Liberalism, Imperialism, and the Historical Imagination

This book examines the ways in which imperial agendas informed the writing of history in nineteenth-century Britain and how historical writing transformed imperial agendas. Using the published writings and personal papers of Walter Scott, J. A. Froude, James Mill, Rammohun Roy, T. B. Macaulay, E. A. Freeman, W. E. Gladstone, and J. R. Seeley among others, Theodore Koditschek sheds new light on the role of the historical imagination in the establishment and legitimation of liberal imperialism. He shows how both imperialists and the imperialized were drawn to reflect back on Empire’s past as a result of the need to construct a modern, multi-national British imperial identity for a more economically expansive and enlightened present. By tracing the imperial lives and historical works of these pivotal figures, Theodore Koditschek illuminates the ways in which discourse altered practice, and vice versa, as well as how the history of Empire was continuously written and re-written.

THEODORE KODITSCHEK is Associate Professor of History at the University of Missouri, Columbia.
Liberalism, Imperialism, and the Historical Imagination

Nineteenth-Century Visions of a Greater Britain

Theodore Koditschek
To Sarah Whites-Koditschek
Contents

Acknowledgements x
List of abbreviations xii

Introduction 1
  1 Historiography and methodology 4
  2 Plan of the chapters 9

1 Imagining Great Britain: Union, Empire, and the burden of history, 1800–1830 17
  1 Maria Edgeworth’s romance of Anglo-Irish Union 22
  2 Edgeworth, Owenson, and the burdens of history 26
  3 The border crossings of Walter Scott 31
  4 The Waverley romances of Anglo-Scottish Union 37
  5 The reception of Scott’s British Unionist romance 48
  6 Conclusion: from British to imperial Union 52

2 Imagining a British India: history and the reconstruction of Empire 56
  1 Orientalism, old and new 59
  2 Scottish orientalism and the romance of British India 66
  3 John Malcolm and the romance of British India 71
  4 Mountstuart Elphinstone and the project of Indian modernization 77
  5 James Mill and the British assault on Indian history 82
  6 Rammohun Roy’s Union of Anglo-Indian history 90
  7 Conclusion 97

3 Imagining a Greater Britain: the Macaulays and the liberal romance of Empire 99
  1 The first Macaulay and the second British Empire 101
  2 The second Macaulay and the historian’s Empire 106
  3 Frustrations in Whig politics 113
  4 Encounter with colonial India 118
  5 Progressive (English) history as liberal (imperial) politics by other means 123
  6 The historical romance of the British center 129
  7 Peripheral nightmares: the Indian and Irish centers do not hold 136
## Contents

8 The reception of Macaulay's *History*  
9 Conclusion  

4 Re-imagining a Greater Britain: J. A. Froude: counter-romance and controversy  
1 Froudian whips  
2 Henrician flaps  
3 Victorian anxieties and Elizabethan adventures  
4 Protestantism and the British Union  
5 Froude's Greater British Victorian vision  
6 Froude revises Anglo-Irish history  
7 W. E. H. Lecky's Anglo-Irish counter-history  
8 Ethnic evolution and Froude's imperial scheme  
9 Racial exclusion and Froude's oceanic dream  
10 'The race against Froudacity'  
11 Conclusion  

5 Greater Britain and the "lesser breeds": liberalism, race, and evolutionary history  
1 The advent of evolution and *longue durée* history  
2 John Lubbock and the evolution of "savagery"  
3 Empire and the classification of racial and evolutionary others  
4 The evolution of Aryanism: Henry Maine  
and imperial divergence  
5 R. C. Dutt: evolution and the liberal middle-class other  
6 E. A. Freeman: the rise of the Anglo-Saxon in racial and  
evolutionary history  
7 E. A. Freeman: the triumph of Anglo-Saxonism  
in the nineteenth century  
8 The failure of hybrid evolutionism: a tale of two Greens  
9 William Stubbs and the evolution of the English Constitution  
10 The English Constitution and Anglo-Indian history  

6 Indian liberals and Greater Britain: the search for union through history  
1 The Calcutta bhadralok and British racial ideology  
2 Keshub Chandra Sen and the quest for spiritual history  
3 Brahma Samaj and the evolution of spirituality  
4 Bankimchandra Chattopadhyay and the contradictions  
of imperial history  
5 Surendranath Banerjea and the Indianization  
of Macaulay's constitutional romance  
6 Dadabhai Naoroji: imperial mis-government and  
the history of the "drain"  
7 R. C. Dutt and the riches of ancient Hindu civilization  
8 R. C. Dutt and the history of modern Indian poverty  
9 Conclusion: liberal imperialism’s reappearance on the periphery  

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
Contents

Epilogue: From liberal imperialism to Conservative Unionism: losing the thread of progress in history 314
   1 Gladstone’s progress: from youthful reactionary to aging radical 315
   2 Midlothianizing India: evolutionary objects or historical agents? 318
   3 Midlothianizing Ireland: conquered colony or Celtic “Home Rule”? 325
   4 Chamberlain and Seeley: Unionism, history, and progress
      in the high imperial age 334
   5 The strange death of liberal imperialism 341

Index 346
Acknowledgements

Several individuals and institutions have facilitated my work on this book. In 1999, Terry Brotherstone invited me to participate in the Mackie Conference at the University of Aberdeen, where I presented a paper on T. B. Macaulay and Empire, which gradually evolved into what is now Chapter 3. Both Terry and Anna Clark gave me valuable feedback on this evolving chapter over the next few years. In addition, Anna helped me to narrow the larger project, giving it a clearer focus and a more manageable length. In 2002–3, a grant from the University of Missouri Research Council relieved me of teaching duties, giving me a year to devote largely to research. My friends in the University of Missouri English Department, notably Nancy West, Devoney Looser, and Noah Heringman, gave me much-valued advice and encouragement, especially Noah, who read and carefully commented on versions of Chapters 1, 2, 4, and 5. In the History Department, LeeAnn Whites and Linda Reeder helped me in formulating my initial book proposal, and Kerby Miller assisted me in all matters pertaining to Ireland and the Irish. In addition, he has given me important feedback on several versions of Chapters 1 and 4.

An invitation to the Nicholson Conference on British Studies at the University of Chicago in 2005 gave me a much-needed boost of intellectual stimulation, and connected me up with Andrew Sartori, who commented helpfully on an earlier version of Chapter 2. I am particularly grateful to Catherine Hall for her invitation to participate in the 2008 Neale Conference at University College, London, which was the perfect environment for helping me tie together the various strands of my book. I also greatly benefited from the specific comments and encouragement of Geof Eley, Christopher Bayly, Mrinalini Sinha, and Catherine herself on my paper, which became the core for Chapter 5. At Cambridge University Press, Michael Watson has shepherded the manuscript through the review process with efficiency and tact. I also benefited from the work of three anonymous reviewers, whose comments have led me to tighten the argument and rethink a few points. In preparing the final manuscript, I have been greatly assisted by Karen Laird and especially Angela Rehbein, while
Michael Bednar cleared up a few points about Rajputs and the history of ancient India. Fiona Little’s expert copyediting saved me from several infelicities and errors. All remaining mistakes are my own. Finally I wish to thank my wife, Sara Gable, for reading the introduction, and telling me that it worked. She has made the last six years, when this book was written, into a very happy time. I dedicate the book to my daughter in the hope that she will live to see the day when liberalism trumps imperialism, rather than the other way around.
Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EIC</td>
<td>East India Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLD</td>
<td>J. N. Gupta, <em>Life and Work of Romesh Chunder Dutt, CIE</em> (London, 1911)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>Indian Civil Service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of abbreviations

MLS  P. C. Mazoomdar, *The Life and Teachings of Keshub Chunder Sen* (Calcutta, 1931)
MMW  T. B. Macaulay, *Miscellaneous Writings and Speeches* [1860] (London, 1897)
NUBR Dadabhai Naoroji, *Poverty and Un-British Rule in India* (London, 1901)
TBM  Thomas Babington Macaulay

Dates of original publication are shown in square brackets.

Note to readers: Due to space limitations, the footnotes provide only the most directly relevant supporting materials, and the most essential historiographical discussions. Further elaboration on some points can be found online at https://mospace.umsystem.edu/xmlui/handle/10355/7818. Interested readers will see that these files are organized to correspond to the chapters and footnotes in the book. However, Cambridge University Press has not reviewed this material, and disclaims all responsibility for its content, which is entirely the author's.