

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini

Beethoven and Rossini have always been more than a pair of famous composers. Even during their lifetimes, they were well on the way to becoming “Beethoven and Rossini” – a symbolic duo, who represented a contrast of philosophies fundamental to Western music. This contrast was to shape the composition, performance, reception, and historiography of music throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. *The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini* puts leading scholars of opera and instrumental music into dialog with each other, with the aim of unpicking the origins, consequences, and fallacies of the opposition between the two composers and what they came to represent. In fifteen chapters, contributors explore topics ranging from the concert lives of early-nineteenth-century capitals to the mythmaking of early cinema, and from the close analysis of individual works by Beethoven and Rossini to the cultural politics of nineteenth-century music histories.

NICHOLAS MATHEW is a professor in the Department of Music at the University of California, Berkeley. He is the author of *Political Beethoven* (2013) and has published articles in, for example, *Musical Quarterly*, *Eighteenth-Century Music*, *19th-Century Music*, *Current Musicology*, the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, and the volume *Engaging Haydn* (edited by Richard Will and Mary Hunter, 2012). He is currently editor, with W. Dean Sutcliffe, of the journal *Eighteenth-Century Music*.

BENJAMIN WALTON is University Senior Lecturer in Music at the University of Cambridge, and a Fellow of Jesus College. He is the author of *Rossini in Restoration Paris: The Sound of Modern Life* (2007), and is currently writing a book about the spread of opera beyond Europe in the first half of the nineteenth century.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini

Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by NICHOLAS MATHEW

and

BENJAMIN WALTON



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521768054

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The invention of Beethoven and Rossini : historiography, analysis, criticism / edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton.

pages cm

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76805-4

1. Music – 19th century – History and criticism. 2. Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770–1827 – Criticism and interpretation. 3. Rossini, Gioachino, 1792–1868 – Criticism and interpretation. 4. Music – Historiography. I. Mathew, Nicholas. II. Walton, Benjamin, 1972–

ML196.I58 2013

780.92'2–dc23

2013013362

ISBN 978-0-521-76805-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

List of figures [page vii]

Notes on contributors [ix]

Acknowledgements [xii]

List of abbreviations [xiii]

Introduction: Pleasure in history [1]

NICHOLAS MATHEW AND BENJAMIN WALTON

PART I THE AGE OF BEETHOVEN AND ROSSINI? [13]

- 1 Dahlhaus's Beethoven-Rossini *Stildualismus*: lingering legacies of the text-event dichotomy [15]

JAMES HEPOKOSKI

- 2 Beethoven, Rossini – and others [49]

JAMES WEBSTER

- 3 *Heilige Trias, Stildualismus*, Beethoven: on the limits of nineteenth-century Germanic music

historiography [66]

GUNDULA KREUZER

- 4 Rossini and Beethoven in the reception of Schubert [96]

SUZANNAH CLARK

PART II SENSES OF PLACE [121]

- 5 Two styles in 1830s London: “The form and order of a perspicuous unity” [123]

ROGER PARKER

- 6 Looking north: Carlo Soliva and the two styles south of the Alps [139]

MARTIN DEASY

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

- 7 “More German than Beethoven”: Rossini’s *Zelmira* and Italian style [159]
BENJAMIN WALTON
- 8 On being there in 1824 [178]
NICHOLAS MATHEW
- PART III REHEARINGS [195]
- 9 Making overtures [197]
SCOTT BURNHAM
- 10 Beethoven dances: Prometheus and his creatures in Vienna and Milan [210]
MARY ANN SMART
- 11 Rossinian repetitions [236]
EMANUELE SENICI
- PART IV CROSSING MUSICAL CULTURES [263]
- 12 Very much of this world: Beethoven, Rossini, and the historiography of modernity [265]
JULIAN JOHNSON
- 13 Schopenhauer and Rossinian universality: on the Italianate in Schopenhauer’s metaphysics of music [283]
Yael BRAUNSCHWEIG
- 14 Elements of disorder: appealing *Beethoven vs. Rossini* [305]
JOHN DEATHRIDGE
- 15 Role reversal: Rossini and Beethoven in early biopics [333]
RICHARD WILL
- List of works cited* [355]
Index [381]

Figures

- 14.1 Title page of *Two Trios in Different Styles Composed by an Amateur in Amsterdam* published by [the fictitious] Jaque Vanderbouzen (1792). © The British Library Board. All rights reserved. [page 308]
- 14.2 “German” musicians and their audience of attentive animals. Detail from the title page of *Two Trios in Different Styles*. © The British Library Board. All rights reserved. [309]
- 14.3 The German musical “sun” invented in London in 1792 by August Frederic Christopher Kollmann. Copper engraving first published in the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, October 30, 1799. By permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library. [310]
- 14.4 Henri Dochy, after Pierre Petit. The formal identification of Rossini’s body (*reconnaissance du corps*) during the exhumation of his remains in the Père-Lachaise cemetery in Paris (1887). [321]
- 14.5 The funeral canopy and formal consecration ceremony in front of Santa Croce, Florence, immediately prior to the reburial of Rossini’s remains inside the church. Wood engraving, *Le Monde illustré*, May 28, 1887. Lebrecht Picture Library. [322]
- 14.6 Beethoven’s reburial on June 22, 1888, a day after the second exhumation of his remains. By permission of the Beethoven-Haus, Bonn. [323]
- 14.7 The original design of Beethoven’s gravestone, possibly by Ferdinand Schubert, as it was first published in 1829. © The British Library Board. All rights reserved. [325]
- 14.8 Rossini’s grave in Santa Croce, Florence. Reproduced under the terms of the GNU Free Documentation Licence. [326]
- 15.1 Mario Bonnard, *Rossini* (1942): the mournful visage of Beethoven (Memo Benassi). [338]
- 15.2 *Rossini*: wide-eyed Rossini (Nino Besozzi). [338]
- 15.3 *Rossini*: Rossini imagines the finale of *Guillaume Tell*. [339]

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

List of figures

- 15.4 Abel Gance, *Un Grand Amour de Beethoven* (1936): Thérèse (Annie Ducaux) tidies up Beethoven's piano. [344]
- 15.5 *Un Grand Amour de Beethoven*: Beethoven (Harry Baur) improvises the "Moonlight" Sonata. [346]
- 15.6 *Un Grand Amour de Beethoven*: Juliette (Jany Holt) begs forgiveness. [347]

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

Yael Braunschweig is a Ph.D. candidate in the history and literature of music at the University of California, Berkeley. She is the recipient of a DAAD fellowship, and is currently completing a dissertation on the music of Robert Schumann. Her writing on Schumann has been published in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* and *The New York Times*.

Scott Burnham is the Scheide Professor of Music History at Princeton University, where he has taught since 1989. Burnham holds degrees in music composition and music theory from Baldwin-Wallace College (B.M.), Yale University (M.M.), and Brandeis University (Ph.D.). His best-known book is *Beethoven Hero* (1995), a study of the values and reception of Beethoven's heroic-style music. His most recent book, *Mozart's Grace* (2013), explores aspects of beauty in Mozart's music.

Suzannah Clark is Professor of Music at Harvard University. Before joining Harvard, she taught at Oxford University for eight years. In addition to her work on Schubert, her research interests range from medieval French motets to the history of tonal music theory. She is co-editor of *Citation and Authority in Medieval and Renaissance Musical Culture: Learning from the Learned*, with Elizabeth Eva Leach, and *Music Theory and Natural Order from the Renaissance to the Early Twentieth Century*, with Alexander Rehding. Her book *Analyzing Schubert* was published by Cambridge University Press in 2011.

Martin Deasy is a musicologist specializing in nineteenth-century Italian opera. He has published in *19th-Century Music* and the *Cambridge Opera Journal*. His critical edition of Puccini's first opera, *Le villi*, is forthcoming as part of the *Edizione Nazionale Giacomo Puccini*.

John Deathridge is King Edward Professor of Music Emeritus at King's College London. He likes teaching, and writing about, radical philosophy, opera, Wagner (most of him), the symphony, Beethoven, and mass media. He is the author of *Wagner beyond Good and Evil* (2008) and an occasional TV and radio broadcaster.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

JAMES HEPOKOSKI is Professor of Music at Yale University. His most recent books include a collection of writings, *Music, Structure, Thought: Selected Essays* (2009) and, in exchanges with William E. Caplin and James Webster, *Musical Form, Forms & Formenlehre: Three Methodological Reflections* (2009).

JULIAN JOHNSON is Regius Professor of Music at Royal Holloway, University of London. He has published widely on music from Beethoven to contemporary music, but with a particular focus on Viennese Modernism, musical aesthetics, and the idea of musical modernity. He has written four books, including *Webern and the Transformation of Nature* (Cambridge University Press, 1999), *Who Needs Classical Music?* (2002), and *Mahler's Voices: Expression and Irony in the Songs and Symphonies* (2009), and contributed chapters to twenty edited volumes and a number of articles to journals including *19th-Century Music*, *Music Analysis*, and *Music & Letters*.

GUNDULA KREUZER is Associate Professor at the Department of Music, Yale University. Her publications include *Verdi and the Germans: From Unification to the Third Reich* (Cambridge University Press, 2010), the critical edition of Verdi's instrumental chamber music (2010), and various articles on Verdi, Wagner, music historiography, and operatic staging. She is currently working on a monograph called *Wagnerian Technologies: On 19th-Century Opera as Production*. Kreuzer has served as Associate and Reviews Editor of *The Opera Quarterly*, for which she also co-guest edited a double issue on "Opera in Transition."

NICHOLAS MATHEW is a professor in the Department of Music at the University of California, Berkeley. He is the co-editor of the journal *Eighteenth-Century Music* and the author of *Political Beethoven* (Cambridge University Press, 2013).

ROGER PARKER is Professor of Music at King's College London, having previously taught at Cornell, Oxford, and Cambridge. He is General Editor (with Gabriele Dotto) of the Donizetti critical edition, published by Ricordi. His most recent books are *Remaking the Song: Operatic Visions and Revisions from Handel to Berio* (2006) and *A History of Opera: The Last Four Hundred Years* (2012), written jointly with Carolyn Abbate. He is now working on a book about music in London in the 1830s.

EMANUELE SENICI is Professor of Music History at the University of Rome La Sapienza. His publications include "*La clemenza di Tito*" di

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Mozart: I primi trent'anni (1791–1821) (1997) and *Landscape and Gender in Italian Opera: The Alpine Virgin from Bellini to Puccini* (Cambridge University Press, 2005). Recent essays have appeared in *Opera Quarterly*, *Il Saggiatore Musicale*, *The Journal of Modern Italian Studies*, and the collection *Opera and Video* (2012).

MARY ANN SMART is Gladyce Arata Terrill Professor of Music at the University of California, Berkeley. Her publications include *Mimomania: Music and Gesture in Nineteenth-Century Opera* (2004). She is currently completing a book about the connections between opera and progressive politics in nineteenth-century Italy, to be titled *Waiting for Verdi: Opera and Political Opinion in Italy, 1815–1848*.

BENJAMIN WALTON is University Senior Lecturer in Music at the University of Cambridge, and a fellow of Jesus College. He is author of *Rossini in Restoration Paris: The Sound of Modern Life* (Cambridge University Press, 2007), and is currently writing a book about the spread of opera beyond Europe in the first half of the nineteenth century.

JAMES WEBSTER is Goldwin Smith Professor of Music at Cornell University. He is the author of *Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style* (Cambridge University Press, 1991) and the Haydn article in the revised edition of the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, and editor of *Haydn Studies* (1981) and Haydn's string quartets Opp. 42, 50, and 54/55 (*Joseph Haydn: Werke, XII/4*). He is an editor of *Opera Buffa in Mozart's Vienna* (Cambridge University Press, 1997) and has published widely on Mozart's operas, Beethoven, Schubert, and Brahms, as well as analysis, editorial and performance practice, and the historiography of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century music.

RICHARD WILL is Associate Professor of Music at the University of Virginia. He is author of *The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven* (2002); co-editor of *Engaging Haydn: Culture, Context, and Criticism* (2012); and a contributor to *C. P. E. Bach Studies* (2006), *The Cambridge History of Eighteenth-Century Music* (2009), and other essay collections and journals.

Acknowledgements

The conference that was the starting point for this book, “Beethoven and Rossini: Crossing Musical Cultures,” was generously supported by the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences, and Humanities (CRASSH) and the Faculty of Music at the University of Cambridge, the Royal Musical Association, the British Academy, and the Music & Letters Trust. For their help with the organization of the conference, we would particularly like to thank Catherine Hurley, Michelle Maciejewska and the staff at CRASSH, and the conference office at Jesus College, Cambridge.

It was our hope that the conference would instigate new exchanges between the sometimes mutually indifferent musicological cultures of Italian opera and German instrumental music. All of those who attended and participated in the conference deserve our thanks for creating its stimulating and good-humored atmosphere – particularly those who presented papers and chaired discussion panels, including Aaron Allen, James Davies, Emily Dolan, Michael Fend, Dana Gooley, Matthew Head, Nicholas Marston, Stephen Rumph, and Laura Tunbridge. Richard Taruskin absorbed every paper and delivered the conference’s closing remarks.

Anicia Timberlake undertook valuable work on the manuscript as the book took shape, not least in compiling the ‘List of works cited’, and David Coll helped with the production of the music examples. We are also grateful to Katherine Hambridge for compiling the index, and to Andrew Dawes for copy-editing the manuscript. As ever, Vicki Cooper, Fleur Jones, and Rebecca Taylor at Cambridge University Press were expert and supportive in bringing together the completed volume.

Last of all, it is a pleasure to thank the authors of these essays, who have each contributed so much more than their own prose to the form and content of this book.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76805-4 - The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism

Edited by Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

- AMZ: *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung.*
- Geschichte: Raphael Georg Kiesewetter, *Geschichte der europäisch-abendländischen oder unsrer heutigen Musik. Darstellung ihres Ursprunges, ihres Wachsthumes und ihrer stufenweisen Entwicklung; von dem ersten Jahrhundert des Christenthumes bis auf unsre Zeit* (Leipzig, 1834).
- NCM: Carl Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989).