The Soul of Nietzsche’s *Beyond Good and Evil*

This book presents a provocative new interpretation of *Beyond Good and Evil*. Arguably Nietzsche’s most important book, it appears to express merely a loosely connected set of questionable opinions. Can Nietzsche really be an important philosopher if this is his most important book? Maudemarie Clark and David Dudrick address this question with a close reading of the book’s first part. They argue that more careful attention to how it is written allows us to see that it presents deeply interconnected arguments for subtle and well-thought-out positions on traditional issues. Nietzsche’s infamous doctrine of the will to power turns out to be a compelling account of the structure and origin of the human soul. And although he rejects aspects of traditional philosophy, Nietzsche aims to show how philosophy’s traditional aspirations toward both the true and the good can be fulfilled. *Beyond Good and Evil* turns out to be a major work of philosophy and Nietzsche’s masterpiece.

Maudemarie Clark is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Riverside, and George Carleton Jr. Professor of Philosophy at Colgate University. She is the author of *Nietzsche on Truth and Philosophy* (Cambridge, 1990), translator and editor (with Alan Swensen) of *On the Genealogy of Morality* (1998), and editor (with Brian Leiter) of *Daybreak* (Cambridge, 1997).

David Dudrick is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Colgate University. His work has appeared in the *European Journal of Philosophy*, *American Philosophical Quarterly*, and *International Studies in Philosophy*. 
Dedicated to each other
And to our wives
Connie Jones and Julie Dudrick
It is my ambition to say in ten sentences what everyone else says in a book – what everyone else does not say in a book.

“Expeditions of an Untimely Man,” in *Twilight of the Idols*
Contents

Note on Texts and Citations  xi

Introduction: Learning to Read Beyond Good and Evil  1
  I.1 The Problem  2
  I.2 Two Strategies  5
  I.3 Our Project  8

Part One. The Will to Truth and the Will to Value  11
  1 Setting the Stage: Nietzsche’s Preface  13
    1.1 First Theme: Dogmatism in Its Last Throes  13
    1.2 Kant and Spir on Dogmatism  16
    1.3 Second Theme: Diagnosis of Dogmatism’s Failure  22
    1.4 Third Theme: Hope for the Future of Philosophy  25
  2 The “Magnificent Tension of the Spirit”  30
    2.1 BGE 1: Introducing the Will to Truth  31
    2.2 BGE 2: Introducing the Will to Value  37
    2.3 The Function of BGE 3 and 4  48
    2.4 The Puzzles of BGE 3 and 4  50
    2.5 “Man” as the Measure  54
    2.6 Solving the Puzzles of BGE 3 and 4  56
    2.7 Conclusion  63
  3 Philosophy and the Will to Value  65
    3.1 BGE 5: The Prejudices and Values of Philosophers  66
    3.2 BGE 10: Skeptical Antirealists, Positivists, and Nihilists  68
Contents

3.3  BGE 11: Kant’s Successors  73
3.4  Conclusion  85

4  Science and the Will to Truth
4.1  BGE 14: Explanation  87
4.2  BGE 14: “Belief in the Senses”  97
4.3  BGE 15: Pursuing Physiology with a Clear Conscience  98
4.4  BGE 15: Sensualism as a Regulative Hypothesis  103
4.5  The Historical Background: Lange and Spir  106
4.6  Conclusion  112

5  Reconciling the Will to Truth and the Will to Value
5.1  Preface to *The Gay Science*: The Unveiled Truth  113
5.2  GS 371 and 372: The “Tension of the Spirit”  116
5.3  GS 373 and 374: Values and Intentionality  119
5.4  GS 373 and 374: Spir’s Relevance  124
5.5  GS 374: In Light of Spir  127
5.6  The Unveiled Truth, Revisited  130

PART TWO. THE WILL TO POWER

6  Nietzsche’s Soul
6.1  BGE 6 and 9: Will to Power and Will to Value  137
6.2  BGE 6: Two Interpretations  142
6.3  BGE 12: Going “Still Further” Than Boscovich  148
6.4  BGE 12: An “Ancient and Venerable Hypothesis”  155
6.5  Values and Human Motivation  163

7  The Will
7.1  BGE 19: The Phenomenology of Willing  171
7.2  BGE 19: Willing  178
7.3  The Error Attached to Willing  185
7.4  Two Kinds of Psychological Theory  191
7.5  The Genealogy of Political Order  195
7.6  Conclusion  200

8  The Other Doctrines of the Will to Power
8.1  BGE 13: Life as Will to Power  206
8.2  BGE 22: Physical Reality as Will to Power  213
8.3  BGE 36: The World as Will to Power  220
8.4  Conclusion  229
Contents ix

Conclusion 245
C.1 Why Does Nietzsche Write the Way He Does? 245
C.2 Education and the Soul 257

Acknowledgments 265
Bibliography 269
Index 275
Note on Texts and Citations

We have incorporated almost all references to secondary sources in the text, citing only the author’s name (unless it is clear from context), the publication date, and the page number of the work. For Nietzsche’s works, we have used Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe, edited by G. Colli and M. Montinari (1980). The translations we have consulted are listed in the Bibliography. In the case of BGE, we have used three different translations, attempting to combine their advantages, and have made some alterations in translations of other works, and so take responsibility for the translations throughout the text.

We cite Nietzsche’s works using the following abbreviations:

A  The Antichrist
BGE Beyond Good and Evil
D  Daybreak: Thoughts on the Prejudices of Morality
EH  Ecce Homo
GM  On the Genealogy of Morality
GS  The Gay Science
HA  Human, All Too Human
KSA  Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe
KSB  Sämtliche Briefe. Kritische Studienausgabe
SE “Schopenhauer as Educator”
TI  Twilight of the Idols
TL  “Truth and Lie in the Non-moral Sense”
Z  Thus Spoke Zarathustra