

DEMOCRATIC DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE

By exploring the nature of economic justice and of democracy, Ross Zucker seeks to explain how democratic countries with market economies should deal with the problem of high levels of income inequality. Revising a basic assumption of social thought, Zucker suggests that people are more equal than political theorists usually suppose them to be – in regard to their attributes, wants, and economic contributions. Such equality morally warrants corresponding limits on income inequality, beyond the measures suggested by Rawls's theory of justice. The origin of equality lies in formative relations between persons, for example, those in the economy, and this book contends that the study of persons-in-relations can provide perspectives on equality that have been overlooked. Zucker also considers the manner in which the ethics of community bear on the just distribution of property. There is, he argues, a dimension of community in market economies that extends more widely and inheres more deeply than liberals, communitarians, Marxists, and social theorists recognize, and it provides further moral support for limiting income inequality.

Integrating this view of economic justice with democratic theory yields "democratic distributive justice," whose central proposition is that the preservation of a redistributory property right is among the chief ends of democratic government. While prevailing theory defines democracy in terms of the electoral mechanism, the author holds that the principles of just distribution form part of the very definition of democracy, which makes just distribution a requirement of democratic government. The problem of income inequality is thus an inherently interdisciplinary one, and grappling with it requires extensive use of political, economic, legal, and philosophical theory.



DEMOCRATIC DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE

ROSS ZUCKER



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Sabon 10/12 pt. System QuarkXPress [CTK]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Zucker, Ross, 1952– Democratic distributive justice/Ross Zucker. p. cm.

ISBN 0-521-79033-6

1. Democracy. 2. Distributive justice. 3. Income distribution. I. Title. JC23.Z83 2000

330.I-dc2I 00-02363I

ISBN 0 521 79033 6 hardback



For Herbert Zucker



Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
ı.	Democracy and Economic Justice	I
	Part I. Unequal Property and Individualism in Liberal Theory	
2.	The Underlying Logic of Liberal Property Theory	27
3.	Unequal Property and Its Premise in Locke's Theory	33
4.	Unequal Property and Individualism, Kant to Rawls	56
Part II. Egalitarian Property and Justice as Dueness		
5.	Whose Property Is It, Anyway?	85
6.	The Social Nature of Economic Actors and Forms of Equal Dueness	108
7.	Policy Reflections: The Effect of an Egalitarian Regime on Economic Growth	142
	Part III. Egalitarian Property and the Ethics of Economic Community	
8.	Deriving Equality from Community	153

vii



Contents

9. The Dimension of Community in Capital-Based Market Systems: Between Consumers and Producers	169	
10. Endogenous Preferences and Economic Community	188	
11. The Dimension of Community in Capital-Based Market Systems: Between Capital and Labor	220	
12. The Right to an Equal Share of Part of National Income	246	
Part IV. Democracy and Economic Justice		
13. Democratic Distributive Justice	269	
14. Democracy and Economic Rights	287	
Conclusions	301	
References	303	
Index	319	



Acknowledgments

The greatest intellectual debts are sometimes personal ones. Charles E. Lindblom aided my education in many crucial ways, such as giving needed support for this research, providing rigorous and eloquent critiques of several drafts, and removing or helping me to overcome various obstacles. I am extremely grateful to have had the opportunity to study political economy with this man, whose sophisticated knowledge taught me much, and whose exemplary human qualities taught me even more. My father, Herbert Zucker, enhanced the possiblity that this book would come into being by responding to numerous trial balloons during the formative stages of the work and preparing a commentary on a draft of the whole manuscript. The interest and involvement he took were sustaining, and it is to him that this book is dedicated.

One day many years ago, while attending a class on classical political economy taught by David P. Levine at Yale, some of the basic ideas of this book occurred to me quite suddenly, though it has taken much time to work them out. Moreover, Levine's writings contain insights into the social nature of the individual that I have found useful in developing a social theory of economic rights and of democracy.

When the manuscript was nearing its final stages, Robert Dahl examined it, gave me his well-considered judgment, and formulated a strategy of revision that was helpful in making final improvements. Carol C. Gould and Sidney Morgenbesser pressed me to elaborate the relationship between equality and community that I had sketched at a seminar, and on other occasions Gould made a variety of helpful suggestions and provided important forms of support for this project. Gary Mongiovi, coeditor of the *Review of Political Economy*, shared his considerable knowledge of economics with me in a detailed commentary on the manuscript. Claire Cook provided the benefit of her general editorial



Acknowledgments

expertise to a project that fell outside her usual literary specialty. I am very grateful for her contribution. Valuable assistance was also rendered by Sandy Thatcher, Minae Mizumura, Ben Gregg, Jeffrey Gordon, and especially Elizabeth Mazzola, to whom I would like to express my deepest appreciation. At Cambridge University Press, the copyediting by Russell Hahn was very helpful, and I appreciate his thoroughness and keen eye. The manuscript was ably stewarded through the publication process by Lewis Bateman, political science editor, Camilla T. Knapp, production editor, and Alex Holzman, senior editor.

Consideration of my ideas at scholarly forums fostered development of the work, and I am obliged to colleagues for helpful suggestions on papers presented at the Twentieth World Congress of Philosophy (1998), the annual meetings of the American Political Science Association (1996, 1995, 1992, 1991), the Seventeenth World Congress of the International Association for Philosophy of Law and Social Philosophy (Bologna, 1995), the Eighth Malvern Political Economy Conference (U.K., 1994), the annual meetings of the Society for the Advancement of Socio-Economics (New York and Stockholm, 1993, 1991) and the Law and Society Association (Amsterdam, 1991), and the MIT faculty seminar on Global Transformations and Property Rights (1992). I also wish to express my appreciation to the University Seminars of Columbia University for financial assistance with the preparation of the manuscript for publication. The ideas presented have benefited from discussions in the University Seminar on the Political Economy of War and Peace.

Some of my ideas were first presented in journal articles. Chapters 5 and 6 modify and expand "Whose Property Is It, Anyway?," *Review of Political Economy*, vol. 7, no. 4 (October, 1995). Chapter 3 extends the analysis of "Unequal Property and Its Premise in Liberal Theory," which appeared in the *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, vol. 17, no. 1 (January 2000). Chapter 11 includes portions of "System-wide Community in Capital-based Market Systems," *Journal of Socio-Economics*, vol. 28, no. 5 (1999). Thanks are due the editors and publishers of these journals for permission to reprint material here.

Given the high caliber of assistance received, it is all too obvious that the remaining faults are entirely my own. Finally, Bess Zucker and Andrea, Jim, Ryan and Heather Wegner made the surrounding environment worthwhile, and to them go my heartfelt thanks.

New York City April 2000