### Contesting Global Governance

This book argues that increasing engagement between international institutions and sectors of civil society is producing a new form of global governance. The authors investigate 'complex multilateralism' by studying the relationship between three multilateral economic institutions (the IMF, World Bank, and World Trade Organization), and three global social movements (environmental, labour, and women's movements). They provide a rich comparative analysis of the institutional response to social movement pressure, tracing institutional change, policy modification and social movement tactics as they struggle to influence the rules and practices governing trade, finance and development regimes. The contest to shape global governance is increasingly being conducted upon a number of levels and amongst a diverse set of actors. Analysing a unique breadth of institutions and movements, this book charts an important part of that contest.

ROBERT O'BRIEN is Assistant Professor of Political Science in the Institute for Globalization and the Human Condition, McMaster University.

ANNE MARIE GOETZ is a Fellow of the Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

JAN AART SCHOLTE is Reader in International Studies at the University of Warwick.

MARC WILLIAMS is Professor of International Relations at the University of New South Wales.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 71

## **Contesting Global Governance**

### Editorial Board

Steve Smith (*Managing editor*) Thomas Biersteker Chris Brown Alex Danchev Rosemary Foot Joseph Grieco G. John Ikenberry Margot Light Andrew Linklater Michael Nicholson Caroline Thomas Roger Tooze

*Cambridge Studies in International Relations* is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series includes a wide range of material, from undergraduate textbooks and surveys to research-based monographs and collaborative volumes. The aim of the series is to publish the best new scholarship in International Studies from Europe, North America and the rest of the world.

71	Robert O'Brien, Anne Marie Goetz, Jan Aart Scholte and Marc Williams <b>Contesting global governance</b> Multilateral economic institutions and global social movements
70	Roland Bleiker Popular dissent, human agency and global politics
69	Bill McSweeney Security, identity and interests A sociology of international relations
68	Molly Cochran <b>Normative theory in international relations</b> <i>A pragmatic approach</i>
67	Alexander Wendt Social theory of international politics
66	Thomas Risse, Stephen C. Ropp and Kathryn Sikkink (eds.) <b>The power of human rights</b> International norms and domestic change
65	Daniel W. Drezner <b>The sanctions paradox</b> <i>Economic statecraft and international relations</i>
64	Viva Ona Bartkus The dynamic of secession
63	John A. Vasquez <b>The power of power politics</b> From classical realism to neotraditionalism
62	Emanuel Adler and Michael Barnett (eds.) Security communities
61	Charles Jones <b>E. H. Carr and international relations</b> <i>A duty to lie</i>
60	<i>Jeffrey W. Knopf</i> <b>Domestic society and international cooperation</b> <i>The impact of protest on US arms control policy</i>
59	Nicholas Greenwood Onuf The republican legacy in international thought
58	Daniel S. Geller and J. David Singer <b>Nations at war</b> A scientific study of international conflict

Series list continues at the end of the book

# Contesting Global Governance

Multilateral Economic Institutions and Global Social Movements

Robert O'Brien McMaster University

Anne Marie Goetz Institute of Development Studies

Jan Aart Scholte University of Warwick

Marc Williams University of New South Wales



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Robert O'Brien, Anne Marie Goetz, Jan Aart Scholte, Marc Williams 2000

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in 10/12.5 Palatino [CE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 77315 6 hardback ISBN 0 521 77440 3 paperback

## Contents

Preface		page ix
List of abbreviations		
1	Contesting global governance: multilateralism and global social movements	1
2	The World Bank and women's movements	24
3	The World Trade Organization and labour	67
4	The World Bank, the World Trade Organization and the environmental social movement	109
5	The International Monetary Fund and social movements	159
6	Complex multilateralism: MEIs and GSMs	206
References Index		235 256

## Preface

The origins of this book lie in a 1994 research programme on global economic institutions (GEI) launched by the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) of Great Britain. The programme encouraged researchers to discuss how existing global economic institutions and regimes, 'shape international interaction, within the context of important changes underway in the world economy' (ESRC 1995). Feeling that initial ESRC projects reflected a narrow field of investigation, we (at that stage all colleagues at the University of Sussex) formulated a research project that would help discover the nature of the evolving relationship between the major public multilateral economic institutions and the world's population. From our perspective, early ESRC GEI projects were dominated by economistic methodologies and a view of the global political economy which excluded civil society actors. Although claiming that changes in the world economy posed great challenges for economic institutions, the methodology and units of analysis used in the projects were hardly innovative. Our view was not that the funded projects were unimportant or unworthy, but that as a group they seemed oblivious of recent theoretical and empirical developments in the fields of international relations, sociology and politics.

It was our hope that the research we produced would supplement and challenge both the findings and the intellectual assumptions of other GEI projects. The initial goal was to determine what relationship there might be between this grand developing architecture of interstate (and sometimes interfirm or state–firm) economic institutions and the non-elite majority of the world's population. It was an interesting, but over-ambitious undertaking given the temporal (two years) and financial (£56,700) constraints on the project. To fulfil the

## CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521773156 - Contesting Global Governance: Multilateral Economic Institutions and Global Social Movements Robert O'Brien, Anne Marie Goetz, Jan Aart Scholte and Marc Williams Frontmatter More information

#### Preface

demands of the funding agency for timely completion, scholarly output and relevance to users we were required to be selective in our study and limit our focus. We decided to focus upon the actions of three multilateral economic institutions (the International Monetary Fund, World Bank, and the World Trade Organization) and three social movements (women's movements, environmentalists and labour). We have used insight gained from these studies to reflect more widely on multilateral governance.

During the course of our research we have accumulated many debts. First, we thank the ESRC for funding our project (grant L120251027). Second, we are grateful to a number of academic colleagues for providing sound advice and supporting us over the evolution of this project. This group includes Robert Cox, Stephen Gill, Richard Higgott, Craig Murphy, Roger Tooze and Caroline Thomas. A graduate student, Chris Slosser, helped in the preparation of this manuscript for publication. Third, we thank many people in our selected international institutions and social movements who have given freely and openly of their time and views on the subject matter. Their number is too great to thank them individually here, but their contribution has been essential to the final product.

Fourth, a number of academics, institutional officials and social movement activists participated in a one-day workshop in February 1998 to discuss our interim report. This group included Jo Marie Griesegraber of the Center of Concern in Washington, Sheila Kawamara of the Ugandan National NGO Forum, Ricardo Melendez of the International Centre for Sustainable Development and Trade in Geneva, Elizabeth Morris-Hughes of the World Bank, Susan Prowse of the International Monetary Fund, Stephen Pursey of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions, Laura Fraude Rubio of the Mexican section of Women's Eyes on the Bank, Gary Sampson of the World Trade Organization, Caroline Thomas of Southampton University, and David Vines of Oxford University. Their insights were greatly appreciated. Despite the fact that there are sections of the book that each of them would challenge we hope that they are stimulated by the final product.

The research for and writing of this book was undertaken as a joint project. Our aspiration was that it would read as a single work rather than an edited collection. Robert O'Brien acted as coordinator and took the lead on the introduction, conclusion and the WTO chapter. Anne Marie Goetz researched and wrote the chapter on the World

#### Preface

Bank, Marc Williams was responsible for the environmental chapter, and Jan Aart Scholte conducted the IMF study. We have faced scheduling difficulties and intellectual disagreements, but we believe a coherent and persuasive study has emerged from our efforts.

## Abbreviations

AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labor–Congress of
	Industrial Organisations
BothENDS	Environment and Development Service for
	NGOs
CEM	Country Economic Memorandum (World Bank)
CTE	Committee on Trade and Environment
DAWN	Development Alternatives with Women for a
	New Era
Development GAP	The Development Group for Alternative
1	Policies
EAs	Environmental assessments (World Bank)
ED	Executive Director (of the IMF)
EGCG	External Gender Consultative Group (World
	Bank)
EI	Education International
ENGOs	Environmental NGOs
ESAF	Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility
ESDVP	Environmentally Sustainable Development Vice
	President (World Bank)
ESM	Environmental social movement
ESW	Economic and sector work (World Bank)
EURODAD	European Network on Debt and Development
EXR	External Relations department (IMF)
FAD	Fiscal Affairs department (IMF)
FOE	Friends of the Earth
GAB	General Arrangements to Borrow
GAP	Gender Analysis and Policy (World Bank)
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
	č

List of abbreviations

GEMIT	Group on Environmental Measures and Inter- national Trade (GATT)
GSM	Global social movements
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries (debt-relief initiative)
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICFTU	International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
ICHRDD	International Centre for Human Rights and
	Democratic Development
IDA	International Development Authority
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IIF	Institute of International Finance
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILRF	International Labor Rights Fund
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ITGLWF	International Textile, Garment and Leather
	Workers' Federation
ITS	International Trade Secretariats
MD	Managing director (of the IMF)
MEI	Multilateral economic institution
MIGA	Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency
NGLS	Non-Governmental Liaison Service (of the
	United Nations)
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
ODs	Operational Directives (World Bank)
PAs	Poverty Assessments (World Bank)
PAD	Public Affairs Division (of IMF's EXR)
PDR	Policy Development and Review department (of
	the IMF)
PSI	Public Services International
Res rep	Resident representative (of the IMF)
SAF	Structural Adjustment Facility
SAP	Structural adjustment programme
SAPRI	Structural Adjustment Policy Review Initiative
SCDO	Swiss Coalition of Development Organisations
SDR	Special Drawing Right
TPRM	Trade policy review mechanism
TWN	Third World Network

xiii

#### List of abbreviations

UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and
	Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WCL	World Confederation of Labour
WEDO	Women's Environment and Development
	Organization
WID	Women in Development
WIDE	Women in Development Europe
WRI	World Resources Institute
WTO	World Trade Organization
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature; World Wildlife
	Fund
WWW	Women Working Worldwide