

Legislative Politics in Latin America

This theoretically inspired study explores legislative politics in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, and Mexico. Instead of beginning with an assumption that these legislatures are either rubber stamps or obstructionist bodies, the chapters provide new data and a fresh analytical approach to describe and explain the role of these representative bodies in these consolidating democracies. For each country the book provides three chapters dedicated, in turn, to executive-legislative relations, the legislatures' organizational structure, and the policy process. The analytical focus of each section, however, remains the same: the role of institutional factors (including the allocation of policy-making authority between the executive and legislative branches of government; the number of relevant parties in the legislature; and the structure of electoral incentives) in shaping the patterns of legislative behavior.

Scott Morgenstern is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at Duke University. Professor Morgenstern has held a visiting professor position at CIDE (Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas) in Mexico and served as a visiting researcher at the Instituto de Cienica Politica, Uruguay.

Benito Nacif is Research Professor at CIDE (Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas) in Mexico. Professor Nacif's academic distinctions include the British Foreign Office and Commonwealth Scholarship (1990–1992).





Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editor

Margaret Levi University of Washington, Seattle

Associate Editors

Robert H. Bates Harvard University
Peter Hall Harvard University
Stephen Hanson University of Washington, Seattle
Peter Lange Duke University
Helen Milner Columbia University
Frances Rosenbluth Yale University
Susan Stokes University of Chicago

Other Books in the Series

Sidney Tarrow Cornell University

Stefano Bartolini, The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980: The Class Cleavage

Carles Boix, Political Parties, Growth and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy

Catherine Boone, Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal, 1930-1985

Michael Bratton and Nicolas van de Walle, Democratic Experiments in Africa: Regime Transitions in Comparative Perspective

Valerie Bunce, Leaving Socialism and Leaving the State: The End of Yugoslavia, the Soviet Union and Czechoslovakia

Ruth Berins Collier, Paths Toward Democracy: The Working Class and Elites in Western Europe and South America

Donatella della Porta, Social Movements, Political Violence, and the State

Gerald Easter, Reconstructing the State: Personal Networks and Elite Identity

Roberto Franzosi, The Puzzle of Strikes: Class and State Strategies in Postwar Italy

Geoffrey Garrett, Partisan Politics in the Global Economy

Miriam Golden, Heroic Defeats: The Politics of Job Loss

Merilee Serrill Grindle, Changing the State

Frances Hagopian, Traditional Politics and Regime Change in Brazil

J. Rogers Hollingsworth and Robert Boyer, eds., Contemporary Capitalism: The Embeddedness of Institutions

Ellen Immergut, Health Politics: Interests and Institutions in Western Europe

Continued on page following Index





Legislative Politics in Latin America

Edited by

SCOTT MORGENSTERN

Duke University

BENITO NACIF

CIDE





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521792196

© Cambridge University Press 2002

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002 Reprinted 2004

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Legislative politics in Latin America / edited by Scott Morgenstern, Benito Nacif.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)
Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.
ISBN 0-521-79219-3 – ISBN 0-521-79659-8 (pb.)

1. Legislative bodies – Latin America – Case studies. 2. Legislative power – Latin America – Case studies. 3. Executive power – Latin America – Case studies. 4. Party discipline – Latin America – Case studies. I. Morgenstern, Scott. II. Nacif, Benito, 1965 – III. Title. IV. Series. JL963 .L43 2001

JL963 .L43 2001 328′.098–dc21

2001025807

ISBN 978-0-521-79219-6 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-79659-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



Contents

Tables and Figures		page xi
Con	tributors	XV
Preface and Acknowledgments		xvii
Part	ry Names and Other Acronyms and Abbreviations	xix
1	TOWARDS A MODEL OF LATIN AMERICAN LEGISLATURES Scott Morgenstern	1
Par	t I: Executive–Legislative Relations	
2	OSCILLATING RELATIONS: PRESIDENT AND CONGRESS IN ARGENTINA Ana María Mustapic	23
3	PRESIDENTIAL CABINETS, ELECTORAL CYCLES, AND COALITION DISCIPLINE IN BRAZIL Octavio Amorim Neto	48
4	EXAGGERATED PRESIDENTIALISM AND MODERATE PRESIDENTS: EXECUTIVE–LEGISLATIVE RELATIONS IN CHILE Peter M. Siavelis	79
5	EXECUTIVE-LEGISLATIVE RELATIONS: THE CASE OF MEXICO (1946–1997) Ma. Amparo Casar	114
		vii



		Contents		
Par	Part II: Political Parties and Legislative Structure			
6	EXPLAINING THE HIGH LEVEL OF PARTY DISCIPLINE IN THE ARGENTINE CONGRESS Mark P. Jones	147		
7	PARTY DISCIPLINE IN THE CHAMBER OF DEPUTIES Barry Ames	185		
8	PARTIES, COALITIONS, AND THE CHILEAN CONGRESS IN THE 1990s John M. Carey	222		
9	UNDERSTANDING PARTY DISCIPLINE IN THE MEXICAN CHAMBER OF DEPUTIES: THE CENTRALIZED PARTY MODEL Benito Nacif	254		
Para	t III: Legislatures and the Policy Process			
10	FISCAL POLICY MAKING IN THE ARGENTINE LEGISLATURE Kent H. Eaton	287		
11	PROGRESSIVE AMBITION, FEDERALISM, AND PORK-BARRELING IN BRAZIL David Samuels	315		
12	APPOINTMENT, REELECTION, AND AUTONOMY IN THE SENATE OF CHILE John Londregan	341		
13	THE LEGAL AND PARTISAN FRAMEWORK OF THE LEGISLATIVE DELEGATION OF THE BUDGET IN MEXICO Jeffrey A. Weldon	377		
Part IV: Conclusions				
14	EXPLAINING LEGISLATIVE POLITICS IN LATIN AMERICA Scott Morgenstern	413		

viii



Contents

15 E	PILOGUE: LATIN AMERICA'S REACTIVE	
AS	SSEMBLIES AND PROACTIVE PRESIDENTS	440
G_{ϵ}	ary W. Cox and Scott Morgenstern	
Referenc	res	469
Author Index		493
General Index		497

ix





Tables and Figures

Tables

2.1	Makeup of the Chamber of Deputies by period and political	
	party	26
2.2	Makeup of Chamber of Senators by period and political party	26
2.3	Canceled sessions due to a lack of quorum in the Chamber of	
	Deputies (1983–1995)	27
2.4	Presidential vetoes	31
2.5	Vetoes of initiatives presented by members of Congress, by	
	political party	34
2.6	Number of positions and members on the front benches of the	
	blocks	35
2.7	Number of standing committees by chamber	36
2.8	Bills passed by initiative and presidential period	43
2.9	Passage of bills initiated by members of Congress	44
3.1	Hypothetical example of how to calculate the cabinet coalescence	
	rate	54
3.2	Presidential cabinets in Brazil (1985-1998)	56
3.3	Effective number of legislative parties (1985–1999)	59
3.4	Summary statistics of coalition discipline, support to the president,	
	per cabinet in Brazil (1985–1998)	64
3.5	The determinants of the coalition discipline rate (in accordance	
	with the president's preferences) of cabinet parties (1989–1998)	68
3.6	Ministerial payoff ratio of the PMDB, PFL, and PSDB	
	(1985–1998)	71
3.7	The determinants of individual parties' support to the president's	
	preferences (1989–1998)	73
4.1	Comparison of presidential and legislative initiatives 1990–1993	85
4.2	Forms of completion for presidential and legislative initiatives	
	1990–1993	86
4.3	Length of consideration: Comparative measures of presidential	
	and congressional initiatives	87
		xi



Tables and Figures

4.4	Distribution of seats in the Chilean House of Deputies by party – 1989, 1993, 1997	90
4.5	Distribution of seats in the Chilean Senate by party, 1989, 1993, 1997	91
4.6	Legislation introduced according to urgency and branch of origin (1990–1993)	92
4.7	Length of legislative consideration of presidential initiatives	
	according to urgency	93
4.8	Summary of approval rate for executive initiatives with and without urgency (1990–1993)	94
4A.1	Summary of legislation with origins in the legislative branch	
	promulgated as law during the Aylwin administration (1990–1994)	110
5.1	Initiatives introduced and approved by the Chamber of Deputies	
	(1982–1988)	126
5.2	Representation in the Chamber of Deputies, 1946–1985	127
5.3	Representation in the Chamber of Deputies, 1988–1997	127
5.4	Initiation and approval of bills, 1988-2000	128
5.5	Chamber of Deputies' committee presidencies (1988–1997)	130
5.6	Structure of political opportunity	136
6.1	Percentage of seats held, by party	152
6.2	Party discipline in the Chamber of Deputies, 1989–1997	156
6.3	Reelection to the Chamber of Deputies, 1989–1999	166
6.4	Last post held by deputies (class of 1991–1995) prior to	
	assuming office	168
6.5	Post held by deputies (class of 1991–1995) as of mid-1998	169
6.6	Percentage of PJ and UCR senators (1995–1998) who held these	4.50
	positions during the post-1983 democratic period	172
6.7	Percentage distribution of PJ and UCR national senators	
	(1995–1998) by the position they held immediately prior to	150
	being elected	173
6.8	Percentage distribution of PJ and UCR gubernatorial candidates	174
	(1991–1999) by the position they held when running for office	174
6.9	Percentage of the 40 individuals elected governor for the PJ and	
	UCR between 1991 and 1999 who held these positions during	175
7 1	the post-1983 democratic period	175
7.1	Cooperation and defection among PFL deputies: 1991–1998	202 203
7.2	Cooperation and defection among PMDB deputies: 1991–1998	
7.3	Cooperation and defection among PSDB deputies: 1991–1998	204 205
7.4 7.5	Cooperation and defection among PPB deputies: 1991–1998 Cooperation and defection among PDT deputies: 1991–1998	203
7.6		207
	Cooperation and defection among PTB deputies: 1991–1998 Cooperation and defection among PFL deputies: 1991–1998	216
	Cooperation and defection among PMDB deputies: 1991–1998 Cooperation and defection among PMDB deputies: 1991–1998	217
	Cooperation and defection among PSDB deputies: 1991–1998	217
	Cooperation and defection among PBB deputies: 1991–1998 Cooperation and defection among PPB deputies: 1991–1998	218
/ / 1. †	Cooperation and detection among FFB deputies: 1991–1998	219

xii



Tables and Figures

7A.5	Cooperation and defection among PDT deputies: 1991–1998	220
	Cooperation and defection among PTB deputies: 1991–1998	221
8.1	Partisan and coalition representation of elected legislators in	
	post-transition Chile	225
8.2	Effective number of vote-winning parties/lists in the Chilean	
	Chamber of Deputies	228
8.3	Renomination and reelection rates to the Chilean Chamber of	
	Deputies, 1989–1993	232
8.4	Renomination and reelection rates to the Chilean Chamber of	
	Deputies, 1993–1997	233
8.5	Renomination and reelection rates to the Chilean Senate	235
8.6	Experience of the 1997–2001 Chilean Congress	236
8.7	Committee characteristics, Congresses of 1994–1997 and	
	1998–2001	240
8.8	Weighted UNITY scores for coalitions and parties	246
8.9	Ideological locations of Chilean legislators, by party, on 1–10,	
	left–right scale	249
8.10	UNITY scores and ideological distances for cross-partisan blocs	249
9.1	Experience in office of incumbent deputies	259
9.2	Previous office experience of elected senators, 1997–2000	261
9.3	Previous office experience of elected governors, 1976–1995	262
9.4	Agenda control in the Chamber of Deputies under PRI majority:	
	The flow of legislative bills from committees to the floor in the	
	56th Legislature (1994–1997)	277
9.5	Agenda control in the Chamber of Deputies without PRI majority:	
	The flow of legislative bills from committees to the floor in the	
	57th Legislature (1997–2000)	281
10.1	Provincial shares of population, product, and revenue transfers	
	versus the electoral importance of the provinces to the Peronist	
	Party	294
10.2	How deputies voted on a list of services that would remain exempt	
	from the VAT	308
11.1	Malapportionment in the Brazilian Congress, 1998	318
11.2	Malapportionment and CMO membership	319
11.3	Budget amendments by agent, 1992–1999	321
11.4	Percent value of all submitted amendments, by submitting agent	322
11.5	Percent value of all approved amendments, by submitting agent	322
11.6	Percent value of submitted amendments	323
11.7	Percent value of approved amendments	323
11.8	Percent value of executed amendments	324
11.9	Average percentage value of amendments submitted to benefit state	
	government, per deputy, 1991–1998	334
11.10	Average percentage of municipalities to which deputies submitted	
	amendments as a percentage of all municipalities in the state,	
	1991–1998	336

xiii



Tables and Figures

11.11	Value of amendments submitted to "their" city as a percentage of the	
	total by deputies running for mayor, 1991–1998	338
12.1	Descriptive statistics: Labor Committee votes	347
12.2	Descriptive statistics: Labor Committee proposers	350
12.3	Proposals leading to divided votes	351
12.4	Parameter estimates for the Labor Committee	364
12.5	Test results	368
13.1	Review of budget laws (1917–1998)	395
13.2	Timing of submission and approval of budget (1917–1998)	399
13.3	Budget approval, amendments, and vetoes (1917–1998)	401
13.4	Pork, supplemental bills, and use of Facultades Extraordinarias	
	(1917-1970)	407
14.1	Reelection rates	416
14.2	Latin American electoral systems	420
14.3	Pedersen Index volatility scores, legislative elections, 1980–1997	423
14.4	Extremism, cohesion, and unity	424
14.5	Determinants of party unity	426
14.6	Structure of partisan competition, lower House	429
14.7	Partisan composition and legislative power	431
14.8	Constitutional powers of the president	438
14A.1	Legislators' self-placement on 10-point left-right scale	445
15.1	Presidential and assembly strategies	455
15.2	Variability of presidential support in the assembly, 1950s-1990s	457
Figur	res	
Ü		
12.1	Hypothetical policy preferences: High salience on the valence	
	dimension	355
12.2	Hypothetical policy preferences: Low salience on the valence	
	dimension	356
12.3	Estimated preferred outcomes	366

xiv



Contributors

Barry Ames Department of Political Science University of Pittsburgh 4L01 Forbes Quad Pittsburgh, PA 152060

Octavio Amorim Neto Rio de Janeiro Graduate Research Institute Rua da Matriz 82 Rio de Janeiro, RJ 22260-100 Brazil

Ma. Amparo Casar Division de Estudio Politicos Centro de Investigacion y Docencia Economicas Carretera Mexico – Toluce 3655 Col. Lomas de Santa Fe Mexico DF, 01210 Mexico

John M. Carey Department of Political Science Washington University, St. Louis Campus Box 1063 One Brookings Drive St. Louis, MO 63130

Gary W. Cox Department of Political Science University of California, San Diego 9500 Gilman Drive, 0521 La Jolla, CA 92093 Kent H. Eaton Woodrow Wilson School Princeton University Princeton, NJ 08544

Mark P. Jones Department of Political Science Michigan State University East Lansing, MI 48824-1032

John Londregan Department of Political Science University of California, Los Angeles 3351 Bunche Los Angeles, CA 14702-1180

Scott Morgenstern
Department of Political Science,
Box 90204
Duke University
Durham, NC 27704

Ana María Mustapic Universidad Torcuato Di Tella Minones 2177 Buenos Aires, 1428 Argentina

Benito Nacif Centro de Investigacion y Docencia Economicas Lomas de Santa Fe Careterra Mexico – Toluca 3655 Mexico, DF, 01210 Mexico

ΧV



Contributors

David Samuels Department of Political Science University of Minnesota Minneapolis, MN 55455

Peter M. Siavelis Politics Department Wake Forest University Box 7568 Reynolda Station Winston-Salem, NC 27109 Jeffrey A. Weldon Dept. de Ciencia Politica ITAM Rio Hondo #1 Col. Tizapan San Angel 01000 Mexico, DF Mexico

xvi



Preface and Acknowledgments

Before 1997 few were studying the Mexican Congress, let alone other legislatures in Latin America. In 1996, however, the opposition parties in Mexico were poised to wrestle the PRI for control of the Congress for the first time, which they succeeded in doing the following year. Understandably, this generated tremendous interest in legislative politics not only among academics, but also in the business world, the press, and the general public.

At that time the two of us were working in the Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas (CIDE) in Mexico City. Blanca Heredia and Carlos Elizondo, the academic secretary and general director of CIDE respectively, charged the two of us with organizing an international conference of our own design. We both had recently finished dissertations related to legislative politics and realized that bringing in other experts could provide the field much fuller descriptions and richer analyses than our own individual work. Further, Mainwaring and Shugart had been working on their volume on presidentialism in Latin America, and we saw an opportunity to complement their valuable study.

Our first challenge was in defining the scope of our study. In this we relied on the División de Estudios Politicos (Political Studies Division) of CIDE, where we first presented our ideas. The first drafts of the proposal covered many countries and themes. We were forced, therefore, into a tradeoff between depth and breadth. We opted for the former, as it allowed us to add theoretical rigor to studies of Latin American politics. Having made this decision, we settled on addressing two main theoretical issues, executive–legislative relations and legislative organization, with a third section showing how these issues shape the policy process.

xvii



Preface and Acknowledgments

Our theoretical bent stems from our training in American politics, based on David Mayhew's general model of the U.S. legislature and Joseph Schlesinger's theory of political ambition. These works have been important cornerstones of studies of the U.S. Congress, since they have shown how simple assumptions about legislators' reelection drives shape politics. However, since they focus on just one case, they hide several assumptions about the nature of the party system, the constitution, the electoral system, and the reelection interests of legislators.

These "hidden" assumptions become variables in a comparative model. We therefore chose our four cases, Argentina, Brazil, Chile, and Mexico, to test their impact. The most prominent variable gleaned from the U.S. models is the reelection-seeking goal of legislators. In Latin America no country has reelection rates as high as those found in the United States, but Chile has the region's highest rates. At the other end of the spectrum is Mexico, where immediate reelection is prohibited. Argentina and Brazil lie at other nodes on the continuum, and thus these cases presented themselves as prime suspects for our study. These countries also provide important variance on our other variables, most importantly the shape of the party and electoral systems.

Our contributors, of course, share this methodological focus. This has allowed us to provide comparable chapters on each of the four countries for each of the three themes. As such, the volume combines depth of knowledge about the four cases as well as tests of our primary variables across four major Latin American countries.

In producing this volume we have incurred many debts. Foremost we must thank CIDE for its financial and moral support. The Center for International Studies at Duke University also provided key financial support for the project. The Fredrich Eber Foundation deserves a special mention for the important financial support from the early stages of the project. Also supportive were the Legislative Studies Committee (Comisión de Estudios Legislativos) and the Institute for Legislative Studies (Instituto de Estudios Legislativos) of the 57th Legislature of the Mexican Chamber of Deputies.

On the intellectual side, our primary thanks must go to an anonymous reviewer who provided almost 40 single-spaced pages of comments. Alex Holzman and Cambridge University Press were very encouraging and helped us focus our revisions. Finally, Lewis Bateman at Cambridge gave us the last necessary push to revise and improve some key sections.

xviii



Party Names and Other Acronyms and Abbreviations

Party Names

Argentina

Alianza Alianza para el Trabajo, la Justicia y la Educación (Alliance for

Work, Justice and Education)

FG Frente Grande (Large Front)

FR Fuerza Republicana (Republican Force)

Frepaso Frente País Solidario (Front for a Country in Solidarity) **MODIN**

Movimiento por la Dignidad y la Independencia (Movement for

Dignity and Independence)

Partido Autonomista (Autonomist Party) PA

PDC Partido Demócrata Cristiano (Christian Democratic Party) PDP Partido Demócrata Progresista (Progressive Democrat Party)

 $_{\rm PI}$ Partido Intransigente (Intransigent Party)

ΡŢ Partido Justicialista (Justicialist Party [Peronists])

PSD Partido Socialista Demócratico (Democratic Socialist Party)

PSP Partido Socialista Popular (Popular Socialist Party)

UCeDé Unión del Centro Democrático (Union of the Democratic

UCR Unión Cívica Radical (Radical Civic Union)

Brazil

PDS Partido Democrático Social (Democratic Social Party) PDT Partido Democrático Trabalhista (Democratic Labor Party) PFL Partido da Frente Liberal (Party of the Liberal Front)

Partido Liberal (Liberal Party) PI.

Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro (Party of the **PMDB**

Brazilian Democratic Movement)

PP Partido Progressista (Progressive Party)

PPB Partido Progressista Brasileiro (Brazilian Progressive Party)

xix



Party Names and Other Acronyms and Abbreviations

PPS Partido Popular Socialista (Popular Socialist Party)
PRN Partido da Reconstrução Nacional (Party of National

Reconstruction)

PSB Partido Socialista Brasileiro (Brazilian Socialist Party)

PSDB Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira (Party of the Brazilian

Social Democracy)

PST Partido Social Trabalhista (Social Labor Party)
PT Partido dos Trabalhadores (Worker's Party)

PTB Partido Trabalhista Brasileiro (Brazilian Labor Party)

Chile

PPD Partido por la Democracia (Party for Democracy)

PS Partido Socialista (Socialist Party)

RN Renovacion Nacional (National Renovation)

UDI Union Democratica Independiente (Democratic Independent

Union)

Mexico

PAN Partico Acción Nacional (National Action Party)

PRD Partido de la Revolución Democratica (Party of the Democratic

Revolution)

PRI Partido Revolucionario Institucional (Institutional Revolutionary

Party)

PT Partido de Trabajo (Labor Party)

PVEM Partido Verde Ecologista de México (Green Party)

Other Acronyms and Abbreviations

CEDI Centro de Estudios para el Desarrollo Institucional (Center for

Studies for Institutional Development)

CEN Comite Ejecutivo Nacional (National Executive Committee)
CLP Comisión de Labor Parlamentaria (Committee of Parliamentary

Work)

CMO Comissão Mista de Planos, Orçamentos Públicos e Fiscalização

(Joint Committee for Planning, Public Budgets and Oversight;

Brazilian budget committee)

CONASUPO Compañía Nacional de Subsistencias Populares (National

Company for Public Subsistence)

CRICP Comisión de Régimen Interno y Concertación Política (Commit-

tee for Internal Regulations and Political Concertation)

DGI Direccion General Impositiva (Director Tax General)

DNU Decree of Necessity and Urgency

DSV double simultaneous vote

XX



Party Names and Other Acronyms and Abbreviations

FOBAPROA Fondo Bancario de Proteccíon al Ahorros (Banking Fund for the

Protection of Savings)

GC Gran Comisión (Great Committee) IMF International Monetary Fund

INJ Instituto Nacional Juvenil (National Youth Institute)

ISI Import-substituting industrialization

M District Magnitude

GAO General Accounting Office (Contaduria Mayor de Hacienda)

MC Member of Congress

MCDs Mexican Chamber of Deputies NUDs Necessary and Urgent Decrees

PEMEX Petróleos Mexicanos (Mexican Petroleum)

PR Proportional Representation

SEGPRES Ministerio Secretaría General de la Presidencia (Ministry of the

Secretary General of the President)

SMD single-member district VAT Value Added Tax

xxi