THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ABELARD

Each volume of this series of companions to major philosophers contains specially commissioned essays by an international team of scholars, together with a substantial bibliography, and will serve as a reference work for students and non-specialists. One aim of the series is to dispel the intimidation such readers often feel when faced with the work of a difficult and challenging thinker.

Peter Abelard (1079–1142) is one of the greatest philosophers of the medieval period. Although best known for his views about universals and his dramatic love affair with Heloise, he made a number of important contributions in metaphysics, logic, philosophy of language, mind and cognition, philosophical theology, ethics, and literature. The essays in this volume survey the entire range of Abelard's thought, and examine his overall intellectual achievement in its intellectual and historical context. They also trace Abelard's influence on later thought and his relevance to philosophical debates today.

New readers will find this the most convenient, accessible guide to Abelard currently available. Advanced students and specialists will find a conspectus of recent developments in the interpretation of Abelard.

JEFFREY E. BROWER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Purdue University, Indiana.

KEVIN GUILFOY is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Akron, Ohio.

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS AOUINAS Edited by NORMAN KRETZMANN and ELEONORE STUMP HANNAH ARENDT Edited by DANA VILLA ARISTOTLE Edited by JONATHAN BARNES AUGUSTINE Edited by ELEONORE STUMP and NORMAN KRETZMANN BACON Edited by MARKKU PELTONEN SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR Edited by claudia card DARWIN Edited by JONATHAN HODGE and GREGORY RADICK DESCARTES Edited by JOHN COTTINGHAM DUNS SCOTUS Edited by THOMAS WILLIAMS EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. A. LONG FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY Edited by MIRANDA FRICKER and JENNIFER HORNSBY FOUCAULT Edited by GARY GUTTING FREUD Edited by JEROME NEU GADAMER Edited by ROBERT J. DOSTAL GALILEO Edited by PETER MACHAMER GERMAN IDEALISM Edited by KARL AMERIKS GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY Edited by DAVID SEDLEY HABERMAS Edited by STEPHEN K. WHITE HEGEL Edited by FREDERICK BEISER HEIDEGGER Edited by CHARLES GUIGNON HOBBES Edited by TOM SORELL HUME Edited by DAVID FATE NORTON HUSSERL Edited by BARRY SMITH and DAVID WOODRUFF SMITH WILLIAM JAMES Edited by RUTH ANNA PUTNAM KANT Edited by PAUL GUYER KIERKEGAARD Edited by ALASTAIR HANNAY and GORDON MARINO LEIBNIZ Edited by NICHOLAS JOLLEY LEVINAS Edited by SIMON CRITCHLEY and ROBERT BERNASCONI LOCKE Edited by VERE CHAPPELL MALEBRANCHE Edited by STEVEN NADLER

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-77596-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Abelard Edited by Jeffrey E. Brower and Kevin Guilfoy Frontmatter More information

> MARX Edited by TERRELL CARVER MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. S. MCGRADE MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY Edited by DANIEL H. FRANK and OLIVER LEAMAN MILL Edited by JOHN SKORUPSKI NEWTON Edited by I. BERNARD COHEN and GEORGE E. SMITH NIETZSCHE Edited by BERND MAGNUS and KATHLEEN HIGGINS OCKHAM Edited by PAUL VINCENT SPADE PASCAL Edited by NICHOLAS HAMMOND PLATO Edited by RICHARD KRAUT PLOTINUS Edited by LLOYD P. GERSON RAWLS Edited by SAMUEL FREEMAN THOMAS REID Edited by TERENCE CUNEO and RENE VAN WOUDENBERG ROUSSEAU Edited by PATRICK RILEY BERTRAND RUSSELL Edited by NICHOLAS GRIFFIN SARTRE Edited by CHRISTINA HOWELLS SCHOPENHAUER Edited by CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT Edited by ALEXANDER BROADIE SPINOZA Edited by DON GARRETT THE STOICS Edited by BRAD INWOOD WITTGENSTEIN Edited by HANS SLUGA and DAVID STERN

The Cambridge Companion to **ABELARD**

Edited by Jeffrey E. Brower Purdue University

and

Kevin Guilfoy University of Akron



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge св2 8ru, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521775960

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-77247-1 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-77596-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

For Janice and Margaret

CONTENTS

	List of contributors	<i>page</i> xi
	Method of citation and abbreviations	xiv
	Acknowledgments	xvii
	Chronology	xviii
	Introduction JEFFREY E. BROWER AND KEVIN GUILFOY	I
Ι	Life, milieu, and intellectual contexts JOHN MARENBON	13
2	Literary works winthrop wetherbee	45
3	Metaphysics PETER KING	65
4	Philosophy of language KLAUS JACOBI	126
5	Logic Christopher J. Martin	158
6	Mind and cognition KEVIN GUILFOY	200
7	Trinity Jeffrey e. brower	223
8	Sin, grace, and redemption THOMAS WILLIAMS	258

ix

Х	Contents	
9	Ethics William e. mann	279
10	Influence yukio iwakuma	305
	List of Abelard's writings	336
	Bibliography	341
	Index	357

CONTRIBUTORS

JEFFREY E. BROWER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Purdue University. He is editor of a special issue of *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* devoted to Peter Abelard, and author of several publications on medieval philosophy and philosophy of religion. His recent articles include "Medieval theories of relations" in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* and "Anselm's ethics" in *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*.

KEVIN GUILFOY is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Akron. He is the author of several articles on Abelard's logic and ethics, as well as the entries on John of Salisbury and William of Champeaux in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

YUKIO IWAKUMA is Professor in the Center for Arts and Sciences, Fukui Prefectural University, Japan. He has written widely on issues in twelfth-century logic and his many articles include "Twelfth century Nominales: the posthumous school of Peter Abelard," "Vocales, or early Nominalists," and "Pierre Abelard et Guillaume de Champeaux dans les premières années du XIIe siècle: une etude préliminaire."

KLAUS JACOBI is Professor of Philosophy (emeritus), Albert-Ludwig University of Freiburg. He has written widely on issues in medieval philosophy, language, and logic and is co-editor (with Christian Strub) of the forthcoming critical edition of Abelard's *Logica "ingredientibus"* commentary on Aristotle's *De Interpretatione*.

PETER KING is Professor of Philosophy and of Medieval Studies at the University of Toronto. He is translator of *John Buridan's Logic: The Treatise on Supposition, The Treatise on Consequences* and of

xi

xii List of contributors

Augustine: Against the Academics and The Teacher and has written extensively on topics in medieval philosophy. His recent articles include contributions to the *Cambridge Companions* to Duns Scotus and Ockham.

WILLIAM E. MANN is Marsh Professor of Intellectual and Moral Philosophy at the University of Vermont. He has written extensively on topics in medieval philosophy and the philosophy of religion. His recent articles include "Augustine on evil and original sin" in *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* and "Duns Scotus on natural and supernatural knowledge of God" in *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*.

JOHN MARENBON is Tutorial Fellow and Lecturer in the History of Philosophy, Trinity College, University of Cambridge. He is the author of *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard* and *From the Circle of Alcuin to the School of Auxerre*, both published by Cambridge University Press, and is editor of *The Routledge History of Philosophy*, vol. III: *The Middle Ages*. He has also written numerous articles on medieval philosophy, especially concerning the development of the medieval Aristotelian logical tradition.

CHRISTOPHER J. MARTIN is Associate Professor in Philosophy at the University of Auckland, New Zealand. He is author of a number of articles in medieval philosophy and logic, including "The logic of the Nominales," "Boethius and the logic of negation," and "William's machine."

WINTHROP WETHERBEE is Avalon Foundation Professor in the Humanities at Cornell University. He is translator of Bernardus Silvestris's *Cosmographia* and author of *Platonism and Poetry in the Twelfth Century*. He has written extensively on Chaucer, Dante, Middle English, classical and medieval Latin, Old French poetry, and medieval literary criticitism. His recent articles include "Philosophy, commentary, and mythic narrative in twelfthcentury France" and "Dante Alighieri" in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He is translator of Augustine's On Free Choice of the Will and Anselm's Monologion and Proslogion and Three List of contributors

xiii

Philosophical Dialogues: On Truth, On Freedom of Choice, On the Fall of the Devil. He is also editor of The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus and his recent articles include contributions to the Cambridge Companions to Augustine, Anselm, and Medieval Philosophy.

METHOD OF CITATION AND Abbreviations

With the exception of manuscripts and texts of Abelard, the complete bibliographical information for each of the works cited may be found in the list of references at the end of this volume. In the case of manuscripts, full details are given in the notes of particular chapters. In the case of Abelard's works, full details are given in the list of his writings in the appendix at the end of the volume.

Primary sources are cited in as abbreviated a form as will allow readers to locate passages readily in the original Latin and (where available) English translations. Such references are often given as intext citations to standard internal divisions of primary sources, but where a more precise location is needed – as in the case of most references to Abelard – page and line numbers of the relevant Latin edition are also included. All other references are given (in chapter notes) by author and date. (NB: references to the English translations of Abelard in Spade 1994 and 1995, which are included wherever possible, are given by paragraph rather than by page number throughout.)

References to Abelard are given according to the following abbreviations:

ad Ast.	Carmen ad Astralabium
Apol.	Apologia contra Bernardum
Coll.	Collationes
Comm. cant.	Commentarius cantabrigiensis in Epistolas
	Pauli
Comm. Rom.	Commentaria in Epistolam Pauli ad
	Romanos

xiv

Method of citation and abbreviations

Dial.	Dialectica
Ep.	Epistola
HC	Historia calamitatum
Hex.	Expositio in Hexameron
IP (Isag., Cat., De	<i>Introductiones parvulorum</i> (or literal glosses
in., De. Div., Top.)	on Porphyry's <i>Isagoge</i> , Aristotle's <i>Categories</i>
	and <i>De interpretatione</i> , and Boethius's <i>De</i>
	divisione and De topicis differentiis)
LI (Isag., Cat.,	Logica "ingredientibus" (glosses on
De in., Top.)	Porphyry's Isagoge, Aristotle's Categories and
, , ,	<i>De interpretatione,</i> and Boethius's <i>De topicis</i>
	<i>differentiis</i> . References prefixed by a "G" or
	"MP" refer, respectively, to the editions in
	Geyer 1927 and Minio-Paluello 1956)
LNPS	Logica "nostrorum petitoni sociorum"
Problemata	Problemata Heloisae cum Petri Abaelardi
	Solutionibus
Sc.	Scito te Ipsum (= Ethica)
Secundum mag.	Secundum magistrum Petrum sententie
Petrum.	
Sent. Flor.	Sententie Florianenses
Sent. Herm.	Sententie Hermanni (= Sententie Abelardi)
Sent. magistri Petri	Sententie magistri Petri
Sent. Par.	Sententie Parisienses
Serm.	Sermones
TC	Theologia Christiana
TSB	Theologia "summi boni"
TSch	Theologia "scholarium"
TI	Tractatus de intellectibus

References to Aristotle are given according to the following abbreviations:

Cat.	Categories (references prefixed by	
	"ed. comp." refer to the medieval Latin	
	translation of the <i>Categories</i> known as	
	"composite edition," edited in	
	Minio-Paluello 1961)	
De in.	<i>De interpretatione (= Peri hermeneias)</i>	
Metaph.	Metaphysics	

xvi Method of citation and abbreviations

Pr. An.	Prior Analytics
Post. An.	Posterior Analytics
Top.	Topics

References to Boethius are given according to the following abbreviations:

Cons.	De consolatione philosophiae
De div.	De divisione
De hyp. syll.	De syllogismis hypotheticis
De inst. arith.	De institutione arithemetica
De top. diff.	De topicis differentiis
De Trin.	De Trinitate
In Cat.	In Categorias Aristotelis libri quattuor
In Cic. Top.	In Topica Ciceronis commentariorum libri
	SEX
In De in. maior	In De interpretatione Aristotelis
	commentarius maior
In De in. minor	In De interpretatione Aristotelis
	commentarius minor
In Isag. maior	In Isagogen Porphyrii commentarius maior
In Isag. minor	In Isagogen Porphyrii commentarius minor

Finally, references to the works of certain other authors are given according to the following abbreviations:

De civ. Dei	Augustine, De civitate Dei
Inst.	Priscian, Institutiones grammaticae
Isag.	Porphyry, Isagoge
ST	Aquinas, Summa Theologiae

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is a pleasure to acknowledge the help, encouragement, and advice that we have received from a number of friends and colleagues in the course of preparing this volume. To begin, we want to thank three individuals who were especially helpful at the beginning stages of this project: the late Norman Kretzmann, who offered invaluable suggestions on an early draft of our prospectus; Eleonore Stump, who showed us how to improve it immensely; and Scott MacDonald, who has given us expert advice and support at every step of the way.

We are also very grateful for the encouragement and expert advice given to us by Susan Brower-Toland, Jean Field, Terry Foreman, Hilary Gaskin, Peter King, John Marenbon, Robert Pasnau, Paul Spade, and Thomas Williams. Without the help of these people, this volume would never have reached completion.

Finally, we want to thank the two people whose friendship and support we cherish the most – our wives, Janice and Margaret. It is to you that this volume is dedicated.

CHRONOLOGY

1079	Born of minor nobility at La Pallet (near Nantes).
1092-1099	Studies with Roscelin sometime during this period
	(either immediately before 1092, when Roscelin is
	tried for heresy, or some time later in the 1090s, or
	during both periods).
1100	Arrives at Paris to study logic with William of
	Champeaux.
1102–1104	Establishes school of logic at Melun, then transfers it
	to Corbeil; perhaps writes series of commentaries
	known as the Introductiones parvulorum.
1108–1110	Studies rhetoric at Paris with William of Champeaux;
	defeats William in disputation over universals;
	teaches briefly at school of Notre Dame.
1110-1112	Reestablishes school at Melun, then transfers it to
	Mont Ste. Geneviève.
1113	Studies theology with Anselm of Laon.
1114	Teaches at Notre Dame (until 1117); perhaps begins
	writing his most famous logical works, Logica
	"ingredientibus" and Dialectica (between 1114 and
	1121).
1115/1116	Begins affair with Heloise.
1117	Secretly marries Heloise (after the discovery of her
	pregnancy); Astralabe's birth; Abelard's castration.
1118	Enters monastery at St. Denis; implores Heloise to
	become a nun.
II2I-II22	First version of Theologia ("summi boni") condemned
	at Soissons.

xviii

Chronology

xix

1126/1128	Appointed Abbot of St. Gildas; retires from public
	teaching.
1133	Resumes teaching at Paris (until 1140/1141); around
	this time writes his major ethical treatises, Scito te
	ipsum and Collationes.
1140/1141	Revised version of <i>Theologia</i> ("scholarium")
., .	condemned at Council of Sens; Abelard and his
	followers excommunicated.
1141	Stops at Cluny on his way to Rome to appeal the
	sentence at Sens; excommunication is revoked.
1142	21 April, dies at Cluny.