poster Co., Miramax, MGM, Sony Pictures Classics, the BBC, and A&E for the photographs which grace this book. The front picture from *Sense and Sensibility* is with the permission of Columbia Pictures/Tristar Motion Picture Group; our thanks to Margarita Medina for arranging this permission.

Editors’ note

Throughout the text, quotations from Jane Austen’s novels are designated by book and chapter, with, for example, *Persuasion*, 1.i referring to Book 1, Chapter 1 of that work.