

State Identities and the Homogenisation of Peoples

Why have forced displacement, ethnic cleansing and genocide been an enduring feature of the modern state system? In this ground-breaking book, Heather Rae locates these practices of 'pathological homogenisation' in the processes of state-building. Political elites have repeatedly used available cultural resources to redefine bounded political communities as exclusive moral communities, from which outsiders must be expelled. Showing that these practices predate the age of nationalism, Rae examines cases from both the pre-nationalist and nationalist eras: the expulsion of the Jews from fifteenth-century Spain, the persecution of the Huguenots under Louis XIV and, in the twentieth century, the Armenian genocide and the ethnic cleansing in the former Yugoslavia. She argues that those atrocities have prompted the development of international norms of legitimate state behaviour that increasingly define sovereignty as conditional. Rae concludes by examining two 'threshold' cases - the Czech Republic and Macedonia - to identify the factors that may inhibit pathological homogenisation as a method of state-building.

HEATHER RAE is Research Fellow and Deputy Director of the Graduate Studies in International Affairs program in the Department of International Relations, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, Australian National University, Canberra.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 84

State Identities and the Homogenisation of Peoples

Editorial Board

Steve Smith (Managing editor)

Thomas Biersteker Chris Brown Alex Danchev
Phil Cerny Joseph Grieco A.J.R. Groom
Richard Higgott G. John Ikenberry
Caroline Kennedy-Pipe Steve Lamy
Michael Nicholson Ngaire Woods

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series will include a wide range of material, from undergraduate textbooks and surveys to research-based monographs and collaborative volumes. The aim of the series is to publish the best new scholarship in International Studies from Europe, North America and the rest of the world.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

84 Heather Rae

State Identities and the Homogenisation of Peoples

83 Maja Zehfuss

Constructivism in International Relations

82 Paul K. Huth and Todd Allee
The Democratic Peace and Territorial Conflict in the
Twentieth Century

81 Neta C. Crawford

Argument and Change in World Politics

80 Douglas Lemke

Regions of War and Peace

79 Richard Shapcott

Justice and Community in International Relations

78 Phil Steinberg

The Social Construction of the Ocean

77 Christine Sylvester

Feminist International Relations: An Unfinished Journey

76 Kenneth A. Schultz

Democracy and Coercive Diplomacy

75 David Houghton

US Foreign Policy and the Iran Hostage Crisis

74 Cecilia Albin

Justice and Fairness in International Negotiation

73 Martin Shaw

Theory of the Global State: Globality as an Unfinished Revolution

Series list continues after Index



State Identities and the Homogenisation of Peoples

Heather Rae

Department of International Relations Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies Australian National University





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Heather Rae 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Plantin 10/12 pt System LATEX $2_{\mathcal{E}}$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Rae, Heather.

State identities and the homogenisation of peoples / Heather Rae.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international relations; 84) Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 79284 3 (hc.) – ISBN 0 521 79708 X (pbk.)

1. Forced migration – History. 2. Population transfers – History.

3. Genocide - History. 4. Political atrocities - History. I. Title. II. Series.

HV640 .R24 2002

 $303.48'2-dc21 \\ 2002016588$

ISBN 0 521 79284 3 hardback ISBN 0 521 79708 X paperback



> For my sister Lesley Cleary and in memory of my father John Douglas Rae 1914–1999



Contents

Preface		page xi
	Introduction	1
1	State formation and pathological homogenisation	14
2	The 'other' within Christian Europe: state-building in early modern Spain	55
3	State-building in early modern France: Louis XIV and the Huguenots	83
4	Pathological homogenisation and Turkish state-building: the Armenian genocide of 1915–1916	124
5	'Ethnic cleansing' and the breakup of Yugoslavia	165
6	Evolving international norms	212
7	On the threshold: the Czech Republic and Macedonia	249
	Conclusion	298
Bibliography Index		311 338

ix



Preface

This book is the result of an abiding interest – perhaps puzzlement would be more apt – in how human beings can come to accept that systematic mistreatment of other human beings is somehow morally justifiable. That the project has taken the particular form it has, as an inquiry into what I call pathological homogenisation – forced assimilation, expulsion, genocide – practised by state-builders, is due to my good fortune in being taught as an undergraduate by Andrew Linklater, now Woodrow Wilson Professor of International Relations at the University of Wales at Aberystwyth.

As well as being an inspirational teacher of international relations, Andrew drew my attention to the problem of inclusion and exclusion in the modern system of states and how the boundary of the state has been drawn not only in territorial form but also as a moral boundary. My sense was that while it is important to search for more inclusive forms of political community, work remained to be done on how exclusion – the sort of moral exclusion that justifies mass slaughter of civilians, for example – can come about. Although this interest has taken me off in a different direction I hope that my intellectual debt to Andrew is obvious, though any shortcomings are of course my own responsibility.

Another important influence that animates this project, though one that I was not perhaps aware of for quite some time, was my father's history as a soldier in the British army between 1933 and the mid-1950s. Starting with a tour of duty in India he then went on to 'scoop the pool' (or the bottom of the barrel) of mid-twentieth-century conflict, serving in Europe during World War II, then Palestine, Korea, Malaya. Like many men of his generation, so much was left unsaid about his experiences – words literally failed him. Despite all that was left unsaid, or perhaps because of it, I have inherited a deep interest (and puzzlement) with the nature and consequences of systematic violence. I hope that words have not failed me in the account that follows.

Of course there is a significant difference between my father's experiences, horrifying as they no doubt were, and those of the people whose



xii Preface

stories I tell in this book. My father was a trained soldier, he was armed, and he stood a fighting chance. This has not been the case for the great majority of those who over the last 500 years have been displaced or murdered by their own rulers in the name of a unified sovereign identity within the state.

I have benefited greatly from the assistance and encouragement of a number of teachers, colleagues and friends over the years during which this book took shape, first as a Ph.D. thesis submitted to Monash University. From my time at Monash I wish to thank Michael Janover, for his patience and feedback as the project evolved, Roger Spegele, Hugh Emy, Paul Muldoon, Margaret Nash, Robyn Eckersley, Richard Shapcott, Catherine Welch and Christian Reus-Smit. For their support while working on the Ph.D., I would like to thank Lesley and Michael Cleary, Sandra Hacker, Margaret Leunig, Janet Reus-Smit, Tor Roxburgh and Pamela Storm. At Deakin University, Melbourne, I thank Joan Beaumont for her support and also gratefully acknowledge the study leave granted to me by Deakin University from January to June 2000. This time was spent as a Visiting Fellow in the Department of International Relations, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, Australian National University, where much of the work on chapter 7 was undertaken.

Since then I have had the good fortune to return to this department as a staff member and it is a great privilege to work in such a vibrant and collegial environment. In the Department of International Relations many thanks are due to Thuy Do for her enthusiastic research assistance and also to Mary-Louise Hickey for her painstaking work in preparing the manuscript for publication. Thanks too to Robin Ward for preparation of the index. I would also like to thank my colleagues in the Graduate Studies in International Affairs programme, the Director Greg Fry, Farnaz Salehzadeh and Suzanne Harding, for their patience and support during the final stages of the book.

Parts of this project have been presented in seminars at the Australian National University, Deakin University, Monash University, The University of Queensland, the Melbourne International Relations Discussion Group, the 'Ethics of Armed Intervention' Workshop held at the University of Melbourne in 1998 and at the APSA Annual Conference, 2000 in Washington, DC. I have benefited greatly from the comments of participants at these seminars. For their comments on various incarnations of the project, or the ideas therein, I thank Peter Katzenstein, Richard Little, Adrian Hastings and once again, Andrew Linklater. Thanks also to Henry Shue, Peter Christoff, Jacqui True, Lynn Savery, Stefan Auer, Jeffrey Checkel, David Wippman, V. P. Gagnon Jnr, Valerie Bunce and Matthew Evangelista. While I have gained immeasurably from the comments of,



Preface xiii

and conversations with, those mentioned above, any failures of omission or interpretation remain my own.

Finally, thanks are due to my partner Chris Reus-Smit for his unfailing love and support, for his inexhaustible commitment to intellectual engagement, and for his close reading of the manuscript as it evolved. I write this in Canberra, which means we no longer live in our 'House in the Woods'. Instead, these acknowledgements come from our new home, which has been dubbed fondly 'Parrot Point'.