

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia

The 1999 conflict between India and Pakistan near the town of Kargil in contested Kashmir was the first military clash between two nuclear-armed powers since the 1969 Sino-Soviet war. Kargil was a landmark event not because of its duration or casualties, but because it contained a very real risk of nuclear escalation. Until the Kargil conflict, academic and policy debates over nuclear deterrence and proliferation occurred largely on the theoretical level. This deep analysis of the conflict offers scholars and policymakers a rare account of how nuclear-armed states interact during a military crisis. Written by analysts from India, Pakistan, and the United States, this unique book draws extensively on primary sources, including unprecedented access to Indian, Pakistani, and US government officials and military officers who were actively involved in the conflict. This is the first rigorous and objective account of the causes, conduct, and consequences of the Kargil conflict.

PETER R. LAVOY is the Deputy Director of National Intelligence for Analysis. Previously he served as Director of the Center for Contemporary Conflict at the Naval Postgraduate School and Director of Counterproliferation Policy in the Office of the Secretary of Defense.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia

*The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil
Conflict*

Edited by

Peter R. Lavoy



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press,
New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521767217

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-76721-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this book,
and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of maps and tables</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of contributors</i>	x
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>List of abbreviations and acronyms</i>	xv
1 Introduction: the importance of the Kargil conflict	1
PETER R. LAVOY	
Why this study matters	2
Controversies clarified	5
The Kargil conflict in context	14
Enduring rivalry in South Asia	23
The nuclear revolution reconsidered	29
Part 1 Causes and conduct of the conflict	39
2 The strategic context of the Kargil conflict: a Pakistani perspective	41
ZAFAR IQBAL CHEEMA	
Introduction	41
The historical rationale	42
FCNA and the Northern Areas	49
Contemporary rationale: the Siachen Glacier	52
The Kashmir uprising: the Line of Control and the Neelum Valley	55
Pakistan's official version	57
Potential objectives of the Kargil conflict	61
Conclusion	62
3 Pakistan's motivations and calculations for the Kargil conflict	64
FEROZ HASSAN KHAN, PETER R. LAVOY, AND CHRISTOPHER CLARY	
A history of grievance	68
Restoring honor	74

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi	Contents	
	The immediate cause of Kargil	80
	A new chain of command	83
	Assumptions and miscalculations	86
	Conclusion	90
4	Military operations in the Kargil conflict	92
	JOHN H. GILL	
	Prelude to conflict	93
	Buildup: local and national	105
	Indian counteroffensive	114
	Combat operations: an assessment	120
	Observations	123
5	American diplomacy and the 1999 Kargil Summit at Blair House	130
	BRUCE RIEDEL	
	Prologue	130
	Introduction	132
	Kargil and Kashmir	132
	Nawaz calls for help	135
	The 4th dawn	137
	Aftermath: new deal in New Delhi, coup in Islamabad	141
6	Kargil: the nuclear dimension	144
	TIMOTHY D. HOYT	
	Prelude to Kargil: the May 1998 tests	146
	Kargil as a nuclear crisis	155
	Post-Kargil interaction: the nuclear dimension	161
	Conclusion	167
7	Why Kargil did not produce general war: the crisis-management strategies of Pakistan, India, and the United States	171
	PETER R. LAVOY	
	South Asia's nuclear revolution	172
	Pakistan's calculations	177
	India's conflict-termination strategy	190
	International diplomacy	197
	Conclusion	204
	Part 2 Consequences and impact of the conflict	207
8	Surprise at the top of the world: India's systemic and intelligence failure	209
	JAMES J. WIRTZ AND SURINDER RANA	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents	vii
The theory of surprise	211
The <i>fait accompli</i> at Kargil	215
Planning the <i>fait accompli</i> : the view from Pakistan	216
Ripe for surprise: the view from India	219
Problems with India's intelligence organizations	220
Conclusion	228
9 Militants in the Kargil conflict: myths, realities, and impacts	231
C. CHRISTINE FAIR	
Background: origins of the myth	231
Pakistan's internal dynamics	236
Impact in the Valley of Kashmir	244
Impact on Pakistan's foreign relations	248
Conclusion	256
10 The impact of the Kargil conflict and Kashmir on Indian politics and society	258
PRAVEEN SWAMI	
Popular culture	259
The Kargil election	263
The Kargil war and the conflict in Kashmir	270
Conclusion: war, terrorists, and temples	277
11 The Kargil conflict's impact on Pakistani politics and society	280
SAEED SHAFQAT	
The Pakistani print media's Kargil	282
The domestic political impact	289
The religious parties outflank the mainstream	290
Political management and mismanagement	296
The coup and its aftermath	304
Conclusion	306
Part 3 Lessons learned	309
12 The lessons of Kargil as learned by India	311
RAJESH M. BASRUR	
Organizational lessons	313
Strategic lessons	320
Conclusion: lessons well learned?	328
13 The lessons of Kargil as learned by Pakistan	333
HASAN-ASKARI RIZVI	
Military learning in South Asia	334

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii	Contents	
	Misperceiving others: Pakistani perceptions of international response	337
	The harsh spotlight	340
	Operational lessons	346
	Assessment of the conflict	349
	Conclusion: has Pakistan learned?	350
14	The Kargil crisis: lessons learned by the United States	353
	RODNEY W. JONES AND JOSEPH McMILLAN	
	Lessons for US relations with India and Pakistan	354
	Lessons for nuclear stability and nonproliferation policy	359
	Lessons for future engagement	365
	Conclusion	373
15	Kargil, deterrence, and international relations theory	377
	ROBERT JERVIS	
	Introduction	377
	Nature of the puzzle	379
	Routes to Kargil	381
	Surprise	387
	Nuclear weapons, nuclear wars	388
	Conclusion	396
	<i>Index</i>	398

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Maps and tables

Maps

1.1 Jammu and Kashmir	<i>page</i> 17
2.1 Indian ingress after 1972 and alleged Pakistani incursion	50
2.2 Unoccupied areas along the LoC	59
4.1 Mushkoh, Dras, and Kaksar sectors	99
4.2 Batalik sector	100
4.3 Chorbat La and Turtok (Hanif) sectors	101

Tables

1.1 The Kargil conflict's implications for nuclear-deterrence theory	36
4.1 Indian and Pakistani forces in the Kargil conflict	127
10.1 Results in the 1998 and 1999 General Elections for major parties	265
10.2 Voting patterns in four key states, General Elections 1998 and 1999	266
10.3 An overview of the "pro-active" policy	273
11.1 Party share of votes: all-Pakistan National Assembly elections	291

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

PETER R. LAVOY is the Deputy Director of National Intelligence for Analysis. Previously he served as director of the Center for Contemporary Conflict at the Naval Postgraduate School and director of counterproliferation policy in the Office of the Secretary of Defense.

RAJESH M. BASRUR is an associate professor of S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Previously he was the director of the Centre for Global Studies, Mumbai, India. He specializes in international security, the politics of nuclear weapons, and the theory of international relations.

M. ZAFAR IQBAL CHEEMA was Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences and the Chairperson and a founding member of the Department of Defence and Strategic Studies at Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

CHRISTOPHER CLARY was Assistant Country Director for South Asia in the Office of the US Secretary of Defense and served as Research Associate with the Center for Contemporary Conflict at the Naval Postgraduate School during 2004 and 2005.

C. CHRISTINE FAIR is a senior political scientist at RAND, where she specializes in South Asian political and military affairs. Previously, she worked as Program Officer in the Research and Studies Program of the US Institute of Peace.

JOHN H. GILL is a professor at the National Defense University's Near East-South Asia Center for Strategic Studies. He retired from the US army as a Colonel, with over ten years of experience in regional affairs with intelligence and policy postings in the Joint Chiefs of Staff, the US Pacific Command Staff, and the Defense Intelligence Agency.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of contributors

xi

TIMOTHY D. HOYT is Associate Professor of Strategy at the US Naval War College. He works on projects assessing security in the developing world, technology and defense policy, US grand strategy in the war against terrorism, and Indo-Pakistani relations.

FEROZ HASSAN KHAN is Senior Lecturer with the Center for Contemporary Conflict and the National Security Affairs Department at the Naval Postgraduate School. He retired from the Pakistan army as Brigadier, last serving as Director, Arms Control and Disarmament in the Strategic Plans Division.

ROBERT JERVIS is Adlai E. Stevenson Professor of International Politics at Columbia University. He serves on numerous editorial boards, is a co-editor of the Cornell Studies in Security Affairs, and is a Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

RODNEY W. JONES is President of Policy Architects International and a consultant to the Defense Threat Reduction Agency. He has worked on India–Pakistan security issues and strategic nuclear arms control at Columbia University, the Center for Strategic and International Studies, and in the US State Department.

JOSEPH McMILLAN is a distinguished research fellow at the National Defense University's Institute of National Strategic Studies, focusing on issues affecting US strategy toward the Middle East and South Asia. Previously he served as Principal Director for Near East and South Asia in the Office of the Secretary of Defense.

SURINDER RANA is a Senior Instructor in the Emerging Languages Task Force of the US Army's Defense Language Institute. He served in the Indian army from 1978 to 2001, with operational assignments in almost all parts of India, including three tenures in Jammu and Kashmir. He fought in the Kargil conflict of 1999.

BRUCE RIEDEL is a Senior Fellow for the Saban Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings. He is a former CIA officer and was senior advisor to three US presidents on Middle Eastern and South Asian affairs.

HASAN-ASKARI RIZVI is an independent political and defense analyst based in Pakistan. He contributes political commentaries to Pakistan's national dailies and has published several books on Pakistan's defense policy and civil–military relations.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii List of contributors

SAEED SHAFQAT is a founding member and former chairman of the Department of Pakistan Studies at the Quaid-i-Azam University in Islamabad. Currently, he is a professor at Forman Christian College, Lahore, Pakistan.

PRAVEEN SWAMI is Deputy Editor and Chief of Bureau (New Delhi) with *Frontline Magazine*, a widely read Indian biweekly magazine, and has reported since 1993 on security-related issues, including the north Indian states of Jammu & Kashmir and Punjab. He is the author of *The Kargil War* (1999).

JAMES J. WIRTZ is Dean of the School of International Graduate Studies at the Naval Postgraduate School. Dr. Wirtz teaches courses and writes on nuclear strategy, international relations theory, and intelligence.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

This volume took six years to research and compile. From the beginning, this study was a challenge. This crisis, in comparison to previous conflicts in the region, drew an unprecedented level of controversy, competing narratives, and implications for domestic politics specifically in Pakistan, but also in India and for the course of international relations in South Asia. For this reason alone, I owe a great deal of gratitude to those who contributed to this volume and many people who were forthcoming with their candor in formal interviews and private exchange of views with me and my colleagues over the past six years. This multi-authored volume is a testimony of the Clausewitzian proverb of “wading through the water” and an earnest attempt to provide the most objective and authenticated version and analysis of this conflict.

The project editor and authors interviewed dozens of policymakers, intelligence officials, and military officers in Pakistan, India, and the United States. They also received a formal presentation by the commander of the Pakistani formation that conducted the Kargil intrusion, Force Command Northern Areas (FCNA), and several other civilian and military officials associated with the operation. Project authors presented preliminary findings and received helpful feedback from other scholars and various governmental and military representatives at conferences in Monterey, California in June 2002, at the United Services Institute in New Delhi in September 2002, and at the Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad in January 2003. Subsequent research trips and interviews in South Asia were undertaken to provide as complete and balanced an account as possible.

I am especially indebted to former Pakistani President General Pervez Musharraf and General Ved Prakash Malik, who were the respective Chiefs of Army Staff at the time of the conflict, for giving their candid views during my several meetings with them. Special thanks are owed to Lieutenant General Mahmood Ahmed and Lieutenant General Javed Hassan, commanders of the Pakistan army’s 10 Corps and FCNA respectively at the time of the Kargil operation, for their extensive interviews

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv Preface

with this author, and to Lieutenant General Nadeem Ahmed, Commander of FCNA in 2003, for his detailed briefing and views in Gilgit at FCNA Headquarters. Without these insights, the Pakistani side of the story would have remained murky.

Finally, I owe a word of gratitude to the team of the Center for Contemporary Conflict (CCC), who in the past five years conducted extensive research, and kept pace with new events and narratives, just when they thought they had reached the final version. My special thanks go to Brigadier (retd.) Feroz Hassan Khan of the Pakistan army and Lieutenant Colonel (retd.) Surinder Rana of the Indian army, both senior researchers with CCC and having the experience of command in the area of operation, for their insights, inputs, edits, and comments. This research would have been incomplete without the relentless efforts of CCC researchers, Christopher Clary, Adam Radin, and Puja Verma. Lastly, a very special thanks to my wife Debra Lavoy and our two children for bearing the brunt of my distractions, midnight-oil burning, and their support. Debra never believed this would come to an end. Publication of this book is fulfillment of one promise among many that I vowed to her.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations and acronyms

APP	Associated Press of Pakistan
BBC	British Broadcasting Company
BJP	Bharatiya Janata Party
BSF	Border Security Force
BSP	Bahujan Samaj Party
CCC	Center for Contemporary Conflict
CCS	Cabinet Committee on Security
CDS	Chief of Defence Staff
CENTCOM	United States Central Command
CFL	Cease-Fire Line
CGS	Chief of General Staff
CI	Counterinsurgency
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
COAS	Chief of Army Staff
COMINT	Communications intelligence
CSDS	Centre for the Study of Developing Societies
CSP	Civil Service of Pakistan
CTBT	Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty
DCC	Defence Committee of the Cabinet
DGMI	Directorate General of Military Intelligence
DGMO	Director General of Military Operations
DIA	Defence Intelligence Agency
DMG	District Management Group
ELINT	Electronic intelligence
FCNA	Force Command Northern Areas
G-8	Group of Eight industrialized nations
GHQ	General Headquarters
GOC	General Office Commanding
GoM	Group of Ministers
HUMINT	Human intelligence
IAF	Indian air force
IAS	Indian Administrative Service

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi List of abbreviations and acronyms

IB	Intelligence Bureau
IDSA	Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses
IMET	International Military Education and Training
IMINT	Imagery intelligence
INC	Indian National Congress
IPS	Indian Police Service
ISID	Inter-Services Intelligence Directorate
ISPR	Office of Inter-Services Public Relations
ITBP	Indo-Tibetan Border Police
JI	Jamaat-e-Islami
JIC	Joint Intelligence Committee
JUI-F	Jamiat-ul-Ulema-e-Islam (headed by Maulana Fazal-ur-Rehman)
JUI-S	Jamiat-ul-Ulema-e-Islam (headed by Maulana Sami-ul-Haq)
LoC	Line of Control
MAC	Multi-Agency Centre
MMA	Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (six-party coalition of Pakistani religious parties)
MoD	Ministry of Defence
NBC	Nuclear, biological, and chemical warfare or weapons
NCP	Nationalist Congress Party
NH-1A	National Highway 1A
NLI	Northern Light Infantry
NPT	Nuclear Nonproliferation Treaty
NSA	US National Security Agency
NSAB	National Security Advisory Board
NSC	National Security Council
NSCS	National Security Council Secretariat
NTFO	National Technical Facilities Organisation
NWFP	North-West Frontier Province
OSD	Office of the Secretary of Defense
PAF	Pakistan Air Force
PML-N	Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz Sharif)
PPP	Pakistan Peoples Party
PTV	Pakistan Television
RAW	Research and Analysis Wing
RSS	Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh
SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SAD	Shiromani Akali Dal
SSG	Special Services Group

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76721-7 - Asymmetric Warfare in South Asia: The Causes and Consequences of the Kargil Conflict

Edited by Peter R. Lavoy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of abbreviations and acronyms

xvii

SSW	Sub-sector West
TES	Technology Experiment Satellite
UAVs	Unmanned aerial vehicles
UN	United Nations
UNCIP	United Nations Commission of India and Pakistan
UNMOGIP	United Nations Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
VCDS	Vice Chief of Defence Staff
VHP	Vishwa Hindu Parishad (World Hindu Council)
VVFs	Village Volunteer Forces
WASO	Winter Air Surveillance Operations