Evidence and Faith
Philosophy and Religion since the Seventeenth Century

Charles Taliaferro has written a dynamic narrative history of philosophical reflection on religion from the seventeenth century to the present, with an emphasis on shifting views of faith and the nature of evidence. The book begins with the movement called Cambridge Platonism, which formed a bridge between the ancient and medieval worlds and early modern philosophy. While the book provides a general overview of different movements in philosophy, it also offers a detailed exposition and reflection on key arguments, and the scope is broad, from Descartes to contemporary feminist philosophy of religion.

Written with clarity and verve, this book will appeal to professionals and students in the philosophy of religion, religious studies, and the history of ideas, as well as informed lay readers.

Charles Taliaferro is Professor of Philosophy at St. Olaf College, Minnesota.
THE EVOLUTION OF MODERN PHILOSOPHY

General Editors:
Paul Guyer and Gary Hatfield (University of Pennsylvania)

Roberto Torretti: The Philosophy of Physics
David Depew and Marjorie Grene: The Philosophy of Biology

Forthcoming:
Paul Guyer: Aesthetics
Gary Hatfield: The Philosophy of Psychology
Stephen Darwall: Ethics
T. R. Harrison: Political Philosophy
William Ewald and Michael J. Hallett: The Philosophy of Mathematics
Michael Losonsky: The Philosophy of Language

Why has philosophy evolved in the way that it has? How have its sub-disciplines developed, and what impact has this development exerted on the way that the subject is now practiced? Each volume of “The Evolution of Modern Philosophy” will focus on a particular subdiscipline of philosophy and examine how it has evolved into the subject as we now understand it. The volumes will be written from the perspective of a current practitioner in contemporary philosophy, whose point of departure will be the question: How did we get from there to here? Cumulatively the series will constitute a library of modern conceptions of philosophy and will reveal how philosophy does not in fact comprise a set of timeless questions but has rather been shaped by broader intellectual and scientific developments to produce particular fields of inquiry addressing particular issues.
Evidence and Faith

Philosophy and Religion since the Seventeenth Century

CHARLES TALIAFERRO
St. Olaf College
# Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
page xi

## Introduction  
1

1  The Sovereignty of the Good in Seventeenth-Century Philosophy of Religion  
11

- Plato and the English Civil War  
11

- Platonism, Christianity, and Some Divine Arguments  
15

- God’s Light  
26

- The Virtues of Human Nature  
29

- The Virtues of God’s Presence  
39

- The Practice of Philosophy of Religion  
42

- Three Challenges  
45

- Doorways to Modern and Contemporary Philosophy  
55

2  Cartesian Philosophy of Religion  
57

- Descartes and a Queen  
57

- Descartes Then and Now  
58

- Cartesian Nature and Ambition  
61

- Cartesian Methodology  
68

- A Substantial Self  
71

- Theistic Arguments  
75

- Theism and Trust  
79

- Dualist Arguments  
84

- God and the World  
95

- Conway’s Coherence  
100

- The Fragility of Philosophy of Religion  
102

- Measure for Measure  
106
## Contents

3  The Ascendancy of Rules of Evidence in Early Modern Philosophy of Religion  
   Locke’s *Essay*  
   Hobbes’s Challenge  
   Lockean Strictures and Toleration  
   The Mind of God in Anglo-American Idealism  
   Early American Philosophy of Religion  
   Leibniz’s Idealism: The Good and the Evident  
   Spinoza’s Anti-Supernaturalism  
   Probability as the Guide to a Supernatural Life  
   Philosophers and Traditions: The Battle of the Books  

4  Humean Philosophy of Religion  
   Life and Death in 1776  
   Hume’s World and Self  
   Against the Design Argument  
   A Cosmological Argument  
   Design Again  
   History and Miracles in the Realm of Nature  
   Annihilation and Suicide  
   An Ideal Observer  
   The Virtues of Inquiry  

5  Kantian Philosophy of Religion  
   A Friendship in the Enlightenment  
   Volcanic Philosophy of Religion  
   Kant on Three Classic Theistic Arguments  
   Reason and Contradictions  
   Moral Faith  
   A Mysterious Grace  
   Cosmopolitanism and Religion  
   Reason and Romance  

6  Religion and the Philosophical Gods and Giants  
   Intelligence, Evidence, and Happiness  
   Naturalism in Philosophy of Religion  
   Biology and Theology  
   Sociological, Political, Psychological Naturalism  
   Hegelian Idealism  
   Idealism after Hegel  
   Pragmatism in Philosophy of Religion
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Continental and Feminist Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Two Rivers</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subjectivity in Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Genealogical Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Heidegger, Sartre, Camus, Beauvoir</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Weil, Buber, Levinas, Marcel</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gadamer, Ricoeur, Derrida, Foucault</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Feminist Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Five Major Moves</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lunch and Mystical Poetry</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positivism and Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contra Positivism</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wittgenstein and Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On the Verge of a Renaissance of Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cognition and Tradition</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pluralistic Philosophy of Religion</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Religions, Evidence, and Legitimacy</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whose Encyclopedia?</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Academy</td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Science and Religion</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Back to the Beginning</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evil and Philosophy of Religion: A Case Study</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Philosophy of Religion and Friendship</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Philosophy of Religion at Large</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix A: A Guide to Further Study</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix B: Select Contemporary Philosophers</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Select Bibliography</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I thank Paul Guyer and Gary Hatfield for inviting me to undertake this project and Terence Moore for his support and guidance. I thank St. Olaf College and especially the Department of Philosophy for ongoing support. My colleague and dean, Rick Fairbanks, has been especially generous. For hospitality, conversation, and library use in 1998–1999, I thank the Department of Philosophy at New York University, especially Thomas Nagel, Roy Sorenson, and Peter Unger; the Department of Religion at Columbia University, especially Wayne Proudfoot and Matthew Bagger; the Department of Religion at Princeton University, especially Jeffrey Stout; the American Academy in Rome; and the General Theological Seminary in New York City. I thank Paula Schanilec for her generous work in helping me prepare this manuscript for publication. I also thank Rachel Traughber, Kate Monson, Adam Goldhammer, Jerrae Swanson, Andrea Gatzke, April Carlson, Michael Littell, Sarah Campbell, Ashley Miller, Erik Christopherson, Dan Sinykin, and Amber Griffioen. For critical comments on earlier versions of this manuscript, I thank Pamela Sue Anderson, Kelly Clark, Brian Davies, Gary DeKrey, Stewart Goetz, Geoffrey Gorham, Paul Griffiths, Paul Guyer, James Harris, William Hasker, Michael Murray, Phillip Quinn, Paul Reasoner, Anthony Rudd, and Corliss Swain. I am also very grateful for the expert assistance of Brian MacDonald and Stephanie Achard of Cambridge University Press.

This book is dedicated to Nicholas Shears, Alex Marcell, and Francesca Lowe with love. And to Jil, with love always.