

The World Bank is dedicated to the promotion of sustainable economic development and to poverty reduction throughout the developing world. It faces new challenges as capital shortages are replaced by large but volatile capital flows. The contributors to this volume argue that the Bank's greatest asset is its accumulated knowledge and experience of the development process, and propose that it organise itself around the concept of a 'Knowledge Bank'. They propose a shift in priority, away from lending with conditionality imposed on borrowing governments, towards assistance to governments in devising good development strategies. Part One examines the existing structure of the Bank and considers the World Bank as an institution. In Part Two the effectiveness of World Bank assistance is evaluated. This book provides essential reading for politicians, civil servants, workers in the non-official sector, and academics and students involved or interested in the development process.

Christopher L. Gilbert is Full Professor in the Department of Finance and Financial Sector Management at the Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. He is also a Visiting Professor of Economics at Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London.

David Vines is Fellow in Economics at Balliol College, Oxford. He is the Director of the Research Programme on Global Economic Institutions of the UK Economic and Social Research Council. He is also an Adjunct Professor of Economics at the Australian National University.



The World Bank

Structure and Policies



The World Bank

Structure and Policies

edited by

Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines 2000

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

Typeface: Times 9/11pt System: [3B2] KW

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 79095 6 hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2004



Global Economic Institutions

This is the third of a series of books produced under the auspices of the Global Economic Institutions Research programme of the UK Economic and Social Research Council. The first two titles have been about Europe, East Asia and regionalism, and about the IMF and international financial crises. There will also be an overview book on global architecture and the reform of global economic institutions, and further volumes may follow.

Oxford Policy Institute

The Oxford Policy Institute (OPI) is an educational charity which brings international research and policy experience to bear on improving public sector policies and performance. It concentrates on areas of economic activity in which the state has a substantial role:

- the provision or financing of health services and education,
- the regulation of economic activity,
- the redistribution of income (including tax policy, social security and international aid).

OPI is concerned both with the role that governments should play at all levels – local, regional, national and international – and with improving the effectiveness and accountability of all kinds of organisations in the public sector.

Oxford Policy Institute 21 St Giles Oxford OX1 3LA Tel. +44 1865 250233 admin@opi.org.uk



Centre for Economic Policy Research

The Centre for Economic Policy Research is a network of over 500 Research Fellows and Affiliates, based primarily in European Universities. The Centre coordinates the research activities of its Fellows and Affiliates and communicates the results to the public and private sectors. CEPR is an entrepreneur, developing research initiatives with the producers, consumers and sponsors of research. Established in 1983, CEPR is a European economics research organisation with uniquely wide-ranging scope and activities.

CEPR is a registered educational charity. Institutional (core) finance for the Centre is provided by major grants from the Economic and Social Research Council, under which an ESRC Resource Centre operates within CEPR; the Esmée Fairburn Charitable Trust and the Bank of England. The Centre is also supported by the European Central Bank; the Bank for International Settlements; 22 national central banks and 45 companies. None of these organisations gives prior review to the Centre's publications, nor do they necessarily endorse the views expressed therein.

The Centre is pluralist and non-partisan, bringing economic research to bear on the analysis of medium- and long-run policy questions. CEPR research may include views on policy, but the Executive Committee of the Centre does not give prior review to its publications, and the Centre takes no institutional policy positions. The opinions expressed in this book are those of the authors and not those of the Centre for Economic Policy Research.

Guillermo de la Dehesa

Executive Committee

Jan Krysztof BieleckiDenis GrombBridget RosewellDiane CoylePhilippe LagayetteMario SarcinelliQuentin DaviesAnthony LoehnisKermit SchoenholtzBernard Dewe MathewsPeter MiddletonPhilippe Weil

Francesco Giavazzi Rafael Repullo

Officers

Chairman

PresidentRichard PortesChief Executive OfficerStephen Yeo

Research Director Mathias Dewatripont



Centre for Economic Policy Research 90–98 Goswell Road London, EC1V 7RR

UK

Tel: (44 20 7878) 2900 Fax: (44 20 7878) 2999 Email: cepr@cepr.org Website: http://www.cepr.org

January 2000



Contents

List of figures page	XV
List of tables	xvi
List of contributors	xviii
Acknowledgements	xxii
Introduction Joseph E. Stiglitz	1
1 The World Bank: an overview of some major issues	10
Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines	
1 The institutional organisation of the Bank	12
2 The history of the Bank	14
3 The World Bank's structure: the Bank as an institution 4 The World Bank's policies: the effectiveness of	17
World Bank aid	21
5 The 'Knowledge Bank': a unifying framework	29
6 The World Bank and crises	30
7 Plan of this volume	31
8 The past and the future	32
Part One: The World Bank's Structure: The Bank as an Institution	
2 Positioning the World Bank	39
Christopher L. Gilbert, Andrew Powell and David Vines	
1 Introduction and summary	39
2 Rationales for an institution like the Bank3 Understanding and justifying the Bank's current	41
activities	44
	xi



Cambridge University Press

0521790956 - The World Bank: Structure and Policies - Edited by Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines

Frontmatter/Prelims

More information

xii	Contents	
	4 Two paradigms: the 'Conditionality Bank' and the	
	'Knowledge Bank'	54
	5 The ineffectiveness of conditionality: evidence and	50
	implications	59
	6 The Bank's role in the light of the emerging market financial crisis	65
	7 The Bank as an institution	72
	3 The World Bank and poverty reduction: past, present and	
	future	87
	Ravi Kanbur and David Vines	
	1 Introduction	87
	2 A brief history of thinking about poverty reduction	88
	3 World Bank thinking on, and policy actions towards,	95
	poverty 4 Poverty reduction and the Bank at the turn of the	93
	century	101
	4 Why the World Bank should be involved in development	
	research	108
	Lyn Squire	
	1 Introduction	108
	2 World Bank research and analysis	111
	3 The World Bank and development research	112 123
	4 The bottom line: quality and impact 5 Conclusion	123
	5 Conclusion	14/
	5 The challenges of multilateralism and governance	132

2 The United States and the Bank as a multilateral

3 The relative autonomy of the Bank

Ngaire Woods
1 Introduction

institution

5 Conclusions

4 New challenges

132

133

137

147

150



Cambridge University Press

0521790956 - The World Bank: Structure and Policies - Edited by Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines

Frontmatter/Prelims

More information

		Contents	xiii
Part	Two: The Effectiveness of World Ban	k Assistance	
	6 The World Bank and structural adjustment:	lessons from the	
	1980s		159
	Francisco H.G. Ferreira and Louise C. Keel	y	150
	1 Introduction 2 The concents courses and nature of adjust	stmant	159 160
	2 The concepts, causes and nature of adjust3 Stabilisation policies	stillellt	168
	4 Adjustment and efficiency of resource all	ocation	175
	5 Adjustment and equity	ocation	179
	6 Conclusions		188
	Appendix		189
	7 The implications of foreign aid fungibility fo	r development	
	assistance	•	196
	Shantayanan Devarajan and Vinya Swaroop	1	
	1 Introduction		196
	2 Fungibility of economic assistance		197
	3 Aid fungibility: a research review		200
	4 Lending instruments and strategies: the i	mplications of	20.4
	economic fungibility 5 Conclusion		204 207
	5 Conclusion		207
	8 Aid, growth, the incentive regime and povert	y reduction	210
	Craig Burnside and David Dollar		
	1 Introduction		210
	2 Aid and growth: theory and evidence		211
	3 Aid and infant mortality		219
	4 Conclusions		223
	9 How policies and institutions affect project p		
	microeconomic evidence on aid, policies and	investment	220
	productivity		228
	Jonathan Isham and Daniel Kaufmann		220
	1 Introduction 2 How policies and institutions affect project	act	228
	2 How policies and institutions affect project performance: a framework	7C1	229
	3 The policy determinants of performance:	evidence from	<u> </u>
	economic projects	Trachec mon	232
	4 The effect of the overall public investmen	nt programme	
	on investment returns	1 0	244
	5 The effect of institutions on investment i	eturns	248



Cambridge University Press

 ${\tt 0521790956} \hbox{-} The World Bank: Structure and Policies - Edited by Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines$

Frontmatter/Prelims

More information

xiv	Contents	
	6 Implications for World Bank policies and strategies	254
	Appendix: a very simple theoretical model	258
	10 Increasing aid effectiveness in Africa? The World Bank and	
	sector investment programmes	266
	Stephen Jones	
	1 Introduction	266
	2 Key issues for aid effectiveness	267
	3 Sector investment programmes	268
	4 Sector investment programmes in practice: examples from	
	Africa	273
	5 The role of the sector approach in increasing aid	
	effectiveness	276
	11 The World Bank, conditionality and the Comprehensive	
	Development Framework	282
	Raul Hopkins, Andrew Powell, Amlan Roy and	
	Christopher L. Gilbert	
	1 Introduction	282
	2 The World Bank: a functional analysis	282
	3 How to understand the World Bank	285
	4 The conditionality debate	288
	5 Conditionality trade-offs	290
	6 Conditionality and the CDF	293
	7 Conclusions	295
	12 Conditionality, dependence and coordination: three current	
	debates in aid policy	299
	Paul Collier	
	1 Introduction	299
	2 Policy conditionality	299
	3 'Aid-dependency'	312
	4 The aid relationship as an instrument for regional	

Index

coordination

5 Conclusion

320

322

325



Figures

		page
2.1	Net transfers, 1985, 1990 and 1995	47
6.1	Flexible and rigid responses to an external shock	164
7.1	The concept of 'fungibility'	198
8.1	Indirect effects arising from different parameterisations	
	of the model	215
8.2	A 'good-management' environment	222
9.1	Share of public investment in GDP and the productivity	
	of tradeable projects	245
9.2	Share of public investment in total investment and the	
	productivity of tradeable projects	246
10.1	A framework for understanding sector programmes	277
11.1	Enforcement of debt service: a game-theoretic framework	286
12.1	The relationship between aid and policy for the median	
	developing country	310
12.2	The fiscal effects of aid	316



Tables

4.1	Bank resources devoted to research in relation to other	page
	Bank analytical work and the administrative budget,	
	FY 1992–1997	113
6.1	Responses of developed and developing countries to the oil	
	shocks of the 1970s.	162
6.2	SAL and SECAL programme levels of funding, 1980–1990	170
6.3	SAL and SECAL funding trends, 1980–1990	
6.4	Policies and results in a sample of countries, 1980–1993	
6.5	OED average rating, by region, 1980–1993	
6.6	Dollar and Svensson (1998), empirical results	
6.7	Average economic indicators of countries	184
6.8	Poverty and inequality in rural Tanzania, 1983 and 1991	186
6.9	Poverty and inequality in Brazil, 1981–1990	187
6A.1	SAL and SECAL programmes, 1980–1990	190
6A.2	Macroeconomic conditions of SAL and SECAL	
	programmes, 1980–1992	190
6A.3	OED SAL and SECAL rating results, 1980–1990	191
6A.4	SAL and SECAL OED ratings, 1980–1993	191
6A.5	SAL sectoral conditions, by sector, 1980–1992	
6A.6	SECAL sectoral conditions, by sector, 1980–1992	192
7.1	Does foreign aid increase government spending?	202
7.2	Does foreign project aid finance particular sectoral	
	spending?	203
8.1	Panel growth regressions,	218
8.2	Estimated impact of 1 per cent of GDP in aid on growth	219
8.3	Panel regressions for decline in infant mortality	223
9.1	Summary statistics	233
9.2	Economic policies and the ERR of projects: single policy	
	distortions	235

xvi



 $\label{lem:cambridge} \begin{tabular}{ll} Cambridge University Press \\ o 521790956 - The World Bank: Structure and Policies - Edited by Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines \\ \end{tabular}$

Frontmatter/Prelims More information

	List of tables	xvii
9.3	Economic policies and the ERR of projects: combined	
	policy distortions	236
9.4	Determinants of ERRs: single-policy variable Tobit	
	specifications	237
9.5	Determinants of ERRs: combined-policy variable	
	specifications	239
9.6	ERRs and policy reforms: controlling for initial conditions	241
9.7	Economic policies and the performance of social projects:	
	single-policy distortions	243
9.8	Determinants of performance of social projects: Probit	
	estimations	244
9.9	Public investment and the ERR of tradeable projects	247
9.10	Impact of civil liberties on rates of return	251
9.11	Impact of civil liberties on satisfactory performance of	
	economic and social projects: Probit estimations	252
9.12	Indicators of civil strife, by average ERR, by country	252
9.13	Indicators of civil strife and project returns, without and	
	with controls for civil liberties	254
11.1	Forms of conditionality	292



Contributors

Christopher L. Gilbert is Research Professor of Finance in the Faculteit der Economische Wetenschappen en Econometrie, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. He is Visiting Professor of Economics at Queen Mary and Westfield College, London, a Research Fellow of the Centre for Economic Policy Research in London and a Fellow of the Tinbergen Institute. He has worked with the World Bank over a number of years.

David Vines is Fellow in Economics at Balliol College, Oxford. He is the Director of the Research Programme on Global Economic Institutions of the UK Economic and Social Research Council, and is also an Adjunct Professor of Economics at the Australian National University. He is a Research Fellow of the Centre for Economic Policy Research in London.

Craig Burnside is an economist in the Development Economics Research Group of the World Bank. He was formerly Assistant Professor of Economics at Queen's University (Canada) and also at the University of Pittsburgh, and is a former National Fellow of the Hoover Institution.

Paul Collier is Director of the Development Research Group of the World Bank. He is on leave from the University of Oxford where he is Professor of Economics and Director of the Centre for the Study of African Economies. He is a Research Fellow of the Centre for Economic Policy Research in London.

Shantayanan Devarajan is Research Manager for Public Economics in the World Bank's Development Research Group. He is also the Editor of the *World Bank Research Observer*.

xviii



More information

Cambridge University Press 0521790956 - The World Bank: Structure and Policies - Edited by Christopher L. Gilbert and David Vines Frontmatter/Prelims

Contributors xix

David Dollar is Head of the Macroeconomics and Growth team in the Development Research Group of the World Bank. He is the co-author (with Lant Pritchett) of the World Bank's 1999 report, 'Assessing Aid'.

Francisco Ferreira is currently on leave from the World Bank's Poverty Reduction and Economic Management group and is a Professor in the Departamento de Economia at Pontifica Universidade Catòlica do Rio de Janeiro. He was formerly a researcher at STICERD at the London School of Economics.

Raul Hopkins is Lecturer in International Finance and Development Economics, Queen Mary and Westfield College, London. He is Research Associate of STICERD at the London School of Economics and a member of the Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, Lima.

Jonathan Isham is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Economics and the Program in Environmental Studies, Middlebury College. His current research focuses on the social foundations of microeconomic performance and economic growth.

Stephen Jones manages the Economic Policy Programme at Oxford Policy Management. He has worked on economic reform and aid policy in Africa, Asia and the former Soviet Union.

Ravi Kanbur is T. H. Lee Professor of World Affairs and Professor of Economics at Cornell University. From 1989 to 1997 he was on the staff of the World Bank, serving successively as Economic Advisor, Senior Economic Advisor, Resident Representative in Ghana, Chief Economist of the African Region of the World Bank and Principal Advisor to the Chief Economist of the World Bank. Prior to joining the World Bank, he was Professor of Economics and Director of the Development Economics Research Centre at the University of Warwick, UK, having previously taught at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, Essex and Princeton. Mr Kanbur is the Director of the World Bank's World Development Report on Poverty and Development (September 2000).

Daniel Kaufmann is a Senior Manager at the World Bank Institute, heading the Governance, Finance and Regulatory Reform Group. Previously, he was a Lead Economist in the Development Economics Group. During the early 1990s he was the first Chief of Mission of the Bank in Ukraine. He was a Visiting Scholar at Harvard University in the mid-1990s, where



xx Contributors

he provided policy advice on a range of economic and institutional issues to governments in emerging economies and in transition.

Louise Keely is a Research Fellow in Economics at New College, Oxford. She is a Research Associate at the Centre of Economic Performance at the London School of Economics.

Andrew Powell is Chief Economist of the Central Bank of Argentina. Previously, he held academic positions at the University of Warwick and Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London.

Amlan Roy is Vice-President in the Global Emerging Markets Strategy Group of Credit Suisse First Boston in London. Mr Roy is also a Research Associate of LSE's Financial Markets Group. He was previously a lecturer at Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London.

Lyn Squire has just completed a three-year assignment to the World Bank as Director of Development Policy in the Office of the Bank's Chief Economist, Joseph Stiglitz. He is now Director of the Global Development Network, an emerging association of research and policy institutes whose goal is to generate and share knowledge related to development.

Joseph E. Stiglitz was, at the time of writing, serving an appointment to the World Bank as Senior Vice President for Development Economics and Chief Economist. Previously, he served as Chairman of the US Council of Economic Advisers from June 1995, and was a member of the Council and an active member of President Clinton's economic team from 1993. Mr Stiglitz is on leave from Stanford University, where he is a Professor of Economics. He was previously a professor of economics at Princeton, Yale and Oxford. In 1979, the American Economic Association awarded him its biennial John Bates Clark Award, given to the economist under forty who has made the most significant contribution to economics. His work has also been recognised through his election as a fellow to the National Academy of Sciences, the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and the Econometric Society.

Vinya Swaroop, a Principal Economist, holds a joint appointment with the Development Research Group and the Public Sector Group of the Poverty Reduction and Management Network at the World Bank.



Contributors xxi

Ngaire Woods is Fellow in Politics and International Relations at University College, Oxford, Senior Research Associate of Queen Elizabeth House and Chair of the Working Group on the International Financial Institutions of the Global Financial Governance Initiative at the International Development Research Centre, Ottawa.



Acknowledgements

In early 1994, the UK Economic and Social Research Council (the ESRC) launched the Global Economic Institutions (GEI) Research Programme, with the objective of funding academic research on the functioning of multilateral economic organisations and about the global institutional structures within which economic activity takes place. As part of this programme, a group of researchers has been considering the structure and policies of the World Bank. This book, which brings together that work, is edited by Christopher Gilbert (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, Queen Mary and Westfield College, London and CEPR), who has led the research, and David Vines (Balliol College, Oxford, Australian National University and CEPR), who is Director of the GEI Programme.

The initial presentation of some of this work took place at the 1996 American Economic Association meetings in San Francisco, and a further discussion meeting was held in the World Bank in February 1997. This led to a workshop on 'The Future of the World Bank' at the Foreign and Commonwealth Office in London on 24 June 1997. The success of that meeting led us to embark on the project of assembling this book. All but two of the chapters have been commissioned, and written, specially for the book. The two editors visited the Bank on a number of occasions in the course of 1998 and 1999, to discuss the contents of the book with economists, and with operational staff, within the Bank. As their work was beginning, they were asked by Jan Gunning (Oxford University and Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam) and Paul Collier (Oxford University, now at the Bank) to write a chapter on the future of the Bank for a 'Special Feature' of the *Economic Journal* on the Changing Roles of the World's International Financial Institutions that appeared just as this book went to press; a greatly revised version of that paper has become chapter 2 of this book.

xxii



Acknowledgements xxiii

We are glad to acknowledge the funding by the ESRC of work in this important area. We would also like to express our thanks to Barry Eichengreen for his invitation to present the initial work in San Francisco and to Huw Evans, then UK Executive Director at the IMF and the World Bank, for organising the meeting at the Bank in February 1997. We are much indebted to Jim Rollo, then Chief Economist at the UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office, for hosting the June 1997 meeting, and to the Centre for Economic Policy Research and the Oxford Policy Institute (and in particular Andrew Graham, of Balliol College, Oxford) for their assistance in organising it. The editors appreciate, too, the courteousness with which many Bank staff have dealt with our requests for information and assistance, and the interest which large numbers of Bank staff have shown in this work as it edged towards completion.

At Cambridge University Press, Ashwin Rattan and Chris Harrison worked hard to expedite our plans, and arranged for three referees to comment on initial drafts of a set of chapters. We are grateful for those comments, since they helped us to considerably improve the general shape of the book. The production of the book would also not have been possible without the continuing assistance and unflagging enthusiasm of the Publications staff at CEPR. Sue Chapman, Lorna Guthrie and Lisa Moss have all worked hard to make this book happen, and to them we express our sincere thanks.

Last, but not least, we are grateful for the interest which Joe Stiglitz has shown in our project from the beginning, and for his assistance in helping us to secure some of the chapters for the book. In the week that the final chapters of the book are being sent to press, we have learned of Joe's pending departure from the Bank. The loss, both to the Bank and to the wider international community, will be considerable. As Chief Economist, Joe was always keen to provoke debate, even on issues which others would have preferred to regard as settled. His pivotal position in Washington stamped these criticisms with an authority which seldom derives from an academic position. There may be fewer ruffled feathers in the future, but we must hope that the spirit of openness and debate that Joe encouraged within the Bank will outlast his departure.

The editors and publishers thank the following for permission to reproduce copyright material.

World Development, for figure 6.1, from F. Bourguignon, J. de Melo and C. Morrisson 'Poverty and Income Distribution during Adjustment: Issues and Evidence from the OECD Project' (1991).



xxiv Acknowledgements

Oxford University Press, for figure 11.1, from R. W. Anderson, C. L. Gilbert and A. Powell, 'Securitizing Development Finance: The Role of Partial Guarantees and Commodity Contingency', in T. Priovolos and R. C. Duncan (eds.), *Commodity Risk Management and Finance* (1991).

The World Bank, for figure 12.1, from P. Collier and D. Dollar, 'Aid Allocation and Poverty Reduction', Policy Research Working Paper, **2041** (1999); for data in tables 6.2–6.5, 6.7, 6A.1–6A.6, from C. Jayarajah and W. Branson, Structural and Sectoral Adjustment: World Bank Experience, 1980-92 (1995) and C. Jayarajah, W. Branson and B. Sen, Social Dimensions of Adjustment: World Bank Experience, 1980-93 (1996), in table 6.6, from D. Dollar and J. Svensson, 'What Explains the Success or Failure of Structural Adjustment Programs?', World Bank PRWP, 1938 (1998), in table 6.7, from WDR 1997 and World Development Indicators (1998) and in table 6.8, from M.L. Ferreira, 'Poverty and Inequality during Structural Adjustment in Rural Tanzania', World Bank PRWP Working Paper, 1641 (1996); for data in tables 9.7 and 9.8, from D. Kaufmann and Y. Wang, 'Macroeconomic Policies and Project Performance in the Social Sectors', World Development, 23 (1995) and in tables 9.10-9.13, from J. Isham, D. Kaufmann and L.H. Pritchett, 'Civil Liberties, Democracy, and the Performance of Government Projects', World Bank Economic Review, 11 (1997).

STICERD/DARP, for data in table 6.9, from F.H.G. Ferreira and J.A. Litchfield, 'Growing Apart: Inequality and Poverty Trends in Brazil in the 1980s', *STICERD/DARP Discussion Paper*, **23** (1996).

Quarterly Journal of Economics, for data in table 9.1–9.5 and 9.9, from J. Isham and D. Kaufmann, 'The Forgotten Rationale for Policy Reform: The Productivity of Investment Projects' (2000).

Review of Income and Wealth, for data in table 6.1, from R. Summers and A. Heston, 'A New set of International Comparisons of Real Product and Price Levels: Estimates for 130 Countries, 1950–1985' (1988). Brett House, for data in figure 2.1.

Christopher Gilbert David Vines Amsterdam and Oxford January 2000