Theories of Case

Case, a system which marks the relationships between words in a sentence, is fundamental to every language. Looking at how different theories of syntax have accounted for the distribution of case across languages, this accessible textbook introduces the various approaches to case that have been proposed in modern linguistics. Clearly organised into topics, it provides beginning students with a solid understanding of the ideas behind the development of theories of case. For the more advanced reader, it presents theories that have been formulated about the interaction between case morphology, argument structure, grammatical relations and semantics, and offers a detailed cross-theoretical discussion of how these are motivated. Each chapter contains practical exercises, encouraging students to engage with the ideas discussed. Drawing on data from a wide range of languages and pooling together a variety of perspectives, Theories of Case is essential reading for all those studying this important area of linguistics.

MIRIAM BUTT is Professor of Theoretical and Computational Linguistics at the University of Konstanz. She has authored, co-authored and co-edited a variety of books on morphosyntax, semantics, historical linguistics and computational linguistics, including The Structure of Complex Predicates in Urdu, A Grammar Writer’s Cookbook, Theoretical Perspectives on Word Order Issues, and The Projection of Arguments, as well as Time over Matter, Argument Realisation, and Nominals: Inside and Out.
CAMBRIDGE TEXTBOOKS IN LINGUISTICS


Theories of Case
Theories of Case

MIRIAM BUTT
Universität Konstanz
Contents

Acknowledgements xi

Abbreviations xiii

1 Introduction 1
  1.1 Overview 1
  1.2 What is Case? 3
    1.2.1 Head vs. Dependent Marking 5
    1.2.2 Is Everything Case? — Persian ezafe 6
    1.2.3 Adverbal Case 6
    1.2.4 Case and Finiteness 7
    1.2.5 Nominal Case 8
    1.2.6 Case Stacking 9
  1.3 Levels of Abstractness 11

2 Foundational Perspectives 12
  2.1 Introduction 12
  2.2 The Greek and Roman Tradition 13
  2.3 The Indian Tradition 15
  2.4 The Arabic Tradition 18
  2.5 Exercises 21

3 Grammatical Relations 23
  3.1 The Structure of Sentences 23
  3.2 Transformational Grammar, Case and the Passive 24
  3.3 Relational Grammar 26
viii THEORIES OF CASE

3.4 The Notion of Grammatical Relations 28
3.5 Case Grammar and Thematic Roles 29
3.6 Core Ideas of Relational Grammar 33
  3.6.1 The Passive Revisited 33
  3.6.2 Case in Relational Grammar 36
3.7 The Unaccusative Hypothesis 38
3.8 The Universal Alignment Hypothesis 42
3.9 Summary 44
3.10 Exercises 44

4 Structural Case 46
  4.1 The Structural View of Grammatical Relations 46
  4.2 The Basic Architecture 46
  4.3 Thematic Roles 48
  4.4 Category Neutral Representations: X’-Syntax 51
  4.5 The VP-internal subject hypothesis 53
  4.6 Case and Agreement 55
  4.7 D-Structure, 9-Theory, and Structural Case 55
    4.7.1 Unaccusatives and Unergatives 60
    4.7.2 Passivization 64
  4.8 Structural vs. Inherent or Quirky Case 67
  4.9 Taking Stock 71
  4.10 Minimalism 73
    4.10.1 Phases, Merge and Features 73
    4.10.2 External Arguments 75
    4.10.3 Lexical Conceptual Structure 77
    4.10.4 Unergatives, Unaccusatives and Passives 79
  4.11 English Double Objects 83
  4.12 Discussion 87
  4.13 Exercises 89

5 Linking Theories 91
  5.1 Introduction 91
  5.2 Representation of Predicate-Argument Structure 92
  5.3 Lexical Decomposition and Linking 94
  5.4 Proto-Roles 98
  5.5 Kiparsky’s Linking Theory 100
CONTENTS ix

5.5.1 Semantic Form and Thematic Roles 101
5.5.2 The Feature System 103
5.5.3 Linking by Case, Position and Agreement 107
5.5.4 Passives, Unaccusatives and Unergatives 109

5.6 Lexical Decomposition Grammar 111
5.6.1 Basic Analyses 113
5.6.2 Unergatives, Unaccusatives and Semantics 114
5.6.3 Quirky Case 116

5.7 Lexical-Functional Grammar 117
5.7.1 LFG Basics 117
5.7.2 Argument Structure and Thematic Roles 122
5.7.3 Quirky Case and Early Association Principles 123
5.7.4 The Introduction of Explicit Features 126
5.7.5 Standard LFG Mapping Theory 127
5.7.6 Argument Alternations 131
5.7.7 Incorporation of Proto-Roles 135

5.8 Case Stacking 138

5.9 An Interactive Model of Case 142
5.9.1 Linking 144
5.9.2 Structural Case 145
5.9.3 Quirky Case 146
5.9.4 Semantic Case 146

5.10 Discussion 149

5.11 Exercises 150

6 The Ergative Dragon 153
6.1 Fighting Dragons 153

6.2 The Terminology 154
6.2.1 Torres Straits and the Agentive Nominative 154
6.2.2 A Misunderstanding with Georgian 156

6.3 Case Systems 158

6.4 Syntactic vs. Morphological Ergativity 161

6.5 Approaches to Morphological Ergativity 165
6.5.1 The Ergative as an Inherent Case 165
6.5.2 The Ergative as a Structural Case 169
6.5.3 Linking theories revisited and more types of ergativity 173

6.6 Split Ergativity 175

6.7 Acquisition Issues 176
THEORIES OF CASE

6.8 Historical Issues 179
6.9 Summary 183
6.10 Exercises 184

The Semantics of Case 188
7.1 Localist Theories 188
7.2 Agency vs. Experience 189
7.3 Object Alternations 191
7.4 Subject Alternations 197
7.5 Discussion 199
7.6 Exercises 200

More Theories Great and Small 202
8.1 Role and Reference Grammar 202
  8.1.1 Basic Linking 205
  8.1.2 Ditransitives and Dative Subjects 208
  8.1.3 Ergatives 211
8.2 Optimality Theory 212
  8.2.1 OT Basics 213
  8.2.2 Structural Case Revisited 216
  8.2.3 Harmonic Alignment 220
8.3 Discussion 224
8.4 Exercises 226

Language Index 250

Subject Index 252
Acknowledgements

This book is dedicated to Andrea Levitt and Anette Herskovits. They were my first linguistics teachers and were very bemused to discover that I had gone on to do syntax. Nevertheless, they set me on my current path and I would like to thank them for it.

This book has been with me for several years now, though for most of these years, it played more of a passive role than it deserved. This was partly due to the fact that it accompanied me to UMIST, Manchester in 2002, and then back to the University of Konstanz in 2003. This book is thus an English/German hybrid and I would like to thank both the Department of Linguistics at Konstanz and the Centre for Computational Linguistics at UMIST for providing a supportive and interesting working environment.

Thanks are also in order to a host of people, whose input and encouragement ultimately made this book possible. I would like to thank David Lightfoot and Paul Kiparsky for proposing that I take on this project and thus getting the ball rolling. At CUP, I would like to thank three editors for many helpful and cooperative exchanges. Andrew Winnard was the editor in charge when the ideas for the content of the book first took shape. Helen Barton is the editor who managed to impose deadlines politely, but firmly, and see the book to its completion. And, finally, the end production of the book was overseen by Annie Lovett in a very competent and professional manner. It was a pleasure to work with all of them.

David Adger, Judith Aissen, Mohamed Badawi, Josef Bayer, Ashwini Deo, Wilhelm Geuder, Helen de Hoop, Georg Kaiser, Ingrid Kaufmann, Tracy Holloway King, Paul Kiparsky, Carmen Kelling, Aditi Lahiri, Beth Levin, Andrej Malchukov, Judith Meinschäfer, Mahinnaz Mirdeghani, Rachel Nordlinger, Frans Plank, Gillian Ramchand, Christoph Schwarze, Peter Sells, Peter Svenonius, Robert D. Van Valin Jr., Connie de Vos, Björn Wiemer, Beate Wolke, Irene Wolke and Dieter Wunderlich have all given generously of their time,
providing me with invaluable information, comments, feedback and criticism. Their input has helped shape the book from a gangly adolescent into something more mature. Thanks go to Katrin Schuhmann for careful proofreading and help with the index. Thanks also go to CUP, who had the manuscript proofread even more carefully. All remaining errors, misrepresentations and omissions are entirely my own responsibility.

Carmen Kelling in particular has been one of my most faithful and reliable readers. Ingrid Kaufmann had to put up with late-night discussions and complaints almost every day and managed to turn my musings into useful material that I could incorporate the next day. Special thanks are also due to Rajesh Bhatt, who visited during the last week of production and good-naturedly put up with late night discussions of case. Zhila Shah provided much needed moral sustenance during my stay in Lahore. Finally, very special thanks go to the Tequila Club, which is a truly most excellent institution!
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>morpheme boundary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>=</td>
<td>clitic boundary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl</td>
<td>Ablative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abs</td>
<td>Absolutive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>Accusative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>Allative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aor</td>
<td>Aorist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asp</td>
<td>Aspect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caus</td>
<td>Causative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat</td>
<td>Dative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decl</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dem</td>
<td>Demonstrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Des</td>
<td>Desiderative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dir</td>
<td>Direct (case)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erg</td>
<td>Ergative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Feminine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gd</td>
<td>Gerund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>Genitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imp</td>
<td>Imperative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impf</td>
<td>Imperfect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IND</td>
<td>Indicative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inf</td>
<td>Infinitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inst</td>
<td>Instrumental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTR</td>
<td>Intransitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loc</td>
<td>Locative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>Masculine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>Neuter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nfut</td>
<td>Nonfuture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>Nominative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAgg</td>
<td>Object Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obj</td>
<td>Object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part</td>
<td>Partitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pass</td>
<td>Passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past</td>
<td>Past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PastP</td>
<td>Past Participle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perf</td>
<td>Perfect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PerfP</td>
<td>Perfect Participle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pl</td>
<td>Plural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pres</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prop</td>
<td>Proprietary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ptcpl</td>
<td>Participle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purp</td>
<td>Purposive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC PAST</td>
<td>Recent Past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB</td>
<td>Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sg</td>
<td>Singular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUBJ</td>
<td>Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subj</td>
<td>Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tns</td>
<td>Tense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top</td>
<td>Topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Transitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VN</td>
<td>Verbal Noun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>