### Semi-Citizenship in Democratic Politics

In every democratic polity there exist individuals and groups who hold some but not all of the essential elements of citizenship. Scholars who study citizenship routinely reach for shared concepts and language to identify forms of political membership held by migrants, children, the disabled, and other groups of individuals who, for various reasons, are neither full citizens nor non-citizens.

This book introduces the concept of *semi-citizenship* as a means of dramatically advancing debates about individuals who hold some, but not all, elements of full democratic citizenship. By analytically classifying the rights of citizenship and their various combinations, scholars can typologize semi-citizens and produce comparisons of different kinds of semi-citizenships and of semi-citizenships in different states. The book uses theoretical analysis, historical examples, and contemporary cases of semi-citizenship to illustrate how normative and governmental doctrines of citizenship converge and conflict, making semi-citizenship an enduring and inevitable part of democratic politics.

Elizabeth F. Cohen is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs at Syracuse University. She holds a Ph.D. from Yale University. Her research interests focus on contemporary political theory, citizenship studies, and the politics of immigration. She has published articles in *Citizenship Studies* and the *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*. Her articles and essays address children's citizenship, immigration, asylum, migration policy, same-sex marriage, the civil disabilities of felons and ex-felons, and citizenship in the European Union. Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76899-3 - Semi-Citizenship in Democratic Politics Elizabeth F. Cohen Frontmatter More information

# Semi-Citizenship in Democratic Politics

ELIZABETH F. COHEN Syracuse University



## CAMBRIDGE

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521768993

© Elizabeth F. Cohen 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Cohen, Elizabeth F., 1973– Semi-citizenship in democratic politics / Elizabeth F. Cohen. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 978-0-521-76899-3 (hardback) I. Citizenship. 2. Nationalism. I. Title. JF801.C593 2009 323.6-dc22 2008053484

ISBN 978-0-521-76899-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76899-3 - Semi-Citizenship in Democratic Politics Elizabeth F. Cohen Frontmatter More information

> For Reggie Feiner Cohen and Ira J. Cohen, who bequeathed to me the ideas that families can be democratic, children are citizens, and acting like grown-ups isn't necessarily the best way to live.

# Contents

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> ix
I	Introduction	I
2	The Myth of Full Citizenship	13
3	An Introduction to Semi-Citizenship	59
4	Logics of Semi-Citizenship	95
5	Semi-Citizenship and the Disaggregation of Autonomous Rights	141
6	Semi-Citizenship and the Disaggregation of Relative Rights	178
7	Conclusion	204
Bibliography		211
Index		227

## Acknowledgments

The motivation for this book lies squarely in the biography of Chaim Feiner. My family's citizenship is the enduring legacy of his determination, courage, and intelligence. I permanently record his name here, before all others, in triumphant defiance of anyone who has ever or will ever attempt to erase a human life. He persevered through the darkest years of modernity, resolutely confronting depravity and indifference. He transcended both with unwavering personal honor and cosmopolitanism, each of which he brought to bear on his political convictions and his relationships. I am in awe of his life and cherish his memory.

For their role in helping me achieve my professional citizenship, I thank the members of my dissertation committee at Yale University: Rogers M. Smith, Ian Shapiro, John P. McCormick, and Bruce Ackerman. They instilled in me an appreciation for academic autonomy that I will carry with me well past the publication of this book. While I was at Yale, Robert Dahl, David Cameron, David Mayhew, and Peter Schuck also shared helpful feedback and congenial support.

Mary Dietz read a section of the dissertation and provided incisive and constructive critiques that took the work on its own terms before those terms were easy to discern. Carol Swain offered intellectual engagement and stalwart professional encouragement early and often. Linda Bosniak and Jennifer Hochschild gave me astute commentary on a draft of this manuscript. Bryan S. Turner provided me with an opportunity to think about questions of governmentality. He also founded the field of citizenship studies, one of his many achievements that have reshaped scholarship in the social sciences. х

Acknowledgments

I am indebted to Lewis Bateman at Cambridge University Press for his support and willingness to take a chance on a brand new word. I also wish to thank Emily Spangler, who skillfully shepherded the manuscript through the editorial process. Two scrupulously thorough and thoughtful anonymous reviewers contributed immensely valuable insights. At several key points their suggestions transformed my thinking. In addition I am grateful for Peter R. Murray's erudite editorial review. Finally, I would like to thank Donna Ching of ChingFoster Design for rendering the evocative cover design.

Sections of this book benefited from presentations at Princeton University's conference on Debating Immigration, at the Vanderbilt University Law School, and at the University of Wisconsin's Political Theory Workshop and American Political Thought Series. Related material was also presented to members of Syracuse University's Sawyer Law and Politics Program and Institute for the Study of the Judiciary, Politics, and the Media, both of which are the institutional brainchildren of Keith J. Bybee. In a singularly civic act, Suzanne Mettler, with support from Syracuse's Department of Political Science and the Maxwell School Dean's Office, founded a Manuscript Review Workshop at which a draft of this book was presented. For her commitment to this endeavor, Suzanne deserves copious credit, not just from me, but from the profession at large.

For grant and research support I thank Yale University and Syracuse University, in particular, the Dean's Office of the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs and the Alan K. Campbell Institute.

My colleagues at the Maxwell School are truly remarkable. For their diverse contributions I wish to acknowledge: Kristi Andersen, Keith Bybee, Ken Baynes, Gavan Duffy, Fred Frohock, Vernon Greene, Tom Keck, Ralph Ketcham, Audie Klotz, Lily Ling, Robert McClure, Glyn Morgan, Mark Rupert, Hans Peter Schmitz, Jeffrey Stonecash, Laurence Thomas, and Stuart Thorson. Brian Taylor and Renee Denevers are unswervingly loyal colleagues and friends. Danny Hayes and Julie Gozan clarified my thinking on membership in important ways. I have also relied on the skill and good humor that Kelley Coleman and Bethany Walawender at the Campbell Institute, and Candy Brooks, Stacy Bunce, Jacquie Meyer, and Tess Slater in Syracuse's Department of Political Science, bring to their work.

While at Syracuse, I have learned a great deal from conversations with numerous talented students, some of whom also assisted with research

#### Acknowledgments

for this book. Special thanks to: Saheli Datta, Havva Karakas-Keles, Lindsey Kingston, Jenn Kinney, John McClure, and Christopher Morley. Steven Dube and Cyril Ghosh invented a profession, editorial therapy, and provided this service to me with alacrity and gentle wit.

Since we met at Yale, Janelle Wong, Dara Strolovitch, Jessica Allina-Pisano, and Naomi Murakawa have regularly demonstrated to me how to unite one's principles with one's vocation. Paul Frymer is as committed a friend as he is a scholar. Lennie Feldman possesses a truly rare intellectual acumen, generosity, and unerring ethics. Casiano Hacker-Cordon exemplifies professional inclusiveness. Jolynn Parker, Mike Goode, Heidi Swarts, Sarah Pralle, Asthildur Bernhardsdottir, Dawn Wilson, Bob Wilson, Tom Perreault, Meredith Perreault, and Tod Rutherford supplied a steady stream of good cheer and good food. I have missed Emily and Bill Gottlieb, Jennifer Wang, and Bess O'Neill while I was sequestered at my desk. Cyril: The strength and grace of your character is a continual source of amazement to me. You have also forever erased the line between friend and family in my head and heart, for which I am profoundly grateful. Loving thanks also to Mobus Operandi and Co. and Misha and Maddie Ketzel.

I am also lucky to call my aunt, Celia Epstein, a lifelong friend. I miss my uncle Gil and feel his absence keenly.

Reggie Feiner Cohen and Ira J. Cohen are the two most intellectually lively, insightful, and intensely loyal individuals I could ever hope to know. I constantly marvel at the good fortune I had to join the lifelong conversation they began 41 years ago. RFC and IJC: you frequently remind me that we cannot choose our relatives. If we could, I would choose you.