Pragmatic Impairment

Pragmatics – the way we interact using more than just language – is particularly problematic for people with communication disorders. Through an extensive analysis of how pragmatics can go wrong, this book not only provides a novel and clinically useful account of pragmatic impairment, but it also throws new light on how pragmatics functions in healthy individuals. The aim of this book is to bring mainstream and clinical pragmatics together by showing that, not only can our understanding of pragmatics be aided by the study of pragmatic impairment, but that clinical and theoretical pragmatics are better served by treating pragmatic ability and disability within a single framework. It is the first book on this topic to be aimed primarily at linguists and psycholinguists rather than clinicians, and includes illustrative material on conditions such as autism and aphasia and a wide range of other communication disorders in both children and adults.

MICHAEL PERKINS is Professor of Clinical Linguistics in the Department of Human Communication Sciences at the University of Sheffield.
Pragmatic Impairment

Michael Perkins
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of figures</th>
<th>Page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcription conventions</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Introduction 1
   1.1 Aims 1
   1.2 Influences 3
   1.3 Outline 4

2 Pragmatic theory and pragmatic impairment 8
   2.1 Introduction 8
   2.2 Defining pragmatic ability and disability 9
      2.2.1 Linguistic vs non-linguistic pragmatics 9
      2.2.2 Normal vs abnormal pragmatic behaviour 10
      2.2.3 Neurological, cognitive and behavioural perspectives 13
   2.3 The clinical application of pragmatic theories and analytical methods 14
      2.3.1 Speech Act Theory 15
      2.3.2 Conversational Implicature 17
      2.3.3 Relevance Theory 19
      2.3.4 Discourse Analysis 21
      2.3.5 Conversation Analysis 27
   2.4 The need for a holistic approach 30

3 Pragmatics and modularity: components, dissociations and associations 33
   3.1 Introduction 33
   3.2 Modularity 34
   3.3 Modularity and pragmatics 36
   3.4 Modular dysfunction vs central capacity overload 37
   3.5 Impairments attributed to modular dysfunction 38
   3.6 Impairments attributed to central capacity limitations 41
   3.7 Background to an interactive emergentist pragmatics 44
      3.7.1 Emergence 45
## Contents

5.5.3 Memory: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 97  
5.5.4 Memory: interactions in the interpersonal domain 98  
5.6 Emotion and attitude 99  
5.6.1 Introduction 99  
5.6.2 Impairment of emotion and attitude and its pragmatic consequences 102  
5.6.3 Emotion and attitude: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 104  
5.6.4 Emotion and attitude: interactions in the interpersonal domain 105  
5.7 Conclusion 106  

6 Language and pragmatics 107  
6.1 Introduction 107  
6.2 Phonology and prosody 109  
6.2.1 Introduction 109  
6.2.2 Phonological and prosodic impairment and their pragmatic consequences 112  
6.2.3 Phonology and prosody: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 113  
6.2.4 Phonology and prosody: interactions in the interpersonal domain 116  
6.3 Syntax and morphology 117  
6.3.1 Introduction 117  
6.3.2 Grammatical impairment and its pragmatic consequences 119  
6.3.3 Syntax and morphology: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 120  
6.3.4 Syntax and morphology: interactions in the interpersonal domain 122  
6.4 Semantics 123  
6.4.1 Introduction 123  
6.4.2 Semantic impairment and its pragmatic consequences 127  
6.4.3 Semantics: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 128  
6.4.4 Semantics: interactions in the interpersonal domain 129  
6.5 Discourse 131  
6.5.1 Introduction 131  
6.5.2 Discourse: interactions in the intrapersonal domain 134  
6.5.3 Discourse: interactions in the interpersonal domain 136  
6.6 Conclusion 138  

7 Sensorimotor systems and pragmatics 139  
7.1 Introduction 139  
7.2 Hearing 140  
7.3 Vision 141  
7.4 Motor ability 143  
7.5 Conclusion 145
8 Compensatory adaptation
  8.1 Introduction 146
  8.2 Definition of terms 147
  8.3 Brain plasticity: the neurology of intrapersonal compensation 149
  8.4 Intrapersonal and interpersonal compensation 151
  8.5 Case study 155
    8.5.1 Background 156
    8.5.2 Language 157
    8.5.3 Cognition 162
    8.5.4 Intrapersonal interactions and compensatory adaptations 165
    8.5.5 Interpersonal interactions and compensatory adaptations 171
  8.6 Conclusion 175

9 Conclusions 176
  9.1 Issues for pragmatics and pragmatic theory 176
    9.1.1 Scope 176
    9.1.2 Multimodality 177
    9.1.3 Causation as explanation 178
    9.1.4 Intrapersonal and interpersonal synergy 178
    9.1.5 Pragmatic ability and disability 179
  9.2 Issues for clinical practice 179
    9.2.1 Terminology 179
    9.2.2 The multiple causes of pragmatic impairment 180
    9.2.3 Intrapersonal and interpersonal perspectives 181
    9.2.4 The centrality of compensatory adaptation 181

Appendix 183
References 184
Index 227
Figures

2.1 The response of a child with autism to the request ‘write the days of the week in these seven boxes’  Page 20
2.2 Narrative picture sequence  24
2.3 A child’s incorrect attempt to arrange a series of pictures to tell a story  24
2.4 Corrected picture sequence  25
2.5 Cohesion without coherence in the conversation of a man with traumatic brain injury  26
8.1 Replication of a block design  163
## Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.1</th>
<th>Main category groups of three pragmatic impairment checklists</th>
<th>Page 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Discourse analytic studies of communication impairment</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Some semiotic, cognitive and sensorimotor elements of pragmatics</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Interpersonal compensation for expressive and receptive communication impairments</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>The effect of short-term memory problems on sentence repetition (1)</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>The effect of short-term memory problems on sentence repetition (2)</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>The emotion–attitude continuum</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>A classification scheme for pragmatic impairment</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Example of a reduced phonological system</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Performance of a man with aphasia on lexical production tasks</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Sample performance on a comprehension test of reversible passives</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Sample performance on a test of sentence formulation</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Sample performance on a test of word structure production</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Sample performance on a test of social reasoning</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>Sample performance on a test of reading accuracy</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>Performance on a test of auditory selective attention aged 13;9</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>Performance on a test of auditory memory aged 13;9</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>Performance on a test of auditory and visual sequential memory aged 13;9</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>Sample performance on tests of syntactic processing</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

Over the years, I have been fortunate enough to have access to a large pool of data consisting of audio and video recordings and transcripts of interactions involving individuals with communication disorders. Much of this data has been generously provided by colleagues and students, and some has found its way into this book in the form of illustrations of pragmatic impairment. My sincere thanks, therefore, go to: Chris Backes, Richard Body, Liz Botly, Andrea Butler, Judy Clegg, Sushie Dobbinson, Margaret Freeman, Sara Howard, Martin Hughes, Rachel Lanz, Tamsyn Patrick, Catherine Simons, Vesna Stojanovik, Kate Tarling, Ruth Taylor, Alison Townsend, Ruth Watson and Abigail Werth for permission to make use of their data in this way.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Richard Body, Jack Damico, Hilary Gardner, Sara Howard, Mike McTear, Dariel Merrills, Ulrika Nettelbladt, Rosemary Varley and Bill Wells, who have been sounding boards for various ideas that have made their way into the book or have provided valuable feedback on draft sections. Special thanks go to Sara Howard for help with phonetics and phonology and to Richard Body for reading and commenting on the final draft in its entirety. None of these individuals are responsible for the use I have made of their comments.

Finally, I am pleased to acknowledge Taylor and Francis (http://www.tandf.co.uk) for permission to draw on material previously published as Perkins (2001, 2005b) in Chapters 3, 4 and 8.
Transcription conventions

[|p|] Phonetic transcription
/p/ Phonemic transcription
(.) Very short pause
. Short pause
- Longer pause
(3.0) Pause length in seconds
` Stressed syllable
\ Falling tone
\ Rising tone
\ Rising-falling tone
\ Falling-rising tone
↑↓ Marked rise or fall in pitch
[text] Text enclosed in square brackets on consecutive lines of a transcript
\\ Text between degree signs is quieter than surrounding talk
___ Underlining indicates emphasis
(.–) Dashes in parentheses denote unintelligible syllables
↑↑ Text between up arrows is higher in pitch than surrounding talk
:: Colons indicate that a sound is prolonged

Phonetic symbols are from the International Phonetic Alphabet (IPA, 2005).