THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO POSTMODERN THEOLOGY

Postmodernity allows for no absolutes and no essence. Yet theology is concerned with the absolute, the essential. How then does theology sit within postmodernity? Is postmodern theology possible, or is such a concept a contradiction in terms? Should theology bother about postmodernism or just get on with its own thing? Can it?

Theologians have responded in many different ways to the challenges posed by theories of postmodernity. In this introductory guide to a complex area, editor Kevin J. Vanhoozer addresses the issue head on in a lively survey of what "talk about God" might mean in a postmodern age, and vice versa. The book then offers examples of different types of contemporary theology in relation to postmodernity, while the second part examines the key Christian doctrines in postmodern perspective. Leading theologians contribute to this clear and informative Companion, which no student of theology should be without.

KEVIN J. VANHOOZER is Research Professor of Systematic Theology at Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, Illinois. Before that he taught for eight years at New College, University of Edinburgh, where he was Senior Lecturer in Theology and Religious Studies. He is the author of *Biblical Narrative in the Philosophy of Paul Ricoeur* (1990), *Is There a Meaning in this Text? The Bible, the Reader, and the Morality of Literary Knowledge* (1998), *First Theology: God, Scripture, and Hermeneutics* (2002), and *The Drama of Doctrine: A Canonical–Linguistic Approach to Theology* (2004). He was also the co-founder and co-chair for many years of the Systematic Theology group in the American Academy of Religion. CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS TO RELIGION A series of companions to major topics and key figures in theology and religious studies. Each volume contains specially commissioned chapters by international scholars which provide an accessible and stimulating introduction to the subject for new readers and non-specialists.

Other titles in the series

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE, edited by Colin Gunton (1997) ISBN 0 521 47118 4 hardback ISBN 0 521 47695 8 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION edited by John Barton (1998) ISBN 0 521 48144 9 hardback ISBN 0 521 48593 2 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO DIETRICH BONHOEFFER edited by John de Gruchy (1999) ISBN 0 521 58258 x hardback ISBN 0 521 58751 6 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO LIBERATION THEOLOGY edited by Christopher Rowland (1999) ISBN 0 521 46144 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 46707 1 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO KARL BARTH edited by John Webster (2000) ISBN 0 521 58476 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 58560 0 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN ETHICS edited by Robin Gill (2001) ISBN 0 521 77070 x hardback ISBN 0 521 77918 9 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JESUS edited by Markus Bockmuehl (2001) ISBN 0 521 79261 4 hardback ISBN 0 521 79678 4 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FEMINIST THEOLOGY edited by Susan Frank Parsons (2002) ISBN 0 521 66327 x hardback ISBN 0 521 66380 6 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MARTIN LUTHER edited by Donald K. McKim (2003) ISBN 0 521 81648 3 hardback ISBN 0 521 01673 8 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ST PAUL edited by James D. G. Dunn (2003) ISBN 0 521 78155 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 78694 0 paperback THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO POSTMODERN THEOLOGY edited by Kevin J. Vanhoozer (2003) ISBN 0 521 79062 x hardback ISBN 0 521 79395 5 paperback

Forthcoming

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THE GOSPELS edited by Stephen C. Barton THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MEDIEVAL JEWISH THOUGHT

edited by Daniel H. Frank and Oliver Leaman

> THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ISLAMIC THEOLOGY edited by Timothy J. Winter THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO REFORMATION THEOLOGY edited by David Bagchi and David Steinmetz THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN CALVIN edited by Donald K. MCKim THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FRIEDRICH SCHLEIERMACHER edited by Jacqueline Mariña THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO HANS URS VON BALTHASAR edited by Edward Oakes and David Moss

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO POSTMODERN THEOLOGY

Editor Kevin J. Vanhoozer



> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, v1c 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003 Reprinted 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Severin 10/13 pt. System LATEX 2ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 79062 x hardback ISBN 0 521 79395 5 paperback

Contents

Notes on contributors page ix Preface xiii

Part one: Types of postmodern theology

- 1 Theology and the condition of postmodernity: a report on knowledge (of God) 3 KEVIN J. VANHOOZER
- 2 Anglo-American postmodernity: a theology of communal practice 26 NANCEY MURPHY AND BRAD J. KALLENBERG
- 3 Postliberal theology 42 GEORGE HUNSINGER
- 4 Postmetaphysical theology 58 THOMAS A. CARLSON
- 5 Deconstructive theology 76 GRAHAM WARD
- 6 Reconstructive theology 92 DAVID RAY GRIFFIN
- 7 Feminist theology 109 MARY MCCLINTOCK FULKERSON
- 8 Radical orthodoxy 126 D. STEPHEN LONG

Part two: Christian doctrine in postmodern perspective

- 9 Scripture and tradition 149 KEVIN J. VANHOOZER
- 10 Theological method 170 DAN R. STIVER
- 11 The Trinity 186 david s. cunningham

vii

viii Contents

- 12 God and world 203 PHILIP CLAYTON
- 13 The human person 219 JOHN WEBSTER
- 14 Christ and salvation 235 WALTER LOWE
- 15 Ecclesiology 252 Stanley J. Grenz
- 16 Holy Spirit and Christian spirituality 269 DAVID F. FORD

Index 291

Contributors

THOMAS A. CARLSON received his Ph.D. from the University of Chicago in 1995 and is Associate Professor in the Department of Religious Studies at the University of California, Santa Barbara, where he teaches courses in religion and modern philosophy, contemporary theory, and the history of Christian thought and culture. He is author of *Indiscretion: Finitude and the Naming of God* (1999), an investigation of negative and mystical theologies in light of deconstructive and phenomenological thought, and translator of several works by Jean-Luc Marion, including *God Without Being* (1991), *Reduction and Donation: Investigations of Husserl, Heidegger, and Phenomenology*, and *The Idol and Distance* (2001).

PHILIP CLAYTON holds a Ph.D. in both philosophy and religious studies from Yale University. Newly appointed to the Ingraham Chair at the Claremont School of Theology, he has taught previously at Haverford College, Williams College, and the California State University. Clayton has been guest professor at the Divinity School of Harvard University, and Humboldt Professor and Senior Fulbright Professor at the University of Munich. He is a past winner of the Templeton Book Prize for best monograph in the field of science and religion and a winner of the first annual Templeton Research Prize. His books include *The Problem of God in Modern Thought* (2000), *God and Contemporary Science* (1997), *Explanation from Physics to Theology: An Essay in Rationality and Religion* (1989), *Das Gottesproblem*, vol. 1: *Gott und Unendlichkeit in der neuzeitlichen Philosophie* (1996), and *The Emergence of Spirit* (2003).

DAVID S. CUNNINGHAM is Professor of Theology and Ethics at Seabury-Western Theological Seminary, Evanston, Illinois. His books include *Faithful Persuasion: In Aid of a Rhetoric of Christian Theology* (1991), *These Three Are One: The Practice of Trinitarian Theology* (1998), and *Reading is Believing: The Christian Faith Through Literature and Film* (2002). He was the lead editor of a Festschrift for Geoffrey Wainwright entitled *Ecumenical Theology in Worship, Doctrine, and Life* (1999). He serves as Co-Chair of the Christian Systematic Theology Group of the American Academy of Religion, is a founding member of the Ekklesia Project, and is currently an Alexander von Humboldt Fellow at the Albert-Ludwigs-Universität in Freiburg, Germany.

DAVID F. FORD is Regius Professor of Divinity at the University of Cambridge and Chairman of the Management Committee of the Centre for Advanced Religious

x Notes on contributors

and Theological Studies. He is a founder member of the Society for Scriptural Reasoning. His many publications include *Barth and God's Story* (1981), *Meaning and Truth in 2 Corinthians* (with Frances Young, 1987), *Theology: a Very Short Introduction* (1999), *Self and Salvation: Being Transformed* (1999), (ed.) *Modern Theologians: An Introduction to Christian Theology in the Twentieth Century* (1989; 1997), and *The Shape of Living* (1997, 2002).

MARY MCCLINTOCK FULKERSON is currently E. Rhodes & Leona B. Carpenter Associate Professor of Theology at Vanderbilt University Divinity School, after having taught for a number of years at Duke Divinity School and in Duke's Women's Studies Program. Her publications include *Changing the Subject: Women's Discourses and Feminist Theology* (1994) and numerous articles on gender, sexuality, and issues of theological authority and practice. Her current project is a book resulting from an ethnographic study of an interracial church entitled, *Traces of Redemption: Theology for a Worldly Church*.

STANLEY J. GRENZ is Distinguished Professor of Theology at Baylor University and Truett Seminary in Waco, Texas. He is the author of *The Social God and the Relational Self: A Trinitarian Theology of the Imago Dei* (2001), *Beyond Foundationalism: Shaping Theology in a Postmodern Context*, co-authored with John R. Franke (2001), and *Renewing the Center: Evangelical Theology in a Post-Theological Era* (2000). His earlier works include A Primer on Postmodernism (1996), *The Moral Quest: Foundations of Christian Ethics* (1997), *Theology for the Community of God* (1994, 2000), and *Twentieth Century Theology: God and the World in a Transitional Age*, co-authored with Roger E. Olson (1992). He is a consulting editor of *Christianity Today* and in 1999–2000 was a Luce Fellow in Theology.

DAVID RAY GRIFFIN is Professor of Philosophy of Religion and Theology at Claremont School of Theology and Claremont Graduate University, one of the directors of the Center for Process Studies, and the editor of the State University of New York Press Series in Constructive Postmodern Thought. His books include *The Reenchantment of Science: Postmodern Proposals* (1986), *God and Religion in the Postmodern World* (1987), *Evil Revisited* (1991), *Parapsychology, Philosophy, and Spirituality: A Postmodern Exploration* (1997), *Unsnarling the World-Knot: Consciousness, Freedom, and the Mind–Body Problem* (1998), *Religion and Scientific Naturalism: Overcoming the Conflicts* (2000), and *Reenchantment without Supernaturalism: A Process Philosophy of Religion* (2001).

GEORGE HUNSINGER is Hazel Thompson McCord Professor of Systematic Theology at Princeton Theological Seminary. An ordained Presbyterian minister, he is particularly interested in the theology of Karl Barth, and is the author of *How to Read Karl Barth: The Shape of His Theology* (1991) and *Disruptive Grace: Studies in the Theology of Karl Barth* (2000).

BRAD J. KALLENBERG is Assistant Professor of Religious Studies at the University of Dayton where he teaches courses in ethics and Protestant Christianity. He is author of *Ethics as Grammar: Changing the Postmodern Subject* (2001) and *Live to*

Notes on contributors xi

Tell: Evangelism for a Postmodern Age (2002), and co-editor of *Virtues and Practices in the Christian Tradition: Christian Ethics after MacIntyre* (1997, repr. 2003).

D. STEPHEN LONG is Associate Professor of Theology at Garrett-Evangelical Theological Seminary, where he teaches courses in theology and ethics. Prior to coming to Garrett-Evangelical he taught for three years at St. Joseph's University in Philadelphia. His most recent publications are *The Divine Economy: Theology and the Market* (2000) and *The Goodness of God: Theology, Church and Social Order* (2001). He is a founding member of the Ekklesia Project.

WALTER LOWE is Professor of Systematic Theology at the Candler School of Theology, Emory University. He has written *Mystery and the Unconscious: A Study in the Thought of Paul Ricoeur* (1977), *Evil and the Unconscious* (1983), and *Theology and Difference: The Wound of Reason* (1993).

NANCEY MURPHY is Professor of Christian Philosophy at Fuller Seminary, Pasadena, CA. She received the Ph.D. from University College Berkeley (philosophy of science) in 1980 and the Th.D. from the Graduate Theological Union (theology) in 1987. Her first book, *Theology in the Age of Scientific Reasoning* (1990), won the American Academy of Religion award for excellence and a Templeton Prize for books in science and theology. She is author of six other books and co-editor of six. Her research focuses on the role of modern and postmodern philosophy in shaping Christian theology and on relations between theology and science. She is a former chair of the Board of Directors of the Center for Theology and the Natural Sciences, Berkeley, CA.

DAN R. STIVER is Professor of Theology at Hardin-Simmons University, Abilene, Texas. His publications include *Theology after Ricoeur: New Directions in Hermeneutical Theology* (2001) and *The Philosophy of Religious Language: Sign, Symbol, and Story* (1996). He was editor of the *Review and Expositor* from 1994 to 1998.

KEVIN J. VANHOOZER taught for eight years at New College, University of Edinburgh, where he was Senior Lecturer in Theology and Religious Studies. He is currently Research Professor of Systematic Theology at Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, Illinois. He is the author of *Biblical Narrative in the Philosophy of Paul Ricoeur* (1990), *Is There a Meaning in this Text? The Bible, the Reader, and the Morality of Literary Knowledge* (1998), *First Theology: God, Scripture, and Hermeneutics* (2002), and *The Drama of Doctrine: A Canonical–Linguistic Approach to Theology* (forthcoming). He was also the co-founder and co-chair for many years of the Systematic Theology group in the American Academy of Religion.

GRAHAM WARD is Professor of Contextual Theology and Ethics at the University of Manchester. His books include *Barth*, *Derrida and the Language of Theology* (1995), *Cities of God* (2000), and *True Religion* (2002). He has edited *The Postmodern God* (1998), *The Certeau Reader* (1999), and the *Blackwell Companion to Postmodern Theology* (2001). He is senior executive editor of the journal *Literature and Theology*.

xii Notes on contributors

JOHN WEBSTER is Professor of Systematic Theology at the University of Aberdeen and formerly Lady Margaret Professor of Divinity at the University of Oxford. He is the author of *Barth's Ethics of Reconciliation* (1995), *Barth's Moral Theology* (1998), and *Barth* (2000), and he edited *The Cambridge Companion to Karl Barth* (2000). More recently he has written *Word and Church* (2001), *Holiness* (2002), and *Holy Scripture* (2003). Preface

To call a theology "modern" is to situate it in a familiar narrative about the Enlightenment or to point out certain family resemblances (for example, critical, scientific) between the thinking of exegetes and theologians and their secular counterparts. No such consensus exists, however, with regard to the term "postmodern." Yet in the past twenty years or so postmodernity has become a concept that is as indispensable for understanding contemporary Western thought and culture as modernity has been for understanding the past three hundred years. For some, postmodernity marks the end of theology; for others, it is a new beginning. What is undeniable is that a number of theologians have now accepted this adjective as an accurate qualification of their approach to theology. Any genuine grasp of the present situation in theology, therefore, must come to grips with the various ways in which these theologians understand and appropriate "the postmodern."

Yet postmodernity is as essentially contested a concept as it is an indispensable one – a sure sign of its importance for society and the academy alike. No one discipline has a monopoly on its definition; indeed, "postmodern" turns up in contexts as diverse as art and architecture, on the one hand, and philosophy and cultural studies, on the other. Though its proponents typically resist hegemonic "metanarratives" that purport to offer universal theories which construe reality from a "God's-eye point of view," there is nonetheless something ambitious about the very concept of the postmodern. For to be postmodern is to signal one's dissatisfaction with at least some aspect of modernity. It is to harbor a revolutionary impulse: the impulse *to do things differently*.

Postmodernity is upsetting, intentionally so. Postmodern thinkers have overturned the tables of the knowledge-changers in the university, the temple of modernity, and have driven out the foundationalists. Or, to take an even older image: postmodern prophets have marched, Moses-like, into Egypt and demanded "Let my people go." Postmoderns have resisted their harsh modern taskmasters together with their requirement to make epistemological bricks out of the straw of logical propositions and the mud of

xiv Preface

universal human experience. Postmodernity is perhaps best construed as an "exodus" from the constraints of modernity, as a plea to release the other, as a demand to let particulars be themselves rather than having to conform to the structures and strictures of the prevailing ideological or political system. Whether this exodus from modernity leads to genuine liberation or to a new bondage remains, of course, a matter of dispute.

Part one presents and examines theologies that either call themselves postmodern or have been described as such. The chapters treat several varieties of postmodern theology (for example, postliberal, deconstructive) with a special view to explaining the way in which each type conceives the task, method, sources, and norms of theology. Each chapter shows how the adjective "postmodern" qualifies its particular brand. Part one thus represents an eightfold typological path, as it were, that leads to enlightenment, at least as far as the meaning of postmodern theology is concerned.

The essays in Part one hold a twofold interest for the student of contemporary theology: first, because they represent an impressive variety of approaches, a variety that presents the further challenge of specifying what, if anything, it is that constitutes their unity-in-diversity, what it is that justifies the common denominator "postmodern"; and second, because each essay makes a case, at least tacitly, on behalf of each type that it, more than the others, is the legitimate pretender to the postmodern throne.

Whereas the chapters in Part one approach theology via postmodernity, the essays in Part two do the reverse, approaching postmodernity from the vantage point of theology, which is to say, from the perspective of particular doctrines. Certain authors explore ways in which postmodern themes make creative contributions to the development of particular doctrines (for example, how might the postmodern critique of modern individualism yield resources for one's understanding of the church?). Other authors focus on the resources implicit in particular doctrines for engaging, and perhaps correcting, certain postmodern tendencies (for example, how might the doctrine of the Trinity allow us to think difference in terms other than conflict?). In this way, essays in Part two do not merely describe but *do* postmodern theology.

Readers will be interested to know that the image on the cover, "Christ II," was entered in a contest marking the 2000th anniversary of Jesus' birth. The image is in fact a "photomosaic" composed of hundreds of images of the Dead Sea Scrolls, a body of ancient Hebrew and Aramaic manuscripts written on papyrus and leather that date from 200 BC to AD 100. The scrolls include sections of the Old Testament as well as hymns, commentaries, and apocalyptic writings of the Qumran community. "Christ" is thus constructed of textual fragments – an apt commentary on Derrida's maxim,

Preface xv

"There is nothing outside textuality," and an apt metaphor for a volume on postmodern theology. After feasting on the present fragments contained herein, however, we may find, as with the fragments left over after the feeding of the 5,000, that our theological baskets, far from being empty, are in fact brim full.

Kevin J. Vanhoozer