Kant’s OBSERVATIONS and REMARKS

Kant’s Observations of 1764 and Remarks of 1764–65 (a set of fragments written in the margins of his copy of the Observations) document a crucial turning-point in his life and thought. Both texts reveal the growing importance for him of ethics, anthropology, and politics, but with an important difference. The Observations attempts to observe human nature directly. The Remarks, by contrast, evinces a revolution in Kant’s thinking, largely inspired by Rousseau, who “turned him around” by disclosing to him the idea of a “state of freedom” (modeled on the state of nature) as a touchstone for his thinking. This and related thoughts anticipate such famous later doctrines as the unconditional goodness of good will, the categorical imperative, and the primacy of moral freedom. The essays by leading Kant scholars that are included in the present volume illuminate many and varied topics within these two rich works, including the emerging relations between theory and practice, ethics and anthropology, men and women, philosophy, history, and the “rights of man.”

Susan Meld Shell is Professor and Chair of the Department of Political Science at Boston College, Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts. She is author of Kant and the Limits of Autonomy (2009), The Embodiment of Reason: Kant on Spirit, Generation, and Community (1996), and The Rights of Reason: A Study of Kant’s Philosophy and Politics (1980). She is coeditor (with Robert Faulkner) of America at Risk: Threats to Liberal Self-Government in an Age of Uncertainty (2009).

Cambridge Critical Guides

Titles published in this series:
Hegel’s *Phenomenology of Spirit*
EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill’s *On Liberty*
EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant’s *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim*
EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant’s *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*
EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN

Kant’s *Critique of Practical Reason*
EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN

Wittgenstein’s *Philosophical Investigations*
EDITED BY ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard’s *Concluding Unscientific Postscript*
EDITED BY RICK FURTAK

Plato’s *Republic*
EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato’s *Laws*
EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza’s *Theological-Political Treatise*
EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle’s *Nichomachean Ethics*
EDITED BY JON MILLER

Kant’s *Metaphysics of Morals*
EDITED BY LARA DENIS

Nietzsche’s *On the Genealogy of Morality*
EDITED BY SIMON MAY

Kant’s *Observations and Remarks*
EDITED BY SUSAN MELD SHELL AND RICHARD VELKLEY
Contents

List of tables  page vii
List of contributors  viii
List of abbreviations  xii

Introduction: Kant as youthful observer and legislator
SUSAN MELD SHELL AND RICHARD VELKLEY  1

I KANT’S ETHICAL THOUGHT: SOURCES AND STAGES  11
1 Concerning Kant’s earliest ethics: an attempt at a reconstruction
DIETER HENRICH  13
2 Chimerical ethics and flattering moralists: Baumgarten’s influence on Kant’s moral theory in the Observations and Remarks
COREY W. DYCK  38
3 Two concepts of universality in Kant’s moral theory
PATRICK R. FRIERSON  57
4 Freedom as the foundation of morality: Kant’s early efforts
PAUL GUYER  77

II ETHICS AND AESTHETICS  99
5 Relating aesthetic and sociable feelings to moral and participatory feelings: reassessing Kant on sympathy and honor
RUDOLF A. MAKKREEL  101
6 Kant’s distinction between true and false sublimity
ROBERT R. CLEWIS  116
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 7 Kant’s “curious catalogue of human frailties” and the great portrait of nature  
  **Alix Cohen** | 144 |
| 8 Relative goodness and ambivalence of human traits: reflections in light of Kant’s pedagogical concerns  
  **G. Felicitas Munzel** | 165 |
| 9 Kant as rebel against the social order  
  **Reinhard Brandt** | 185 |
| 10 National character via the beautiful and sublime?  
  **Robert B. Louden** | 198 |
| 11 Absent an even finer feeling: a commentary on the opening of  
  *Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime*  
  **Peter Fenves** | 219 |
| 12 The pursuit of science as decadence in Kant’s Remarks in  
  “Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime”  
  **John H. Zammito** | 234 |
| 13 Kant, human nature, and history after Rousseau  
  **Karl Ameriks** | 247 |

**Bibliography**  
**Index**  
**266**  
**278**
Tables

Table 6.1 Examples of objects with respect to true and false sublimity. 132
Table 7.1 The three modalities of the relationship between nature and morality. 146
Table 7.2 The trichotomy of feelings. 147
Table 7.3 The feelings that compensate for the lack of virtue. 148
Table 7.4 The four human types. 150
Table 7.5 Human types and nature’s purposes. 151
Table 7.6 The correspondence of temperaments and natural drives. 152
Table 7.7 Expanded version of the great portrait of nature. 155
Table 7.8 The degeneration of beautiful and sublime qualities. 157
Table 7.9 Gender and its degenerations. 159
Table 7.10 Temperaments and their degenerative forms. 160
Contributors


REINHARD BRANDT is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Marburg. He has published on Greek philosophy and the Enlightenment in both German and Italian, including Philosophie in Bildern: Von Giorgione bis Magritte (2000), and is editor of works of Kant in the Akademie-Ausgabe (Berlin). Books on Kant: Universität zwischen Selbst- und Fremdbestimmung: Kant’s “Streit der Fakultäten,” mit einem Anhang zu Heideggers “Rektoratsrede” (Berlin 2003), Die Bestimmung des Menschen bei Kant (Hamburg 2007; 2nd printing, 2009), and Immanuel Kant – Was bleibt? (Hamburg 2010; 2nd printing, 2011).


ALIX COHEN is a Lecturer at the University of York and a Research Fellow at the University of Neuchâtel. She is the author of Kant and the Human Sciences: Biology, Anthropology and History (2009) and has published in a range of journals, including Canadian Journal of Philosophy, Kantian Review, History of Philosophy Quarterly, and British Journal for the History of Philosophy. She is currently working on a monograph provisionally entitled...
List of contributors

Kant on the Emotions as part of a research project on imagination, emotion, and value, funded by the Fond national suisse.

Corey W. Dyck is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He specializes in the history of German philosophy, with an emphasis on the eighteenth century and Kant in particular. His publications include articles in the Journal of the History of Philosophy, British Journal for the History of Philosophy, and Kant-Studien, and he is the cotranslator (with Daniel Dahlstrom) of Moses Mendelssohn’s Morning Hours: Lectures on God’s Existence.

Peter Fenves is Joan and Serepta Harrison Professor of Literature at Northwestern University and the author of several books, most recently Late Kant: Toward Another Law of the Earth (2003) and The Messianic Reduction: Walter Benjamin and the Shape of Time (2011).

Patrick R. Frierson is an Associate Professor of Philosophy and Garrett Fellow at Whitman College in Walla Walla, Washington. His research deals with Kant’s psychology, ethics, and conceptions of freedom. He has published Freedom and Anthropology in Kant’s Moral Philosophy (Cambridge University Press, 2003) and numerous articles on Kant in journals such as the Journal of the History of Philosophy and Philosopher’s Imprint and in edited collections such as Kant’s Anatomy of Evil (2010, ed. Sharon Anderson-Gold and Pablo Muchnik) and Kant’s Moral Metaphysics (2010, ed. Benjamin Lipscomb and James Krueger). He is coeditor (with Paul Guyer) of Kant: Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime and Other Writings (Cambridge University Press, 2011) and is presently working on a volume entitled What Is the Human Being? for a series on Kant’s Questions.

List of contributors

worked as editor and translator of the Critique of Pure Reason, the Critique of the Power of Judgment, and Kant’s Notes and Fragments.

DIETER HENRICH is Professor Emeritus at the University of Munich and Honorary Professor at the Humboldt University, Berlin, and was formerly Professor at the Free University, Berlin and at Heidelberg. He is a philosopher in the German idealist tradition and one of that tradition’s leading interpreters. Henrich also taught at Harvard and Columbia, and has been Foreign Honorary Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences since 1993. His many books include Hegel im Kontext (1971), Aesthetic Judgment and the Moral Image of the World: Studies in Kant (1992), The Unity of Reason: Essays on Kant’s Philosophy (1994), Between Kant and Hegel: Lectures on German Idealism (2003), and Denken und Selbstsein (2007).


RUDOLF A. MAKKREEL, C. H. Candler Professor of Philosophy at Emory University, is the author of Dilthey, Philosopher of the Human Studies (1975) and Imagination and Interpretation in Kant: The Hermeneutical Import of the “Critique of Judgment” (1990). He is the co-editor of Dilthey’s Selected Works (5 volumes so far), and of Neo-Kantianism in Contemporary Philosophy (2009). Editor of the Journal of the History of Philosophy from 1983 to 1998, and recipient of fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities, DAAD (Deutscher Akademischer Austausch Dienst), Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, Fritz Thyssen Stiftung, and Volkswagen Stiftung, he is currently completing a book with the working title “Interpretation, Judgment and Critique.”

G. FELICITAS MUNZEL is Associate Professor in the Program of Liberal Studies and Department of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. She is author of Kant’s Conception of Moral Character: The “Critical” Link of Morality, Anthropology, and Reflective Judgment (1999), Kant’s Conception of Pedagogy: Toward Education for Freedom (forthcoming), and articles on Kant’s moral philosophy, anthropology, and pedagogical writings. She is translator of Kant’s 1775/76 Friedländer anthropology lectures (forthcoming).

**Susan Meld Shell** is Professor and Chair of the Department of Political Science at Boston College. Her publications include *Kant and the Limits of Autonomy* (2009), *The Embodiment of Reason: Kant on Spirit, Generation, and Community* (1996), and *The Rights of Reason: A Study of Kant’s Philosophy and Politics* (1980), as well as articles on Kant, Rousseau, German Idealism, Machiavelli, Leo Strauss, and various topics in public policy, including punishment, higher education, and the future of the liberal family.


**John H. Zammito** is John Antony Weir Professor of History at Rice University. His research focuses on the philosophy of Immanuel Kant and that of his student and rival, Johann Gottfried Herder, as well as on the history and philosophy of science and the philosophy of history. His current research involves the genesis of biology as a special science in Germany in the eighteenth century. His key publications are *The Genesis of Kant’s Critique of Judgment* (1992), *Kant, Herder, and the Birth of Anthropology* (2002), and *A Nice Derangement of Epistemes: Post-positivism in the Study of Science from Quine to Latour* (2004).
Abbreviations

In most cases Kant’s works will be cited in the body of the text according to the volume and page number in Kants gesammelte Schriften, Königliche preussische Akademie der Wissenschaften edition (Berlin: W. de Gruyter, 1902–), abbreviated in the list below as Ak.

The following abbreviations are used to refer to specific works by Kant.

AC Anthropologie Collins (1772/73), Ak 25.1
   Collins’ Notes on Kant’s Anthropology Lectures
AN Allgemeine Naturgeschichte und Theorie des Himmels (1755), Ak 1
   Universal Natural History and Theory of the Heavens
AF Vorlesungen über Anthropologie Friedländer (1775/76), Ak 25.1
   Friedländer’s Notes on Kant’s Anthropology Lectures
AP Anthropologie Parow (1772/73), Ak 25.1
   Parow’s Notes on Kant’s Anthropology Lectures
ApH Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht (1798), Ak 7
   Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View
Bem Bemerkungen zu den “Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen und Erhabenen” (1764–65), Ak 20
   Remarks in the “Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime”
Beo Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen und Erhabenen (1764), Ak 2
   Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime
Brief Briefwechsel, Ak 10–13
   Kant’s Letters
Dm De mundi sensibilis atque intelligibilis forma et principiis (1770), Ak 2
   On the Form and Principles of the Sensible and Intelligible World
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do</td>
<td>Was heisst: Sich im Denken orientieren? (1786), Ak 8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Em</td>
<td>Der einzig mögliche Beweisgrund zu einer Demonstration des Dasein Gottes (1763), Ak 2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>En</td>
<td>Entwurf und Ankündigung eines Collegii der physischen Geographie (1757), Ak 2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Grundlegung der Metaphysik der Sitten (1785), Ak 4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHo</td>
<td>Geographie Holstein (1758/59), Ak 26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea</td>
<td>Idee zu einer allgemeinen Geschichte in weltbürgerlicher Absicht (1784), Ak 8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KpV</td>
<td>Kritik der praktischen Vernunft (1788), Ak 5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KrV</td>
<td>Kritik der reinen Vernunft (1781, 1787)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KU</td>
<td>Kritik der Urteilskraft (1790), Ak 5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>Mutmaßlicher Anfang der Menschengeschichte (1786), Ak 8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Me</td>
<td>Menschenkunde (1781/82), Ak 25.2</td>
<td>25.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Bestimmung des Begriffs einer Menschenrace (1785), Ak 8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MH</td>
<td>Metaphysik Herder (1762–64), Ak 28.1–2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td>Metaphysik der Sitten (1797–98), Ak 6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>Nachricht von der Einrichtung seiner Vorlesung in dem Winterhalbjahr 1765–66 (1765), Ak 2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NB</td>
<td>Neuer Lehrbegriff der Bewegung und Ruhe (1758), Ak 2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of abbreviations

P  Principiorum primorum cognitionis metaphysicae nova dilucidatio (1755), Ak 2
    New Elucidation of the First Principles of Metaphysical Cognition

Päd  Pädagogik (1803), Ak 9
    Lectures on Pedagogy

PG  Physische Geographie (1802), Ak 9
    Lectures on Physical Geography

Ph  Aufsätze, das Philanthropin betreffend (1776–77), Ak 2
    Essays regarding the Philanthropinum

PPH  Praktische Philosophie Herder (1762–64), Ak 27.1
    J. G. Herder’s Notes on Kant’s Practical Philosophy Lectures

PPV  Metaphysik der Sitten Vigilantius (1793/94), Ak 27.2/1
    Vigilantius’s Notes on Kant’s Metaphysics of Morals Lectures

PR  Philosophische Religionslehre nach Pölitz (1783/84), Ak 28.2/2
    Pölitz’s Notes on Kant’s Lectures on the Philosophical Theology

R  Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der bloßen Vernunft (1793–94), Ak 6
    Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason

Ref  Reflexionen (Ak 14–23). References here are to the number of the
    Reflection and then to the volume and the page of the Akademie edition.

Ri  Bemerkungen in den “Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen
    und Erhabenen” (1764–65), ed. M. Rischmüller (Felix Meiner, 1991)
    Remarks in the “Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and
    Sublime”

S  Der Streit der Fakultäten (1798), Ak 7
    The Conflict of the Faculties

T  Träume eines Geistersehers, erläutert durch Träume der Metaphysik
    (1766), Ak 2
    Dreams of a Spirit-Seer, Elucidated by Dreams of Metaphysics

UD  Untersuchung über die Deutlichkeit der Grundsätze der natürlichen
    Theologie und der Moral (1764), Ak 2
    Inquiry concerning the Distinctness of the Principles of Natural
    Theology and Morality

VBN  Versuch den Begriff der negativen Größen in die Weltweisheit
    einzuführen (1763), Ak 2
    An Attempt to Introduce the Concept of Negative Quantities into
    Metaphysics

VBO  Versuch einiger Betrachtungen über den Optimismus (1759), Ak 2
    An Attempt at Some Reflections on Optimism
List of abbreviations

VK Versuch über die Krankheiten des Kopfes (1764), Ak 2
Essay on the Maladies of the Head

vRM Von den verschiedenen Racen der Menschen (1775), Ak 2
Of the Different Races of Men

ZeF Zum ewigen Frieden: Ein philosophischer Entwurf (1795), Ak 8
Toward Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Sketch