Conserving Living Natural Resources

Conserving Living Natural Resources provides students, managers, and general readers with an introduction to the principles of managing biological resources. It presents the historical and conceptual contexts of three seminal approaches to the management of living natural resources: utilitarian management for harvest of featured species and control of unwanted species, protection and restoration of populations and habitats to maintain biodiversity, and management of complex ecosystems to sustain both productivity and biodiversity. The book shows how the first two approaches were grounded in the belief that nature is "in balance" and that people are outsiders, and then goes on to show how the "flux-of-nature" viewpoint suggests new strategies for conservation grounded in a view of nature as dynamic, and people as participants in the natural world.

Rather than endorsing a single approach as the only correct one, this book investigates the historical and philosophical contexts, conceptual frameworks, principal techniques, and limitations of each approach.

BERTIE JOSEPHSON WEDDELL teaches principles of conservation in the Distance Degree Program of Washington State University, and is principal of *Draba*, a natural resource management consulting business she founded.

To Jim, Wes, and Angie

Conserving Living Natural Resources

in the context of a changing world

Bertie Josephson Weddell

Washington State University



© Cambridge University Press

> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Monotype Garamond 11/13pt System QuarkXPress™ [SE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Weddell, Bertie, J., 1948–
Conserving living natural resources in the context of a changing world / BertieJosephson Weddell.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references (p.)
ISBN 0 521 78270 8 (hb) – ISBN 0 521 78812 9 (pb.)
1. Conservation biology.
2. Conservation of natural resources.
3. Natural resources – Management.
I. Title.
QH75.W42 2002
333.7'2–dc21 2001037355

ISBN 0 521 78270 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 78812 9 paperback

Contents

Preface	<i>page</i> xi
Introduction: Balance and flux	1
Methodology: Getting the information we need to mana	nge
living natural resources	9
The scientific method	9
Controlled experiments	9
Comparative studies	17
Simulations and models	22
Evaluating evidence with a critical eye	23
I: Management to maximize production of featu ties – a utilitarian approach to conservation	red
Historical context – the commodification of resources an	d
the foundations of utilitarian resource management	29
1.1 Historical background	30
1.2 The result: Habitat alteration, declines, and extinctions	32

Part spec 1

	the foundations of utilitarian resource management	29
	1.1 Historical background	30
	1.2 The result: Habitat alteration, declines, and extinctions	32
	1.3 Diagnosing the problem	52
	1.4 The response to the problem	52
	1.4.1 Regulation and protection	52
	1.4.2 The disciplines of natural resource management	55
2	Central concepts – population growth and interactions	
	between populations	60
	2.1 Adding to and subtracting from populations	60

vi Contents

	2.2 Lir	nits to population size	61
	2.2.	1 Mortality	61
	2.2.	2 Reproduction	62
	2.3 Ty	pes of population growth	62
	2.3.	1 Exponential growth	62
	2.3.	2 Logistic growth and density-dependent population regulation	66
	2.4 Int	eractions between populations: Predation	71
	2.4.	1 Predation as a mechanism of limiting prey populations	71
	2.4.	2 Factors that compensate for predation	75
	2.4.	3 Management implications	75
3	Cent	al concepts – habitats	77
	3.1 Ec	osystems	78
	3.1.	1 The ecosystem concept	78
	3.1.	2 Ecosystem components	78
	3.2 Ho	w habitats provide the resources needed by organisms	80
	3.2.	1 Resources	80
	3.2.	2 Juxtaposition of habitat patches	85
	3.2.	3 Range of tolerance	87
	3.2.	4 Seasonal variations in resource availability	88
	3.3 Ch	anges in comunities over time: Succession	89
	3.3.	1 The concept	89
	3.3.	2 Examples	93
	3.3.	3 Implications	96
4	Techr	niques – harvest management	99
	4.1 Cla	ssifying species on the basis of utilitarian values	99
	4.2 Kir	nds of harvest	100
	4.2.	1 Commercial harvests	100
	4.2.	2 Recreational harvests	100
	4.2.	3 Subsistence harvests	104
	4.2.	4 Illegal harvests	104
	4.3 Ma	naging for sustained yield	105
	4.3.	1 In theory	105
	4.3.	2 In practice	113
	4.3.	3 Social, economic, and political considerations	118
	4.3.	4 How successful has harvest management been?	118
5	Techr	niques – habitat management	123
	5.1 Di	ect modification of plant communities	123
	5.1.	1 Planting and fertilizing	124
	5.1.	2 Removing unwanted vegetation	126

cambridge University Press	
521782708 - Conserving Living Natural Resources: In the Context of a Changing Worl	d
ertie Josephson Weddell	
rontmatter	
Iore information	

		Contents	vii
	5.1.3 Managing water supplies		128
	5.1.4 Providing special structures		129
	5.2 Indirect modification of habitats: Modifying succession		130
	5.2.1 Flooding		132
	5.2.2 Grazing management		132
	5.2.3 Logging		133
	5.2.4 Fire management		135
	5.3 Arranging habitat components		137
	5.4 Managing for multiple uses		138
	5.5 Conclusions		140
6	Techniques – management to minimize conflicts b	etween p	est
	species and people		143
	6.1 What is a pest?		143
	6.2 How is damage from pests controlled?		145

	6.4.5 Elephants and crop damage in Africa
6.5	Conclusions
Part II: habitat	Protection and restoration of populations and s – a preservationist approach to conservation

6.4.4 Attacks by black bears and grizzly bears on visitors to U.S. national parks

7	Historical context – the rise of environmental concerns after		
	World War II	163	
	7.1 Economic and demographic changes	164	
	7.2 Awareness of ecological problems	165	
	7.2.1 Invading species	165	
	7.2.2 Harmful substances in the environment	168	
	7.2.3 Extinctions	176	
	7.3 Diagnosing the problem	185	
	7.4 The response to the problem: The rise of preservationist management	190	
8	Central concepts – the causes of extinction	194	
	8.1 Speciation: The formation of species	194	
	8.1.1 What is a species?	194	
	8.1.2 The theory of natural selection	195	

8.1.3	The tempo of speciation	
-------	-------------------------	--

6.3 Historical background

6.4.1 Coyote control on rangelands in the western U.S.A.

6.4.3 Human behavior and pigeon pests in urban environments

6.4.2 Control of fox rabies in western Europe

6.4 Case studies

199

147

150

150

151 153

155 156

157

viii Contents

		8.1.4 Adaptive radiation, isolation, and endemism	200
	8.2	How many species are there?	201
	8.3	Classification	202
		8.3.1 Nomenclature	202
		8.3.2 Genetic differentiation within species: Subspecies and local adaptation	204
	8.4	Extinction	204
		8.4.1 Extinctions in the fossil record	205
		8.4.2 Why are some species more vulnerable than others?	206
		8.4.3 Why are some populations more vulnerable than others?	208
		8.4.4 Population viability analysis: A tool for assessing risk of extinction	221
9	Те	chniques – protecting and restoring species	225
	9.1	Overview of options: Strategies for preventing extinctions	225
	9.2	Decreasing losses	226
		9.2.1 Regulating exploitation	226
		9.2.2 Minimizing natural sources of mortality	228
	9.3	Enhancing the size and range of populations	230
		9.3.1 Increasing population productivity	230
		9.3.2 Increasing geographic range	237
		9.3.3 Guidelines	242
	9.4	Setting priorities: Which species should we try to save?	243
0	Те	chniques – protecting and restoring ecosystems	246
	10.3	1 Historical background	246
	10.2	2 Protecting communities	249
		10.2.1 Designing reserves	249
		10.2.2 Setting priorities: Which habitats should we save?	258
		10.2.3 Managing reserves	265
		10.2.4 Providing economic incentives to set aside preserves: Debt-for-nature swaps	266
	10.3	3 Restoring communities	267
		10.3.1 The need for ecological restoration	267
		10.3.2 Methods of restoring ecosystems	267
		10.3.4 Mitigation	270
		10.3.5 Evaluating restoration and mitigation	272

Part III: Management to maintain processes and structures – a sustainable-ecosystem approach to conservation

11	Historical context – pressures to move beyond protection of		
	species and reserves	279	
	11.1 Practical considerations	280	
	11.2 Scientific considerations	281	

Cambridge University Press	
521782708 - Conserving Living Natural Resources: In the Context of a Changing World	d
ertie Josephson Weddell	
'rontmatter	
Iore information	

		Contents	ix
	11.2		202
	11.3	Political considerations	282
		11.2.2 Charge limit in the U.S. Endangered Species Act	202 294
	11 4	11.3.2 Changing direction in natural resource management	204 295
	11.4	Etnical considerations	205
		11.4.1 Who bears the costs of protection:	200
		11.4.2 Who makes decisions about access to resources?	201 200
		11.4.7 Who is responsible for causing the problem?	200
	11 5	11.4.4 Dioaiversity versus cultural alversity?	290 201
	11.5	11.5.1 Attitude shoutback and the natural world	291
		11.5.1 Attituaes about people and the natural world	291
			294
	11.7	Discussion de conduct	295
	11.0	Diagnosing the problem	290
	11.7	I he response to the problem: The rise of sustainable-ecosystem management	297
12	Cer	ntral concepts – the flux of nature	301
	12.1	Revisiting equilibrium theories	302
		12.1.1 Competition and density-dependent population regulation	302
		12.1.2 The stable climax	307
		12.1.3 The equilibrium theory of island biogeography	313
	12.2	A new perspective: The flux of nature	315
		12.2.1 Background	315
		12.2.2 Key points	316
		12.2.3 Minimum conditions for maintaining ecosystem functions	320
	12.3	Implications of the flux-of-nature viewpoint for conservation strategies	321
	12.4	Conclusions	322
13	Тес	hniques – conserving processes and contexts	327
	13.1	Conserving processes	328
	13.2	Recognizing limits and assessing vulnerability	331
		13.2.1 Variations in ecosystem productivity	350
		13.2.2 Variations in soil fertility	353
		13.2.3 Variations in adaptations to disturbance	354
	13.3	Geographic context	356
		13.3.1 Maximizing potential for recovery from disturbance	356
		13.3.2 Maximizing movement of organisms through the matrix	358
	13.4	Examples	358
		13.4.1 Maintaining and restoring structures and functions of late-successional forests in the	
		Sierra Nevada ecosystem	358
		13.4.2 Restoring structural heterogeneity in the Negev Desert	362
		13.4.3 Restoring variations in river flow on the Roanoke River	364

Cambridge University Press	
521782708 - Conserving Living Natural Resources: In the Context of a Changing World	ł
Bertie Josephson Weddell	
Frontmatter	
<i>I</i> ore information	

x Contents

14 Techniques – including people in the conservation process	370
14.1 Sustainable use versus sustained yield	371
14.2 Returning profits from biodiversity-based products to local communities	373
14.3 Integrating economic development and conservation	374
14.4 Basing resource management in local communities	378
14.5 Locating reserves in a compatible landscape	381
14.5.1 Integrating traditional resource uses and conservation: Biosphere reserves	381
14.5.2 Developing alternative resource uses: Nontimber forest products	388
14.6 Evaluating attempts to include people in the conservation process	390
14.7 Conclusions	391
Postscript	396
Appendix: Scientific names of organisms mentioned in the text	398

Index

407

Preface

I wrote this book to introduce students to and to review for managers three different approaches to natural resource management. Until the early 1970s, college courses and texts in natural resource management dealt primarily with a utilitarian approach to resources, with a little preservationist management thrown in (for example, the story of Yellowstone National Park and parks in general). Then endangered species and nongame species began to attract the attention of managers. During this period, a number of ecologists in North America also undertook studies of ecosystem functions and processes. (In Europe ecosystem studies had been receiving attention since late in the nine-teenth century.) By the 1980s, courses and texts in conservation biology began to appear. At first these emphasized the management of small, fragmented populations; later, management to maintain fundamental ecosystem processes became a more prominent theme.

I wanted to present these different strands of thought to students who were not necessarily majoring in the natural sciences or in management and to show how these threads interweave in the fabric of natural resource management. This book attempts to do that, by presenting the historical and conceptual contexts of different approaches to resource management. It begins with the utilitarian approach to harvesting featured species, proceeds to recent responses to the biodiversity crisis, and culminates in efforts to manage ecosystems sustainably.

In writing this book, I started from the premise that it is more useful for students and managers to learn about the historical conditions that gave rise to different strategies for resource stewardship and the strengths and weaknesses of each, than to study a single approach as the only correct one. The

xii Preface

book is organized into three main sections, which cover three approaches to conservation, more or less in chronological order: management for products (the utilitarian approach), preserves (the preservationist approach), or processes (the sustainable-ecosystem approach). Utilitarian management focuses on the harvest of featured species to provide desired products, preservationist management stresses the protection and restoration of populations and habitats to maintain biodiversity, and the sustainable-ecosystem approach seeks to conserve both productivity and biodiversity by maintaining healthy ecosystems. Each section describes the historical and philosophical context, the conceptual framework, the principal techniques, and the limitations of the approach in question. By showing how each period in natural resource management has operated within a particular world view, made important contributions, and had definite limitations, I hope this volume will encourage readers to view science and resource management as ongoing processes rather than as static entities. In keeping with its historical bent, the book includes substantial amounts of quoted material from bygone decades. Some of these are from seminal thinkers; others are simply examples that reflect the thinking of the day. It is hoped that this will give students some appreciation of the flavor of the different mind-sets that are discussed.

Many books present the philosophical context of conservation as a dichotomy between anthropocentric and biocentric approaches, or use versus preservation. A number of scholars have recently pointed out, however, that *both* the utilitarian and the preservationist perspective share a similar philosophical context: the idea that people are outside of the balance of nature. At the same time, some scientists have suggested that the flux of nature is a more appropriate metaphor for nature. This leads to novel ways of thinking about the natural world and our role in it.

Parts I and II of this book deal with management strategies that are grounded in the balance-of-nature view. Part I shows how the academic disciplines of forestry, wildlife management, and range management developed in response to the unregulated exploitation of wild plant and animal populations after Europeans colonized the New World, Africa, the Australian region, and parts of Asia. Professionals in these disciplines approach natural resources from a utilitarian perspective, that is, they seek to regulate the exploitation of economically valuable resources such as timber, game species, and livestock forage. To accomplish their objectives, utilitarian resource managers attempt to enhance populations and habitats that provide economic benefits and to reduce or eliminate processes (such as fire) and species (such as predators) that are viewed as detrimental. They focus primarily on a small number of natural processes, such as density-dependent population growth

Preface xiii

and the development of stable plant communities. The underlying assumption is that managers can maximize the flow of useful products by controlling or compensating for forces that upset the balance of nature.

Part II covers efforts to preserve natural places and living things regardless of their economic values. Whereas utilitarian management attempts to conserve natural resources for people, this type of management seeks to protect those resources from people. The roots of this movement go back to nineteenth-century efforts to preserve wild places for their intrinsic beauty and spiritual value. A century later, awareness of environmental problems and accelerating losses of species led to a new goal, the protection of biodiversity. Preservationist resource managers apply insights into processes such as extinction and colonization and the genetic consequences of small population size to this challenge. Like utilitarian resource managers, preservationists envision nature as tending toward equilibrium. In this view, the activities of people upset the balance of nature, and the goal of conservationists should be to reinstate that balance by protecting and restoring populations and habitats. The assumption underlying this approach is that the natural world often needs to be protected from the degrading and disturbing influences of people because these influences upset the balance of nature.

Part III investigates an alternative view – that nature is in a state of flux which people are part of. This approach, termed the sustainable-ecosystem approach, draws on insights from both utilitarian and preservationist management, but it suggests new ways of thinking about our place in nature and of managing natural resources to sustain ecosystems. It was fostered by a variety of practical and theoretical considerations that highlight the need for an approach to resource management which emphasizes the variability of nature, addresses social issues of equity and power, and includes the activities of people as part of the natural world. Recent insights into disturbance dynamics and heterogeneous environments suggest new techniques for managing to conserve ecological processes at a variety of temporal and spatial scales. The underlying assumption here is that by preserving ecological processes and natural variability we can maintain both productivity and diversity.

The first chapter in each part describes the historical conditions that set the stage for that particular type of resource management and concludes with a discussion of historical perceptions about fundamental problems in resource management and how they should be solved. I suggest that readers, especially those who are not resource managers or ecologists, begin by reading those chapters (1, 7, and 12) to get some idea of the issues being addressed by the different kinds of resource management. These chapters are followed by one

xiv Preface

or two chapters that outline the central concepts of each approach, and two or three chapters dealing with its principal techniques.

The sequence presented in this book, of three stages in resource management - utilitarian management, preservationist management, and management to sustain ecosystems - is not, strictly speaking, a chronological one. Although in a general sense utilitarian management led to biodiversity protection and subsequently to management for sustainable ecosystems, there is plenty of temporal overlap between these strategies. Furthermore, all three approaches are thriving and producing useful insights in the twenty-first century. Many resource managers hold views that are a combination of the different approaches covered in this book and practice a type of management that synthesizes elements of the different styles. But even though reality is complicated, and managers don't really fit into pigeon-holes, understanding the different schools of thought that have influenced the theory and practice of resource management during the past century and a half can help us to put current challenges in context. If we understand the assumptions underlying various resource management policies, we are in a better position to evaluate them. Organizing those ideas into three categories - utilitarian, preservationist, and sustainable-ecosystem - is a heuristic device that helps us do that.

Throughout the discussion of these different approaches, I point out that each approach is appropriate under certain circumstances and that each has its limitations. For example, after Aldo Leopold suggested that game species tend to prefer edges, wildlife biologists set out to create habitats with large amounts of edge. This resulted in small patches of forest surrounded by fields. In terms of the objectives of game managers, this has been quite appropriate. Later, however, it became apparent that some species prefer forest interiors, and these species do not do well in highly fragmented landscapes. Most of them are not game species. Their needs were overlooked by game managers, and now some are now threatened or endangered. If our objective is to maximize populations of game species, creating edges is a good idea. But if we seek to preserve enough habitat to maintain viable populations of all species, maximizing the amount of edge is not a good way to do this. Changing objectives often lead to changing strategies.

Students may well ask "If managers no longer believe that maximizing edge is a good strategy, then why should I bother to learn about it?" There are several reasons why learning about "outmoded" ideas is essential. First, there is no single correct way to manage natural resources. As noted above, managing to maximize edge is still appropriate under some circumstances, that is, when the goal is to benefit edge-dependent species. Second, our generation has no special corner on the truth. To act as if we do seems arrogant and only

Preface xv

invites our successors to wonder how we could possibly have been so naive. Every generation, in every cultural setting, focuses on certain things and develops insight about those things. Likewise, every generation and culture has its own particular blinders and prejudices. Our predecessors did, and so do we. Third, it is important to understand how we got where we are. If mistakes were made in the past, can we learn from them? Although we know that we too have a particular slant on reality, perhaps we can be a little less shortsighted if we understand past shortcomings. Fourth, sometimes without realizing it, we hold on to ideas that are out of date. Many of the ideas that are discussed in this book are widely held, even though scientists are now questioning them. This is partly because science reporters and science teachers themselves do not always keep abreast of the latest developments. But it is also because old ways die hard. That may put us in the position where we are reasoning from contradictions that we do not see. For example, if we try to manage to sustain ecosystem processes, an approach that is based upon the flux-of-nature perspective, yet we continue to envision nature as tending toward balance, the contradictions in our approach are likely to undermine our efforts. With a good understanding of historical context, however, we can understand and disentangle the different threads of thought contributing to our thinking.

A great many people contributed to this book, often in ways that were not apparent at the time. It is not possible to name them all here, but some of the most important deserve special thanks. My mother, Lucy Ellen Wishart Josephson, made sure that I was able to spend my childhood summers away from our apartment in New York City, so that I had some opportunities to be around wild things. My grandmother, Mabel Bradshaw Wishart, taught me the names of plants and animals and ignited my desire to know more. My father, Leon Josephson, taught me the importance of ideas and of history. Nancy Reed Kykyri's enthusiasm and love of people, Cape Cod, and life was infectious. In junior high school, Leah Wallach's intellectual curiosity, honesty, and imagination opened many doors for me and Mrs. Dorothy Young taught me how to organize my writing. In graduate school Richard E. Johnson's meticulous editing trained me to pay attention to the details of written presentation. More recently, my husband Jim has always been supportive and believed that a city girl like me could become a field biologist, even when I had my doubts, and my children, Wes and Angie, were fun to be around and put up with the demands on my time and the piles of books and papers in our home. I also thank Yoram Keyes Bauman, John Donnelly, and John Lawrence for reading and commenting on portions of the manuscript; the other three members of the Sage Notes Gang of Four (Karen Gary, Juanita Lichthardt, and Sarah Walker) and Alan Busacca, Jack Connelly, Michael Dexter, Jean Gorton,

xvi Preface

Bill Lipe, and Kerry Reese for the stimulating discussions and helpful suggestions they provided; Bob Greene and Betsy Dickow of Bookpeople for suggesting important readings and for ordering obscure books for me; the staff of Washington State University's Owen Science and Engineering Library for helping me find useful references; Charlie Robbins for moral support at many points along the way; Jim and Zoe Cooley for their encouragement; Berta Herrera-Trejo for assistance with translating, and Dan Bukvich for making the University of Idaho's Jazz Choir I the ultimate antidote to stress. In addition, I am grateful to Melissa Rockwood and Julie Flynn for doing some of the illustrations, to Emily Silver for working closely with me to develop landscape illustrations that elegantly convey the different approaches to managing living natural resources, to Susan Vetter at Washington State University's Distance Degree Program and Carol Borden for editorial assistance early on, to an anonymous reviewer whose thoughtful and thorough comments were invaluable, and especially to Ward Cooper at Cambridge University Press for believing in this project, and Anna Hodson, for her meticulous copy-editing, and Carol Miller for her fine assistance with proofreading.